

2008

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 26

THURSDAY, 5 JUNE 2008

1 The House met, at 9 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (Mr Jenkins) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

**2 SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS MOVED**

Mr Hockey moved—That so much of the standing orders be suspended as would prevent the Member for North Sydney from moving immediately—That the Assistant Treasurer be:

- (1) required to appear before the House at the first available opportunity and explain his misleading of the House by claiming that:
  - (a) Treasury officials did not work through the night of Wednesday, 28 May 2008 on the Fuelwatch legislation when in fact they did; and
  - (b) the Office of Parliamentary Counsel was integrally involved in the all night drafting session of the Fuelwatch legislation when they were not; and
- (2) censured for misleading this House with his statement at 2.53 p.m. yesterday which was directly contradicted by evidence provided by senior Treasury officials to the Senate later that afternoon.

*Closure of Member*

Mr Albanese (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member be no longer heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

AYES, 70

Mr Adams	Mr Dreyfus	Ms Jackson	Mr Raguse
Mr Albanese	Mrs Elliot	Dr Kelly	Ms Rea
Mr Bevis	Ms A. L. Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr Ripoll
Ms Bird	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Mr Bradbury	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Saffin
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Mr Sidebottom
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Mr Snowdon
Mr Butler	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Marles	Mr Sullivan
Mr Byrne	Mr Georganas	Mr Melham	Mr Symon
Ms Campbell	Ms George	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Champion	Mr Gibbons	Ms Neal	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Grierson	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr Trevor
Ms Collins	Mr Griffin	Ms Owens	Mr Turnour
Mr Combet	Mr Hale	Ms Parke	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby	Ms Hall*	Mr Perrett	Mr Zappia
Ms D'Ath	Mr Hayes*	Ms Plibersek	
Mr Debus	Mrs Irwin	Mr Price	

## NOES, 63

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Ms Marino	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs Markus	Mr Simpkins
Fran Bailey	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs May	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs Mirabella	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Billson	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mr Morrison	Mr Somlyay
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Dr Southcott
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Stone
Mr Ciobo	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Truss
Mr Cobb	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Mr Tuckey
Mr Costello	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Mr Turnbull
Mr Coulton	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Downer	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Dr Washer
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Mr Windsor
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	Mr Wood
Mrs Gash	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Scott	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Dutton (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member*

Mr Albanese moved—That the Member be no longer heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 71

Mr Adams	Mr Dreyfus	Ms Jackson	Mr Raguse
Mr Albanese	Mrs Elliot	Dr Kelly	Ms Rea
Mr Bevis	Ms A. L. Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr Ripoll
Ms Bird	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Mr Bradbury	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Saffin
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Mr Shorten
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Butler	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Marles	Mr Snowdon
Mr Byrne	Mr Georganas	Mr Melham	Mr Sullivan
Ms Campbell	Ms George	Mr Murphy	Mr Symon
Mr Champion	Mr Gibbons	Ms Neal	Mr Tanner
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Grierson	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Collins	Mr Griffin	Ms Owens	Mr Trevor
Mr Combet	Mr Hale	Ms Parke	Mr Turnour
Mr Danby	Ms Hall*	Mr Perrett	Ms Vamvakinou
Mrs D'Ath	Mr Hayes*	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zappia
Mr Debus	Mrs Irwin	Mr Price	

## NOES, 63

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Ms Marino	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs Markus	Mr Simpkins
Fran Bailey	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs May	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs Mirabella	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Billson	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mr Morrison	Mr Somlyay
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Dr Southcott
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Stone
Mr Ciobo	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Truss
Mr Cobb	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Mr Tuckey
Mr Costello	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Mr Turnbull
Mr Coulton	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Downer	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Dr Washer
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Mr Windsor
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	Mr Wood
Mrs Gash	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Scott	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing orders be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 62

