

The Senate

Environment, Communications,
Information Technology and the Arts
References Committee

The performance of the Australian
telecommunications regulatory regime

August 2005

© Commonwealth of Australia 2005

ISBN 0 642 71557 2

This document was printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra

Committee membership

Members:

Senator Andrew Bartlett (AD, QLD) (Chair) (from 23 June 2005)
*Senator John Cherry (AD, QLD) (Chair) (to 23 June 2005)
*Senator John Tierney (LP, NSW) (Deputy Chair) (to 14 April 2005)
Senator the Hon. Judith Troeth (LP, VIC) (from 14 April 2005, Deputy Chair from 12 May 2005)
*Senator Mark Bishop (ALP, WA) (to 1 July 2005)
Senator Stephen Conroy (ALP, VIC)
Senator Kate Lundy (ALP, ACT)
Senator the Hon. Michael Ronaldson (LP, VIC) (from 1 July 2005)
*Senator Tsebin Tchen (LP, VIC) (to 1 July 2005)
Senator Dana Wortley (ALP, SA) (from 1 July 2005)

Participating Members:

Senator the Hon Eric Abetz (LP, TAS)	Senator Michael Forshaw (ALP, NSW)
Senator Lyn Allison (AD, VIC)	Senator Alan Ferguson (LP, SA)
Senator the Hon Nick Bolkus (ALP, SA)	Senator Jeannie Ferris (LP, SA))
Senator the Hon Ron Boswell (NPA, QLD)	Senator Gary Humphries (LP, ACT)
Senator Bob Brown (AG, TAS)	Senator Joseph Ludwig (ALP, QLD)
Senator Geoffrey Buckland (ALP, SA)	Senator Brett Mason (LP, QLD)
Senator George Campbell (ALP, NSW)	Senator Julian McGauran (NPA, VIC)
Senator Kim Carr (ALP, VIC)	Senator Claire Moore (ALP, QLD)
Senator Grant Chapman (LP, SA)	Senator Kerry Nettle (AG, NSW)
Senator Richard Colbeck (LP, SA)	Senator Kerry O'Brien (ALP, TAS)
Senator the Hon Helen Coonan (LP, NSW)	Senator Marise Payne (LP, NSW)
Senator Trish Crossin (ALP, NT)	Senator Robert Ray (ALP, VIC)
Senator Alan Eggleston, (LP, WA)	Senator John Watson (LP, TAS)
Senator Christopher Evans (ALP, WA)	Senator Ruth Webber (ALP, WA)
Senator the Hon. John Faulkner (ALP, NSW)	

Committee Secretariat

Ms Louise Gell, Secretary
Dr Jacqueline Dewar, Principal Research Officer
Mr Jonathan Chowns, Principal Research Officer (April-June)
Dr Rick Williams, Principal Research Officer (May-June)
Dr Robyn Clough, Senior Research Officer (June-July)
Ms Jacquie Hawkins, Research Officer
Mrs Dianne Warhurst, Executive Assistant

Committee Address

S1.57 Parliament House

Canberra ACT 2600

Tel: 02 6277 3526

Fax: 02 6277 5818

Email: ecita.sen@aph.gov.au

Internet: http://www.aph.gov.au/senate/committee/ecita_ctte/index.htm

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Committee membership	iii
Terms of Reference	xi
List of Tables & Figures	xiii
Recommendations	xv
Abbreviations	xxi
Chapter 1 - Background to the inquiry	1
Conduct of the inquiry	1
Outline of the report	1
Acknowledgements	2
Note on references in this report	2
Chapter 2 - The telecommunications environment	3
Regulatory overview	3
Access	5
Competition	5
The need for a review	7
Telecommunications as an essential social service	10
The pending sale and privatisation of Telstra	14
Telecommunication services in rural and regional areas	16
Poor quality of telecommunications services	19
The need for high speed telecommunications	24
Future services to rural and regional areas	28
Future investment in the telecommunications network	31
Conclusion	36

