The Senate

Legal and Constitutional Affairs Legislation Committee

Exposure Draft of the Human Rights and Anti-Discrimination Bill 2012

February 2013

© Commonwealth of Australia

ISBN: 978-1-74229-754-5

This document was produced by the Senate Legal and Constitutional Affairs Committee secretariat and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Department of the Senate, Parliament House, Canberra.

MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE

Members

Senator Patricia Crossin, **Chair**, ALP, NT

Senator Gary Humphries, **Deputy Chair**, LP, ACT

Senator Sue Boyce, LP, QLD

Senator Mark Furner, ALP, QLD

Senator Louise Pratt, ALP, WA

Senator Penny Wright, AG, SA

Participating members

Senator the Hon George Brandis SC, LP, QLD

Senator Doug Cameron, ALP, NSW

Senator Sarah Hanson-Young, AG, SA

Committee secretariat

Ms Julie Dennett	Committee Secretary
Ms Jackie Morris	Acting Committee Secretary (January 2013)
Ms Sandra Kennedy	Principal Research Officer
Ms Ann Palmer	Principal Research Officer
Mr CJ Sautelle	Senior Research Officer
Ms Monika Sheppard	Senior Research Officer
Ms Hannah Dibley	Administrative Officer
Ms Elise Williamson	Administrative Officer

Suite S1.61	Telephone:	(02) 6277 3560
Parliament House	Fax:	(02) 6277 5794
CANBERRA ACT 2600	Email:	legcon.sen@aph.gov.au

TABLE OF CONTENTS

MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE ..... **iii**

RECOMMENDATIONS ..... **ix**

CHAPTER 1 ..... **1**

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND **1**

Referral of the inquiry 1

Purpose of the proposed consolidation 1

Background to the proposed reforms 2

Approach taken in the consolidation project 4

Conduct of the inquiry 5

Scope of the report 6

Structure of the report 6

Note on references 7

Acknowledgement 7

CHAPTER 2 ..... **9**

KEY PROVISIONS OF THE BILL **9**

Chapter 2 – Unlawful conduct and equality before the law 9

Chapter 3 – Measures to assist compliance 13

Chapter 4 – Complaints 14

Chapter 6 – Australian Human Rights Commission 17

CHAPTER 3 ..... **19**

PROTECTED ATTRIBUTES **19**

New protected attributes of 'sexual orientation' and 'gender identity' 19

Other protected attributes included in the Draft Bill 25

Attributes not covered in the Draft Bill 30

CHAPTER 4 ..... **37**

MEANING OF DISCRIMINATION AND CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH DISCRIMINATION IS UNLAWFUL **37**

Definition of discrimination in the Draft Bill 37

Circumstances in which discrimination is unlawful 43

'Special measures' and 'reasonable adjustments' clauses 50

CHAPTER 5 ..... **53**

EXCEPTIONS TO UNLAWFUL DISCRIMINATION **53**

General exception for 'justifiable conduct' 53

Exception for inherent requirements of work 55

Exceptions for religious organisations under the Draft Bill 56

CHAPTER 6 ..... **73**

COMPLAINTS AND COURT PROCESSES **73**

Shifting burden of proof 73

Costs in cases brought before the courts 76

Standing to apply to the Federal Court of the Federal Magistrates Court 78

Power to dismiss complaints 80

CHAPTER 7 ..... **83**

COMMITTEE VIEWS AND RECOMMENDATIONS **83**

Protected attributes 84

Definition of discrimination 88

Areas of public life covered by the Draft Bill 90

Exceptions 91

Complaints and court processes 97

Other issues 98

DISSENTING REPORT BY COALITION SENATORS 101

The provisions of the bill violate fundamental human rights.....102

The scope of the bill is impossibly wide and dangerously vague 105

The bill is internally inconsistent and liable to produce unintended consequences 108

The bill would change damage Australia's social fabric by encouraging a "culture of complaint" 108

An area for reform 109

ADDITIONAL COMMENTS BY THE AUSTRALIAN GREENS 111

Protected attributes 112

Exception for justifiable conduct.....114

Inherent requirements exception 114

Religious exceptions.....114

Costs 115

Reasonable adjustments.....116

Special measures 116

Insurance exception 117

Systemic discrimination 117

APPENDIX 1 121

SUBMISSIONS PUBLISHED ON THE COMMITTEE'S WEBSITE 121

APPENDIX 2 145

WITNESSES WHO APPEARED BEFORE THE COMMITTEE 145