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Ms Marino	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs Markus	Mr Simpkins
Fran Bailey	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs May	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs Mirabella	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Billson	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mr Morrison	Mr Somlyay
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Dr Southcott
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mrs Hull*	Mr Neville	Dr Stone
Mr Ciobo	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Truss
Mr Cobb	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Mr Tuckey
Mr Costello	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Mr Turnbull
Mr Coulton	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Downer	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Dr Washer
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Mr Wood
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Gash	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Scott	

## NOES, 71

Mr Adams	Mr Dreyfus	Ms Jackson	Mr Raguse
Mr Albanese	Mrs Elliot	Dr Kelly	Ms Rea
Mr Bevis	Ms A. L. Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr Ripoll
Ms Bird	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Mr Bradbury	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Ms Saffin
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Mr Shorten
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Butler	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Marles	Mr Snowden
Mr Byrne	Mr Georganas	Mr Melham	Mr Sullivan
Ms Campbell	Ms George	Mr Murphy	Mr Symon
Mr Champion	Mr Gibbons	Ms Neal	Mr Tanner
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Grierson	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Collins	Mr Griffin	Ms Owens	Mr Trevor
Mr Combet	Mr Hale	Ms Parke	Mr Turnour
Mr Danby	Ms Hall*	Mr Perrett	Ms Vamvakinou
Mrs D'Ath	Mr Hayes*	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zappia
Mr Debus	Mrs Irwin	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

### 3 FAMILIES, HOUSING, COMMUNITY SERVICES AND INDIGENOUS AFFAIRS AND OTHER LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (2008 BUDGET AND OTHER MEASURES) BILL 2008

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr Abbott who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “while not declining to give the bill a second reading, the House:

- (1) is of the opinion that the Baby Bonus should be payable at a tapered rate for incomes in excess of \$150,000, being reduced in respect of higher incomes by \$1,000 for every \$10,000 earned; and
- (2) records its concern at the Government’s decision to impose a means test on the family tax benefit”.

Debate continued.

Amendment negatived.

Question—That the bill be now read a second time—put and passed—bill read a second time.

#### *Message from the Governor-General*

Message No. 46, 28 May 2008, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the bill.

#### *Consideration in detail*

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

Mrs B. K. Bishop, by leave, moved Opposition amendments (1) and (2) together.

Debate continued.

Question—That the amendments be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Georganas, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 60

Mr Abbott	Mr Georgiou	Ms Marino	Mr Secker
Mr Andrews	Mr Haase	Mrs Markus	Mr Simpkins
Fran Bailey	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs May	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs Mirabella	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Billson	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mr Morrison	Mr Somlyay
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Dr Southcott
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mrs Hull*	Mr Pearce	Dr Stone
Mr Ciobo	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Mr Truss
Mr Cobb	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Mr Tuckey
Mr Costello	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr Turnbull
Mr Coulton	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Dutton	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Farmer	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Dr Washer
Mr Forrest	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz	Mr Windsor
Mrs Gash	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Scott	Mr Wood

## NOES, 71

Mr Adams	Mrs D' Ath	Dr Kelly	Mr Raguse
Mr Albanese	Mr Dreyfus	Mr Kerr	Ms Rea
Mr Bevis	Mrs Elliot	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bidgood	Ms A. L. Ellis	Mr McClelland	Ms Rishworth
Ms Bird	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms McKew	Ms Saffin
Mr Bowen	Dr Emerson	Ms Macklin	Mr Shorten
Mr Bradbury	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr Garrett	Mr Marles	Mr Snowdon
Mr A. S. Burke	Ms George	Mr Melham	Mr Sullivan
Mr Butler	Mr Gibbons	Mr Murphy	Mr Symon
Mr Byrne	Ms Gillard	Ms Neal	Mr Tanner
Ms Campbell	Mr Gray	Mr Neumann	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Champion	Ms Grierson	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Griffin	Ms Owens	Mr Trevor
Mr Clare	Mr Hale	Ms Parke	Mr Turnour
Ms Collins	Ms Hall*	Mr Perrett	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Combet	Mrs Irwin	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zappia
Mr Danby	Ms Jackson	Mr Price*	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

Bill agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Mr Shorten (Parliamentary Secretary for Disabilities and Children's Services), by leave, the bill was read a third time.

