

## THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

## HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

## VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 148

WEDNESDAY, 1 NOVEMBER 1989

1 The House met, at 10 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. Mr Speaker (the Honourable Leo McLeay) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED:** Mr Peacock (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith—That this House demands that the Treasurer apologise for his false and unsubstantiated allegations concerning the processes leading to the formulation of the Coalition's Economic Action Plan.

*Closure of Member:* Mr P. F. Morris (Minister for Industrial Relations) moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 63

Mr Baldwin	Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Beddall	Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Bilney	Mr Duncan	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Blanchard	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Sawford
Dr Blewett	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Scholes
Mr Bowen	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr Sciacca
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Cleland	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Mr Courtice	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr West
Ms Crawford	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wright
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	

NOES, 52

Mr Aderrmann	Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Cowan	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Shipton
Mr Blunt	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Blunt (Leader of the National Party of Australia—second) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member:* Mr P. F. Morris moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 66

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duffy	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Dr Blewett	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Mr Cleland	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Dawkins	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch	

NOES, 53

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Shipton
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mr Taylor
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Webster
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Wilson
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Fife rising to address the House—

*Closure:* Mr P. F. Morris moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 66

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duffy	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Dr Blewett	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Mr Cleland	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Dawkins	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch	

## NOES, 53

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Shipton
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mr Taylor
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Webster
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Wilson
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—  
The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 53

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Shipton
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mr Taylor
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Webster
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Wilson
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	

## NOES, 66

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duffy	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Dr Blewett	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Mr Clelland	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Dawkins	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch	

\* Tellers

And so it was negated.

3 **SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED:** Mr Peacock (Leader of the Opposition) having delivered to the Clerk a notice of motion of censure of the Treasurer which he proposed to move at the next sitting and the notice having been reported to the House—

Mr Peacock moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith the motion of which he has given notice.

*Closure of Member:* Mr P. F. Morris (Minister for Industrial Relations) moved—  
That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

## The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 65

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Bilney	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Mr Blanchard	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr J. L. Scott
Dr Blewett	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Brumby	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Campbell	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cleeland	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Ms Crawford	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch	
Mr Duffy	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson	

NOES, 54

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Peacock	Mr Wilson
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Blunt (Leader of the National Party of Australia—second) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member:* Mr P. F. Morris moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 65

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Bilney	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Mr Blanchard	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr J. L. Scott
Dr Blewett	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Brumby	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Campbell	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cleeland	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Ms Crawford	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch	
Mr Duffy	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson	

## NOES, 54

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Peacock	Mr Wilson
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Robnson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Fife rising to address the House—

*Closure of Member:* Mr P. F. Morris moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 65

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Bilney	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Mr Blanchard	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr J. L. Scott
Dr Blewett	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Brumby	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Campbell	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cleeland	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Ms Crawford	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch	
Mr Duffy	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson	

## NOES, 54

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Peacock	Mr Wilson
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Robnson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr T. A. Fischer rising to address the House—

*Closure:* Mr P. F. Morris moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

## The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 65

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Bilney	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Mr Blanchard	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr J. L. Scott
Dr Blewett	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Brumby	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Campbell	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Clelland	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Ms Crawford	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch	
Mr Duffy	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson	

NOES, 54

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Peacock	Mr Wilson
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 53

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mr Taylor
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Webster
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Wilson
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Peacock	Dr Woods
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Pratt	Dr Wooldridge
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

NOES, 65

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Bilney	Ms Fatin	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Mr Blanchard	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lavarch	Mr J. L. Scott
Dr Blewett	Mr Gayler	Mr Lee	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Brumby	Mr Griffiths	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Campbell	Mr Hand	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Holding	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cleeland	Mr Hollis	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Ms Crawford	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch	
Mr Duffy	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

- 4 **GRAPE RESEARCH LEVY AMENDMENT BILL 1989:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Mr Mildren addressing the House—

It being 12.45 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with sessional order 101A, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

- 5 **SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—MOTION OF CENSURE OF TREASURER:** Mr Beazley (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith the motion of censure of the Treasurer of which he has given notice for the next sitting.

Question—put and passed.

- 6 **TREASURER—MOTION OF CENSURE:** Mr Peacock (Leader of the Opposition), pursuant to notice, moved—That this House censures the Treasurer for his failure to apologise for his false and unsubstantiated allegations concerning the processes leading to the formulation of the Coalition's Economic Action Plan.

Debate ensued.

Ordered—That Mr Keating (Treasurer) be granted an extension of time.

Debate continued.

*Closure:* Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 73

Mr Baldwin	Ms Fatin	Mr Keating	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beazley	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr Free	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Mr Bilney	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gear	Mr Kerr	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Brumby	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Campbell	Mr Hand	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hawke	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr West
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wright
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	
Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch	

## NOES, 57

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Peacock	Mr Wilson
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr E. C. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Prosser	Dr Wooldridge
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	
Mr Carlton	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—  
The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 57

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Aldred	Mr Cowan	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Peacock	Mr Wilson
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr E. C. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Prosser	Dr Wooldridge
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	
Mr Carlton	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

## NOES, 73

Mr Baldwin	Ms Fatin	Mr Keating	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beazley	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Mr Free	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Mr Bilney	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gear	Mr Kerr	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Mr Lavarch	Mr Sinmons
Mr Brumby	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Campbell	Mr Hand	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hawke	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr West
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wright
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	
Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

7 **QUESTIONS:** Questions without notice were asked.

