

2002

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 19

TUESDAY, 28 MAY 2002

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

**2 MINISTERIAL ARRANGEMENTS**

Mr Howard (Prime Minister) informed the House that, during the absence abroad of Mr M. A. J. Vaile (Minister for Trade), Mr Downer (Minister for Foreign Affairs) would answer questions on his behalf.

**3 QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice being asked—

*Paper*

Mr Hockey (Minister for Small Business and Tourism) presented the following paper:

List of legislation by State and Territory relating to insurance.

*Papers*

Mr Latham, by leave, presented the following papers:

GIO privatisation—

Questions and Answers—Extract from New South Wales Legislative Assembly Estimates Committees, October and November 1992.

Selection of advertising agency—Paper by Joe Hockey, Policy Adviser, Convenor—GIO Privatisation Communications Committee, 19 December 1991.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Paper*

Mr Tanner, by leave, presented the following paper:

Telstra Corporation—Paper by GICS Integrated Telecommunication Services, 26 April 2002.

Questions without notice continuing—

Mr Adams asking a question—

*Speaker's ruling*

The Speaker ruled that the question was out of order.

*Dissent from ruling moved*

Mr Swan moved—That the ruling be dissented from.

*Member named and suspended*

The Speaker named the Member for Batman (Mr M. J. Ferguson) for continuing to interject after having been warned by the Chair.

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member for Batman be suspended from the service of the House.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 77

Mr Abbott	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr Anderson	Mrs Draper	Mr Katter	Mr Ruddock
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Dutton	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mrs Elson	Dr Kemp	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr Entsch	Mr P. E. King	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mr Farmer	Mrs Ley	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Baldwin	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lindsay	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gallus	Mr Lloyd	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Ms Gambaro	Mr McArthur*	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Ticehurst
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mr McGauran	Mr Tollner
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Mrs Moylan	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Nairn	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cameron	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Dr Washer
Mr Causley	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Mr Howard	Ms Panopoulos	Ms Worth
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	
Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne	

## NOES, 63

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford
Mr Byrne	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Corcoran	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe
Mr Cox	Ms Hall	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Crean	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mrs Crosio	Ms Hoare	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowden
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick*	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

The Member was, therefore, suspended at 3.36 p.m. for 24 hours under standing order 305, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Debate ensued on the motion of dissent.

Question—That the Speaker's ruling be dissented from—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 63

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Mr Andren	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowden
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby*	Ms Jackson	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilkie
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Price	Mr Windsor
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Quick*	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Ripoll	

## NOES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Dr Washer
Mr Ciobo	Mr Howard	Ms Panopoulos	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Ms Worth

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

Questions without notice concluded.

#### 4 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORTS

The Speaker presented the following papers:

Auditor-General—Audit reports of 2001-2002—

No. 51—Performance audit—Research project management—Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO).

No. 52—Financial control and administration audit—Internal budgeting.

Severally ordered to be printed.

**5 PAPERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPERS**

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) presented the following papers:

Australian Radiation Protection and Nuclear Safety Agency—Quarterly reports of the Chief Executive Officer for periods—

1 July to 30 September 2001.

1 October to 31 December 2001.

Department of Health and Ageing—Private health insurance—Report on premium increases for quarter commencing 1 January 2002.

Natural Heritage Trust—Report for 2000-01—

and moved—That the House take note of the papers.

Debate adjourned (Mr Swan), and the resumption of each debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**6 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—PUBLIC LIABILITY INSURANCE**

The House was informed that Mr Latham had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The failure of the Government to come up with a coherent strategy to respond to the crisis in public liability insurance”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Latham rising to address the House—

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Dr Nelson	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Ms Panopoulos	Mr Williams
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	

## NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Andren	Ms George	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby*	Ms Jackson	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms Plibersek	Mr Windsor
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Quick*	
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Ripoll	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

**7 SPEAKER'S RULING—DISSENT FROM RULING MOVED***Question to Speaker*

Mr Swan asked the Speaker about the deletion of certain words from Hansard.

*Speaker's ruling*

The Speaker stated that he had ruled that the words be deleted.

*Dissent from ruling moved*

Mr Swan moved—That the ruling be dissented from.