#### 4 NATIONAL HEALTH AMENDMENT (PHARMACEUTICAL AND OTHER BENEFITS—COST RECOVERY) BILL 2008

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—bill read a second time.

*Message from the Governor-General*

Message No. 47, 28 May 2008, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

On the motion of Mrs Elliot (Minister for Ageing), the bill was read a third time.

**5 NATIONAL HEALTH AMENDMENT (PHARMACEUTICAL BENEFITS SCHEME) BILL 2008**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—bill read a second time.

*Message from the Governor-General*

Message No. 48, 28 May 2008, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

On the motion of Mrs Elliot (Minister for Ageing), the bill was read a third time.

**6 POSTPONEMENT OF ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Ordered—That orders of the day Nos 4 and 5, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

**7 INDIGENOUS AFFAIRS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 2008**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—bill read a second time.

*Message from the Governor-General*

Message No. 49, 30 May 2008, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

On the motion of Mr Murphy (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Trade), the bill was read a third time.

**8 TAX LAWS AMENDMENT (2008 MEASURES NO. 3) BILL 2008**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr Keenan who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “while not declining to give the bill a second reading, the House records its concerns at the haste with which this bill is to be dealt with and calls for the bill to be referred to the Senate Economics Committee for review, which will allow those with practical expertise and interest in the proposals to have an input”.

Debate continued.

Amendment negatived.

Question—That the bill be now read a second time—put and passed—bill read a second time.

*Consideration in detail*

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

*Document*

Mr Bowen (Assistant Treasurer) presented a supplementary explanatory memorandum to the bill.

On the motion of Mr Bowen, by leave, Government amendments (1) to (3) were made together.

Bill, as amended, agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Mr Bowen, by leave, the bill was read a third time.

**9 NATIONAL FUELWATCH (EMPOWERING CONSUMERS) BILL 2008**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Dutton, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “the House declines to give the bill a second reading and rejects in particular the obligation that fuel prices be fixed for 24 hours”—

Debate resumed.

Debate adjourned (Mr Albanese), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

**10 WORLD ENVIRONMENT DAY—MINISTERIAL STATEMENT**

Mr Rudd (Prime Minister), by leave, made a ministerial statement relating to World Environment Day.

*Suspension of standing orders—Time for speech*

Mr Albanese, by leave, moved—That so much of the standing orders be suspended as would prevent Dr Nelson (Leader of the Opposition) speaking for a period not exceeding 20 minutes.

Question—put and passed.

Dr Nelson addressed the House.

**11 PRESENTATION OF ADDRESS IN REPLY**

The Speaker informed the House that he had ascertained that His Excellency the Governor-General would be pleased to receive the Address in Reply at Government House at 5 p.m. on Tuesday, 17 June 2008. The Speaker said he would be glad if the mover and seconder, together with other Members, would accompany him to present the Address.

**12 QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice being asked—

*Document*

Mr Bowen (Assistant Treasurer) presented the following document:

Fuelwatch—Drafting of Fuelwatch bills—Copy of Treasury Executive Minute, 5 June 2008.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Member directed to leave*

At 2.47 p.m. the Member for O'Connor (Mr Tuckey) was directed, under standing order 94, to leave the Chamber for one hour for raising a frivolous point of order, and he accordingly left the Chamber.

Questions without notice continued.

**13 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORT**

The Speaker presented the following document:

Auditor-General—Audit report No. 39 of 2007–2008—Performance audit—Managing e-business applications—Follow-up audit: Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations.

Ordered to be made a Parliamentary Paper.

**14 DOCUMENTS**

International Labour Organisation—Submission reports on ILO instruments adopted in 2006—Employment relationship recommendation (No. 198).

Promotional framework for occupational safety and health—Convention (No. 187).

Recommendation (No. 197).

