

1993-94

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 57

THURSDAY, 24 FEBRUARY 1994

1 The House met, at 9.30 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Stephen Martin) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **PRIVILEGE—COMPLAINTS OF BREACHES**

Mr Langmore raised, as a matter of privilege, articles published in several newspapers of today which made reference to a draft report of the Standing Committee on Environment, Recreation and the Arts and purported to reveal conclusions reached by the committee. Mr Langmore stated that the committee had considered these matters and had concluded that publication of the material had caused substantial interference with its work. Mr Langmore asked that the matters be considered with a view to according precedence of a motion referring them to the Committee of Privileges.

Mr Langmore also raised, as a matter of privilege, remarks reportedly made by Mrs Moylan, a member of the Standing Committee on Environment, Recreation and the Arts, during an interview this morning on the ABC radio program AM. Mr Langmore stated that the committee was of the opinion that the views expressed by Mrs Moylan constituted a further substantial interference with the committee's work.

The Speaker stated that he would look at the issues raised and report to the House at a later time.

3 **VETERANS' AFFAIRS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 1993—SENATE'S MESSAGE NO. 187**

The order of the day having been read for the consideration of Message No. 187 from the Senate returning the Veterans' Affairs Legislation Amendment Bill (No. 2) 1993 and insisting on its amendment disagreed to by the House—

Dr Theophanous (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Housing, Local Government and Human Services) moved—That the House insists on disagreeing to the amendment insisted on by the Senate.

Debate ensued.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Martin, in the Chair)—

AYES, 75

Mr Adams	Mrs Easson	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Baldwin	Mr Elliott	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Quick
Mr Beddall	Mr Ferguson	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Bevis	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Knott	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Breerton	Mr Gear	Mr Langmore	Mr Simmons
Mr Brown	Mr Gibson	Mr Latham	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Campbell	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Grace*	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Cleeland	Mr Griffin	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Ms Crawford	Mr Griffiths	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Crean	Mr Haviland	Mr McLeay*	Mr Swan
Mr Crosio	Ms Henzell	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mr Cunningham	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Dr Theophanous
Ms Deahm	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Tickner
Mr Dodd	Mr Horne	Mr Newell	Mr Willis
Mr Duffy	Mr Howe	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods
Mr Duncan	Mr Humphreys	Mr O'Keefe	

NOES, 61

Mr Aldred	Mr Evans	Mr Mack	Mr Sharp
Mr Anderson	Mr Filing*	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sinclair
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Forrest	Mr Miles	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mr Somlyay
Mr Atkinson	Mr Hall	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Beale	Mr Halverson	Mr Neville	Mr Taylor
Mr Bradford	Mr Hawker	Mr Nugent	Mr Truss
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Hicks*	Mr Peacock	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Connolly	Mr Lieberman	Mr Rocher	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ronaldson	
Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr B. C. Scott	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

On the motion of Dr Theophanous, the Bill was laid aside.

4 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—VETERANS' AFFAIRS LEGISLATION
AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 3) 1993

The following message from the Senate was reported:

Message No. 212

Mr Speaker,

The Senate returns to the House of Representatives the bill for "*An Act to amend the law relating to veterans' affairs, and for related purposes*" and acquaints the House that the Senate insists upon its amendment disagreed to by the House of Representatives.

The Senate desires the reconsideration by the House of the bill in respect of the amendment.

MICHAEL BEAHAN
President

The Senate,

Canberra, 23 February 1994

Ordered—That the message be considered forthwith.

Dr Theophanous (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Housing, Local Government and Human Services) moved—That the House insists on disagreeing to the amendment insisted on by the Senate.

Debate ensued.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Martin, in the Chair)—

AYES, 75

Mr Adams	Mr Duncan	Mr Humphreys	Mr Price
Mr Baldwin	Mrs Easson	Mr Jenkins	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Mr Elliott	Mr Johns	Mr Quick
Mr Beddall	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Sawford
Mr Bevis	Mr Ferguson	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bilney	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Knott	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brereton	Mr Free	Mr Langmore	Mr Simmons
Mr Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Latham	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Campbell	Mr Gibson	Mr Lavarch	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Gorman	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Cleary	Mr Grace*	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleeland	Mr Griffin	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Ms Crawford	Mr Griffiths	Mr McLeay*	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mr Haviland	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Ms Henzell	Mr A. A. Morris	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cunningham	Mr Holding	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Tickner
Ms Deahm	Mr Hollis	Mr Newell	Mr Willis
Mr Dodd	Mr Horne	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods
Mr Duffy	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	

NOES, 58

Mr Anderson	Mr Filing*	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sharp
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Forrest	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr Atkinson	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mr Slipper
Mr Beale	Mr Hall	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bradford	Mr Halverson	Mr Neville	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Hawker	Mr Nugent	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Mr Peacock	Mr Truss
Mr Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Tuckey
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Vaile
Mr Cobb	Dr Kemp	Mr Reid	Mr Wakelin
Mr Connolly	Mr Lieberman	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mr Lloyd	Mr Rocher	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Evans	Mr Mack	Mr B. C. Scott	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

On the motion of Dr Theophanous, the Bill was laid aside.

5 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 1993-94

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Mr Snow speaking—

It being 3 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 101A, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

6 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice having been called on—

Prime Minister—Motion of censure

Dr Hewson (Leader of the Opposition), by leave, moved—That this House censures the Prime Minister for his refusal to ensure proper standards of ministerial responsibility, for his failure to sack the Minister for the Environment, Sport and Territories and for his undermining of the established processes of ministerial accountability to this Parliament.

Debate ensued.

Member ordered to withdraw: At 3.22 p.m. the Member for O'Connor (Mr Tuckey) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for not resuming his seat when directed to do so, and he accordingly withdraw from the Chamber.

Debate continued.

Closure: Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Martin, in the Chair)—

AYES, 75

Mr Adams	Mrs Easson	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Baldwin	Mr Elliott	Mr Johns	Mr Quick
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr Ferguson	Mr Keating	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mrs Kelly	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerr	Mr Simmons
Mr Brereton	Mr Gear	Mr Knott	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Brown	Mr Gibson	Mr Langmore	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Campbell	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Grace*	Mr Lee	Mr Snowdon
Mr Clelland	Mr Griffin	Mr Lindsay	Mr Staples
Ms Crawford	Mr Griffiths	Ms McHugh	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mr Haviland	Mr McLeay*	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Ms Henzell	Mr Melham	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cunningham	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tickner
Ms Deahm	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Walker
Mr Dodd	Mr Horne	Mr Newell	Mr Willis
Mr Duffy	Mr Howe	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods
Mr Duncan	Mr Humphreys	Mr O'Keefe	

NOES, 61

Mr Aldred	Mr Filing*	Mr McGauran	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr Mack	Mr B. C. Scott
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Forrest	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sharp
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Gallus	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr Atkinson	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Slipper
Mr Beale	Mr Halverson	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bradford	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Braithwaite	Dr Hewson	Mr Neville	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Mr Nugent	Mr Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Peacock	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Connolly	Dr Kemp	Mr Reid	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mr Lieberman	Mr Reith	
Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Rocher	
Mr Evans	Mr McArthur	Mr Ronaldson	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Martin, in the Chair)—

AYES, 61

Mr Aldred	Mr Filing*	Mr McGauran	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr Mack	Mr B. C. Scott
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Forrest	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sharp
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Gallus	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr Atkinson	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Slipper
Mr Beale	Mr Halverson	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bradford	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Braithwaite	Dr Hewson	Mr Neville	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Mr Nugent	Mr Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Peacock	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Connolly	Dr Kemp	Mr Reid	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mr Lieberman	Mr Reith	
Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Rocher	
Mr Evans	Mr McArthur	Mr Ronaldson	

NOES, 75

Mr Adams	Mrs Easson	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Baldwin	Mr Elliott	Mr Johns	Mr Quick
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr Ferguson	Mr Keating	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mrs Kelly	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerr	Mr Simmons
Mr Brereton	Mr Gear	Mr Knott	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Brown	Mr Gibson	Mr Langmore	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Campbell	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Grace*	Mr Lee	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleeland	Mr Griffin	Mr Lindsay	Mr Staples
Ms Crawford	Mr Griffiths	Ms McHugh	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mr Haviland	Mr McLeay*	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Ms Henzell	Mr Melham	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cunningham	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tickner
Ms Deahm	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Walker
Mr Dodd	Mr Horne	Mr Newell	Mr Willis
Mr Duffy	Mr Howe	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods
Mr Duncan	Mr Humphreys	Mr O'Keefe	

* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

Questions without notice concluded.

7 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORT—PUBLICATION OF PAPER

The Speaker presented the following paper:

Audit Act—Auditor-General—Audit report No. 28 of 1993-94—Efficiency audit—Department of Veterans' Affairs: Use of private hospitals.

Mr Beazley (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That:

- (1) this House authorises the publication of the Auditor-General's audit report No. 28 of 1993-94; and
- (2) the report be printed.

Question—put and passed.

8 PAPERS

The following papers were presented:

Department of Finance—Financial statements guidelines—

For departmental secretaries—

Accrual reporting, January 1994.

Modified cash reporting, January 1994.

Of public authorities and commercial activities, January 1994.

Employment, Education and Training Act—National Board of Employment, Education and Training—Reports—

Australian Language and Literacy Council, including the Board's advice—Speaking of business: The needs of business and industry for language skills, February 1994.

Australian Research Council, including the Board's advice—The strategic role of academic research, February 1994.

9 PAPERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPERS

Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following papers:

Department of Finance—Financial statements guidelines—

For departmental secretaries—

Accrual reporting, January 1994.

Modified cash reporting, January 1994.

Of public authorities and commercial activities, January 1994.

Employment, Education and Training Act—National Board of Employment, Education and Training—Reports—

Australian Language and Literacy Council, including the Board's advice—Speaking of business: The needs of business and industry for language skills, February 1994.

Australian Research Council, including the Board's advice—The strategic role of academic research, February 1994.

Debate adjourned (Mr Howard), and the resumption of each debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

10 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—COMMUNITY CULTURAL, RECREATIONAL AND SPORTING FACILITIES PROGRAM

The House was informed that Mr Costello had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The blatant maladministration and biased disbursement of grants under the Community Cultural, Recreational and Sporting Facilities Program".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Costello rising to speak—

Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Martin, in the Chair)—

AYES, 75

Mr Adams	Mrs Easson	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Baldwin	Mr Elliott	Mr Johns	Mr Quick
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr Ferguson	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kerr	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Knott	Mr Simmons
Mr Brereton	Mr Gear	Mr Langmore	Mrs S. J. Smith
Mr Brown	Mr Gibson	Mr Lavarch	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Campbell	Mr Gorman	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Grace*	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleeland	Mr Griffin	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Ms Crawford	Mr Griffiths	Mr Mack	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mr Haviland	Mr McLeay*	Mr Tanner
Ms Crosio	Ms Henzell	Mr Melham	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cunningham	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tickner
Ms Deahm	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Walker
Mr Dodd	Mr Horne	Mr Newell	Mr Willis
Mr Duffy	Mr Howe	Mr O'Connor	Mr Woods
Mr Duncan	Mr Humphreys	Mr O'Keefe	

NOES, 61

Mr Aldred	Mr Filing*	Mr McGauran	Mr B. C. Scott
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr McLachlan	Mr Sharp
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Forrest	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mr Slipper
Mr Atkinson	Mr Hall	Mrs Moylan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Beale	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bradford	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Mr Truss
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Hewson	Mr Nugent	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Mr Peacock	Mr Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Katter	Mr Reid	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Connolly	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mr Lieberman	Mr Rocher	
Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ronaldson	
Mr Evans	Mr McArthur	Mr Ruddock	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

11 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 1993-94

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Debate adjourned (Mr Johns—Assistant Minister for Industrial Relations), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

12 ADJOURNMENT

Mr Johns (Assistant Minister for Industrial Relations) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Privilege—Statement by Speaker

The Speaker referred to the matters of privilege raised earlier today by Mr Langmore concerning the Standing Committee on the Environment, Recreation and the Arts. On the matter of newspaper articles referring to a draft report of the committee, the Speaker said that the committee had followed the established procedures and had considered whether substantial interference had occurred. The Speaker said he accepted the committee's conclusion on this and was willing to allow precedence to a motion, although before a motion was moved the committee should take steps to seek to ascertain the source or sources of the disclosure.

On the matter concerning remarks attributed to Mrs Moylan during an interview on the ABC radio program AM, the Speaker said he had examined the transcript and that it was not clear to him that Mrs Moylan had in fact disclosed private deliberations of the committee or the contents of a draft report. Accordingly, he did not find a *prima facie* case had been made out and would not allow precedence to a motion.

Debate continued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 5.58 p.m., adjourned until Monday next at 12.30 p.m.

PAPERS

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 24 February 1994: Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Commission Act—Determination 1994 No. 1.

Lands Acquisition Act—Statement under section 125.

ATTENDANCE

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting).

L. M. BARLIN

Clerk of the House of Representatives