

1993-94

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 99

MONDAY, 17 OCTOBER 1994

1 The House met, at 12.30 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Stephen Martin) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 AUSTRALIAN PARLIAMENTARY DELEGATION—REPORTS—STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

The Speaker presented the following report:

Australian Parliamentary Delegation to Japan and the Republic of Korea, July 1994: A time of change, a time of opportunity—Report, September 1994.

Mr McGauran presented the following report:

Visit to Taiwan by members of the Australian Parliament, July 1994: Australia-Taiwan bilateral relations—Report, September 1994.

The Speaker, Mr McGauran, Mr Ferguson and Mr Hawker made statements in connection with the reports.

3 MUNICIPAL LIBRARIES

Mr Latham, pursuant to notice, moved—That this House declares its support for:

- (1) federal funding of municipal libraries to promote quality, equity and access to those services in areas of greatest need; and
- (2) developing Australia's network of 1400 municipal libraries as public access points on the so-called information superhighway.

Debate ensued.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting Monday.

4 ECOTERRORISM

Mr Nehl, pursuant to notice, moved—That this House condemns any acts of ecoterrorism in Australia, particularly those directed at the forest industries, with consequent danger to the lives of workers, and detrimental effects on families, small business and the community at large.

Debate ensued.

The time allotted for the debate having expired, the debate was interrupted and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting Monday.

5 NRMA—PROPOSED PUBLIC LISTING

Mr Brown, pursuant to notice, moved—That this House:

- (1) expresses its deep concern about the proposal by the NRMA motorist organisation in New South Wales to seek the public listing and float of that body because:
 - (a) it will convert a service driven mutual organisation into a profit driven private organisation with serious disadvantages for its 1.8 million members;
 - (b) the present benefits to members of a subsidised road service and untaxed rebates on their insurance premiums will be replaced by a road service geared to profit and by dividends on shares which will be taxed;
 - (c) the alleged financial gain to members in the form of cash or shares will be offset within a few years by the loss of the subsidised road service and the loss of rebates on insurance premiums;
 - (d) members will become liable for capital gains tax on part of the share issue as well as any further appreciated value of the shares if they choose to sell them in future;
 - (e) thousands of pensioners will become subject to the assets test on the level of their pensions for the first time;
 - (f) the change will remove the control of the NRMA from its 1.8 million members and facilitate the transfer of ownership and control to large institutional investors including foreign investors;
 - (g) the NRMA is using millions of dollars which belong to its members to promote the “yes” case of this proposal by misrepresenting the alleged benefits to them;
 - (h) the NRMA has failed to present a balanced case, including a “no” case, which would enable members to assess more objectively the alleged merits of the proposal despite the NRMA claim that it welcomes wide public debate on the issue; and
 - (i) this proposal simply represents an attempt by the ruling clique of the NRMA to entrench and consolidate its control of the organisation and to exclude people like the MAG group from becoming directors of the organisation;
- (2) therefore calls on the Government to provide no assistance to the NRMA to facilitate the destruction of this mutual organisation;
- (3) welcomes the intervention of the Trade Practices Commission which has identified the misleading nature of the NRMA’s promotional advertising and directed it to correct it;
- (4) calls on the Australian Securities Commission to investigate the operation of the NRMA in regard to this issue and especially the possible misuse of proxy vote arrangements at the 1993 Annual General Meeting; and
- (5) calls on the NRMA to suspend this attempt to float the organisation until elections are held for a new Board under the provisions of the pre-1993 Articles of Association.

Debate ensued.

It being 2.45 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 104A, the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting Monday, and Mr Knott was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed.

6 MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

Members' statements being made—

Paper: Mr Brown, by leave, presented the following paper:

NRMA—Fraser & Talbot v. NRMA Holdings Limited, NRMA Limited & NRMA Insurance Limited—Copy of facsimile from Carol Berliner, Gadens Ridgeway to Mr D. G. Mackay, President, NRMA Limited, 17 October 1994.

Members' statements continued.

7 MINISTERIAL ARRANGEMENTS

Mr Keating (Prime Minister) informed the House that, during the absence of Mr Willis (Treasurer), Mr Beazley (Minister for Finance) would answer questions on behalf of Mr Willis.

Mr Keating also informed the House that, during the absence of Mr Howe (Minister for Housing and Regional Development), Mr Baldwin (Minister for Social Security) would answer questions on behalf of Mr Howe today and Mr Beazley would answer questions on behalf of Mr Howe on Thursday.

8 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice being asked—

Papers: Mr Brereton (Minister for Transport) presented the following papers:

Civil Aviation Authority—Copies of letters from—

Mr Brereton to Mr D. J. Roser, Chief Executive and Managing Director, Civil Aviation Authority, 14 October 1994.

Mr D. J. Roser to Mr Brereton, 16 October 1994.

Questions without notice continued.

9 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED

Mr Sharp moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the honourable Member for Hume from moving forthwith—That the House requires the Minister for Transport to explain why he has failed in his responsibilities by:

- (1) allowing the Chief Executive Officer of the Civil Aviation Authority to continue in his job despite being proven to have misled the public about aviation safety;
- (2) publicly announcing that Seaview Air was in good and safe order when it was not and had to be grounded shortly after;
- (3) allowing Seaview Air to continue to operate in a de facto manner, flying a regular public transport service with their aircraft and passengers; and
- (4) making a complete mess of the privatisation of ANL.

Closure of Member: Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Martin, in the Chair) —

AYES, 70

Mr Adams	Mrs Easson	Mrs Kelly	Mr Punch
Mr Baldwin	Mr Elliott	Mr Kerr	Mr Quick
Mr Beazley	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Knott	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beddall	Mr Ferguson	Mr Langmore	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Latham	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Brereton	Mr Gear	Dr Lawrence	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Brown	Mr Gibson	Mr Lee	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Campbell	Mr Gorman	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Griffin	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleeland	Mr Griffiths	Mr McLeay	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mr Haviland	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Ms Henzell	Mr A. A. Morris	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cunningham	Mr Holding	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Tickner
Ms Deahm	Mr Hollis	Mr Newell	Mr Walker
Mr Dodd	Mr Horne*	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods
Mr Duffy	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr Duncan	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

NOES, 55

Mr Abbott	Mr Filing	Mr McArthur	Mr B. C. Scott
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sinclair
Mr Atkinson	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mr Slipper
Mrs Bishop	Mr Hall	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bradford	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Neville	Mr Truss
Mr Charles	Mr Hicks*	Mr Nugent	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Vaile
Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Dobie	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr R.D.C. Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Howard (seconder) addressing the House—

Closure of Member: Mr Beazley moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Martin, in the Chair) —

AYES, 70

Mr Adams	Mrs Easson	Mrs Kelly	Mr Punch
Mr Baldwin	Mr Elliott	Mr Kerr	Mr Quick
Mr Beazley	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Knott	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beddall	Mr Ferguson	Mr Langmore	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Latham	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Breerton	Mr Gear	Dr Lawrence	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Brown	Mr Gibson	Mr Lee	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Campbell	Mr Gorman	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Griffin	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleeland	Mr Griffiths	Mr McLeay	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mr Haviland	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Ms Henzell	Mr A. A. Morris	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cunningham	Mr Holding	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Tickner
Ms Deahm	Mr Hollis	Mr Newell	Mr Walker
Mr Dodd	Mr Horne*	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods
Mr Duffy	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr Duncan	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

NOES, 55

Mr Abbott	Mr Filing	Mr McArthur	Mr B. C. Scott
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sinclair
Mr Atkinson	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mr Slipper
Mrs Bishop	Mr Hall	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bradford	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Neville	Mr Truss
Mr Charles	Mr Hicks*	Mr Nugent	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Vaile
Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Dobie	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr R.D.C.Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Closure: Mr Beazley moved—That the question be now put.

Question—put and passed.

And the question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Martin, in the Chair)—

AYES, 55

Mr Abbott	Mr Filing	Mr McArthur	Mr B. C. Scott
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Forrest	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sinclair
Mr Atkinson	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mr Slipper
Mrs Bishop	Mr Hall	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bradford	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Neville	Mr Truss
Mr Charles	Mr Hicks*	Mr Nugent	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Vaile
Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Dobie	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr R.D.C.Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock	

NOES, 68

Mr Adams	Mr Duncan	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Baldwin	Mrs Easson	Mr Johns	Mr Price
Mr Beazley	Mr Elliott	Mrs Kelly	Mr Punch
Mr Beddall	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr Quick
Mr Bevis	Mr Ferguson	Mr Knott	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bilney	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Langmore	Mr Sciacca
Mr Breton	Mr Free	Mr Latham	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Campbell	Mr Gibson	Dr Lawrence	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Gorman	Mr Lee	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Cleeland	Mr Griffin	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr Crean	Mr Griffiths	Mr McLeay	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mr Haviland	Mr Melham	Mr Swan
Mr Cunningham	Ms Henzell	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tanner
Ms Deahm	Mr Holding	Mr P. F. Morris	Dr Theophanus
Mr Dodd	Mr Hollis	Mr Newell	Mr Walker
Mr Duffy	Mr Horne*	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods

* Tellers

And so it was negated.

10 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—GRIEVANCE DEBATE

Mr Beazley (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent Grievance debate concluding at 5.30 p.m. this day.

Question—put and passed.

11 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE

A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill without amendment:

13 October 1994—Message No. 341—Drought Relief Payment 1994.

12 PETITIONS: The Clerk announced that the following Members had each lodged petitions for presentation, viz.:

Mrs Bishop, Mr Cameron, Mr Duncan, Mr Sinclair and Ms Worth, from 1360, 15, 151, 96 and 163 petitioners, respectively, praying that funding for breast cancer research be increased tenfold in the Budget and initiatives to encourage donations for research be considered.

Mrs Bishop and Mr Filing, from 48 and 252 petitioners, respectively, in similar terms.

Mr Forrest, Mr Jenkins, Mr Newell and Mrs Sullivan, from 8, 16, 16 and 13 petitioners, respectively, praying that Anzac Day be declared Australia's National Day of Commemoration and that it be held on 25 April each year and on no other day.

Ms Deahm and Mr Somlyay, from 309 and 10 petitioners, respectively, in similar terms.

Mr Anderson and Mr Fischer, from 91 and 9 petitioners, respectively, praying that certain action be taken to establish by referendum whether the Constitution should be amended to ensure parliamentary scrutiny of all international treaties, conventions and agreements before they come into force in Australia.

Mr Cameron, from 1310 residents of Western Australia, praying that action be taken to stop the practice in China of extracting bile from caged bears for medical purposes.

Mr Cameron, from 356 residents of Western Australia, praying that greater restrictions be introduced on the export of dogs to Asia.

Mr Cameron, from 319 petitioners, praying that Mr Li Shi Ping and Miss Liu Xiu Ling be granted refugee status and released from custody.

Mr Downer, from 205 petitioners, praying that Australia remain a democratic constitutional monarchy with the Queen as head of state, represented in Australia by a Governor-General.

Mr Lloyd, from 113 petitioners, in similar terms.

Mr Ferguson, from 1000 residents of South Australia and 807 residents of Western Australia, respectively, praying that the *Australian Citizenship Act 1948* be amended to provide for dual citizenship.

Mr Filing, from 15 petitioners, praying that certain action be taken in response to the shipment of plutonium from France to Japan.

Mr Filing, from 12 petitioners, praying that the ABC continue its current programming of news and current affairs in Western Australia.

Mr Jenkins, from 8 members of the North East Melbourne Division of General Practice, praying that the full amount of the Medicare rebate fee increase be implemented in the November 1994 funding.

Mr Jull, from 10 petitioners, praying that no action be taken to change the national flag unless approved by the people of Australia in a national poll.

Mr Kerr, from 2773 petitioners, praying that the House pass legislation that will prevail over and invalidate sections 122 a&c and 123 of the Tasmanian criminal code.

Mr Mack, from 60 petitioners, praying that certain measures be taken that would prevent members of parliament, retired members and top bureaucrats from plundering the public purse.

Mr Newell, from 15 petitioners, praying that women remain eligible for the age pension from the age of 60.

Mr Somlyay, from 1168 petitioners, praying for certain changes to the Family Law Act and the Child Support Scheme.