**15 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—SOLAR PANEL SECTOR**

The House was informed that Mr Hunt had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The dramatic collapse in the solar panel sector as a direct consequence of the Government’s negligence”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Hunt addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

#### 16 LEAVE OF ABSENCE TO MEMBER

Mr Somlyay moved—That leave of absence from 16 June to 25 September 2008 be given to Mrs Mirabella for maternity purposes.

Question—put and passed.

#### 17 PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE—REPORT

Mr Sidebottom presented the following document:

##### PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT

The Publications Committee reports that it has met and considered documents presented to the House of Representatives since 15 May 2008.

The Committee recommends that the following be made Parliamentary Papers:

Administrative Review Council—Report No. 48—The coercive information-gathering powers of government agencies, May 2008.

Australian Maritime College—Report for 2007.

Defence Force Discipline Act—Chief Military Judge—Australian Military Court—Report for the period 1 October to 31 December 2007.

Torres Strait Protected Zone Joint Authority—Report for 2005-06.

Wreck Bay Aboriginal Community Council—Report for 2006-07.

CHRIS HAYES

Chair

5 June 2008

On the motion of Mr Sidebottom, by leave, the report was agreed to.

#### 18 NATIONAL FUELWATCH (EMPOWERING CONSUMERS) BILL 2008

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Dutton (see item No. 9, page 359)—*

Debate resumed.

Mr Gibbons addressing the House—

*Adjournment negatived*

It being 4.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Mr McMullan (Parliamentary Secretary for International Development Assistance) requiring the question to be put immediately without debate—

Question—put and negatived.

Debate continued.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—



## AYES, 75

Mr Adams	Mr Debus	Mrs Irwin	Mr Raguse
Mr Albanese	Mr Dreyfus	Ms Jackson	Ms Rea
Mr Bevis	Mrs Elliot	Mr Katter	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bidgood	Ms A. L. Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Rishworth
Ms Bird	Ms K. M. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Mr Bowen	Dr Emerson	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Bradbury	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms McKew	Ms Saffin
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Mr Shorten
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Butler	Mr Garrett	Mr Marles	Mr Snowden
Mr Byrne	Mr Georganas	Mr Melham	Mr Sullivan
Ms Campbell	Ms George	Mr Murphy	Mr Symon
Mr Champion	Mr Gibbons	Mr Neumann	Mr Tanner
Mr Cheeseman	Ms Gillard	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Clare	Mr Gray	Ms Owens	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Collins	Ms Grierson	Ms Parke	Mr Trevor
Mr Combet	Mr Griffin	Mr Perrett	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby	Mr Hale	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zappia
Ms D'Ath	Ms Hall*	Mr Price*	

## NOES, 52

Mr Andrews	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull*	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Somlyay
Mr Coulton	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Dr Southcott
Mr Downer	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Dr Stone
Mr Dutton	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr Truss
Mr Farmer	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Tuckey
Mr Forrest	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mrs Gash	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Georgiou	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Schultz	Dr Washer
Mr Haase	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	Mr Wood

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the bill be now read a second time—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 74

Mr Adams	Mr Debus	Mrs Irwin	Ms Rea
Mr Albanese	Mr Dreyfus	Ms Jackson	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mrs Elliot	Mr Katter	Ms Rishworth
Mr Bidgood	Ms A. L. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Ms Bird	Ms K. M. Ellis	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Bowen	Dr Emerson	Ms McKew	Ms Saffin
Mr Bradbury	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Mr Shorten
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Marles	Mr Snowden
Mr Butler	Mr Garrett	Mr Melham	Mr Sullivan
Mr Byrne	Mr Georganas	Mr Murphy	Mr Symon
Ms Campbell	Ms George	Mr Neumann	Mr Tanner
Mr Champion	Mr Gibbons	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Cheeseman	Ms Gillard	Ms Owens	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Clare	Mr Gray	Ms Parke	Mr Trevor
Ms Collins	Ms Grierson	Mr Perrett	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Combet	Mr Griffin	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zappia
Mr Danby	Mr Hale	Mr Price*	
Mrs D'Ath	Ms Hall*	Mr Raguse	

