SEXUAL HARASSMENT

IN THE

AUSTRALIAN DEFENCE FORCE

August 1994
TERMS OF REFERENCE

On 29 September 1993, the Senate referred the following matter to the Senate Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade for inquiry and report by the last sitting day in February 1994.¹

1. The incidence of sexual harassment or sexual assault in the Royal Australian Navy, and the appropriateness of the handling by the Royal Australian Navy of allegations of such harassment or assault, with particular reference to:

   a. allegations of sexual harassment towards female personnel aboard HMAS SWAN in 1992;

   b. the adequacy of living conditions provided for female personnel on HMAS SWAN, including the sleeping and ablution areas;

   c. the behaviour of officers from HMAS SWAN while ashore during deployments in South-East Asia in 1992;

   d. other appropriate matters contained in the Board of Inquiry Report;

   e. whether the Terms of Reference of the Board of Inquiry were sufficient to enable the Board to consider any aspects of the unacceptable behaviour occurring on board HMAS SWAN, and the appropriateness of the recommendations of the Board;

   f. whether the subsequent disciplinary and administrative action taken against persons named in the Board of Inquiry Report was sufficient and appropriate;

   g. the appropriateness of the decisions made as part of determining whether sexual assault charges should be laid, and a Court Martial convened, in reference to an officer aboard HMAS SWAN in 1992;

   h. the content and timing of directives from the Government in relation to the integration of female personnel into the Navy, with particular reference to sea-going appointments, and the actions taken by the Government relating to the Board of Inquiry;

   i. the appropriateness of actions taken by the Navy subsequent to the Board of Inquiry Report to address the issues of sexual harassment on Navy ships; and

   j. an evaluation of the 'Good Working Relationships' project being undertaken by the Navy.

2. While dealing with and reporting first on the case of sexual harassment on HMAS SWAN, the Committee is also to inquire into the nature and extent, if any, of sexual harassment in the other armed forces.

¹ Reporting date was subsequently extended to 25 August 1994.
AUSTRALIAN DEFENCE FORCE

SEXUAL HARASSMENT HOTLINES

Royal Australian Navy (Operation Lifeguard)

Australia 008 - 644 247
Canada 1800 - 655 4796
Hawaii 1800 - 865 3776
Hong Kong 800 - 2974
Indonesia 00800 - 61626
Japan 0066 - 338 00917
Korea 0078 - 611 3348
Malaysia 800 - 2536
New Zealand 0800 - 442 290
Philippines 1027 - 1800 610 3344
Singapore 800 - 616 1205
Thailand 001 - 800 613 346

Royal Australian Army 008 - 803 831

Royal Australian Air Force 1800 - 626 25

EEO CO-ORDINATORS

Headquarters ADF
CMDR Elizabeth Coles 06 265 5886

Australian Defence Force Academy
LTCOL Alan McClelland 06 268 8502

Royal Australian Navy
LCDR Wendy Downing 06 265 3303

Royal Australian Army
Major Jane Glenn 06 265 1437

Royal Australian Air Force
SQNLDR John Stafford 06 265 2366
SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN AFFAIRS, DEFENCE AND TRADE

MEMBERS

Senator G. Jones, Queensland (Chairman)
Senator B.C. Teague, South Australia (Deputy Chairman)
Senator B.R. Burns, Queensland
Senator C. Ellison, Western Australia
Senator S. West, New South Wales
Senator J. Woodley, Queensland

SECRETARIAT

Ms Ilze Svenne, Secretary
Ms Roxane LeGuen, Principal Research Officer
Mr Richard Keith, Senior Research Officer
Mrs Dolores Young, Executive Assistant

Ms Virginia Buring provided advice on legal aspects during the course of the inquiry.

Contributions were made at various times by Ms Lynette Aungiers, Ms Linda Bates, Ms Jane Battersby, Ms Kim Donaldson, Ms Jenny Hill, Mrs Kay Chee Lance, Ms Angie Misi and Ms Elizabeth Mulligan.

Parliament House
Canberra ACT 2600
Phone: (06) 277 3535
Fax: (06) 277 5818
PROFILES OF MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE

Senator Gerry Jones (ALP - Queensland), Chairman of the Committee since 1993, Senator Jones is the Government Whip in the Senate, a position he has held since 1987. He was elected to the Senate in 1980 and has been a Senator for Queensland since that time. Senator Jones has been a member of several Senate Standing and Select Committees, including Science, Technology and the Environment; Procedure, Publications, House, the Senate Select Committee on Video Material and Legislation Procedures Committee. He is currently the Chairman of the Selection of Bills Committee. He has also served on the Joint Statutory Committee on Public Works and is currently a member of the Joint Statutory Committee on the National Crime Authority and of the Joint Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade. Before entering Parliament, Senator Jones was a Research Assistant and ALP official. He was the State Secretary of the Queensland ALP from 1977 to 1980. He was the official Australian Government representative at the inauguration of the President of Chile in March 1994.

Senator Baden Teague (Liberal Party - South Australia) Deputy Chairman: A Senator since 1978 and Chairman of the Opposition Task Force on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade 1990-93, Senator Teague is now Parliamentary Secretary to the Deputy Leader of the Liberal Party. He has served on many parliamentary inquiries, especially in the areas of Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade; Employment, Education and Training; and Parliamentary Privilege. Graduating BA (Hons) BSc at Adelaide and PHD at Cambridge, he worked at Adelaide University from 1972 to 1978 where he was responsible for student services and lectured in the history of ideas. Senator Teague has visited most countries in the Asia-Pacific region and many, such as China and Indonesia, on numerous occasions. As Deputy Leader of Parliamentary Delegations he has visited Europe, North America, Latin America, South Asia and the Middle East. He has participated in all the inquiries of this Senate Committee since joining the Committee in September 1987.
Senator Bryant Burns (ALP - Queensland) was elected to the Senate in 1987. He is a member of several Senate Standing and Joint House Committees, including Industry, Science and Technology and Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade. He has been a member of the Joint Statutory Committee on Public Works since 1987. Senator Burns is currently Chairperson of the Senate Standing Committee on Rural and Regional Affairs as well as Senate Estimates Committee B. Before entering Parliament he has worked as a Stockman, Boilermaker and Trade Union official as the State President of the Amalgamated Metal Workers Union, Queensland. He has held positions on various ALP and Trade Union Committees and was an Executive Officer of the Trades and Labor Council of Queensland. He is presently Deputy Whip.

Senator Sue West (ALP - New South Wales) The first woman from New South Wales to represent that state in the Senate, she filled the casual vacancy created by the retirement of Senator Doug McClelland in 1987. Defeated in the double dissolution in July that year, she was re-elected to the Senate in 1990. Senator West is a qualified midwife, and has also worked as a community health nurse, a research officer and a ministerial consultant. She is a member of numerous committees including the Senate Standing Committees on Community Affairs; Environment, Recreation and the Arts; Rural and Regional Affairs and the Senate Select Committee on Superannuation. Senator West is presently the Chair of the Community Affairs Committee and Secretary of the Federal Parliamentary Labor Party Caucus.
Senator Chris Ellison (Liberal, Western Australia). Elected as a Senator for Western Australia in July 1993, Senator Ellison serves on the Senate Legal and Constitutional Committee, the Senate Privileges Committee, the Senate Standing Committee Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade, and he is a member of the Senate Inquiry into the Print Media. He was recently elected to serve on the Joint House Committee which will take responsibility for reviewing the implementation of the Native Title Act. Senator Ellison graduated from the University of Western Australia in 1977 with a Bachelor of Jurisprudence (B.JURIS) and Bachelor of Laws (LLB). He completed his Articles with the Legal Aid Commission of Western Australia and in 1980 commenced practice as a partner in his own firm in Perth, WA until election to the Senate in 1993. Apart from some civil and family law, his main practice was in criminal law jurisdiction where he practised as a barrister and solicitor (which is permissible in WA).

Senator John Woodley (Australian Democrats - Queensland) was elected to the Senate in March 1993 and is the Australian Democrats' spokesperson on Social Security, Rural Australia, Primary Industry, Australia's Security (including Defence) and Tourism. He is a member of the Senate Standing Committees on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade; Rural and Regional Affairs and the Senate Select Committee on Superannuation. Senator Woodley holds a Licentiate of Theology from the Melbourne College of Divinity and a Bachelor of Theology from the Brisbane College of Theology. Before entering Parliament, the Reverend John Woodley was Chaplain of the Queensland University of Technology and a Guest Lecturer and Tutor in Ethics at that institution. He has held several positions in the Methodist and Uniting Churches and has written a number of books. He was a Reservist in the Royal Australian Navy for two years from 1957. He was Queensland State President of the Australian Democrats from 1991 to 1993.
CONTENTS

Introduction i
Recommendations xi

CHAPTER 1  SEXUAL HARASSMENT 1

What is sexual harassment? 2
Sexual assault 2
Sexual harassment 3
Women in the Services-Impact of change 4
Sexual harassment - different perceptions 5
The "reasonable person" test 14
Community standards 17
Types of behaviours 18
Intent 21
Possible consequences of sexual harassment 32
Impact on the individual 33
Impact on the organisation 33
Who harasses whom? 35
Sexual harassment and management style 35
Sexual harassment and poor performance 36

CHAPTER 2  SEXUAL HARASSMENT IN THE NAVY 39

Data available on sexual harassment in the Navy 39
How widespread is sexual harassment in the workforce generally? 42
Reluctance to complain 43
Drawing conclusions from statistical data on sexual harassment 47
The workplace 48
The nature of women's experiences in the RAN 50
Who engages in sexual harassment? 54
How women cope 57
Reverse discrimination 60
Physical Strength 61
Fraternisation 63

CHAPTER 3  ACCOMMODATION ON HMAS SWAN 65

Term of Reference 1 (b)

