

The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

Inquiry into the disposal of Defence property

Artillery Barracks, Fremantle

**INTERIM REPORT OF THE
SENATE FOREIGN AFFAIRS, DEFENCE AND TRADE
REFERENCES COMMITTEE**

January 2001

© Commonwealth of Australia

ISBN 0 642 71114 3

This document is produced from camera-ready copy by the Senate Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade References Committee Secretariat, and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

Cover photograph: Artillery Barracks, Fremantle.

MEMBERSHIP OF THE COMMITTEE

Current Members

Senator John Hogg, ALP, Qld (from 1.7.98) (**Chair**)
Senator Sandy Macdonald, NPA, NSW (to 30.6.99 and
from 9.5.00) (**Deputy Chair**)
Senator Vicki Bourne, AD, NSW (from 12.5.99)
Senator Steve Hutchins (from 17.8.00)
Senator Ross Lightfoot, LP, WA (from 21.10.97)
Senator Sue West, ALP, NSW (from 24.11.98)

Current Participating Members

Senator the Hon Eric Abetz, LP, Tas (from 5.12.97)
Senator Lyn Allison, AD, Vic (from 19.10.99)
Senator Andrew Bartlett, AD, Qld (from 19.10.99)
Senator the Hon Nick Bolkus, ALP, SA (from 7.12.98)
Senator the Hon Ron Boswell, NPA, Qld (from 26.11.98)
Senator Bob Brown, TG, Tas (from 18.6.96)
Senator Paul Calvert, LP, Tas (from 24.8.99)
Senator Grant Chapman, LP, SA (from 24.8.99)
Senator the Hon Peter Cook, ALP, WA (from 3.12.98)
Senator Helen Coonan, LP, NSW (from 24.8.99)
Senator Winston Crane, LP, WA (from 24.8.99)
Senator Alan Eggleston, LP, WA (from 8.12.98)
Senator the Hon John Faulkner, ALP, NSW (from 7.12.98)
Senator Alan Ferguson, LP, SA (from 24.8.99)
Senator Jeannie Ferris, LP, SA (from 24.8.99)
Senator Michael Forshaw, ALP, NSW (from 7.4.98)
Senator Brenda Gibbs, ALP, Qld (from 3.12.98)
Senator the Hon Brian Gibson, LP, Tas (from 24.8.99)
Senator Brian Harradine, Ind, Tas (from 24.11.98)
Senator Susan Knowles, LP, WA (from 24.8.99)
Senator Brett Mason, LP, Qld (from 24.8.99)
Senator Julian McGauran, NPA, Vic (from 3.12.98)
Senator Shayne Murphy, ALP, Tas (from 20.10.99)
Senator Marise Payne, LP, NSW (from 24.8.99)
Senator Tsebin Tchen, LP, Vic (from 24.8.99)
Senator John Tierney, LP, NSW (from 24.8.99)
Senator John Watson, LP, Tas (from 24.8.99)

**Former
Members**

Senator the Hon David Brownhill, NPA, NSW (to 14.4.00)
Senator the Hon Peter Cook, ALP, WA (to 3.12.98)
Senator Alan Eggleston, LP, WA (to 3.12.98)
Senator Brenda Gibbs, ALP, Qld (to 3.12.98)
Senator Sandy Macdonald, NPA, NSW (to 30.6.99)
Senator John Quirke, ALP, SA (to 15.8.00)
Senator John Woodley, AD, Qld (to 12.5.99)

**Former
Participating
Members**

Senator the Hon David Brownhill, NPA, NSW (to 30.6.99)
Senator Mal Colston, Ind, Qld (to 30.6.99)
Senator Steve Hutchins, ALP, NSW (to 17.8.00)
Senator Dee Margetts, GWA, WA (to 30.6.99)

Secretariat

Mr Paul Barsdell, Secretary
Dr Robert King, Principal Research Officer
Mr Frank Nugent, Principal Research Officer
Mr Jonathan Curtis, Principal Research Officer
Ms Pamela Corrigan, Research Officer
Ms Laurie Cassidy, Executive Assistant

The Senate

Parliament House

Canberra ACT 2600

Phone: (02) 6277 3535; Fax: (02) 6277 5818

E-mail: fadt.sen@aph.gov.au; website: www.aph.gov.au/senate_fadt

TERMS OF REFERENCE

That the following matter be referred to the Senate Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade References Committee for inquiry and report by the last sitting day in March 2001:

1. The importance and value of the Western Australian Army Museum and the Fremantle Artillery Barracks.
2. Whether the Fremantle Artillery Barracks is the most appropriate and suitable location for the Museum.
3. The reason for the disposal of the Fremantle Artillery Barracks.
4. The disposal of the Fremantle Artillery Barracks and the probity of the disposal process.
5. How the Australian Defence Organisation (ADO) decides whether property is surplus to requirements and the management or disposal of surplus property.
6. Sale and lease-back of ADO property.
7. Any other matter related to the above-mentioned issues.

The Committee will report initially on the disposal of the Fremantle Artillery Barracks and then in a second report on the broader issues in terms 5 and 6.

CONTENTS

<i>Membership of the Committee</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Secretariat</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>Terms of reference</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Table of contents</i>	<i>vii</i>
CHAPTER 1—Introduction	1
Establishment of the inquiry	1
Conduct of the inquiry	1
Scope of this report	2
Acknowledgements	2
CHAPTER 2—The Fremantle Artillery Barracks	3
History of the Cantonment Hill—Artillery Barracks site	3
Description of the site	6
<i>Cantonment Hill reserve</i>	6
<i>Tuckfield Street oval</i>	6
<i>Gun House and Rifle Cottage</i>	7
<i>Residential quarters on Queen Victoria Street</i>	7
<i>Signal station and surrounds</i>	7
<i>Artillery barracks</i>	7
<i>Naval store</i>	7
Significance of the site	7
<i>Aesthetic value</i>	8
<i>Historic value</i>	8
<i>Social value</i>	11
<i>Scientific value</i>	12
Disposal options	12
Recommendation	14
Future uses of the site	15
Conclusions	19

CHAPTER 3—Army Museum of Western Australia	21
Status of the Army Museum	21
The Museum’s collection, displays and activities	22
Proposed relocation to Hobbs Hall	25
<i>Volunteers</i>	27
<i>Visitors to the museum</i>	28
<i>Security of tenure</i>	29
Between a rock and a hard place	30
Recommendations	33
CHAPTER 4—The sale process	35
Defence’s decision that the Artillery Barracks site is surplus to requirements	35
Decision to dispose of the property	37
The sale process	40
Consultations with interested parties	42
<i>Criticism of lack of consultation</i>	42
<i>City of Fremantle’s interests in the property</i>	45
<i>Timing of commencement of consultation</i>	47
<i>Possible transfer to a Commonwealth agency</i>	49
The application for priority status by the University of Notre Dame, Australia	49
Defence annual report and performance outcomes	50
CHAPTER 5—Conclusions and recommendations	51
Disposal of Artillery Barracks, Fremantle	51
Army Museum of Western Australia	52
Disposal process	52
Recommendations	53
APPENDICES	
Appendix 1	
Submissions authorised for publication by the Committee	55
Appendix 2	
Witnesses who appeared before the Committee at public hearings	59