## NOES, 52

Mr Andrews	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull*	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Somlyay
Mr Coulton	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Dr Southcott
Mr Downer	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Dr Stone
Mr Dutton	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr Truss
Mr Farmer	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Tuckey
Mr Forrest	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mrs Gash	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Georgiou	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Schultz	Dr Washer
Mr Haase	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	Mr Wood

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

Mr Bowen (Minister for Competition Policy and Consumer Affairs) moved—That the bill be now read a third time.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 72

Mr Adams	Mrs D' Ath	Mr Hale	Mr Price*
Mr Albanese	Mr Debus	Ms Hall*	Mr Raguse
Mr Bevis	Mr Dreyfus	Mrs Irwin	Ms Rea
Mr Bidgood	Mrs Elliot	Ms Jackson	Mr Ripoll
Ms Bird	Ms A. L. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Mr Bowen	Ms K. M. Ellis	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bradbury	Dr Emerson	Ms McKew	Mr Rudd
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Ms Saffin
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McMullan	Mr Shorten
Mr Butler	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Marles	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Byrne	Mr Garrett	Mr Melham	Mr Sullivan
Ms Campbell	Mr Georganas	Mr Murphy	Mr Symon
Mr Champion	Ms George	Mr Neumann	Mr Tanner
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gibbons	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Gillard	Ms Owens	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Collins	Mr Gray	Ms Parke	Mr Trevor
Mr Combet	Ms Grierson	Mr Perrett	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby	Mr Griffin	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zappia

## NOES, 52

Mr Andrews	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull*	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Somlyay
Mr Coulton	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Dr Southcott
Mr Downer	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Dr Stone
Mr Dutton	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr Truss
Mr Farmer	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Tuckey
Mr Forrest	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mrs Gash	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Georgiou	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Schultz	Dr Washer
Mr Haase	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	Mr Wood

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—bill read a third time.

# 19 NATIONAL FUELWATCH (EMPOWERING CONSUMERS) (CONSEQUENTIAL AMENDMENTS) BILL 2008

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the bill be now read a second time—

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 72

Mr Adams	Mrs D' Ath	Mr Hale	Mr Price*
Mr Albanese	Mr Debus	Ms Hall*	Mr Raguse
Mr Bevis	Mr Dreyfus	Mrs Irwin	Ms Rea
Mr Bidgood	Mrs Elliot	Ms Jackson	Mr Ripoll
Ms Bird	Ms A. L. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Mr Bowen	Ms K. M. Ellis	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bradbury	Dr Emerson	Ms McKew	Mr Rudd
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Ms Saffin
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McMullan	Mr Shorten
Mr Butler	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Marles	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Byrne	Mr Garrett	Mr Melham	Mr Sullivan
Ms Campbell	Mr Georganas	Mr Murphy	Mr Symon
Mr Champion	Ms George	Mr Neumann	Mr Tanner
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gibbons	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Gillard	Ms Owens	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Collins	Mr Gray	Ms Parke	Mr Trevor
Mr Combet	Ms Grierson	Mr Perrett	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby	Mr Griffin	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zappia

## NOES, 52

Mr Andrews	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull*	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Somlyay
Mr Coulton	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Dr Southcott
Mr Downer	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Dr Stone
Mr Dutton	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr Truss
Mr Farmer	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Tuckey
Mr Forrest	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mrs Gash	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Georgiou	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Schultz	Dr Washer
Mr Haase	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	Mr Wood

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved immediately.

