The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

IN THE PUBLIC INTEREST:

Monitoring Australia’s media

Report by the Senate Select Committee on Information Technologies

April 2000
Terms of Reference

To evaluate the appropriateness, effectiveness and privacy implications of the existing self-regulatory framework in relation to the information and communications industries and, in particular, the adequacy of the complaints regime.
Membership of the Committee*

Chair:
Senator Jeannie Ferris (LP, SA)

Deputy Chair:
Senator Mark Bishop (ALP, WA)

Other Members:
Senator Paul Calvert (LP, TAS)
Senator Brian Harradine (Ind, TAS)
Senator Kate Lundy (ALP, ACT)
Senator Julian McGauran (NPA, VIC)
Senator Natasha Stott Despoja (AD, SA)
Senator John Tierney (LP, NSW)

* Senator John Quirke and former Senator the Hon Margaret Reynolds were Members of the Committee in the 38th Parliament.

Secretariat:

Secretary
Ms Andrea Griffiths

Principal Research Officer
Mr George Kosmas

Executive Assistant
Mr Michael Gallagher

Committee Address:
Suite S1.30.1
Parliament House
Canberra ACT 2600

Phone: 02/6277 3646    Fax: 02/6277 3830
Email: it.sen@aph.gov.au
This report is also available on the Internet at: http://www.aph.gov.au/it
Table of Contents

Terms of Reference ............................................................................................................... iii
Membership of the Committee ........................................................................................ iv
Table of Contents .............................................................................................................. v
List of Acronymns .......................................................................................................... ix
Executive Summary ....................................................................................................... x
Recommendations ........................................................................................................ xii

CHAPTER 1 ..................................................................................................................... 1

OVERVIEW .................................................................................................................... 1

Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1
The nature of Australia’s information and communications industries ..................... 2
  Overview .................................................................................................................... 2
  Print Media ............................................................................................................. 3
  Television ................................................................................................................ 4
  Radio ....................................................................................................................... 5
  Telecommunications ............................................................................................... 6
Regulation of the information and communications industries ................................ 6
  Regulation, co-regulation and self-regulation .............................................................. 7
  Print media ............................................................................................................. 7
  Radio and Television ............................................................................................... 8
  Telecommunications ............................................................................................... 9
Complaints-handling in the information and communications industries ................ 10
  Print Media ............................................................................................................. 10
  Television ................................................................................................................ 12
  Radio ....................................................................................................................... 12
  Telecommunications ............................................................................................... 13
Privacy and the information and communications industries .................................... 14
Convergence - the future of the regulation of Australia’s information and communications industries ................................................................. 15

CHAPTER 2 ................................................................................................................ 17

PRINT MEDIA ......................................................................................................... 17

Introduction ................................................................................................................... 17
The Australian Press Council ......................................................................................... 18
  Statement of Principles ......................................................................................... 18
  Complaints-handling process ............................................................................. 19
  Record of complaints ......................................................................................... 22
The Effectiveness of the Australian Press Council ...................................................... 25
Lack of pro-active role and enforcement powers ....................................................... 26
Time taken to deal with complaints ........................................................................... 28
Extent of awareness of the complaints process .......................................................... 29
Privacy ........................................................................................................................ 29

Lessons from Overseas – United Kingdom Press Complaints Commission (PCC) ..... 32
Origins of the Press Complaints Commission ........................................................... 32
Purpose of the Press Complaints Commission ........................................................... 33
Operations of the Press Complaints Commission ...................................................... 34
Reviews and reforms of the Press Complaints Commission ..................................... 36

The Australian Journalists’ Association ................................................................. 41
The AJA Code of Ethics ............................................................................................ 41
AJA complaints-handling process ........................................................................... 43
General views on self-regulation by the AJA ............................................................ 45
Public awareness of the AJA and its complaints-handling function ....................... 46
Access to AJA adjudications ................................................................................... 47
Limited powers of the AJA ...................................................................................... 48
Privacy ........................................................................................................................ 50

CHAPTER 3 ............................................................................................................. 53

TELEVISION ............................................................................................................ 53

