

The Senate

Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade
References Committee

Procurement procedures for Defence
capital projects

Final Report

August 2012

© Commonwealth of Australia 2012

ISBN 978-1-74229-565-7

Printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra

Members of the committee

Core members

Senator Alan Eggleston, LP, WA (Chair) from 7.7.2011
Senator the Hon Ursula Stephens, ALP, NSW (Deputy Chair) from 7.7.2011
Senator Mark Bishop, ALP, WA (Deputy Chair until 7.7.2011)
Senator David Fawcett, LP, SA from 1.7.2011
Senator Helen Kroger, LP, VIC (Chair until 7.7.2011)
Senator Scott Ludlam, AG, WA

Senator the Hon Alan Ferguson, LP, SA – until 30.6.2011
Senator Michael Forshaw, ALP, NSW – until 30.6.2011
Senator Russell Trood, LP, QLD – until 30.6.2011

Participating members who contributed to the inquiry

Senator Gary Humphries LP, ACT
Senator the Hon David Johnston LP, WA
Senator Nick Xenophon IND, SA

Secretariat

Dr Kathleen Dermody, Committee Secretary
Ms Jane Thomson, Principal Research Officer (until June 2012)
Mr Michael Kozakos, Research Officer (December 2011–March 2012)
Ms Jedidiah Reardon, Senior Research Officer
Ms Penny Bear, Research Officer (from 9 March 2012)
Ms Jo-Anne Holmes, Administrative Officer

Senate Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade Committee
Department of the Senate
PO Box 6100
Parliament House
Canberra ACT 2600
Australia

Phone: + 61 2 6277 3535

Fax: + 61 2 6277 5818

Email: fadt.sen@aph.gov.au

Internet: http://www.aph.gov.au/Parliamentary_Business/Committees/Senate/Committees?url=fadt_ctte/procurement/index.htm

Table of contents

Members of the committee	iii
Table of contents	v
Acronyms and Abbreviations	xv
Executive summary	xxi
Recommendations	xxiii

Chapter 1

Introduction	1
Conduct of inquiry	1
Change in Defence personnel	3
Developments during inquiry	4
Reviews and references	4
Site visits to South Australia and Western Australia	5
Overseas visit	7
Scope and structure of the report	7
Part 1—Major acquisitions—background and context	8
Part II—Compliance with, and awareness of, policy and guidelines	9
Part III—Accountability, responsibility and collaboration	9
Part IV—Contestability and independent advice	10
Part V—Right people, skills and analysis	10
Part VI—Industry—workforce and relationship with Defence	10
Part VII—Conclusion	11
Acknowledgements	11

Part I - Background

Chapter 2

Project performance	15
Super Seasprite	15
Landing Watercraft for HMAS <i>Manoora</i> and HMAS <i>Kanimbla</i> (LCM 2000)	17
Wedgetail	18
Tiger Armed Reconnaissance Helicopter	20

Guided Missile Frigate Upgrade Project.....	22
KC-30A Multi-Role Tanker Transport.....	24
Multi-Role (MRH-90) Helicopter	25
Air Warfare Destroyer.....	27
M113 Upgrade Program.....	27
Lightweight Torpedo Replacement Project.....	29
The Collins Class Submarine Reliability and Sustainability Project	31
Common problems—costs, schedule slippage and reduced capability.....	31
Schedule slippage	31
Costs	32
Capability	33
Conclusion.....	34

Chapter 3

Lessons to be learnt	37
Early research and analysis	37
New submarines—SEA 1000.....	37
Offshore combatant vessel	44
Industry engagement	46
Committee view.....	46
Funding <i>Force 2030</i>	47
New Defence White Paper	50
Committee view.....	52
Slippage of approval rate at first and second pass.....	52
Reason for delayed approval rates.....	55
Committee view.....	55

Chapter 4

Challenges for Defence procurement.....	57
Large, complex and costly undertakings	57
Advances in technology and the importance of integration.....	58
Changing geo-strategic environment.....	60

Conspiracy of optimism	61
Long term ventures and extended timeframes	62
Self-sufficiency for Australia as a medium sized country	64
Marketplace developments	65
Managing risk.....	66
Self-inflicted complexity	67

Part II - Risk and defence procurement

Chapter 5

Risk management and good governance	73
Risk management in defence organisations overseas.....	73
Risk management—best practice	74
Committee view.....	77
Risk management in Defence	77
Policy	77
Guidelines.....	78
Conclusion	80

Chapter 6

Compliance and awareness.....	81
Problems in Defence procurement	81
Culture of risk management	82
Adherence to procurement policy and guidelines	83
Awareness and ownership of risk.....	85
Committee view.....	87
Learning lessons and recordkeeping	87
Conclusion	89