HMAS SWAN 65
The 1992 deployments 66
Dr Wheat's accommodation 67
The accommodation of other female personnel 68
Modifications to HMAS SWAN 69
Standards of accommodation for women at sea 72
CHAPTER 4 BEHAVIOUR OF OFFICERS ASHORE
Term of Reference 1 (c)

CHAPTER 5 THE TERMS OF REFERENCE OF THE BOARD of INQUIRY
Term of Reference 1(e) and 1(d)

Terms of Reference of the Board
Powers of the Board of Inquiry
Complaints about the Board's procedures
  Captain Mole
  Lieutenant Commander Flynn
  Lieutenant Turner
The Board's interpretation of its terms of reference
  Initial investigations at Lumut
Other Matters Investigated by the Board
  Payment for Dr Wheat's expenses
  The Board's analysis of the PR5
  Court Martial
Committee Conclusion
Parallel inquiry by Assistant Chief of Naval Staff - Personnel
  Dr Wheat's employment
Treatment of Dr Wheat after her return to Australia

CHAPTER 6 RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BOARD of INQUIRY
Term of Reference 1(a) and 1(e)

Gender Issues
  Appropriateness of the gender related recommendations
Sexual Harassment of Dr Wheat
  Background
The Board's investigations of sexual harassment of Dr Wheat
  Lieutenant Commander James
  Recommendations of the Board regarding individuals and behaviour in the wardroom
  Lieutenant Bartlett
  Lieutenant Commander Spruce
  Captain Mole
The Board's Investigation of the sexual harassment of the junior sailors
  Chief Petty Officer Broad
  RANTEWSS Team - the Board's analysis
Sexual Harassment - Language
Factors other than sexual harassment
  Level of Skills - training
Training for direct entry specialist officers 145
Shortage of medical officers 145
Selection of Personnel 149
Work Practices 151
Performance appraisal 154
Breakdown of the Divisional System 156
Management style 169
Defence Instructions on Sexual Harassment 171
Unsubstantiated and False Allegations 174

CHAPTER 7 DISCIPLINARY AND ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION TAKEN 179
Term of Reference 1(e) and 1(f)

ADF mechanisms for maintaining good order and discipline 179
Courts Martial 180
Censures 180
Performance Appraisals 181
Quarterly Report 182
Administrative and Disciplinary action taken 182
The censure of Captain Mole 184
How the decision to censure was reached 185
Content of the censure 187
Summary - responsibility for Dr Wheat’s situation 214
RANTEWSS Team 215
Revelations in the media since the BOI 216
Committee Comment 226
Corporate Responsibility 233
Impact of censure on promotion prospects 242
Review of censure 243

CHAPTER 8 COURT MARTIAL 249
Term of Reference 1(g)

CHAPTER 9 INTEGRATION OF WOMEN IN THE NAVY 257
Term of Reference 1(h)

Background 257
Employment of Women at Sea 258
Women in the Navy - some statistics 260
Actions taken in relation to the Board of Inquiry 264

CHAPTER 10 THE NAVY’S RESPONSE TO SEXUAL HARASSMENT 267
Term of Reference 1(l)

Before the SWAN Incident 267
Navy’s actions before the Board of Inquiry 268
Navy’s actions after the Board of Inquiry 269
CHAPTER 11  THE GOOD WORKING RELATIONSHIPS
PROJECT  279

Term of Reference 1(j)

The Good Working Relationships Project  279
The GWR fact-finding study  280
Attitudes to Change in Navy  281
Implementation of GWR strategy  283
Management of Unacceptable Behaviour Seminar  283
Other Good Working Relationships initiatives  285
Good Working Relations Advisory Committee  289

CHAPTER 12  SEXUAL HARASSMENT IN THE AUSTRALIAN
DEFENCE FORCE  293

Term of Reference 2

Women in the Armed Services  293
Monitoring of Sexual Harassment  294
ADF Mechanisms of Monitoring Sexual Harassment  295
Incidence of Sexual Harassment in the
Australian Defence Force  296
The Sex Discrimination Commissioner  296
Internal ADF records  297
Defence Force Ombudsman  299
Surveys  300
Individual Submissions to the Committee  303

Culture of the ADF  304
Badges  305
Alcohol  305
Community attitudes  305
Leadership Commitment  307
Role of Senior Officers  308
Commanding Officers' responsibilities  308
Accountability  310
Investigative procedures  312
Performance Appraisal  313
Homosexuality  314
Courts Martial  314
Integrated military/civilian workplaces  315

ADF future action plan  316
General harassment  323
Sexual harassment and integration  324
ANNEXES

1 Evidence received by the Senate Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade
2 Integration of Women in the Navy and HMAS SWAN - Chronology of Events
3 Glossary
4 Australian Defence Force Ranks and Abbreviations
5 Notes on Ranks and Positions
6 RAN Senior Positions - Incumbents
7 Promulgation of Inquiry within the Australian Defence Force
8 Reported Incidence of Sexual Harassment and Sexual Offences in the Australian Defence Force
9 Comparative Figures and Comparative Rates of Separation for Male and Female Officers in the Australian Defence Force