*Closure of Member*

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Dr Nelson	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Ms Panopoulos	Mr Williams
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	

## NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby*	Ms Jackson	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Windsor
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Quick*	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Latham (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member*

Mr Abbott moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Dr Nelson	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Ms Panopoulos	Mr Williams
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	

## NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby*	Ms Jackson	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Windsor
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Quick*	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr McClelland rising to address the House—

*Closure*

Mr Abbott moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Dr Nelson	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Ms Panopoulos	Mr Williams
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	

## NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Ms George	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby*	Ms Jackson	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Windsor
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Quick*	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the ruling be dissented from—being accordingly put—  
The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 60

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick*
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Byrne	Ms Grierson	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford
Ms Corcoran	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Cox	Ms Hall	Dr Martin	Mr Sercombe
Mr Crean	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mrs Crosio	Ms Hoare	Mr Mossfield	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	Mr Zahra



## NOES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Dr Nelson	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Ms Panopoulos	Mr Williams
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

## 8 SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS MOVED

Mr Swan moved—That so much of the standing orders be suspended as would prevent the Member for Lilley from moving forthwith the following motion:

1. the unprecedented decision of the Speaker to expunge the Hansard record without reference to precedents of the House;
2. his continuing application of standing orders in favour of the Government exemplified today in Question Time by refusing to rule the Minister for Employment and Workplace Relations out of order, rather, extending to him latitude denied to the Opposition to ask a relevant and in order question to the Deputy Prime Minister and Leader of the National Party; and
3. the abuse of House procedures in gagging a dissent motion to protect the Speaker from scrutiny over his rulings in the House.

### *Closure of Member*

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Dr Nelson	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Ms Panopoulos	Dr Washer
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Ms Worth

## NOES, 59

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick*
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Byrne	Ms Grierson	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford
Ms Corcoran	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Cox	Ms Hall	Dr Martin	Mr Sercombe
Mr Crean	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mrs Crosio	Ms Hoare	Mr Mossfield	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr S. F. Smith (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member*

Mr Abbott moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Dr Nelson	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Ms Panopoulos	Dr Washer
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Ms Worth

## NOES, 59

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick*
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Byrne	Ms Grierson	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford
Ms Corcoran	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Cox	Ms Hall	Dr Martin	Mr Sercombe
Mr Crean	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mrs Crosio	Ms Hoare	Mr Mossfield	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing orders be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 59

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick*
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Byrne	Ms Grierson	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford
Ms Corcoran	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Mr Cox	Ms Hall	Dr Martin	Mr Sercombe
Mr Crean	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mrs Crosio	Ms Hoare	Mr Mossfield	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	

## NOES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Dr Nelson	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Ms Panopoulos	Dr Washer
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Mr Pearce	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Ms Worth

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

**9 SELECTION COMMITTEE—REPORT**

Mr Causley (Chair) presented the following paper:

Selection Committee—Report relating to the consideration of committee and delegation reports and private Members' business on Monday, 3 June 2002.

**10 PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE—FIRST REPORT**

Mr Randall (Chair) presented the following paper:

**PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE 1ST REPORT**

The Publications Committee reports that, having considered documents presented to the House of Representatives since 25 September 2001, it recommends that the following be printed:

Australian National Residue Survey Program—Report for 2000-01.

Department of the Environment and Heritage—Report—Australia—State of the environment 2001, December 2001.

Department of the House of Representatives—Report for 2000-2001.

Finance—Budget 2002-03—

Australia's overseas aid program 2002-03.

Growing stronger: Agriculture, fisheries and forestry 2002-03.

Indigenous affairs 2002-03.

Putting Australia's interests first: Honouring our commitments 2002-03.

Regional Australia: A partnership for stronger regions 2002-03.

Towards a sustainable Australia: Commonwealth environment expenditure 2002-03.

Women's budget statement 2002-03.

Higher Education—Report for the 2002 to 2004 triennium.

Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission—Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Social Justice Commissioner—

Native title report for 2001.

Social Justice Report 2001.

National Crime Authority—Report for 2000-01.

Native Title Act—Native title representative bodies—Aboriginal Legal Rights Movement Inc.—Report for 2000-01.

