

2008-09

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 96

TUESDAY, 2 JUNE 2009

1 The House met, at 9 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (Mr Jenkins) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **FAIR WORK (TRANSITIONAL PROVISIONS AND CONSEQUENTIAL AMENDMENTS) BILL 2009**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Debate adjourned (Ms McKew—Parliamentary Secretary for Early Childhood Education and Childcare), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

3 **POSTPONEMENT OF ORDER OF THE DAY**

Ordered—That order of the day No. 2, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

4 **FAIRER PRIVATE HEALTH INSURANCE INCENTIVES BILL 2009**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Dutton, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “the House declines to give the bill a second reading, and calls on the Government to offset the revenue that would have resulted from the enactment of this bill and the associated bills, the Fairer Private Health Insurance Incentives (Medicare Levy Surcharge) Bill 2009 and the Fairer Private Health Insurance Incentives (Medicare Levy Surcharge—Fringe Benefits) Bill 2009, by increasing the excise on tobacco”—

Debate resumed.

Dr Jensen addressing the House—

It being 2 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 97, Dr Jensen was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

5 **QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice were asked.

6 **AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORT**

The Speaker presented the following document:

Auditor-General—Audit report No. 40 of 2008–2009—Performance audit—Planning and allocating aged care places and capital grants: Department of Health and Ageing.

Ordered to be made a Parliamentary Paper.

**7 SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS 31 AND 33, AND DEFERRED DIVISIONS**

Mr Albanese (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That for the sitting tomorrow, Wednesday, 3 June 2009:

- (1) standing order 31 (automatic adjournment of the House) and standing order 33 (limit on business after 10 p.m.) be suspended; and
- (2) from 7.30 p.m. any division on a question called for in the House, other than a motion moved by a Minister, shall stand deferred until the next sitting.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

**8 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—EDUCATION**

The House was informed that Mr Oakeshott had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The need to close the education gap for regional and rural Australia”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Oakeshott addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

The time allotted under standing order 1 having expired, the discussion was interrupted.

**9 FAIR WORK (TRANSITIONAL PROVISIONS AND CONSEQUENTIAL AMENDMENTS) BILL 2009**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—bill read a second time.

*Consideration in detail*

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

Mr Keenan, by leave, moved Opposition amendments (1) to (9) together.

Debate continued.

Question—That the amendments be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Dr Washer, in the Chair)—

AYES, 62

Mr Abbott	Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Ruddock
Mr Andrews	Mrs Gash	Ms Marino	Mr Schultz
Fran Bailey	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Markus	Mr Scott
Mr Baldwin	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Secker
Mr Billson	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Simpkins
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mr Morrison	Mr Slipper
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Briggs	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Somlyay
Mr Broadbent	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Southcott
Mr Chester	Mr Hunt	Mr Oakeshott	Dr Stone
Mr Ciobo	Mr Irons	Mr Pearce	Mr Truss
Mr Cobb	Dr Jensen	Mr Pyne	Mr Tuckey
Mr Costello	Mr Johnson*	Mr Ramsey	Mrs Vale
Mr Coulton	Mr Keenan	Mr Randall	Mr Wood
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robb	
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Robert	

## NOES, 77

Mr Adams	Mr Debus	Dr Kelly	Ms Rea
Mr Albanese	Mr Dreyfus	Mr Kerr	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mrs Elliot	Ms King	Ms Rishworth
Mr Bidgood	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Ms Bird	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Saffin
Mr Bowen	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Bradbury	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Snowdon
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr Garrett	Mr McMullan	Mr Sullivan
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr Georganas	Mr Marles	Mr Symon
Mr Butler	Ms George	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mr Byrne	Mr Gibbons	Mr Murphy	Mr C. R. Thomson
Ms Campbell	Ms Gillard	Ms Neal	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Champion	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr Trevor
Mr Cheeseman	Ms Grierson	Mr O'Connor	Mr Turnour
Mr Clare	Mr Griffin	Ms Owens	Ms Vamvakinou
Ms Collins	Mr Hale	Ms Parke	Mr Windsor
Mr Combet	Ms Hall*	Mr Perrett	Mr Zappia
Mr Crean	Mr Hayes*	Ms Plibersek	
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Price	
Mrs D'Ath	Ms Jackson	Mr Raguse	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

*Document*

Ms Gillard (Minister for Employment and Workplace Relations) presented a supplementary explanatory memorandum to the bill.

On the motion of Ms Gillard, by leave, Government amendments (1) to (110) were made together, after debate.

Bill, as amended, agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Ms Gillard, by leave, the bill was read a third time.

**10 FAIR WORK (STATE REFERRAL AND CONSEQUENTIAL AND OTHER AMENDMENTS) BILL 2009**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Question—put and passed—bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

On the motion of Ms Gillard (Minister for Employment and Workplace Relations), the bill was read a third time.

**11 FAIRER PRIVATE HEALTH INSURANCE INCENTIVES BILL 2009**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Dutton (see item No. 4, page 1085)—*

Debate resumed.

*Document*

Ms Roxon (Minister for Health and Ageing) presented a correction to the explanatory memorandum to the following bills:

Fairer Private Health Insurance Incentives 2009;

Fairer Private Health Insurance Incentives (Medicare Levy Surcharge) 2009; and

Fairer Private Health Insurance Incentives (Medicare Levy Surcharge—Fringe Benefits) 2009.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Bevis, in the Chair)—

AYES, 73

Mr Adams	Mr Dreyfus	Mr Kerr	Ms Rea
Mr Albanese	Mrs Elliot	Ms King	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bidgood	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Ms Bird	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bowen	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Ms Saffin
Mr Bradbury	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr Garrett	Mr McMullan	Mr Snowdon
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr Georganas	Mr Marles	Mr Sullivan
Mr Butler	Ms George	Mr Melham	Mr Symon
Mr Byrne	Mr Gibbons	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Champion	Ms Gillard	Ms Neal	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Grierson	Mr O'Connor	Mr Trevor
Ms Collins	Mr Hale	Ms Owens	Mr Turnour
Mr Combet	Ms Hall*	Ms Parke	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Crean	Mr Hayes*	Mr Perrett	Mr Zappia
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Ms Plibersek	
Mrs D'Ath	Ms Jackson	Mr Price	
Mr Debus	Dr Kelly	Mr Raguse	

NOES, 65

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Billson	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Dr Southcott
Mr Briggs	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Stone
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hunt	Mr Oakeshott	Mr Truss
Mr Chester	Mr Irons	Mr Pearce	Mr Tuckey
Mr Ciobo	Dr Jensen	Mr Pyne	Mr Turnbull
Mr Cobb	Mr Johnson*	Mr Ramsey	Mrs Vale
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Dr Washer
Mr Coulton	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Windsor
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr Wood
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Gash	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the bill be now read a second time—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Bevis, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 73

Mr Adams	Mr Dreyfus	Mr Kerr	Ms Rea
Mr Albanese	Mrs Elliot	Ms King	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bidgood	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Ms Bird	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bowen	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Ms Saffin
Mr Bradbury	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr Garrett	Mr McMullan	Mr Snowdon
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr Georganas	Mr Marles	Mr Sullivan
Mr Butler	Ms George	Mr Melham	Mr Symon
Mr Byrne	Mr Gibbons	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Champion	Ms Gillard	Ms Neal	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Grierson	Mr O'Connor	Mr Trevor
Ms Collins	Mr Hale	Ms Owens	Mr Turnour
Mr Combet	Ms Hall*	Ms Parke	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Crean	Mr Hayes*	Mr Perrett	Mr Zappia
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Ms Plibersek	
Mrs D'Ath	Ms Jackson	Mr Price	
Mr Debus	Dr Kelly	Mr Raguse	

## NOES, 65

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Billson	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Dr Southcott
Mr Briggs	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Stone
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hunt	Mr Oakeshott	Mr Truss
Mr Chester	Mr Irons	Mr Pearce	Mr Tuckey
Mr Ciobo	Dr Jensen	Mr Pyne	Mr Turnbull
Mr Cobb	Mr Johnson*	Mr Ramsey	Mrs Vale
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Dr Washer
Mr Coulton	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Windsor
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr Wood
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Gash	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—bill read a second time.

*Message from the Governor-General*

Message No. 192, 26 May 2009, from Her Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

Ms Roxon moved—That the bill be now read a third time.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Bevis, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 73

Mr Adams	Mr Dreyfus	Mr Kerr	Ms Rea
Mr Albanese	Mrs Elliot	Ms King	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bidgood	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Ms Bird	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bowen	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Ms Saffin
Mr Bradbury	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr Garrett	Mr McMullan	Mr Snowdon
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr Georganas	Mr Marles	Mr Sullivan
Mr Butler	Ms George	Mr Melham	Mr Symon
Mr Byrne	Mr Gibbons	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Champion	Ms Gillard	Ms Neal	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Grierson	Mr O'Connor	Mr Trevor
Ms Collins	Mr Hale	Ms Owens	Mr Turnour
Mr Combet	Ms Hall*	Ms Parke	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Crean	Mr Hayes*	Mr Perrett	Mr Zappia
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Ms Plibersek	
Mrs D'Ath	Ms Jackson	Mr Price	
Mr Debus	Dr Kelly	Mr Raguse	

## NOES, 65

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Billson	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Dr Southcott
Mr Briggs	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Stone
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hunt	Mr Oakeshott	Mr Truss
Mr Chester	Mr Irons	Mr Pearce	Mr Tuckey
Mr Ciobo	Dr Jensen	Mr Pyne	Mr Turnbull
Mr Cobb	Mr Johnson*	Mr Ramsey	Mrs Vale
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Dr Washer
Mr Coulton	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Windsor
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr Wood
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Gash	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—bill read a third time.

12 **FAIRER PRIVATE HEALTH INSURANCE INCENTIVES (MEDICARE LEVY SURCHARGE) BILL 2009**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Bevis, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 73

Mr Adams	Mr Dreyfus	Mr Kerr	Ms Rea
Mr Albanese	Mrs Elliot	Ms King	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bidgood	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Ms Bird	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bowen	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Ms Saffin
Mr Bradbury	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr Garrett	Mr McMullan	Mr Snowdon
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr Georganas	Mr Marles	Mr Sullivan
Mr Butler	Ms George	Mr Melham	Mr Symon
Mr Byrne	Mr Gibbons	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Champion	Ms Gillard	Ms Neal	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Grierson	Mr O'Connor	Mr Trevor
Ms Collins	Mr Hale	Ms Owens	Mr Turnour
Mr Combet	Ms Hall*	Ms Parke	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Crean	Mr Hayes*	Mr Perrett	Mr Zappia
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Ms Plibersek	
Mrs D'Ath	Ms Jackson	Mr Price	
Mr Debus	Dr Kelly	Mr Raguse	

## NOES, 65

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Billson	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Dr Southcott
Mr Briggs	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Stone
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hunt	Mr Oakeshott	Mr Truss
Mr Chester	Mr Irons	Mr Pearce	Mr Tuckey
Mr Ciobo	Dr Jensen	Mr Pyne	Mr Turnbull
Mr Cobb	Mr Johnson*	Mr Ramsey	Mrs Vale
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Dr Washer
Mr Coulton	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Windsor
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr Wood
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Gash	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

On the motion of Ms Roxon (Minister for Health and Ageing), the bill was read a third time.

**13 FAIRER PRIVATE HEALTH INSURANCE INCENTIVES (MEDICARE LEVY SURCHARGE—FRINGE BENEFITS) BILL 2009**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 74

Mr Adams	Mr Debus	Dr Kelly	Mr Raguse
Mr Albanese	Mr Dreyfus	Mr Kerr	Ms Rea
Mr Bevis	Mrs Elliot	Ms King	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bidgood	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Ms Bird	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bowen	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Ms Saffin
Mr Bradbury	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr Garrett	Mr McMullan	Mr Snowdon
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr Georganas	Mr Marles	Mr Sullivan
Mr Butler	Ms George	Mr Melham	Mr Symon
Mr Byrne	Mr Gibbons	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Champion	Ms Gillard	Ms Neal	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Grierson	Mr O'Connor	Mr Trevor
Ms Collins	Mr Hale	Ms Owens	Mr Turnour
Mr Combet	Ms Hall*	Ms Parke	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Crean	Mr Hayes*	Mr Perrett	Mr Zappia
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Ms Plibersek	
Mrs D'Ath	Ms Jackson	Mr Price	

## NOES, 65

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Billson	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Dr Southcott
Mr Briggs	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Stone
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hunt	Mr Oakeshott	Mr Truss
Mr Chester	Mr Irons	Mr Pearce	Mr Tuckey
Mr Ciobo	Dr Jensen	Mr Pyne	Mr Turnbull
Mr Cobb	Mr Johnson*	Mr Ramsey	Mrs Vale
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Dr Washer
Mr Coulton	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Windsor
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr Wood
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Gash	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

On the motion of Ms Roxon (Minister for Health and Ageing), the bill was read a third time.

#### 14 CARBON POLLUTION REDUCTION SCHEME BILL 2009

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr Turnbull (Leader of the Opposition) who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “the House defer consideration of the bill until the following have occurred:

- (1) the Copenhagen Climate Change Summit at the end of this year has concluded;
- (2) the Barack Obama administration in the United States has clarified its intentions in this area;



- (3) the Government has referred its Carbon Pollution Reduction Scheme (CPRS) to the Productivity Commission so that it may conduct a six-month review to:
- (a) assess the national, regional and industry sectoral impact of the CPRS in light of the global financial crisis;
  - (b) assess the economic impact of the CPRS in light of other countries either not imposing a price on carbon comparable to that proposed for Australia or imposing such a price after different assumed periods of delay; and
  - (c) conceptually and empirically examine the relative costs and benefits (including emissions reductions) of the key alternative scheme designs against the CPRS; and
- (4) the Productivity Commission's reports on these topics have been publicly released".

Debate continued.

Debate adjourned (Mr Gray—Parliamentary Secretary for Regional Development and Northern Australia), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting

## 15 ADJOURNMENT

Mr Gray (Parliamentary Secretary for Regional Development and Northern Australia) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensuing—

### *Petitions*

Mr Ciobo presented the following petitions approved by the Standing Committee on Petitions: *Montevideo Maru* [3]—913, 356 and 26 petitioners, respectively.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 11.02 p.m., adjourned until 9 a.m. tomorrow.

---

## DOCUMENTS

The following documents were deemed to have been presented on 2 June 2009:

Civil Aviation Act—

Civil Aviation Regulations—

Civil Aviation Orders—2009—

Civil Aviation Order 40.1.0 Amendment (No. 1) [F2009L01475].

Civil Aviation Order 40.3.0 Amendment (No. 1) [F2009L01471].

Exemption—2009 No. CASA EX41 [F2009L01787].

Civil Aviation Safety Regulations—Airworthiness Directives under—  
Part 39-105—

AD/A330—

No. 17—Amendment (No. 3) [F2009L01863].

No. 67—Amendment (No. 1) [F2009L01862].

AD/AA-1—

No. 3—Cancellation [F2009L01948].

No. 4—Cancellation [F2009L01947].

No. 6—Cancellation [F2009L01945].

No. 8—Cancellation [F2009L01944].

No. 12—Cancellation [F2009L01942].

No. 15—Cancellation [F2009L01940].

AD/AA-5—

No. 3—Cancellation [F2009L01939].

No. 11—Cancellation [F2009L01933].

No. 14—Cancellation [F2009L01858].

No. 15—Cancellation [F2009L01930].

No. 18—Cancellation [F2009L01929].

No. 21—Cancellation [F2009L01857].

No. 22—Cancellation [F2009L01856].

AD/B-2—  
 No. 10—Cancellation [F2009L01848].  
 No. 11—Cancellation [F2009L01847].  
 No. 24—Cancellation [F2009L01846].  
 AD/B727—No. 218 [F2009L01844].  
 AD/HU 269—No. 72—Cancellation [F2009L01963].  
 AD/HU 369—  
 No. 30—Cancellation [F2009L01887].  
 No. 40—Cancellation [F2009L01885].  
 No. 42—Cancellation [F2009L01884].  
 AD/SM-205 No. 13—Cancellation [F2009L01958].  
 AD/TSA-600 No. 25—Amendment (No. 2) [F2009L01678].  
 Part 39-106—  
 AD/AL 250—  
 No. 2—Cancellation [F2009L01928].  
 No. 3—Cancellation [F2009L01927].  
 No. 18—Cancellation [F2009L01923].  
 No. 20—Amendment (No. 1)—Cancellation [F2009L01922].  
 No. 21—Cancellation [F2009L01921].  
 No. 30—Cancellation [F2009L01962].  
 No. 31—Cancellation [F2009L01920].  
 No. 50—Amendment (No. 1)—Cancellation [F2009L01961].  
 No. 55—Amendment (No. 3)—Cancellation [F2009L01960].  
 AD/DHE—  
 No. 1—Cancellation [F2009L01910].  
 No. 4—Cancellation [F2009L01908].  
 No. 5—Cancellation [F2009L01907].  
 No. 6—Cancellation [F2009L01906].  
 No. 7—Cancellation [F2009L01905].  
 No. 8—Cancellation [F2009L01904].  
 No. 9—Cancellation [F2009L01903].  
 No. 25—Cancellation [F2009L01959].  
 Part 39-107—AD/FMS No. 3—Amendment (No. 1) [F2009L01968].  
 Sydney Airport Curfew Act—Dispensation—2009 No. 4.

---



---

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Ms A. L. Ellis, Mr Macfarlane and Mr Shorten.

---



---

**I. C. HARRIS**  
 Clerk of the House of Representatives

2008-09

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 96

**MAIN COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

TUESDAY, 2 JUNE 2009

---

---

1 The Main Committee met at 4 p.m.

**2 MEMBERS' CONSTITUENCY STATEMENTS**

Members' constituency statements were made.

**3 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 1) 2009-2010—BUDGET DEBATE**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

---

*Suspension of meeting*

At 5.31 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of meeting*

At 5.42 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---

Debate continuing—

*Document*

Mr Bidgood, by leave, presented the following document:

Federal government investment in transport infrastructure 2006-07 to 2013-14—Copy of graph from annual budget papers.

Debate continued.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**4 ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Ms Grierson, the Main Committee adjourned at 8.33 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed 9.30 a.m. tomorrow for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

---

---

**B. C. WRIGHT**  
Clerk of the Main Committee