Introduction ................................................................................................................ 53
The Australian Broadcasting Authority ................................................................. 53
Codes of practice ..................................................................................................... 55
The complaints-handling process .......................................................................... 57
Record of complaints .............................................................................................. 58
Effectiveness of the regulation of commercial television ....................................... 59
Complaints-handling process .................................................................................. 62
Lack of public awareness of the complaints-handling mechanism ...................... 63
Time taken to deal with complaints ...................................................................... 64
Availability of escape clauses .................................................................................. 67
Inadequate monitoring of the system by the ABA .................................................. 68
Lack of meaningful penalties ................................................................................... 69
Other criticisms ........................................................................................................ 70
Privacy ....................................................................................................................... 71
Programming for children ....................................................................................... 72
Time taken to develop new codes of practice ........................................................ 73
Classification of programs ....................................................................................... 75
Amount of non-program matter broadcast ............................................................ 77
Advertising .............................................................................................................. 78
Codes of practice .................................................................................................... 78
Effectiveness of the regulatory model for commercial advertising ....................... 79
Complaints-handling process .................................................................................. 80
The Australian Association of National Advertisers ............................................. 81
The Australian Broadcasting Corporation ............................................................. 84
Complaints-handling process .................................................................................. 85
Privacy ........................................................................................................................ 87
Special Broadcasting Service Corporation ................................................................. 88
Complaints-handling process ..................................................................................... 89

CHAPTER 4 .................................................................................................................... 91
RADIO .............................................................................................................................. 91
Introduction .................................................................................................................. 91
Federation of Australian Radio Broadcasters Commercial Radio Codes of Practice ... 91
The Australian Broadcasting Authority ........................................................................ 92
Complaints-handling process ..................................................................................... 92
Record of complaints ................................................................................................. 93
The effectiveness of self-regulation in radio ............................................................... 94
Privacy ...................................................................................................................... 95
Regulation of adult content ....................................................................................... 96
Radio station 2UE ...................................................................................................... 99
Advertising ................................................................................................................... 103
ABC and SBS Radio .................................................................................................... 104

CHAPTER 5 .................................................................................................................... 107
TELECOMMUNICATIONS ............................................................................................ 107
Introduction .................................................................................................................. 107
Regulation of carriage of information by telephony and the Internet ......................... 107
The Telecommunications Industry Ombudsman Scheme .......................................... 107
Self-regulatory codes of practice .............................................................................. 108
Complaints-handling process ................................................................................... 110
The effectiveness of regulation of the carriage of information .................................... 111
Criticisms of the self-regulatory scheme ................................................................. 112
Inefficient development of self-regulatory codes ................................................... 113
Inadequate coverage of the self-regulatory model .................................................. 115
Monitoring and enforcement mechanisms ............................................................. 118
Inadequate standard for data protection ................................................................. 119
Regulation of content of information on the Internet ................................................ 120
Internet Industry Codes of Practice ........................................................................ 120
Complaints-handling process ................................................................................... 121
Privacy ...................................................................................................................... 123
Distinction between carriage and content ............................................................... 124

CHAPTER 6 .................................................................................................................... 127
MEDIA COMPLAINTS COMMISSION ..................................................................... 127
Introduction .................................................................................................................. 127
Sectors included in the MCC ..................................................................................... 128
**List of Acronyms**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AANA</td>
<td>Australian Association of National Advertisers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABA</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABC</td>
<td>Australian Broadcasting Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACA</td>
<td>Australian Communications Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACCC</td>
<td>Australian Competition and Consumer Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACIF</td>
<td>Australian Communications Industry Forum (formerly NIIF – Network Interworking Industry Forum)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJA</td>
<td>Australian Journalists’ Association (a section of the Media, Entertainment and Arts Alliance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APC</td>
<td>Australian Press Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASB</td>
<td>Advertising Standards Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CND</td>
<td>Calling Number Display</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FACTS</td>
<td>Federation of Australian Commercial Television Stations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FARB</td>
<td>Federation of Australian Radio Broadcasters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IIA</td>
<td>Internet Industry Association (formerly INTIAA – Internet Industry Association of Australia)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISP</td>
<td>Internet service provider</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEAA</td>
<td>Media, Entertainment and Arts Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCC</td>
<td>Media Complaints Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOIE</td>
<td>National Office for the Information Economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPPs</td>
<td>National Principles for the Fair Handling of Personal Information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCC</td>
<td>Press Complaints Commission (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SBS</td>
<td>Special Broadcasting Service Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIO</td>
<td>Telecommunications Industry Ombudsman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TISSC</td>
<td>Telephone Information Services Standards Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YMA</td>
<td>Young Media Australia</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

Australia’s information and communications industries affect the lives of all Australians on a daily basis. The community relies on these industries – that is, the print media, television, radio, telephony and the Internet – to be informed, entertained and to communicate with each other.

The regulation of the information and communications industries must allow for their expansion and development in a competitive market. At the same time, regulation must ensure that these industries operate in a transparent and accountable environment.

Effective regulation involves balancing industry interests and safeguarding the wider interests of the Australian community. One way in which regulation is currently managed, is through codes of practice that have been developed by the industries themselves.

The Committee heard of numerous instances that question the success of the self-regulation by the information and communications industries:

- Breaches in the privacy of individuals. For example, a photograph of former Senator Bob Woods and his wife, which was published in the *Daily Telegraph* in 1996, was labelled by the Australian Press Council as ‘a blatant example of the unjustified breach of privacy’. The photograph also appeared on the same day in the *Herald Sun*, the *Courier Mail* and the *Advertiser*. The photograph was subsequently re-published in the *Daily Telegraph* as part of a portfolio that won a merit award in the Nikon-Kodak press photographer awards.

- The display of undesirable images. For example, in 1998 the *Townsville Bulletin* published a photograph of a circus act that showed a woman performer’s face contorting as air was sucked from a plastic bag she was wearing. A complaint was lodged alleging that the photograph may encourage children to perform a similar act, with possible fatal consequences. Although the photograph was found to have breached the Australian Press Council’s Statement of Principles, it was published a second time.

- The broadcasting of undesirable content. For example, a commercial radio station broadcast from a brothel that included live sexual activity.

- News broadcasts that are influenced by commercial arrangements. For example, the recent ‘cash-for-comments’ inquiry by the Australian Broadcasting Authority into radio station 2UE Sydney Pty Limited, which found that certain news and current affairs broadcasts promoted the commercial interests of sponsors.

In Chapters 1-5 of this Report, the Committee considers the self-regulation that applies to each of Australia’s information and communications industries. In summary, the Committee believes that a number of improvements can be made to self-regulation, including:
• Better and more proactive enforcement of the self-regulatory codes of practice.
• An increased awareness of and ability to complain about breaches of codes of practice by the information and communications industries.
• Increased guidance on the self-regulatory codes of practice that protect an individual’s right to privacy.

In Chapter 6, the Committee addresses these challenges. It recommends the establishment of an independent statutory body, the Media Complaints Commission (MCC), which will be a one-stop-shop for all complaints and will assist to enforce standards established by self-regulation.

The current models for self-regulation will continue to operate unchanged. Codes of practice and complaints-handling procedures will continue to be largely developed and administered by information and communications industries. Further, the industry member will in each case continue to be the principal body that will deal with the complaint. However, a Media Complaints Commission Adjudication Committee will provide a last resort for unresolved complaints.

The Committee wishes to thank all those who contributed to the inquiry.

Senator Jeannie Ferris
Chair
April 2000
Recommendations

Recommendation 1

The Committee recommends that an independent statutory body, known as the Media Complaints Commission (MCC), be established to more effectively protect the right to privacy and empower individuals in lodging a complaint against Australia’s information and communications industries.

Recommendation 2

The Committee recommends that the MCC provide a single reference point for all complaints, regardless of which information or communications industry is involved. As a one-stop-shop, the MCC will also assist individuals with the complaints process.

Recommendation 3

The Committee recommends that the MCC function as a final adjudicatory body for complaints. In this capacity, it will be able to impose sanctions in addition to those that currently exist.

Recommendation 4

The Committee recommends that, in the MCC’s annual report to the Parliament, the MCC show how it has contributed to the better and more proactive enforcement of the self-regulatory codes. It should also include comprehensive data about the complaints that it has recorded throughout the year and the way in which they have been resolved.

Recommendation 5

The Committee recommends that section 148(c)(i) of the Broadcasting Services Act 1992 be amended so that complaints about a broadcast can be addressed to the Australian Broadcasting Authority 30 days after the original complaint to the broadcasting service operator.