

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA  
**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 89

TUESDAY, 8 NOVEMBER 1988

---

1 The House met, at 2.30 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. Madam Speaker (the Honourable Jean Child) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **QUESTIONS:** Questions without notice being asked—

*Paper:* Mr Holding (Minister for the Arts and Territories) presented the following paper:

Aboriginal Arts Board—Allegations against Mr C. Clare of Inada Holdings—  
 Copy of letter from Mr Holding, Minister for Aboriginal Affairs, to Mr C. Dixon, Chairman, Aboriginal Arts Board, dated 22 October 1985.

Questions without notice concluded.

3 **SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED:** Mr Howard (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition presenting forthwith a Bill for an Act to ban the sale and distribution of X-rated videos, and for related purposes.

*Closure of Member:* Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 77

Mr Baldwin	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Sanderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gear	Dr Klugman	Mr Sciacca
Dr Blewett	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Mr Langmore	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Charles	Mr Hand	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hawke	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Cleland	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cohen	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Ms Crawford	Mr Humphreys	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr West
Mr Cross	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Mountford	Mr Wright
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr O'Neil	
Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Keating	Mr Price	

## NOES, 60

Mr Adermann	Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Ruddock
Mr Andrew*	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McGauran	Mr Shack
Mr Beale	Mr Fife	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sharp
Mr Blunt	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Macphee	Mr Shipton
Mr Braithwaite	Mr P. S. Fisher	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Millar	Mr Smith
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Spender
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mrs Sullivan
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker	Mr Peacock	Mr Taylor
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Porter	Mr Tuckey
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Pratt	Mr Webster
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr White
Mr Connolly	Mr Hunt	Mr Reith	Mr Wilson
Mr Cowan	Mr Jull	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr N. A. Brown (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member:* Mr Beazley moved—That the honourable Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 77

Mr Baldwin	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gear	Dr Klugman	Mr Sciacca
Dr Blewett	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Mr Langmore	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Charles	Mr Hand	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Harvey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hawke	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cohen	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Ms Crawford	Mr Humphreys	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr West
Mr Cross	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Mountford	Mr Wright
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr O'Neil	
Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Keating	Mr Price	

## NOES, 60

Mr Adermann	Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Ruddock
Mr Andrew*	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McGauran	Mr Shack
Mr Beale	Mr Fife	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sharp
Mr Blunt	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Macphee	Mr Shipton
Mr Braithwaite	Mr P. S. Fisher	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Millar	Mr Smith
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Spender
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mrs Sullivan
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker	Mr Peacock	Mr Taylor
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Porter	Mr Tuckey
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Pratt	Mr Webster
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr White
Mr Connolly	Mr Hunt	Mr Reith	Mr Wilson
Mr Cowan	Mr Jull	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Blunt rising to address the House—

*Closure:* Mr Beazley moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

## The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 77

Mr Baldwin	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gear	Dr Klugman	Mr Sciacca
Dr Blewett	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Mr Langmore	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Charles	Mr Hand	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hawke	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cohen	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Ms Crawford	Mr Humphreys	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr West
Mr Cross	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Mountford	Mr Wright
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr O'Neil	
Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Keating	Mr Price	

NOES, 60

Mr Adermann	Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Ruddock
Mr Andrew*	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McGauran	Mr Shack
Mr Beale	Mr Fife	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sharp
Mr Blunt	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Macphee	Mr Shipton
Mr Braithwaite	Mr P. S. Fisher	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Millar	Mr Smith
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Spender
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mrs Sullivan
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker	Mr Peacock	Mr Taylor
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Porter	Mr Tuckey
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Pratt	Mr Webster
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr White
Mr Connolly	Mr Hunt	Mr Reith	Mr Wilson
Mr Cowan	Mr Jull	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr McLeay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 60

Mr Adermann	Mr Dobie	Mr Lloyd	Mr Rocher
Mr Aldred	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Ruddock
Mr Andrew*	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McGauran	Mr Shack
Mr Beale	Mr Fife	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sharp
Mr Blunt	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Macphee	Mr Shipton
Mr Braithwaite	Mr P. S. Fisher	Mr Miles	Mr Sinclair
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Millar	Mr Smith
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Moore	Mr Spender
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mrs Sullivan
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker	Mr Peacock	Mr Taylor
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Dr Hewson	Mr Porter	Mr Tuckey
Mr Carlton	Mr Hicks*	Mr Pratt	Mr Webster
Mr Cobb	Mr Howard	Mr Prosser	Mr White
Mr Connolly	Mr Hunt	Mr Reith	Mr Wilson
Mr Cowan	Mr Jull	Mr Robinson	Dr Wooldridge

## NOES, 77

Mr Baldwin	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Punch
Mr Beazley	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beddall	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Sawford
Mr Bilney	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Scholes
Mr Blanchard	Mr Gear	Dr Klugman	Mr Sciacca
Dr Blewett	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr J. L. Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Grace	Mr Langmore	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lavarch	Mr Simmons
Mr Charles	Mr Hand	Mr Lee	Mr Snow
Dr Charlesworth	Mrs Harvey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snowdon
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hawke	Ms McHugh	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cohen	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Tickner
Mr Courtice	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Uren
Ms Crawford	Mr Humphreys	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr West
Mr Cross	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Mountford	Mr Wright
Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr O'Neil	
Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Keating	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

**4 PAPERS:** The following papers were presented:

Advance to the Minister for Finance—Statements for July, August and September 1988.