Productivity Commission—Reports—

No. 18—Review of the Superannuation Industry (Supervision) Act 1993 and certain other superannuation legislation, 10 December 2001.

No. 19—Price regulation of airport services, 23 January 2002.

Protection of Movable Cultural Heritage Act—Report on the Act and National Cultural Heritage Account for 2000-01.

Screenrights—Report for 2000-01.

Telecommunications (Interception) Act—Report for 2000-2001.

DON RANDALL

Chair

28 May 2002

On the motion of Mr Randall, by leave, the report was agreed to.

#### 11 MAIN COMMITTEE—DAY OF NEXT MEETING

The Speaker reported that the Deputy Speaker had fixed Wednesday, 29 May 2002, at 9.40 a.m., for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

#### 12 MATTERS REFERRED TO MAIN COMMITTEE

Mr Lloyd (Chief Government Whip), by leave, moved—That:

(1) the following Bills be referred to the Main Committee for further consideration:

International Tax Agreements Amendment (No. 1) 2002;

Bankruptcy Legislation Amendment 2002;

Bankruptcy (Estate Charges) Amendment 2002;

Customs Tariff Amendment (No. 1) 2002; and

(2) the following order of the day be referred to the Main Committee for debate:

East Timor—Ministerial statement—Motion to take note of paper: Resumption of debate.

Question—put and passed.

#### 13 SPACE ACTIVITIES AMENDMENT BILL 2002

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Emerson, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the bill a second reading, the House:

(1) noting that the issue of insurance is a central part of the Government's proposal, expresses concerns about the Government's priorities in offering \$3 billion of insurance cover for space

launching when school fetes, country shows and sporting associations are struggling to meet the exorbitant cost of public liability insurance; and

- (2) notes that the Government has been able to find \$100 million to support the Asia Pacific Space Centre while freezing the R&D Start Program”—

Debate resumed.

Amendment negatived.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

*Message from the Governor-General*

Message No. 26, 15 February 2002, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the Bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Entsch (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Industry, Tourism and Resources), the Bill was read a third time.

**14 TAXATION LAWS AMENDMENT (MEDICARE LEVY AND MEDICARE LEVY SURCHARGE) BILL 2002**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr S. F. Smith who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words:

“the House, recognising that the provisions of this equitable measure will appropriately exempt some individuals, couples and sole parents from the levy and surcharge in line with movements in the consumer price index, supports the bill but:

- (1) notes that the Government’s overall approach to Medicare has seen the regrettable position where General Practitioner bulk billing usage has declined to only 74%;
- (2) notes that the average extra cost to a patient for a non bulk billing GP visit is now \$12;
- (3) notes that those who can afford private health insurance have been subject recently to substantial increases in premiums, on average \$150 extra per year;
- (4) notes that pensioners and concession card holders and those families under financial pressures will suffer further as a result of the Government’s latest budget measures, in particular the proposed 30% increase in payments for essential medicines; and
- (5) calls on the Government to recognise the Australian community’s belief in and support of bulk billing and Medicare and to accept that the Government must match that community commitment in its health policies”.

Debate continued.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Barresi, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne
Mr Anderson	Mrs Draper	Mr Katter	Mr Randall
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Dutton	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anthony	Mrs Elson	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mr Entsch	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mr Farmer	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baldwin	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr C. P. Thompson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mr McGauran	Mr Ticehurst
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mrs May	Mr Tollner
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Ciobo	Mrs Hull	Ms Panopoulos	Dr Washer
Mr Cobb	Mr Hunt	Mr Pearce	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mr Johnson	Mr Prosser	Ms Worth

## NOES, 58

Mr Adams	Ms George	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mrs Crosio	Ms Hoare	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick*	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), the Bill was read a third time.

#### 15 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 1) 2002-2003—BUDGET DEBATE

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Ms Macklin (Deputy Leader of the Opposition) addressing the House—

#### 16 ADJOURNMENT

It being 10.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

The House continuing to sit until 11 p.m.—The Speaker adjourned the House until tomorrow at 9.30 a.m.

---

---

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Albanese, Ms Burke\*, Jackie Kelly\*, Mr Schultz, Dr Stone and Mr M. A. J. Vaile.

\* On leave

---

---

**I. C. HARRIS**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives