

1909.

## THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH

No. 52.

## VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

## HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES.

WEDNESDAY, 22ND SEPTEMBER, 1909.

1. The House met pursuant to adjournment.—Mr. Speaker took the Chair, and read Prayers.
2. PRIVILEGE.—DISSENT FROM SPEAKER'S RULING.—The Order of the Day having been read for the consideration of the motion, of which notice had been given at the last sitting, to dissent from a ruling of Mr. Speaker—Mr. Hughes moved, That this House dissents from the ruling of Mr. Speaker, that the motion of the Prime Minister for the suspension of the Standing Orders was a motion within the meaning of Standing Orders 407 and 409.

During his speech Mr. Hughes used two expressions which Mr. Speaker ruled out of order, and directed their withdrawal by the honorable Member. Mr. Hughes withdrew one expression but refused to withdraw the other. Mr. Speaker having repeatedly asked the honorable Member to withdraw the latter expression, and the honorable Member still refusing, Mr. Speaker named the honorable Member for West Sydney (Mr. Hughes) for consistent and persistent disregard of the direction of the Chair to withdraw a word that was considered disorderly. Mr. Deakin stated that he thought there was a misunderstanding, and that Mr. Hughes had used the word "contemptible" not in reference to an honorable Member personally, but as a criticism on the tactics of the Ministry. Mr. Hughes stated that was the way in which he applied the word. Mr. Speaker thereupon accepted the honorable Member's explanation, and the matter was not proceeded with further.

Debate ensued.

Mr. Batchelor moved, That so much of the Standing Orders be suspended as prevents the discussion forthwith of the Speaker's rulings of yesterday.

Debate ensued.

Question—That so much of the Standing Orders be suspended as prevents the discussion forthwith of the Speaker's rulings of yesterday—put.

The House divided—

Ayes, 28.

Mr. Bamford	Mr. McDougall
Mr. Batchelor	Mr. O'Malley
Mr. Thomas Brown	Mr. Page
Mr. Carr	Mr. Poynton
Mr. Catts	Mr. Roberts
Mr. Chanter	Mr. Spence
Mr. Fisher	Mr. Thomas
Mr. Frank J. Foster	Mr. Tudor
Mr. Frazer	Mr. Watkins
Mr. Hughes	Mr. Webster
Sir William Lyne	Mr. Wise
Mr. Mahon	
Mr. Maloney	<i>Tellers.</i>
Mr. Mathews	Mr. Hall
Mr. McDonald	Mr. Hutchison

Noes, 34.

Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Kelly
Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Liddell
Mr. Coon	Mr. Livingston
Mr. Crouch	Mr. Mauger
Mr. Deakin	Mr. McWilliams
Mr. Edwards	Mr. Palmer
Sir Thomas Ewing	Sir John Quick
Mr. Fairbairn	Mr. Sampson
Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sinclair
Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Bruce Smith
Mr. Fuller	Mr. Dugald Thomson
Sir Philip Fysh	Mr. John Thomson
Mr. Glynn	Mr. Wilson
Mr. Groom	Mr. Wynne
Mr. Harper	
Mr. Hedges	<i>Tellers.</i>
Mr. Hans Irvine	Mr. Archer
Mr. Johnson	Mr. Hume Cook

And so it passed in the negative.

Debate on original motion continued.

Mr. Deakin moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

22nd September, 1909.

The House divided—

Ayes, 37.		Noes, 27.	
Mr. Archer	Mr. Kelly	Mr. Bamford	Mr. McDougall
Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Knox	Mr. Batchelor	Mr. O'Malley
Mr. Bowden	Mr. Liddell	Mr. Thomas Brown	Mr. Page
Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Livingston	Mr. Carr	Mr. Poynton
Mr. Coon	Mr. Mauger	Mr. Catts	Mr. Roberts
Mr. Deakin	Mr. McWilliams	Mr. Chanter	Mr. Spence
Sir Thomas Ewing	Mr. Palmer	Mr. Fisher	Mr. Thomas
Mr. Fairbairn	Sir John Quick	Mr. Frank J. Foster	Mr. Tudor
Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sampson	Mr. Hughes	Mr. Watkins
Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Sinclair	Mr. Hutchison	Mr. Wise
Mr. Fowler	Mr. Bruce Smith	Sir William Lyne	
Mr. Fuller	Mr. Dugald Thomson	Mr. Mahon	
Sir Philip Fysh	Mr. John Thomson	Mr. Maloney	<i>Tellers.</i>
Mr. Glynn	Mr. Wilson	Mr. Mathews	Mr. Frazer
Mr. Groom	Mr. Wynne	Mr. McDonald	Mr. Hall
Mr. Harper			
Mr. Hedges			
Mr. Hans Irvine	<i>Tellers.</i>		
Mr. W. H. Irvine	Mr. Hume Cook		
Mr. Johnson	Mr. Crouch		

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question being accordingly put—"That this House dissents from the ruling of Mr. Speaker, that the motion of the Prime Minister for the suspension of the Standing Orders was a motion within the meaning of Standing Orders 407 and 409"—

The House divided—

Ayes, 25.		Noes, 37.	
Mr. Bamford	Mr. O'Malley	Mr. Archer	Mr. Johnson
Mr. Batchelor	Mr. Page	Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Kelly
Mr. Thomas Brown	Mr. Poynton	Mr. Bowden	Mr. Knox
Mr. Carr	Mr. Roberts	Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Liddell
Mr. Catts	Mr. Spence	Mr. Coon	Mr. Livingston
Mr. Fisher	Mr. Thomas	Mr. Crouch	Mr. McWilliams
Mr. Frank J. Foster	Mr. Tudor	Mr. Deakin	Mr. Palmer
Mr. Hughes	Mr. Watkins	Sir Thomas Ewing	Sir John Quick
Mr. Hutchison	Mr. Webster	Mr. Fairbairn	Mr. Sampson
Sir William Lyne		Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sinclair
Mr. Mahon		Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Bruce Smith
Mr. Maloney	<i>Tellers.</i>	Mr. Fowler	Mr. Dugald Thomson
Mr. Mathews	Mr. Frazer	Mr. Fuller	Mr. John Thomson
Mr. McDougall	Mr. Hall	Sir Philip Fysh	Mr. Wilson
		Mr. Glynn	Mr. Wynne
		Mr. Groom	
		Mr. Harper	
		Mr. Hedges	<i>Tellers.</i>
		Mr. Hans Irvine	Mr. Hume Cook
		Mr. W. H. Irvine	Mr. Mauger

And so it passed in the negative.

3. CONSTITUTION ALTERATION (FINANCE) BILL.—The Order of the Day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the following motion of Mr. Deakin :—That he have leave to bring in a Bill for an Act to alter the provisions of the Constitution relating to Finance—

Debate resumed.

Mr. Bowden moved, That the debate be now adjourned.

Question—That the debate be now adjourned—put and resolved in the affirmative.

Ordered—That the resumption of the debate be made an Order of the Day for to-morrow.

4. ADJOURNMENT.—Mr. Deakin moved, That the House do now adjourn.

Question—put and resolved in the affirmative.

And then the House, at two minutes past eleven o'clock p.m., adjourned until to-morrow at half-past two o'clock p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT.—All Members were present (at some time during the sitting) except—Mr. Tilley Brown, Mr. Chapman\*, Colonel Foxton, Mr. Reid, Mr. Watson, and Mr. Willis.

\* On leave.

C. GAVAN DUFFY,  
Clerk of the House of Representatives.