Chapter 3 - Competition	39
The current regulatory regime	39
Part XIB - anti-competitive conduct	40
Part IV – anti-competitive conduct	42
Comparison of Part IV and Part XIB	43
Accounting separation and record-keeping rules	44
Anti-competitive behaviour: a case study	47
Part XIB: lessons learnt	51
Defining abuse of market power	51
Proving decreased competition – the effectiveness of accounting separation ..	52
Difficulty in mounting a legal case	55
Flaws in the process.....	58
Financial penalties	59
Impact on smaller players.....	60
The ACCC's powers	61
Telstra's response.....	62
The Committee's view	63
Telstra's relationship with its wholesale customers.....	63
Competitors' capacity to roll out infrastructure.....	66
Telstra's deployment of services into regions once a competitor has rolled out infrastructure.....	67
Aggressive pricing practices	69
Churning customers from the Telstra network.....	70
The unrecoverable costs of dealing with Telstra.....	74
Managing customer problems on the Telstra network	75
ADSL on Telstra lines	76
Conclusion	80
Chapter 4 - Access	81
Introduction	81

The legislative framework	82
The policy intention.....	82
Declaration of services	83
Standard access obligations.....	83
Conditions of access	83
Model terms – core services	84
Price of access	84
Ordinary and anticipatory exemptions from SAOs.....	84
Special access undertakings	85
Key issues.....	85
The process of declaring services.....	87
Inherent delays in the regime	88
Regulatory gaming and delay.....	89
Impediments other than access price.....	93
Facility sharing	95
Pricing issues	97
Declaration, investment and regulatory ‘safe harbours’	109
'Dark fibre'	113
Conclusion	114
Chapter 5 - Consumer issues.....	117
The framework for consumer protection.....	118
Universal Service Regime	118
Digital Data Service Obligation (DDSO).....	120
Customer Service Guarantee	120
DCITA Review 2004.....	121
The CSG	121
The USO	122
DDSO delivery arrangements	122
Criticism of services under the USO	123

The standard telephone service	123
Costing and funding of the USO	124
Contestability arrangements	127
Expanding the USO	129
Support for the inclusion of broadband in the USO	130
Voice over internet protocol (VoIP).....	132
Hearing and speech impaired customers	133
The HiBIS model.....	135
Evidence about the CSG.....	137
Unfair consumer contracts and Standard Forms of Agreement	139
Industry codes and standards.....	142
The legislative framework.....	142
Criticism of the codes process.....	143
Meeting consumer expectations	145
Involvement of consumers	145
The Consumer Driven Communications Report	146
The Consumer Contracts Industry Code	147
Compliance.....	148
Dispute resolution – the Telecommunications Industry Ombudsman	151
The main issues facing the TIO.....	151
Billing complaints	152
Possible solutions in complaints resolution.....	153
Other issues.....	155
Price controls and low income customers	156
Remote Indigenous communities	160
Emergency call service.....	161
Conclusion	162
Chapter 6 - A blueprint for the future.....	165
The structure of Telstra: achieving greater transparency	167

Structural separation.....	168
Operational separation.....	173
Application of models to other competitors.....	182
The Committee's view.....	182
The ACCC.....	184
Penalties.....	185
Other powers.....	186
Resources.....	191
The TPA: Part XIB and section 46.....	195
The TPA: Part XIC.....	198
Foxtel and the HFC.....	202
Investment in infrastructure.....	206
Meeting consumer demands.....	207
The Universal Service Obligation.....	207
Broadband.....	208
Broadband options.....	211
People with hearing and speech impairment.....	213
The Customer Service Guarantee.....	214
Consumer protection.....	214
Complaint handling and code compliance.....	215
Low income consumers.....	217
The Emergency Call Service.....	218
Government Members' Dissenting Report.....	219
Recommendations which Government Senators reject.....	221
Separation of Telstra.....	221
Broadband infrastructure.....	226
The Universal Service Obligation.....	226
Broadband infrastructure, including the Higher Bandwidth Incentive Scheme.....	227

The Estens Report.....	229
Consumer issues	230
Recommendations supported in principle	231
Appendix 1 - Submissions and Tabled Documents.....	233
Submissions	233
Tabled Documents	236
Appendix 2 - Public Hearings	237