8 **PAPERS:** The following papers were presented:

Australian Film Finance Corporation Pty Limited—Report for period 12 July 1988 to 30 June 1989.



High Court of Australia Act—High Court of Australia—Report and financial statements, including the Auditor-General's Report and freedom of information statement, for 1988-89.

National Measurement Act—National Standards Commission—Report and financial statements including the Auditor-General's Report, for 1988-89.

**9 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—COMMUNITY PHARMACY:** The House was informed that Mr Shack had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The actions of the Government which will see the wholesale destruction of community pharmacy".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Shack rising to address the House—

Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 71

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Simmons
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

NOES, 54

Mr Adermann	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Cowan	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Slipton
Mr Blunt	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Prosser	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

**10 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED:** Mr Shack moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Member for Tangney moving forthwith—That this House condemns the Government for implementing today the 28 August 1989 determination of the Pharmaceutical Benefits Remuneration Tribunal which will place the health care interests of the nation in jeopardy.

*Closure of Member:* Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

## The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 71

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Simmons
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

## NOES, 55

Mr Adermann	Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Cowan	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Shipton
Mr Blunt	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Prosser	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Braithwaite (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member:* Mr Beazley moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 71

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Simmons
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

## NOES, 55

Mr Adermann	Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Cowan	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Slipton
Mr Blunt	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Prosser	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Reith rising to address the House—

*Closure:* Mr Beazley moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 71

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Simmons
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Cleland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

## NOES, 55

Mr Adermann	Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Cowan	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Slipton
Mr Blunt	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Prosser	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—  
The House divided (the Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 55

Mr Adermann	Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Cowan	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Shipton
Mr Blunt	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Prosser	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Robinson	

NOES, 71

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Simrnons
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

11 **POSTPONEMENT OF ORDERS OF THE DAY:** Ordered—That orders of the day Nos. 2 to 9, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

12 **COURTS AND TRIBUNALS ADMINISTRATION AMENDMENT BILL 1989:** Mr Bowen (Attorney-General), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend various Acts relating to the administration of certain courts and tribunals, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Bowen moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper:* Mr Bowen presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr N. A. Brown), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

13 **POSTPONEMENT OF NOTICE:** Ordered—That notice No. 2, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

14 **BROADCASTING AMENDMENT BILL 1989:** Mr Willis (Minister for Transport and Communications), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *Broadcasting Act 1942*, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Willis moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper:* Mr Willis presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Jull), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

- 15 GRAIN LEGUMES LEVY LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1989:** Mr Kerin (Minister for Primary Industries and Energy) presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *Grain Legumes Levy Act 1985*, and for related purposes.  
 Bill read a first time.  
 Mr Kerin moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.  
*Paper:* Mr Kerin presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.  
 Debate adjourned (Mr Jull), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.
- 16 AUSTRALIAN HERITAGE COMMISSION AMENDMENT BILL 1989:** Mr Staples (Minister for Housing and Aged Care), for Mr Holding (Minister representing the Minister for the Arts, Sport, the Environment, Tourism and Territories), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *Australian Heritage Commission Act 1975*, and for related purposes.  
 Bill read a first time.  
 Mr Staples moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.  
*Paper:* Mr Staples presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.  
 Debate adjourned (Mr McGauran), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.
- 17 HOUSING ASSISTANCE BILL 1989:** Mr Staples (Minister for Housing and Aged Care), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to provide financial assistance to the States, the Australian Capital Territory and the Northern Territory in relation to housing, and for related purposes.  
 Bill read a first time.  
 Mr Staples moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.  
*Paper:* Mr Staples presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.  
 Debate adjourned (Mr McGauran), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.
- 18 MARINE NAVIGATION LEVY BILL 1989:** Mr Staples (Minister for Housing and Aged Care) presented a Bill for an Act to impose a levy on certain sea-going ships, and for related purposes.  
 Bill read a first time.  
 Mr Staples moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.  
*Paper:* Mr Staples presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.  
 Debate adjourned (Mr McGauran), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.
- 19 MARINE NAVIGATION LEVY COLLECTION BILL 1989:** Mr Staples (Minister for Housing and Aged Care) presented a Bill for an Act to provide for the collection of the levy imposed by the *Marine Navigation Levy Act 1989*, and for related purposes.  
 Bill read a first time.  
 Mr Staples moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.  
*Paper:* Mr Staples presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.  
 Debate adjourned (Mr Jull), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.
- 20 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED:** Mr Jull moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent order of the day No. 24, government business—Two Airlines Agreement which relates to a Senate resolution calling for the termination of the two airlines agreement—being considered forthwith.  
*Closure of Member:* Mr Staples (Minister for Housing and Aged Care) moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.  
 Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Cowan, in the Chair)—

AYES, 69

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr West
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Wright
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

NOES, 52

Mr Adermann	Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Hall	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Halverson	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker*	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Prosser	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Woods
Mr Carlton	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Sharp (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member:* Mr Staples moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Cowan, in the Chair)—

AYES, 69

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr West
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Wright
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

## NOES, 55

Mr Adermann	Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Prosser	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Fife rising to address the House—

*Closure:* Mr Staples moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Cowan, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 71

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Simmons
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

## NOES, 54

Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Prosser	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Cowan, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 54

Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr Blunt	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Prosser	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

## NOES, 71

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lavarch	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Grace	Mr Lee	Mr Simmons
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Hand	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Martin	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Dr Theophanous
Mr Courtice	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Howe	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Uren
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

- 21 **GRAPE RESEARCH LEVY AMENDMENT BILL 1989:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Hand (Minister for Aboriginal Affairs), the Bill was read a third time.

- 22 **WINE GRAPES LEVY AMENDMENT BILL 1989:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Hand (Minister for Aboriginal Affairs), the Bill was read a third time.

- 23 **AUSTRALIAN WINE AND BRANDY CORPORATION AMENDMENT BILL 1989:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

*Message from the Governor-General:* Message No. 255, dated 31 October 1989, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation of revenue for the purposes of the Bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Hand (Minister for Aboriginal Affairs), the Bill was read a third time.



24 **SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED:** Mr Downer moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent notice No. 9, private Members' business, standing in the name of the Member for Mayo, being called on forthwith.

*Closure of Member:* Mr Hand (Minister for Aboriginal Affairs) moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Cowan, in the Chair)—

AYES, 67

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Sanderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Kerr	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb *	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Grace	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hand	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleeland	Mrs Harvey	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Courtice	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Ms Crawford	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Cunningham *	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Mr Dawkins	Mr Humphreys	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	

NOES, 50

Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Shack
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sharp
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Slipton
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McCauran	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr MacKellar	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Macphee	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Miles	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Millar	Mr Webster
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Wilson
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker *	Mr Reith	Dr Woods
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks *	Mr Rocher	
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Ruddock	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Reith (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member:* Mr Hand moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Cowan, in the Chair)—

AYES, 67

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Sanderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Kerr	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb *	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Grace	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hand	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleeland	Mrs Harvey	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Courtice	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Ms Crawford	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Cunningham *	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Mr Dawkins	Mr Humphreys	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	

## NOES, 51

Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McGauran	Mr Shipton
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Macphee	Mr Spender
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Millar	Mr Taylor
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Webster
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker *	Mr Pratt	Mr Wilson
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Reith	Dr Woods
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks *	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Beale rising to address the House—

*Closure:* Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Cowan, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 67

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Kerr	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Grace	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hand	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleeland	Mrs Harvey	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Courtice	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Ms Crawford	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Mr Dawkins	Mr Humphreys	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	

## NOES, 52

Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Taylor
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Mr Webster
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Prosser	Mr Wilson
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Woods
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Cowan, in the Chair)—

AYES, 52

Mr Aldred	Mr Connolly	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher
Mr Anderson	Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Andrew	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Beale	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Braithwaite	Mr Fife	Mr MacKellar	Mr Shipton
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Macphee	Mr Sinclair
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Taylor
Mr E. C. Carreron	Mr Hawker*	Mr Pratt	Mr Webster
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Prosser	Mr Wilson
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Reith	Dr Woods
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge

NOES, 67

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Ms Fatin	Mr Jones	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Free	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gear	Mr Kerr	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr Brumby	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Grace	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hand	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cleland	Mrs Harvey	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Courtice	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Ms Crawford	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Mr Dawkins	Mr Humphreys	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Dubois	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wright
Mr Duffy	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

**25 STATES GRANTS (SCHOOLS ASSISTANCE) AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 1989:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Debate adjourned (Dr Charlesworth), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**26 ADJOURNMENT:** Mrs Kelly (Minister for Telecommunications and Aviation Support) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

*Papers:* Dr H. R. Edwards, by leave, presented the following papers:

Gross Domestic Product—Table of changes in components from 1959-60 to 1988-89.

Gross fixed capital expenditure—Table, by type of asset, from 1976-77 to 1987-88.

Debate continued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 8.12 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 10 a.m.

**PAPERS:** The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 1 November 1989:

Defence Act—Determinations under section 58B—1989—

No. 173—Submarine Service Allowance and other allowances.

No. 176—Spouse Accompanied Travel on Duty.

Lands Acquisition Act—Statement of lands acquired by agreement authorised under subsection 125 (4).

---

---

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** All Members were present (at some time during the sitting) except Mr J. J. Brown, Mr Charles, Mrs Child, Mr Cohen, Mr Cross, Mrs Darling, Mr P. S. Fisher\*, Mr Katter\*, Dr Klugman\*, Mr Langmore, Mr Mountford, Mr Porter, Mr Tuckey and Mr White.

\*On leave

---

---

**A. R. BROWNING**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives