

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 51

MONDAY, 18 APRIL 1988

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. Madam Speaker (the Honourable Joan Child) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **QUESTIONS:** Questions without notice were asked.

3 **SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—MOTION OF CENSURE OF THE MINISTER FOR FOREIGN AFFAIRS AND TRADE:** Mr Spender having delivered to the Clerk a notice of motion of censure of the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Trade which he proposed to move at the next sitting and the notice having been reported to the House—

Mr Beazley (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the honourable Member for North Sydney moving forthwith the motion of censure of the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Trade of which he has given notice for the next sitting.

Question—put and passed.

4 **MINISTER FOR FOREIGN AFFAIRS AND TRADE—MOTION OF CENSURE:** Mr Spender moved—That this House censures the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Trade for the following reasons—

- (1) his gross abuse in the recent defence debate of the privileges of this House of absolute freedom of speech;
- (2) he has demeaned his position as Minister and misused his powers by gaining access to a confidential personal file of a former officer of his Department for the purposes of a premeditated parliamentary attack on him; and
- (3) by these actions he has gravely compromised the system of confidential personal assessments which are crucial to the operations of his and other Departments and has attacked the right of Australians to basic protections of privacy.

Debate ensued.

Closure: Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mrs Child, in the Chair)—

AYES, 69

Mr Baldwin	Mr Dawkins	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Beazley	Mr Dubois	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Beddall	Mr Duffy	Mr Jones	Mr Saunderson
Mr Bilney	Mr Duncan	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Blanchard	Ms Fatin	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Dr Blewett	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bowen	Mr Free	Mr Kerr	Mr Scott
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Gayler	Dr Klugman	Mr Simmons
Mr Brumby	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr Snow
Mr Campbell	Mr Gorman	Mr Lee	Mr Staples
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lindsay	Dr Theophanous
Mr Chynoweth	Mrs Harvey	Ms McHugh	Mr Tickner
Mr Cleeland	Mr Hayden	Mr Martin	Mr West
Mr Courtice	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Mr Willis
Ms Crawford	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Wright
Mr Cross	Mr Howe	Mr Mountford	
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Humphreys	Mr O'Keefe	
Mrs Darling	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil	

NOES, 51

Mr Adermann	Mr Downer	Mr Katter	Mr Robinson
Mr Aldred	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Beale	Mr Fife	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Blunt	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr P. S. Fisher	Mr Macphee	Mr Smith
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr E. C. Cameron*	Mr Hawker	Mr Peacock	Mr Webster
Mr Carlton	Dr Hewson	Mr Porter	Mr Wilson
Mr Cobb	Mr Hicks*	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr Connolly	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Dobie	Mr Jull	Mr Reith	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mrs Child, in the Chair)—

AYES, 52

Mr Adermann	Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Reith
Mr Aldred	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr Katter	Mr Robinson
Mr Beale	Mr Fife	Mr McArthur	Mr Shack
Mr Blunt	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr Sharp
Mr Braithwaite	Mr P. S. Fisher	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Macphee	Mr Smith
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr E. C. Cameron*	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Carlton	Dr Hewson	Mr Peacock	Mr Webster
Mr Cobb	Mr Hicks*	Mr Porter	Mr Wilson
Mr Connolly	Mr Howard	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr Dobie	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Dr Wooldridge

NOES, 71

Mr Baldwin	Mr Dawkins	Mr Humphreys	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Beazley	Mr Dubois	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil
Mr Beddall	Mr Duffy	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Bilney	Mr Duncan	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Blanchard	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mr Jones	Mr Saunderson
Dr Blewett	Ms Fatin	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Bowen	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Free	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brumby	Mr Gayler	Mr Kerr	Mr Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Gear	Dr Klugman	Mr Simmons
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Gorman	Mr Lamb*	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Griffiths	Mr Lee	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mrs Harvey	Mr Lindsay	Dr Theophanus
Mr Courtice	Mr Hawke	Ms McHugh	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Hayden	Mr Martin	Mr West
Mr Cross	Mr Holding	Mr Mildren	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Hollis	Mr Milton	Mr Wright
Mrs Darling	Mr Howe	Mr Mountford	

* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

- 5 **PAPERS:** The following papers were presented:
 Australian Security Intelligence Organization—Report for 1986-87.
 Commonwealth Grants Commission Act—Commonwealth Grants Commission—
 Report on general revenue grant relativities 1988—
 Volume I—Main report.
 Volume II—Appendixes and Consultants' reports.
- 6 **AUSTRALIAN SECURITY INTELLIGENCE ORGANIZATION—REPORT—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER:** Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following paper:
 Australian Security Intelligence Organization—Report for 1986-87.
 Debate adjourned (Mr Fife), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.
- 7 **PAPER:** Mr Bowen (Attorney-General) presented the following paper:
 Health Insurance Act—Provision of certain information to Mr G. Gear, MP, by the Health Insurance Commission through the office of the Minister for Community Services and Health in November 1987—Opinion by Mr I. D. Temby, Director of Public Prosecutions, dated 15 April 1988.
- 8 **PAPER:** Mr Sinclair (Leader of the National Party of Australia), during a personal explanation, by leave, presented the following paper:
 Travelling allowance—Summary of travel taken by members of Mr Sinclair's staff during the period 26 February 1985 to 22 August 1986.
- 9 **MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE:** A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill without amendment:
 15 April 1988—Message No. 133—Nuclear Non-Proliferation (Safeguards) (Consequential Amendments) 1987.
- 10 **PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—COMPULSORY UNIONISM:** The House was informed that Mr Shack had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The Hawke Labor Government's complete disregard for the freedom of Australian workers through its support of compulsory unionism".
 The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—
 Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.
 Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Mountford, in the Chair)—

AYES, 68

Mr Baldwin	Mrs Darling	Mr Humphreys	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Beazley	Mr Dawkins	Mrs Jakobsen	Mr O'Neil
Mr Beddall	Mr Dubois	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price
Mr Bilney	Mr Duffy	Mr Johns	Mr Punch
Mr Blanchard	Mr Duncan	Mr Jones	Mr Saunderson
Dr Blewett	Mr R. F. Edwards	Mrs Kelly	Mr Sawford
Mr Bowen	Ms Fatin	Mr Kent	Mr Scholes
Mr R. J. Brown	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Kerin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Brumby	Mr Free	Mr Kerr	Mr Scott
Mr Campbell	Mr Gayler	Dr Klugman	Mr Simmons
Dr Charlesworth	Mr Gear	Mr Lamb*	Mr Snow
Mr Chynoweth	Mr Gorman	Mr Lee	Mr Staples
Mr Cleeland	Mrs Harvey	Mr Lindsay	Dr Theophanous
Mr Courtice	Mr Hayden	Ms McHugh	Mr Tickner
Ms Crawford	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Mr West
Mr Cross	Mr Hollis	Mr Mildren	Mr Willis
Mr Cunningham*	Mr Howe	Mr Milton	Mr Wright

NOES, 51

Mr Adermann	Mr Downer	Mr Katter	Mr Robinson
Mr Aldred	Dr H. R. Edwards	Mr McArthur	Mr Rocher
Mr Beale	Mr Fife	Mr McGauran	Mr Shack
Mr Blunt	Mr T. A. Fischer	Mr MacKellar	Mr Sinclair
Mr Braithwaite	Mr P. S. Fisher	Mr Macphree	Mr Smith
Mr Burr	Mr Goodluck	Mr Miles	Mr Spender
Mr Cadman	Mr Hall	Mr Millar	Mrs Sullivan
Mr D. M. Cameron	Mr Halverson	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr E. C. Cameron*	Mr Hawker	Mr Peacock	Mr Webster
Mr Carlton	Dr Hewson	Mr Porter	Mr Wilson
Mr Cobb	Mr Hicks*	Mr Pratt	Dr Woods
Mr Connolly	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Dobie	Mr Jull	Mr Reith	

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

11 **POSTPONEMENT OF ORDERS OF THE DAY:** Ordered—That orders of the day Nos. 1 to 4, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

12 **TRANSPORT, COMMUNICATIONS AND INFRASTRUCTURE—STANDING COMMITTEES—REFERENCE AND PROPOSED JOINT COMMITTEE POWERS AND PROCEEDINGS—SENATE'S RESOLUTION:** The order of the day having been read for the consideration of message No. 131 from the Senate transmitting a resolution agreed to by the Senate relating to the Standing Committees on Transport, Communication and Infrastructure of the Senate and the House of Representatives when sitting as a joint committee—

Mr Punch (Minister for the Arts and Territories) moved—

- (1) That all aspects of the Australian Capital Territory leasehold system be referred to the Standing Committee on Transport, Communications and Infrastructure for inquiry and report.
- (2) That the committee when inquiring into this matter:
 - (a) confer with a similar committee of the Senate; and
 - (b) have power to consider and make use of the evidence and records of the Joint Committees on the Australian Capital Territory appointed during previous Parliaments and the paper entitled *The Canberra Leasehold System* prepared by Professor Max Neutze for the Joint Committee on the Australian Capital Territory appointed in the 34th Parliament.
- (3) That this House concurs in paragraph (2) of the resolution transmitted in message No. 131 of the Senate relating to the powers and proceedings of the Standing Committees on Transport, Communications and Infrastructure of the Senate and House of Representatives when sitting as a joint committee.

- (4) That the provisions of the resolution so far as they are inconsistent with the standing orders, have effect notwithstanding anything contained in the standing orders.
- (5) That a message be sent to the Senate acquainting it of this resolution and seeking its concurrence in subparagraph (2) (b) of this resolution.

Question—put and passed.

13 **APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 1987-88:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Peacock (Deputy Leader of the Opposition), viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House notes that:

- (1) Budget estimates put Commonwealth Government outlays at over a quarter of Australia’s GDP, and that this is funded by revenue collection that has made this the highest taxing Government in the post-war history of Australia;
- (2) the Government has increasingly burdened not only individuals but business with new incentive-sapping taxes like the fringe benefits tax and capital gains tax;
- (3) national productivity is not expected to rise much more than a dismal 0.5% during the course of 1987-88; and
- (4) without the incentive to invest and work productively, Australia will find it increasingly difficult to extricate itself from its \$87 billion foreign debt strait jacket without further reductions in our standard of living”—

Debate resumed.

Mr Downer addressing the House—

14 **ADJOURNMENT:** It being 10.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 10.59 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 2 p.m.

PAPERS: The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 18 April 1988:
Acts Interpretation Act—Statements relating to extension of specified period for presentation of periodic report—Merit Protection and Review Agency—Report for 1986-87.

Export Control Act—Export Control (Orders) Regulations—Orders—1988—

No. 3—Prescribed Goods (General) as amended (Amendment).

No. 4—Export Control (Fees) as amended (Amendment).

Fisheries Levy Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1988, No. 51.

National Health Act—Pharmaceutical benefits—

Advice of Pharmaceutical Benefits Advisory Committee pursuant to subsection 85 (2AB), dated 27 January 1988.

Declarations dated 30 March 1988, pursuant to—

Subsection 85 (2)

Subsection 85 (2AA)

Seamen’s War Pensions and Allowances Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1988, No. 49.

Superannuation Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1988, No. 48.

Veterans’ Entitlements Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1988, No. 50.

World Heritage Properties Conservation Act—

Proclamation pursuant to subsection 6 (3), dated 31 March 1988.

Regulations—Statutory Rules 1988, No. 47.

MEMBERS PRESENT: All Members were present (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Andrew, Mr J. J. Brown, Mr N. A. Brown, Mr I. M. D. Cameron, Mr Charles, Mr Cohen, Mr Cowan, Mr Grace, Mr Hand, Mr Langmore, Mr Lavarch, Mr McLeay, Mr A. A. Morris, Mr P. F. Morris, Mr Ruddock, Mr Shipton and Mr Uren.

A. R. BROWNING
Clerk of the House of Representatives