Mr Tanner, from 8000 petitioners, praying that the proposed Crib Point crude oil terminal in Western Port Bay, Vic., be subject to a full independent inquiry and that national uniform legislation be developed for crude oil spills in Australian waters.

Petitions received.

13 GRIEVANCE DEBATE

Pursuant to the provisions of standing order 106, the order of the day having been read—

Question proposed—That grievances be noted.

Debate ensued.

It being 5.30 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with the resolution agreed to this day.

Question—That grievances be noted—put and passed.

14 CARRIAGE OF GOODS BY SEA ACT—PART 3 AND SCHEDULE 2

Mr Snowdon (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Employment, Education and Training), for Mr Brereton (Minister for Transport), pursuant to notice, moved—That:

- (1) in accordance with paragraph 2(3)(b) of the *Carriage of Goods by Sea Act 1991* the question of the repeal of Part 3 and Schedule 2 of the Act be reconsidered after a further period of 3 years and no later than 31 October 1997; and
- (2) a message be sent to the Senate acquainting it of this resolution and requesting it take similar action.

Question—put and passed.

15 SOCIAL SECURITY (1994 BUDGET AND WHITE PAPER) AMENDMENT BILL 1994

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Ruddock, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not opposing the provisions of the Bill, the House is of the opinion that the Government should be condemned for—

- (1) its policies which have created record levels of unemployment;
- (2) its inability to address the associated social inequity and hardship which has resulted; and
- (3) its failure to solve the ongoing unemployment crisis, in particular, the problem of long-term unemployment”—

Debate resumed.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Truss, in the Chair)—

AYES, 67

Mr Adams	Mr Duncan	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Baldwin	Mrs Easson	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Mr Elliott	Mr Kerr	Mr Quick
Mr Beddall	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Knott	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr Ferguson	Mr Langmore	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bilney	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Latham	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brereton	Mr Free	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Brown	Mr Gear	Dr Lawrence	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Campbell	Mr Gibson	Mr Lee	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Gorman	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr Cleeland	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay*	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Griffiths	Mr Melham	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mr Haviland	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tanner
Mr Cunningham	Ms Hanzell	Mr P. F. Morris	Dr Theophanous
Ms Deahm	Mr Holding	Mr Newell	Mr Walker
Mr Dodd	Mr Hollis	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods
Mr Duffy	Mr Humphreys	Mr O'Keefe	

NOES, 53

Mr Abbott	Mr Forrest	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sharp
Mr Atkinson	Mrs Gallus	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr Beale	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Slipper
Mrs Bishop	Mr Halverson	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bradford	Mr Hawker*	Mr Nehl	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Mr Nugent	Mr Tuckey
Mr Charles	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Vaile
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Connolly	Mr Katter	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Dobie	Mr Lieberman	Mr Rocher	Ms Worth
Mr R.D.C. Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ronaldson	
Mr Filing	Mr McArthur	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr B. C. Scott	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Message from the Governor-General: Message No. 190, dated 31 August 1994, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the Bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mrs Crosio (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Social Security), the Bill was read a third time.

16 SOCIAL SECURITY (NEW ZEALAND AGREEMENT) AMENDMENT BILL 1994

The order of the day having been read for the second reading—Mrs Crosio (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Social Security) moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mrs Crosio, the Bill was read a third time.

17 CUSTOMS TARIFF (URANIUM CONCENTRATE EXPORT DUTY) ACT REPEAL BILL 1994

The order of the day having been read for the second reading—Mr Lindsay (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Industry, Science and Technology) moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

Debate adjourned (Mr McGauran), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

18 ADJOURNMENT

Mr McLeay (Chief Government Whip) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 7.43 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 12.30 p.m.

PAPERS

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 17 October 1994:

Defence Act—Determinations under section 58B 1994 Nos. 43, 44, 45, 46.

Public Service Act—Determinations 1994 Nos. 79, 84, 85, 160, 161, 163, 182, 184.

ATTENDANCE

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Aldred, Mr Braithwaite, Mr Cameron, Ms Crawford, Ms Fatin, Mr Grace, Dr Hewson, Mr Howe, Mr Jones, Mr Mack, Mr Staples, Mrs Sullivan and Mr Willis.

L. M. BARLIN

Clerk of the House of Representatives