**5 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—ABORIGINES AND TORRES**

**STRAIT ISLANDERS:** The House was informed that Mr Miles had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The Government's failure, in priorities and policies, to address the needs of Aborigines and Torres Strait Islanders".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—  
Mr Miles addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

**6 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—EXTENSION OF TIME FOR PRESENTATION OF REPORTS ON THURSDAY, 10 NOVEMBER 1988:**

Mr McLeay, by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the time for presentation and consideration of parliamentary committee and delegation reports on Thursday, 10 November, continuing for a period not exceeding 1 hour 40 minutes.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

**7 VETERANS' AFFAIRS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1988:**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr T. A. Fischer, viz.*—That all words after "That" be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: "whilst supporting the general thrust of the Bill, the House is of the view that:

- (1) repatriation should be recognised as compensation, and not welfare, in acknowledgment of the service of veterans, war widows, ex-service personnel and serving personnel;
- (2) there has been a series of cutbacks and complex changes impacting on veterans, war widows and ex-service personnel described as a 'penny pinching, miserable and narrow-minded cash-register approach' and typified by:
  - (a) a \$300 limit on certain categories of dental treatment within the one year;

- (b) the halving of the country travel allowance for veterans referred to specialists and Repatriation General Hospitals;
  - (c) the hardship imposed by recent changes in the Repatriation Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme;
  - (d) the imposition of a statutory patient contribution in excess of \$5000 per year from 1 January 1988 on veterans in nursing homes for war-related conditions;
  - (e) the massive delays in the determining system, thus denying justice where veterans die before a decision is made; and
  - (f) the 2% cutback applied to DFRDB pensioners in 1986 which has never been rectified despite promises by the Government to do so; and
- (3) the Government should take account of recent criticisms of Government policies, priorities and administration in relation to the repatriation system and make the necessary adjustments as a matter of priority”—

Debate resumed.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Mildren, in the Chair)—

AYES, 69

Mr Baldwin	Mr Duncan	Mr Kent	Mr Saunderson
Mr Beazley	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Kerr	Mr Sawford
Mr Beddall	Ms Fatin	Dr Klugman	Mr Scholes
Mr Bilney	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lamb*	Mr Sciacca
Mr Blanchard	Mr Free	Mr Langmore	Mr J. L. Scott
Dr Blewett	Mr Gayler	Mr Lavarch	Mr L. J. Scott
Mr Bowen	Mr Gear	Mr Lee	Mr Simmons
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gorman	Mr Lindsay	Mr Snow
Mr Campbell	Mr Grace	Ms McHugh	Mr Snowdon
Mr Charles	Mr Griffiths	Mr McLeay	Mr Staples
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Hand	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Cleeland	Mrs Harvey	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Tickner
Mr Cohen	Mr Howe	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr West
Mr Courtice	Mr Humphreys	Mr Mountford	Mr Willis
Ms Crawford	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wright
Mr Cross	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Neil	
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Johns	Mr Price	
Mr Dubois	Mrs Kelly	Mr Punch	

NOES, 51

Mr Adermann	Mr Cowan	Mr Lloyd	Mr Ruddock
Mr Aldred	Mr Downer	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Andrew*	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Beale	Mr Fife	Mr Macphee	Mr Shipton
Mr Blunt	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr Miles	Mr Smith
Mr Braithwaite	Mr P. S. Fisher	Mr Millar	Mr Spender
Mr N. A. Brown	Mr Goodluck	Mr Nehl	Mr Taylor
Mr Burr	Mr Hall	Mr Peacock	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Halverson	Mr Porter	Mr Webster
Mr E. C. Cameron	Mr Hawker	Mr Pratt	Mr White
Mr I. M. D. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Prosser	Mr Wilson
Mr Carlton	Mr Hunt	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Rocher	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

*Message from the Governor-General:* Message No. 132, dated 7 November 1988, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation of revenue for the purposes of the Bill.

The House resolved itself into a committee of the whole.

---

*In the committee*

Clauses 1 to 3, by leave, taken together, and agreed to, after debate.

Remainder of Bill, by leave, taken as a whole, and agreed to, after debate.

Bill to be reported without amendment.

---

The House resumed; Mr R. F. Edwards reported accordingly.

On the motion of Mr Humphreys (Minister for Veterans' Affairs), the House adopted the report, and, by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

**8 LOANS SECURITIES AMENDMENT BILL 1988:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr Peacock (Deputy Leader of the Opposition) who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House notes that the administration of the legislation by the Government has been less than satisfactory in that:

- (1) the management of public debt by the Government has seen a rise in the public debt interest component of the Commonwealth Budget to such an extent that it now is larger than expenditure on education and is equivalent to that spent on defence; and
- (2) Government policies in the past saw a swallowing up of Australia's domestic savings by the public sector and caused Australia as a nation to borrow more from overseas, resulting in net foreign debt quadrupling over the term of this Government to \$89 billion”.

Debate continued.

Amendment negatived.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

*Message from the Governor-General:* Message No. 133, dated 28 September 1988, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation of revenue for the purposes of the Bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr P. F. Morris (Minister Assisting the Treasurer), the Bill was read a third time.

**9 AUSTRALIAN SECURITY INTELLIGENCE ORGANIZATION AMENDMENT BILL 1988:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Bowen (Attorney-General), the Bill was read a third time.

**10 ADJOURNMENT:** Mr Bowen (Attorney-General) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

The House continuing to sit until 11 p.m.—Madam Speaker adjourned the House until tomorrow at 10 a.m.

---

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** All Members were present (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Brumby, Mr D. M. Cameron\*, Mrs Darling\*, Mr Dawkins, Mr Duffy, Mr Katter and Dr Woods.

\* On leave

---

---

**A. R. BROWNING**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives