

1996

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 35

TUESDAY, 8 OCTOBER 1996

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Bob Halverson) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 MINISTERIAL ARRANGEMENTS

Mr Howard (Prime Minister) informed the House that, during the absence of Mr Ruddock (Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs), Dr Wooldridge (Minister for Health and Family Services) would answer questions on his behalf.

Mr Howard also informed the House that, during the absence of Mr McLachlan (Minister for Defence), Mrs Bishop (Minister for Defence Industry, Science and Personnel) would answer questions on his behalf.

3 SUPPLEMENTARY QUESTIONS—STATEMENT BY SPEAKER

The Speaker made a statement relating to supplementary questions.

4 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice being asked—

Suspension of standing and sessional orders moved

Mr G. J. Evans (Deputy Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Deputy Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith—That this House censures the Treasurer for the embarrassment he caused Dr Alan Greenspan, Chairman of the Federal Reserve Board, United States of America, by disclosing the contents of a confidential conversation on a highly sensitive matter; for the damage he has caused thereby to Australia's international reputation and credibility with senior decision makers; and for his subsequent persistent and deliberate attempts to mislead the public as to what he had done, in clear breach of his duty under the Prime Minister's Code of Ministerial Conduct.

Closure of Member: Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Halverson, in the Chair)—

AYES, 91

Mr Abbott	Mr Downer	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ronaldson
Mr Anderson	Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Mr Andren	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Sharp
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sinclair
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Fahey	Mr McArthur*	Mr A. C. Smith
Mrs Bailey	Mr Filing	Mr McDougall	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gallus	Mr Marek	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Ms Gambaro	Mr Miles	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mrs Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Taylor
Mr Bradford	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Mutch	Mr Truss
Mr Broadbent	Ms Hanson	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr R. A. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Campbell	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mrs West
Mr Causley	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Ms Jeanes	Mr Pyne	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Cobb	Mrs Johnston	Mr Randall	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mr Jull	Mr Reith	Mr Zammit
Mr Dondas	Mr Katter	Mr Rocher	

NOES, 42

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lee	Mr Price
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McClelland	Mr Quick
Mr Beazley	Mr Griffin	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beddall	Mr Hatton	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Bevis	Mr Holding	Mr McMullan	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Langmore	Mr Mossfield	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr O'Connor	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Crean (seconder) addressing the House—

Closure of Member: Mr Fischer (Minister for Trade) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put and passed.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—put and negatived.

Questions without notice continued.

5 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORTS—PUBLICATION OF PAPERS

The Speaker presented the following papers:

Audit Act—Auditor-General—Audit reports of 1996-97—Performance audits—

No. 8—Drug evaluation by the Therapeutic Goods Administration: Department of Health and Family Services.

No. 9—Building better cities: Department of Transport and Regional Development.

Mr Reith (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That:

(1) this House authorises the publication of the Auditor-General's audit reports Nos. 8 and 9 of 1996-97; and

(2) the reports be printed.

Question—put and passed.

6 PAPERS

The following papers were presented:

Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Heritage Protection Act—Review by the Hon. Elizabeth Evatt, AC.

Australian Science and Technology Council Act—

Australian Science and Technology Council—Report for 1995-96.

Australian Science, Technology and Engineering Council—Report—Australian maritime industries: Priorities in science and technology.

Department of Defence—Special purpose flights—Schedule for period 1 January to 30 June 1996.

Economic Planning Advisory Commission Act—Economic Planning Advisory Commission—Report for 1995-96.

Equal Employment Opportunity (Commonwealth Authorities) Act—Equal employment opportunity program—Australian Film, Television and Radio School—Report for 1995-96.

Immigration Review Tribunal—Report for 1995-96.

Industry Commission Act—Industry Commission—Report No. 49—Packaging and labelling.

Law Reform Commission Act—Australian Law Reform Commission—Report No. 80—Legal risk in international transactions.

Treaty—Multilateral with national interest analysis—Agreement for the Establishment of the Indian Ocean Tuna Commission, done at Rome on 25 November 1993.

7 PAPERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPERS

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following papers:

Australian Science and Technology Council Act—Australian Science, Technology and Engineering Council—Report—Australian maritime industries: Priorities in science and technology.

Department of Defence—Special purpose flights—Schedule for period 1 January to 30 June 1996.

Debate adjourned (Mr Crean), and the resumption of each debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

8 RELATIONS BETWEEN THE CIVIL AVIATION AUTHORITY AND SEAVIEW AIR—COMMISSION OF INQUIRY—MINISTERIAL STATEMENT AND REPORT—PUBLICATION OF PAPER—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER

Mr Sharp (Minister for Transport and Regional Development), by leave, made a ministerial statement relating to the report of the Commission of Inquiry into the relations between the Civil Aviation Authority and Seaview Air and presented the following paper:

Relations between the Civil Aviation Authority and Seaview Air—Commission of Inquiry—Report, September 1996—Volumes 1 and 2.

Mr Sharp, by leave, moved—That this House authorises the publication of the report of the Commission of Inquiry into the relations between the Civil Aviation Authority and Seaview Air—Volumes 1 and 2.

Question—put and passed.

Mr Tanner, by leave, also made a statement in relation to the matter.

Mr Sharp moved—That the House take note of the paper.

Debate adjourned (Mr Bevis), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

9 TREASURER—MOTION OF CENSURE

Mr G. J. Evans (Deputy Leader of the Opposition), by leave, moved—That this House censures the Treasurer for the embarrassment he caused Dr Alan Greenspan, Chairman of the Federal Reserve Board, United States of America, by disclosing the contents of a confidential conversation on a highly sensitive matter; for the damage he has caused thereby to Australia's international reputation and credibility with senior decision makers; and for his subsequent persistent and deliberate attempts to mislead the public as to what he had done, in clear breach of his duty under the Prime Minister's Code of Ministerial Conduct.

Debate ensued.

Mr Latham rising to address the House—

Closure: Mr Abbott (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Truss, in the Chair)—

AYES, 84

Mr Abbott	Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sharp
Mr Anthony	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sinclair
Mrs Bailey	Mr Fahey	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Mr Fischer	Mr McDougall	Mr A. C. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr Bartlett	Ms Gambaro	Mr Marek	Mr Somlyay
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mr Miles	Dr Southcott
Mrs Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bradford	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Broadbent	Ms Hanson	Mr Mutch	Mr Taylor
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr R. A. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Dr Nelson	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Howard	Mr Nugent	Mrs West
Mr Cobb	Ms Jeanes	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs Johnston	Mr Pyne	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Dondas	Mr Jull	Mr Randall	Ms Worth
Mr Downer	Mr Katter	Mr Reith	Mr Zammit

NOES, 43

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lee	Mr Price
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McClelland	Mr Quick
Mr Beazley	Mr Griffin	Ms Macklin	Mr Rocher
Mr Beddall	Mr Hatton	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr Holding	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tanner
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Langmore	Mr Mossfield	Mr Wilton
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr O'Connor	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Truss, in the Chair)—

AYES, 42

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lee	Mr Price
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McClelland	Mr Quick
Mr Beazley	Mr Griffin	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beddall	Mr Hatton	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Bevis	Mr Holding	Mr McMullan	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Langmore	Mr Mossfield	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr O'Connor	

NOES, 85

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sharp
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sinclair
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Fahey	Mr McDougall	Mr A. C. Smith
Mrs Bailey	Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Mrs Gallus	Mr Marek	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mr Miles	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Sullivan
Mrs Bishop	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Mutch	Mr Taylor
Mr Bradford	Ms Hanson	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr R. A. Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mrs West
Mr Causley	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Ms Jeanes	Mr Pyne	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Cobb	Mrs Johnston	Mr Randall	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mr Jull	Mr Reith	Mr Zammit
Mr Dondas	Mr Katter	Mr Rocher	
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr Scott	

* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

10 AUSTRALIAN CAPITAL TERRITORY—LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY— RESOLUTION—EUTHANASIA LAWS BILL 1996

The Deputy Speaker informed the House that the Speaker had received the following resolution passed by the Legislative Assembly for the Australian Capital Territory on 25 September 1996—

“That this Assembly endorses the findings of the Senate Standing Committee for the Scrutiny of Bills in relation to the Euthanasia Laws Bill 1996”.

**11 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—
DISCLOSURE OF FINANCIAL INFORMATION**

The House was informed that Mr G. J. Evans (Deputy Leader of the Opposition) had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The damage caused to Australia’s international reputation and credibility with key decision-makers by the Treasurer’s disclosure of sensitive financial information”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr G. J. Evans rising to address the House—

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put and passed.

**12 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—PRIVATE MEMBERS’
BUSINESS**

Mr Reith (Leader of the House), pursuant to notice, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the following arrangements applying in relation to the Euthanasia Laws Bill 1996 unless the House otherwise orders:

- (1) order of the day No. 15, private Members’ business, namely the motion for the second reading of the Bill, being called on immediately prior to grievance debate on Monday, 28 October 1996, and debate continuing for 1 hour and 30 minutes; the mover of the motion for the second reading of the Bill and the next 5 Members speaking each speaking for a period not exceeding 15 minutes and the debate then being adjourned;
- (2) at the conclusion of the proceedings on the Bill in the House on Monday, 28 October 1996, the Bill being referred to the Main Committee for the remainder of the second reading stage up to but not including the putting of any questions at the conclusion of the debate;
- (3) in speaking to the motion for the second reading of the Bill in the Main Committee each Member speaking for a period not exceeding 10 minutes;
- (4) during consideration of the Bill in the Main Committee the quorum of the Committee being three Members comprising the occupant of the Chair and two other Members; and
- (5) the Main Committee continuing debate on the Bill regardless of any unresolved questions.

Mr S. F Smith having raised as a point of order that any change proposed by paragraph (5) of the motion should be done by amendment of the standing and sessional orders, not by suspension of standing orders—

Deputy Speaker’s ruling: The Deputy Speaker (Mr Truss) ruled that it was a matter for determination by the House which could suspend standing and sessional orders.

Dissent from ruling moved: Mr S. F. Smith moved—That the ruling be dissented from.

Debate ensued.

Mr Kerr rising to address the House—

Closure: Mr Reith moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Truss, in the Chair)—

AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sinclair
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr McDougall	Mr A. C. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr W. L. Smith
Mrs Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr Marek	Mr Somlyay
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Mrs Gash	Mr Miles	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Mutch	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Taylor
Mrs Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Bradford	Mr Hicks*	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr Brough	Ms Jeanes	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cadman	Mrs Johnston	Mr Prosser	Mrs West
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Randall	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Cobb	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith	Ms Worth
Mr Dondas	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Zammit

NOES, 41

Mr Adams	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Rocher
Mr Andren	Mr Filing	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Beazley	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McMullan	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Beddall	Mr Griffin	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mr Bevis	Mr Hatton	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Campbell	Mr Hollis	Mr Mossfield	Mr Wilton
Mr Crean	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Connor	
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Price	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the ruling be dissented from—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Truss, in the Chair)—

AYES, 37

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Macklin	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe
Mr Beazley	Mr Griffin	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Beddall	Mr Hutton	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tanner
Mr Bevis	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Crean	Mr Kerr	Mr Mossfield	Mr Wilton
Ms Ellis	Mr Latham	Mr O'Connor	
Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Price	

NOES, 80

Mr Abbott	Mr Dondas	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ronaldson
Mr Anderson	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr Andren	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sinclair
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr McDougall	Mr A. C. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Filing	Mr McGauran	Mr W. L. Smith
Mrs Bailey	Mrs Gallus	Mr Marek	Mr Somlyay
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Ms Gambaro	Mr Miles	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mr Mutch	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Nairn	Mr Taylor
Mrs Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Bradford	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hicks*	Mr Neville	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cadman	Ms Jeanes	Mr Prosser	Mrs West
Mr Campbell	Mrs Johnston	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Randall	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Dr Kemp	Mr Rocher	Mr Zammit

* Tellers

And so it was negated.

Debate on the original question continued.

Closure: Mr McGauran (Minister for Science and Technology) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Mossfield, in the Chair)—

AYES, 77

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Slipper
Mr Anderson	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McArthur*	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Fahey	Mr McDougall	Mr Somlyay
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Dr Southcott
Mr Anthony	Mrs Gallus	Mr Marek	Mrs Stone
Mrs Bailey	Ms Gambaro	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mr Taylor
Mr Barresi	Mr Georgiou	Mr Mutch	Mr Truss
Mr Bartlett	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Billson	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mrs Bishop	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr Bradford	Mr Hicks*	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mrs West
Mr Brough	Ms Jeanes	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Cadman	Mrs Johnston	Mr Pyne	Dr Woodridge
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Randall	Ms Worth
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Zammit
Mr Cobb	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	
Mr Dondas	Mr Lieberman	Mr Scott	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sinclair	

NOES, 40

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr Filing	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price
Mr Andren	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Quick
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr E. L. Grace*	Ms Macklin	Mr Rocher
Mr Beddall	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr Hatton	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe
Mr Crean	Mr Holding	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Ms Ellis	Mr Hollis	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tanner
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Jenkins	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilton

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—
The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Mossfield, in the Chair)—

AYES, 77

Mr Abbott	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Slipper
Mr Anderson	Mr Fahey	Mr McArthur*	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Fischer	Mr McDougall	Mr Somlyay
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Southcott
Mr Anthony	Ms Gambaro	Mr Marek	Mrs Stone
Mrs Bailey	Mrs Gash	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Taylor
Mr Barresi	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Mutch	Mr Truss
Mr Bartlett	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Billson	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mrs Bishop	Mr Hicks*	Dr Nelson	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Brough	Ms Jeanes	Mr Nugent	Mrs West
Mr Cadman	Mrs Johnston	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Zammit
Mr Dondas	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Scott	
Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sinclair	

NOES, 41

Mr Adams	Mr Filing	Mr McClelland	Mr Rocher
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Andren	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr A. C. Smith
Mr Beddall	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Bevis	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Price	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

13 SELECTION COMMITTEE—REPORT

Mr Nehl (Chair) presented the following paper:

Selection Committee—Report relating to the consideration of committee and delegation reports and private Members' business on Monday, 14 October 1996.

14 INCOME TAX RATES AMENDMENT (FAMILY TAX INITIATIVE) BILL 1996

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr G. J. Evans (Deputy Leader of the Opposition), viz.—That*

all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House:

- (1) notes that only a limited proportion of family types receive the full benefits of the so-called Family Tax Initiative;
- (2) expresses its concerns that other Budget measures leave the average Australian family substantially worse off;
- (3) notes with concern that the Government is only returning to PAYE taxpayers a small proportion of bracket creep/fiscal drag revenue collections via this Bill; and
- (4) expresses its concern that this and other Budget-related measures have established very high Effective Marginal Tax Rates for non-working parents returning to the workforce”—

Debate resumed.

15 ADJOURNMENT

It being 10.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 10.59 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 9.30 a.m.

PAPERS

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 8 October 1996:

Admiralty Act—Rules—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 215.

Aged or Disabled Persons Care Act—Aged or Disabled Persons Care (Standards Review Panels) Order 1996 No. 1.

Agricultural and Veterinary Chemicals Code Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 216.

Air Navigation Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 209.

Australian Wool Research and Promotion Organisation Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 217.

Child Care Act—Guidelines No. CCA/12A/96/2.

Christmas Island Act—

Casino Control Ordinance—Reappointment of members of Casino Surveillance Authority, 16 September 1996.

Ordinance 1996 No. 7.