Mr Bowen (Minister for Competition Policy and Consumer Affairs) moved—That the bill be now read a third time.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 72

Mr Adams	Mrs D' Ath	Mr Hale	Mr Price*
Mr Albanese	Mr Debus	Ms Hall*	Mr Raguse
Mr Bevis	Mr Dreyfus	Mrs Irwin	Ms Rea
Mr Bidgood	Mrs Elliot	Ms Jackson	Mr Ripoll
Ms Bird	Ms A. L. Ellis	Ms Livermore	Ms Rishworth
Mr Bowen	Ms K. M. Ellis	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bradbury	Dr Emerson	Ms McKew	Mr Rudd
Ms A. E. Burke	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Ms Saffin
Mr A. S. Burke	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McMullan	Mr Shorten
Mr Butler	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Marles	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Byrne	Mr Garrett	Mr Melham	Mr Sullivan
Ms Campbell	Mr Georganas	Mr Murphy	Mr Symon
Mr Champion	Ms George	Mr Neumann	Mr Tanner
Mr Cheeseman	Mr Gibbons	Mr B. P. J. O'Connor	Mr C. R. Thomson
Mr Clare	Ms Gillard	Ms Owens	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Collins	Mr Gray	Ms Parke	Mr Trevor
Mr Combet	Ms Grierson	Mr Perrett	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby	Mr Griffin	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zappia

## NOES, 52

Mr Andrews	Mr Hartsuyker	Mrs Markus	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr A. G. Hawke	Mrs May	Mr Simpkins
Mr Baldwin	Mr D. P. M. Hawker	Mrs Mirabella	Mr Slipper
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull*	Mr Morrison	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Somlyay
Mr Coulton	Mr Irons	Mr Pyne	Dr Southcott
Mr Downer	Dr Jensen	Mr Ramsey	Dr Stone
Mr Dutton	Mr Johnson*	Mr Randall	Mr Truss
Mr Farmer	Mr Keenan	Mr Robb	Mr Tuckey
Mr Forrest	Mr Laming	Mr Robert	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mrs Gash	Ms Ley	Mr Ruddock	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Georgiou	Mr Macfarlane	Mr Schultz	Dr Washer
Mr Haase	Ms Marino	Mr Scott	Mr Wood

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—bill read a third time.

20 **ADJOURNMENT**

Mr McMullan (Parliamentary Secretary for International Development Assistance) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 5.53 p.m., adjourned until 12 noon on Monday, 16 June 2008.

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Broadbent, Mr Crean, Ms King\*, Mrs Moylan, Mr S. F. Smith and Mr Swan.

\* On leave

**I. C. HARRIS**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives

2008

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 26

**MAIN COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

THURSDAY, 5 JUNE 2008

---

1 The Main Committee met at 9.30 a.m.

2 **MEMBERS' STATEMENTS**

Members' statements were made.

3 **APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 1) 2008-2009**

The order of the day having been read for the consideration in detail of the bill—

*Consideration in detail*

Schedule—

Ordered—That the proposed expenditure for the services in Schedule 1 be considered in the following order:

Education, Employment and Workplace Relations Portfolio;  
 Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs Portfolio;  
 Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts Portfolio;  
 Health and Ageing Portfolio;  
 Defence Portfolio;  
 Foreign Affairs and Trade Portfolio;  
 Resources, Energy and Tourism Portfolio;  
 Infrastructure, Transport, Regional Development and Local Government Portfolio;  
 Broadband, Communications and the Digital Economy Portfolio;  
 Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry Portfolio;  
 Human Services Portfolio;  
 Immigration and Citizenship Portfolio;  
 Attorney-General's Portfolio;  
 Innovation, Industry, Science and Research Portfolio;  
 Finance and Deregulation Portfolio;  
 Treasury Portfolio; and  
 Prime Minister and Cabinet Portfolio.

Proposed expenditures—

Education, Employment and Workplace Relations Portfolio, \$6,831,870,000—debated—

---

*Suspension of meeting*

At 10.46 a.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of meeting*

At 11 a.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---

Debate continued.

Proposed expenditure agreed to.

Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs Portfolio, \$3,270,142,000—debated and agreed to.

Environment, Water, Heritage and the Arts Portfolio, \$2,710,381,000—debated.

Debate adjourned and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**4 ADJOURNMENT**

Ms Grierson moved—That the Main Committee do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

At 1.03 p.m., the Deputy Speaker adjourned the Main Committee until 4 p.m. on Monday, 16 June 2008.

---

---

**B. C. WRIGHT**

Clerk of the Main Committee