

The Senate

Senate Select Committee on
Ministerial Discretion in Migration
Matters

Report

March 2004

Commonwealth of Australia

ISBN 0 642 71373 1

This document is prepared by the Senate Select Committee on Ministerial Discretion in Migration Matters and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE

Senator Joseph Ludwig (Chair)	ALP, QLD
Senator Santo Santoro (Deputy Chair)	LP, QLD
Senator Andrew Bartlett	AD, QLD
Senator Gary Humphries	LP, ACT
Senator David Johnston	LP, WA
Senator the Hon. Nick Sherry	ALP, TAS
Senator Penny Wong	ALP, SA

Secretariat

Alistair Sands	Committee Secretary
Terry Brown	Principal Research Officer
Peta Leemen	Principal Research Officer
David Sullivan	Principal Research Officer
Matt Keele	Research Officer
Dianne Warhurst	Executive Assistant

Committee address

Senate Select Committee on Ministerial Discretion in Migration Matters

SG.60

Parliament House

CANBERRA ACT 2600

Tel: 02 6277 3103 Fax: 02 6277 5809

Email: minmig.sen@aph.gov.au Internet: http://www.aph.gov.au/senate_minmig

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary	xi
Recommendations	xxi
List of Abbreviations	xxvii
Introduction	xxix
Terms of reference.....	xxix
Background to the inquiry	xxix
Conduct of the inquiry.....	xxix
Structure of the report.....	xxx
Chapter 1	1
Ministerial discretion – background issues and problems experienced during the inquiry	
Allegations of impropriety raised by the Opposition.....	2
Outcome of parliamentary debate	4
Obstacles to the conduct of the inquiry	5
Powers of Senate committees: ministers, officials and departments	10
Chapter 2	15
Ministerial discretion in migration matters: explanation and history	
Pre-1989 discretionary powers	15
Legislative reforms of 1989.....	16
Ministerial discretion powers under sections 351 and 417 of the <i>Migration Act 1958</i>	19
Parliamentary consideration of ministerial discretion powers	22
Chapter 3	27
Patterns of use of ministerial discretion	
Data limitations	27

Use of discretion by ministers	28
Special concession visa categories	32
Greater numbers of decisions by tribunals	33
Increased public awareness of the discretionary powers.....	34
Other factors that encourage greater use of ministerial discretion.....	35
Cases before the courts.....	36
Use by nationality.....	37
Categories of visas granted.....	39
Humanitarian and compassionate grounds.....	41
Use of discretion to meet international obligations.....	42
Conclusion.....	42
Chapter 4	45
Development of ministerial guidelines and the exercise of the minister's discretionary powers	
Development of guidelines and administrative procedures	46
Recent operation of the ministerial discretion powers	52
Conclusion.....	67
Chapter 5	69
Operation of the powers – problems encountered by applicants	
Availability of information.....	69
Legal aid	71
Reasons not given to unsuccessful applicants.....	72
Exploitation of applicants.....	74
Visas and work rights	75
Delays in obtaining bridging visas	77
Financial hardship	78
Tribunal determination as prerequisite for intervention.....	81
Conclusion.....	83

Chapter 685
Representations to the minister

Registered migration agents and lawyers.....	85
Parliamentarians	89
Community leaders.....	92
Non-registered migration agents and other actors.....	100
Observations	103

Chapter 7107
The role of the minister

The Minister's personal discretion.....	107
Operation of the powers under Minister Ruddock	112
Accountability to parliament	116
Volume of cases decided by the Minister.....	119

Chapter 8125
International humanitarian obligations

Ministerial discretion and Australia's international humanitarian obligations...	126
Criticisms of reliance on ministerial discretion to fulfil Australia's non-refoulement obligations	133
Parliamentary scrutiny of Australia's international obligations	136
Complementary protection for refugees.....	138
Conclusion.....	146

Chapter 9149
Appropriateness of the minister's discretionary powers

The need for discretion in the migration system	149
Should the discretion rest only with the minister?	151
Why ministerial discretion?.....	154
Arguments against ministerial discretion	158

Appropriateness of the present ministerial intervention processes	163
Conclusion	165
Finding.....	165
Report of Government Members	167
Summary of Government Members' Position	168
Chapter 1	171
Background to the inquiry	
Chapter 2	173
Answering the allegations	
Chapter 3	176
Statistical overview of the use of discretionary powers	
Chapter 4	180
Operation of discretionary powers and accountability	
Chapter 5	184
The Committee's Recommendations: The Position of Government Members	
Additional Comments.....	193
Senator Andrew Bartlett	
Appendix 1	201
List of Submissions, Additional Information and Tabled Documents	
Appendix 2	207
Public Hearings	
Appendix 3	213
Sections 351 and 417 of the <i>Migration Act 1958</i>	

Appendix 4	217
Correspondence with Senator Vanstone and DIMIA over requests for case file and other information	
Appendix 5	237
Migration Series Instructions 386 and 387	
Appendix 6	281
Section 417 Statements	