Part III - Accountability, responsibility and collaboration

Chapter 7

Responsibility and accountability	93
Background to accountability—committees	93
Who is responsible?.....	95
Capability Development Group.....	97
Capability Managers.....	97
Defence Materiel Organisation.....	100
Distinct and complementary responsibilities	100
Measures to strengthen accountability	104
Joint project directive	105
Materiel Acquisition Agreements	106
Ministerial Directive to the Defence Materiel Organisation.....	108
Project charter.....	109
Lessons to be learnt and accountability.....	111
Conclusion	113

Chapter 8

Communication, integration and collaboration	115
Shared understandings.....	116
Strategy Executive and its relationship with CDG.....	116
Management matrix and linkages between groups	119
Smooth transitions	121
Involvement of capability managers	122
Strengthening relationships	123
Materiel Acquisition Agreement	124
Project initiation and review board	125
Committee view.....	126
Defence Science and Technology Organisation.....	127
Industry	129
Conclusion	130

Part IV - Contestability and independent advice

Chapter 9

An informed organisation—contestability	135
Early stages–Defence White Paper	135
Former Force Development and Analysis Division	136
1997 Defence Efficiency Review and the abolition of the FDA.....	137
Associate Secretary (Capability)	140
Committee view.....	141

Chapter 10

Contest of ideas and independent advice	143
Defence's quality assurance framework	143
Independent Project Performance Office	144
Gate reviews	145
Committee view.....	153
Independent advice and contestability	154
Defence Material Organisation.....	154
Defence Science and Technology Organisation.....	155
Capability Investment and Resources Division.....	156
Central agencies.....	159
Effectiveness of internal contestability	160
One Defence view	161
Conclusion	162

Part V - Training, skills and experience

Chapter 11

Knowledge-based organisation.....	169
The right people.....	169
Smart customer	170
Specialist skills in Defence.....	174

Capability Development Group and Defence Materiel Organisation	174
Defence Materiel Organisation.....	178
Engineering and high technical skills.....	184
The Services	186
Rebuilding Defence's engineering base.....	189
Solutions	190
Conclusion	192

Chapter 12

Technical analysis and test and evaluation	195
Off-the-shelf purchase	196
Possible secondary risks	197
Analysis—test and evaluation	198
Early testing.....	200
Implementation.....	202
Resourcing test and evaluation.....	205
Long-standing concern	206
Conclusion	210

Part VI - Defence industry

Chapter 13

Sustaining and building Australia's defence industry	215
Assisting Australian defence industry	215
Skills in industry	215
Shipbuilding projects.....	216
Defence Materiel Organisation and government initiatives.....	217
Committee view.....	219
Access to information.....	219
Industry's perspective	222
Committee view.....	224

Off-the-shelf	225
Workflows	225
Committee view.....	231

Chapter 14

Defence's relationship with defence industry	233
Partnership—Defence and industry.....	233
Early engagement	234
Probity concerns	237
Capability Development Advisory Forum and environmental working groups.....	238
Committee view.....	239
Defence Materiel Organisation's negotiations with industry	240
Contracting and risk sharing between Defence and industry	242
Industry perspective.....	244
Committee view.....	247

Chapter 15

Conclusion	249
Challenges and Defence's responses	249
Process versus genuine reform	250
Disenfranchised capability managers.....	252
Continuing struggle for skilled people	254
Underperforming organisation	256
Need for structural reform	258
Recommendations—proposed model.....	258
Strategic Policy Division.....	259
Capability managers	259
Capability Development Group.....	260
Defence Materiel Organisation.....	261
Specialist acquisition organisation	261
Defence Science and Technology Organisation.....	262

Other recommendations.....	263
Future submarines SEA 1000—applying lessons	263
Air 8000 Ph 2 (Battlefield Airlift—Caribou replacement)	264
The 2013 White Paper—clarity on future capability	265
Improving gate reviews	265
Test and evaluation—building capability.....	267
Industry—planning for investment and early engagement with Defence.....	268
Selected Bibliography	271

Additional Comments by Senator Nick Xenophon

Independent Senator for South Australia	275
--	------------

Additional Comments by Senator David Fawcett

Liberal Party Senator for South Australia	279
--	------------

Additional Comments by Senator Scott Ludlam

Australian Greens Senator for Western Australia.....	319
---	------------

Appendix 1

Public submissions.....	321
--------------------------------	------------

Appendix 2

Public hearings and witnesses	325
Thursday 11 August 2011—Canberra.....	325
Friday 12 August 2011—Canberra	326
Wednesday 5 October 2011—Canberra.....	327
Friday 7 October 2011—Canberra	328
Wednesday 12 June 2012—Canberra	329
Thursday 13 June 2012—Canberra.....	330

Appendix 3

Tabled documents, answers to questions on notice and additional information	331
Additional Information Received	331
Answers to Questions on Notice	332

Appendix 4

Independent Members of the Defence Gate Review Board—Background and Experience.....	333
--	------------

