

1998-1999-2000

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 145

THURSDAY, 12 OCTOBER 2000



1 The House met, at 9.30 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW TRIBUNAL (CONSEQUENTIAL AND TRANSITIONAL PROVISIONS) BILL 2000**

Mr Williams (Attorney-General), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to repeal or amend certain Acts as a consequence of the enactment of the *Administrative Review Tribunal Act 2000*, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Williams moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper*

Mr Williams presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Swan), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

3 **TAXATION LAWS AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 8) 2000**

Mr Hockey (Minister for Financial Services and Regulation) presented a Bill for an Act to amend the law relating to taxation, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Hockey moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper*

Mr Hockey presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Swan), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

4 **INTERNATIONAL MONETARY AGREEMENTS AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 1) 2000**

Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *International Monetary Agreements Act 1947*, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Slipper moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper*

Mr Slipper presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Swan), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

#### 5 CHILD SUPPORT LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 2000

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

It being 2 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 101A, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

#### 6 MINISTERIAL ARRANGEMENTS

Mr Howard (Prime Minister) informed the House that, during his absence abroad, Mr Anderson (Deputy Prime Minister) would be Acting Prime Minister.

#### 7 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice being asked—

*Member ordered to withdraw*

At 2.38 p.m. the Member for Dobell (Mr Lee) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a warning had been given from the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Questions without notice continued.

---

*Motion of censure of the Prime Minister*

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition), by leave, moved—That this House censures the Prime Minister for:

- (1) allowing double standards to be applied in the lenient treatment afforded to his Ministers as against the strict treatment meted out to members of the public;
- (2) planning to cover up the Reith Telecard scandal prior to its public disclosure by the media and the Opposition; and
- (3) not standing Mr Reith aside as soon as he was informed of the Telecard scandal.

Debate ensued.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 61

Mr Adams	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Mr Andren	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Smith
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Dr Martin	Mr Snowdon
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr Wilkie
Mr Edwards	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr Zahra
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	
Mr Emerson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	
Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick	

## NOES, 73

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Ms Worth
Mr Downer	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	
Mrs Draper	Jackie Kelly	Mr Ruddock	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lawler	Mr St Clair	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Anderson	Ms O'Byrne
Mr M. A. J. Vaile	Mr Hollis

And so it was negatived.

Questions without notice concluded.

## **8 PAPERS**

The following papers were presented:

Australian Statistics Advisory Council—Report for 1999–2000.

Australian Tourist Commission—Report for 1999–2000.

Bureau of Meteorology—Report for 1999–2000.

Department of the Environment and Heritage—Report, including the Report of the Supervising Scientist, for 1999–2000.

National Occupational Health and Safety Commission—Report for 1999–2000.

Professional Services Review—Report for 1999–2000.

## **9 PAPER—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER**

Mr McGauran (Acting Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following paper:

National Occupational Health and Safety Commission—Report for 1999–2000.

Debate adjourned (Dr Martin), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

## **10 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—MINISTERIAL CONDUCT**

The House was informed that Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The double standards exhibited by the Government caused by the erosion of the guidelines on Ministerial Conduct”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Beazley rising to address the House—

Mr McGauran (Acting Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put and passed.

## **11 PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE—20TH REPORT**

Mr Lieberman (Chair) presented the following paper:

### **PUBLICATIONS COMMITTEE 20TH REPORT**

The Publications Committee reports that it has met in conference with the Publications Committee of the Senate.

The Committee, having considered documents presented to Parliament since 7 September 2000, recommends that the following be printed:

Aboriginal Hostels Limited—Report for 1999–2000.

Aboriginal Land Commissioner—  
Report for 1999–2000.

Report and recommendations to the Minister for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs and to the Administrator of the Northern Territory—No. 58—  
Barrow Creek (Kaytetye) Land Claim No. 161.

Aboriginals Benefit Account—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Broadcasting Authority—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Bureau of Statistics—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Communications Authority—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Customs Service—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Federal Police—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Film Commission—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Film, Television and Radio School—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Maritime Safety Authority—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian National Maritime Museum—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Postal Corporation (Australia Post)—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian Safeguards and Non-Proliferation Office—Report for 1999–2000.  
Australian War Memorial—Report for 1999–2000.  
Commonwealth Grants Commission—Report for 1999–2000.  
Crimes Act—Controlled operations—Report for 1999–2000.  
Department of Communications, Information Technology and the Arts—Report for 1999–2000.  
Department of Family and Community Services—Report for 1999–2000.  
Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet—Report for 1999–2000.  
Department of Transport and Regional Services—Report for 1999–2000.  
Department of Veterans' Affairs—Data-matching program—Report for 1999–2000.  
Film Australia Limited—Report for 1999–2000.  
Health Insurance Commission—Report for 1999–2000.  
Indigenous Land Corporation—Report for 1999–2000.  
National Gallery of Australia—Report for 1999–2000.  
National Industrial Chemicals Notification and Assessment Scheme—Report for 1999–2000.  
National Library of Australia—Report for 1999–2000.  
National Museum of Australia—Report for 1999–2000.  
Northern Territory Fisheries Joint Authority—Report for 1998–99.  
Private Health Insurance Administration Council—Report for 1999–2000.  
Protection of Movable Cultural Heritage Act—Report on the Act and National Cultural Heritage Fund—1999–2000.  
Public Lending Right Committee—Report for 1999–2000.  
Repatriation Medical Authority—Report for 1999–2000.  
Royal Australian Mint—Report for 1999–2000.  
Special Broadcasting Service Corporation (SBS)—Report for 1999–2000.  
Telstra Corporation Limited—Report for 1999–2000.  
Torres Strait Regional Authority—Report for 1999–2000.  
Witness Protection Act—Reports on the operation of the Act—1999–2000.

LOU LIEBERMAN

Chair

12 October 2000

On the motion of Mr Lieberman, by leave, the report was agreed to.

**12 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE**

A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill without amendment:

12 October 2000—Message No. 465—Commonwealth Electoral Legislation (Provision of Information) 2000.

**13 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—COMMONWEALTH ELECTORAL AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 1) 2000**

Message No. 464, 12 October 2000, from the Senate was reported returning the Commonwealth Electoral Amendment Bill (No. 1) 2000 with amendments.

Ordered—That the amendments be considered forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), the amendments were agreed to, after debate.

**14 CHILD SUPPORT LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Mr Anthony (Minister for Community Services) addressing the House—

---

It being 5.30 p.m. the debate was interrupted.

**15 PRIVILEGE—INTIMIDATION OF COMMITTEE WITNESS—REFERENCE TO COMMITTEE OF PRIVILEGES**

The Speaker referred to a matter of privilege raised by Mr Wakelin (Chair, Standing Committee on Family and Community Services) on Thursday, 7 September 2000 concerning the alleged intimidation of a prospective witness before the Committee and the possibility that misleading evidence had been given. In light of the Committee's finding that it had not been able to reconcile different accounts in respect of the possible intimidation of a witness and its conclusion that that matter should be pursued, the Speaker stated that he was willing to allow precedence to a motion on the matter.

Mr Wakelin then moved—That the following matter be referred to the Committee of Privileges for inquiry and report: Whether Mr Peter Osborne was subject to threat or intimidation in connection with his involvement in the inquiry in the last Parliament by the Standing Committee on Family and Community Affairs into health information management and telemedicine.

Question—put and passed.

**16 ADJOURNMENT**

It being past 5.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Mr McMullan addressing the House—

*Closure*

Mr McGauran (Acting Leader of the House) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 70

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Dr Kemp	Mr St Clair
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Entsch	Mr Lawler	Mr Schultz
Mr Anthony	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Moore	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Nehl	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Howard	Dr Nelson	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Ms Worth
Mr Downer	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	
Mr Draper	Jackie Kelly	Mr Ruddock	

## NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Dr Martin	Mr Smith
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Snowden
Mr Cox	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Edwards	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	
Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Anderson	Ms O'Byrne
Mr M. A. J. Vaile	Mr Hollis

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the House do now adjourn—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 70

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Dr Kemp	Mr St Clair
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Entsch	Mr Lawler	Mr Schultz
Mr Anthony	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr McGauran	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs May	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Moore	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Nehl	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Howard	Dr Nelson	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs Hull	Mr Neville	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Nugent	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Ms Worth
Mr Downer	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	
Mrs Draper	Jackie Kelly	Mr Ruddock	

NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Dr Martin	Mr Smith
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cox	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner
Mr Danby	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Edwards	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	
Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Anderson	Ms O'Byrne
Mr M. A. J. Vaile	Mr Hollis



And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And then the House, at 5.47 p.m., adjourned until Monday, 30 October 2000, at 12.30 p.m.

---

---

**PAPERS**

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 12 October 2000:

Broadcasting Services Act—Regional Equalisation Plan, 22 September 2000.

Civil Aviation Act—Civil Aviation Regulations—Airworthiness Directives—Part 39-105 2000 5, 6 October.

Corporations Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2000 No. 282.

Migration Act—Certificate under section 502, 9 October 2000.

Parliamentary Entitlements Act—Advice of decisions under paragraph 18(a), 9 October 2000.

Taxation Administration Act—  
Determination—2000 No. TD 46.

Rulings—

1999 No. TR 19.

2000 Nos PR 106, PR 107.

*Telecommunications Act 1997—*

Declaration—2000 Telecommunications (Types of Cabling) Amendment (No. 1).

Rules—2000 Telecommunications Cabling Provider.

Television Licence Fees Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 2000 No. 277.

---

---

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Anderson, Mrs Crosio, Ms Gerick, Mr Hollis\*, Ms O’Byrne, Mr Reith, Mr Sciacca, Dr Theophanous, Mr M. A. J. Vaile and Dr Wooldridge.

\* On leave

---

---

**I. C. HARRIS**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives

1998-1999-2000

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 145

**MAIN COMMITTEE****MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

THURSDAY, 12 OCTOBER 2000

---

1 The Main Committee met at 9.40 a.m.

2 **MEMBERS' STATEMENTS**

Members' statements were made.

3 **STANDING COMMITTEE ON COMMUNICATIONS, TRANSPORT AND THE ARTS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the motion of Mr Neville—That the House take note of the paper (*presented on 9 October 2000*), viz.:

Communications, Transport and the Arts—Standing Committee—Report—Beyond the Midnight Oil: An Inquiry into managing fatigue in transport—Final report, October 2000—

Debate resumed.

Mr Neville, by leave, addressed the Main Committee without closing the debate.

Debate adjourned (Mrs Elson), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

4 **ADJOURNMENT**

Mrs Elson moved—That the Main Committee do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

At 12.44 p.m. the Deputy Speaker adjourned the Main Committee.

---

**B. C. WRIGHT**  
Clerk of the Main Committee