Civil Aviation Act—Civil Aviation Regulations—Civil Aviation Orders—

- Exemptions 1996 Nos. 174/FRS/186/1996, 175/FRS/187/1996, 176/FRS/188/1996, 177/FRS/189/1996, 178/FRS/190/1996, 179/FRS/191/1996, 180/FRS/192/1996, 181/FRS/193/1996.
- Instruments Nos. CASA 990/96, CASA 991/96.
- Part 105—Amendments 9(3), 11(3), 13(3), 16(2), 18, 19, 20(2) September 1996.
- Part 107—Amendments 13(2), 16(2) September 1996.
- Corporations Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 Nos. 205, 218.
- Currency Act—Determinations 1996 Nos. 3, 4.
- Customs Act—Instruments of approval 1996 Nos. 2, 3, 4, 5.
- Defence Act—
- Defence Force Remuneration Tribunal—Determination 1996 No. 19.
- Determinations under section 58B 1996 Nos. 27, 28, 29, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36.
- Evidence Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 202.
- Export Control Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 Nos. 206, 207.
- Family Law Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 201.
- Housing Assistance Act—
- Determinations Nos. HAA 1/96, HAA 2/96.
- Housing Assistance (Form of Agreement) Determination No. 1.
- Lands Acquisition Act—Statement under section 40.
- Life Insurance Act—Insurance and Superannuation Commissioner—Rules under section 252 Nos. 21, 22, 23, 24.
- Migration Act—Policy directions 1996 Nos. 1, 2.
- National Health Act—Determinations Nos. PHI14/1996, 1996-97/ACC1.
- Navigation Act—Marine orders 1996 Nos. 1, 2.
- Ozone Protection Act—Exemptions (2) under section 40, 2 September 1996.
- Passports Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 210.
- Proceeds of Crime Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 203.
- Public Service Act—Determinations 1996 Nos. 154, 160, 162, 163, 165, 166, 167, 168, 169, 170, 171, 172, 173, 174, 175, 177, 178, 179, 180, 182, 183, 184, 185, 186, 187, 189, 190, 192, 193, LES 21, LES 26, LES 28, LES 29.
- Radiocommunications Act—
- Radiocommunications (Low Interference Potential Devices) Class Licence No. 1 of 1993 (Variation No. 1).
- Radiocommunications Class Licence (Radio-controlled Models).
- Superannuation Act 1976—*
- Determination under section 238 No. 13.
- Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 204.
- Superannuation Guarantee (Administration) Act—Determination 1996 No. SGD 96/2.
- Sydney Airport Curfew Act—Dispensation No. 4/96.

Taxation Administration Act—

Determinations 1996 Nos. TD 96/37, TD 96/38, TD 96/39, TD 96/40, TD 96/41.

Rulings 1996 Nos. TR 92/12, TR 96/24.

Telecommunications Act 1991—

Determinations of technical standards 1996 Nos. TS 027, TS 029.

Notices 1996 Nos. TN5, TN 6.

Therapeutic Goods Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1996 No. 208.

Veterans' Entitlements Act—Instruments under section 196B 1996 Nos. 122, 123, 124, 125, 126, 127, 128, 129, 130, 131, 132, 133, 134, 135, 136, 137, 138, 139, 140, 141, 142, 143, 144, 145, 146, 147, 148, 149, 150, 151, 152.

ATTENDANCE

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Brereton, Mr Brown, Mr E. H. Cameron, Mrs Crosio, Mr Forrest, Mr Jones, Mr McLachlan, Mr Reid, Mr Ruddock, Dr Theophanous, Mr A. P. Thomson and Mr Willis.

L. M. BARLIN

Clerk of the House of Representatives

1996

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES
SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 35

MAIN COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

TUESDAY, 8 OCTOBER 1996

1 The Main Committee met at 4.32 p.m.

Suspension of sitting: At 4.32 p.m., the Deputy Speaker left the Chair due to the lack of a quorum.

Resumption of sitting: At 4.40 p.m., the Deputy Speaker resumed the Chair, and a quorum being present—

2 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 1) 1996-97—BUDGET DEBATE

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr G. J. Evans (Deputy Leader of the Opposition), viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House notes that:

- (1) the Budget betrays the Australian promise of working towards a more fair, just, inclusive and united society;
- (2) the Budget is both mindless and heartless, and its prescriptions are not what the Australian economy needs at present;
- (3) the Budget will have a savagely contractionary impact on economic growth and make impossible the job creation necessary to reduce Australia’s still unacceptably high level of unemployment;
- (4) with stronger economic growth the Budget could be restored to underlying balance over the life of this Parliament through a much more moderate program of fiscal consolidation;
- (5) the spending cuts and tax increases contained in the Budget are, on the evidence of the Government’s own Budget Papers, not necessary to reduce

- the Commonwealth Government's debt-to-GDP ratio and will not produce a significant improvement in the current account deficit;
- (6) the Budget not only offers no hope to the unemployed but actively harms their prospects of finding a job by cutting labour market programs and privatising the previously publicly provided employment service function of the CES;
 - (7) the Budget will have unfair and unjust consequences for the struggling and disadvantaged in our midst—the poor, the old, the sick, indigenous Australians and newly-arrived migrants;
 - (8) the many spending cuts concerned with education and training, research and development, trade development (including breaches of promise with respect to EMDG, ITES and IAMP), production bounties, and other business support, will be counter-productive in their longer term consequences;
 - (9) there is deception involved in the family tax package contained in the Budget, whereby what the Prime Minister appears to be putting into one pocket is for most middle Australian families being taken right out of the other by the Treasurer in higher education fees, Austudy changes, higher nursing home charges, higher fees and charges;
 - (10) there are many breaches of Coalition election promises contained in this Budget, which amount to over \$17 billion over four years, and which will cause hardship, insecurity and dismay for millions of Australians;
 - (11) the Budget involves a massive betrayal of regional Australia through the abolition of the \$150 million regional development program, large cuts to road funding, the closure of regional Government offices such as Medicare and CES offices, and the cuts to the ABC and university funding;
 - (12) the mean-spirited decision to introduce large, up-front entry fees and massively increased daily fees for nursing homes, and increase user-charges will harm elderly Australians;
 - (13) the abolition of Childcare Operational Subsidies will impact heavily upon community based child care centres;
 - (14) the reduction of \$800 million over four years in public hospital funding will cause longer waiting lists for the sick and reduce the quality of hospital and medical assistance for millions of people;
 - (15) the Budget involves a breaking of the Government's so called 'core' commitment to maintain Medicare in its entirety through cuts to rebates for numerous items under Medicare;
 - (16) the cruel decision to abolish the Commonwealth Dental Health Programme will cause serious problems for the less well off;
 - (17) harsh and promise-breaking decisions will force Australian families to pay substantially more for the cost of their prescription medicines;

- (18) the massive funding cuts to education, the increased HECS charges and AUSTUDY changes will penalise the less well-off;
- (19) the Budget's comprehensive and ideological assault on the public sector will cost 10 500 jobs in 1996-97 alone;
- (20) the Government has failed to honour its election commitment to maintain the environment budget and to provide an additional \$84 million in the 1996-97 Budget, instead cutting by 13 per cent the environmental budget and forward estimates;
- (21) the reckless decision to reduce funding for the National Highway by \$622 million over four years, breaches a clear Coalition election commitment at the 1996 election, and with other decisions will reduce the level of public infrastructure investment, especially in regional Australia;
- (22) the decision to impose a 500 per cent increase in the taxation arrangements for visits to the Great Barrier Reef will discourage tourism and cost jobs in Queensland;
- (23) the Government has failed to honour its promise to not cut Australia's foreign aid beyond the election commitment to abolish the DIFF program, and in doing so will allow the estimated ODA/GDP ratio for Australia in 1996-97 to fall to 0.29 per cent;
- (24) the Government has failed to honour its election promise that Defence expenditure would not be cut, whilst cutting \$165 million from the 1995 Defence Budget estimates for 1996-97, and reducing Defence expenditure as a percentage of GDP to its lowest level since 1939;
- (25) the mean-spirited and discriminatory approach to migrants and ethnic communities will harm outworkers, hurt newly-arrived migrants and refugees, cut humanitarian aid and penalise asylum seekers;
- (26) the substantial cuts to ATSIC and to indigenous-related Commonwealth programs represent a massive setback to the process of reconciliation in Australia;
- (27) the savage cuts to the ABC, of \$209 million over four years, are in complete breach of the Coalition's solemn election promise to maintain existing levels of Commonwealth funding to the ABC;
- (28) the Budget has failed to honour the promise to maintain levels of arts funding and spend an additional \$60 million over three years; and
- (29) the Government's plan to substantially increase Commonwealth court and tribunal fees, coupled with deep cuts to legal aid, will result in a severe curtailment of access to justice by many Australians"—

Debate resumed.

Suspension of sitting: At 5.30 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

Resumption of sitting: At 5.55 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

Debate continued.

Suspension of sitting: At 8.13 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

Resumption of sitting: At 8.38 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

Debate continued.

Suspension of sitting: At 9.05 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

Resumption of sitting: At 9.30 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

Debate continued.

Mr Hicks was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

3 ADJOURNMENT

On the motion of Mr Sawford, the Main Committee adjourned at 10.01 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 10 a.m., for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

I. C. HARRIS
Clerk of the Main Committee