The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

Balancing Work and Family

Report on the inquiry into balancing work and family

House of Representatives Standing Committee on Family and Human Services

December 2006 Canberra © Commonwealth of Australia 2006 ISBN 0 642 78873 1 (printed version) ISBN 0 642 78874 X (HTML version)

Printed by CanPrint Communications Pty Ltd, Canberra.

Cover design by Lisa McDonald, Department of the House of Representatives Printing and Publishing Office, Canberra.

Contents

Fore	eword	ix
	Postscript	XV
Men	nbership of the Committee	xix
Terr	ms of reference	xxi
List	of abbreviations	xxii
List	of recommendations	xxiii
Ove	erview of the inquiry	xxvii
	Conduct of the inquiry	xxvii
	Structure of the report	xxviii
1	Introduction	1
	Social change in Australia	1
	Distribution of human capital	2
	Trends in labour force participation	5
	Changes to families and households	9
	Trends in fertility rates	13
	Fertility decision-making	15
	Ageing population	18
	Work and family debate	22
	Who is affected by work and family stress?	22
	Role of fathers	
	Can people work and enjoy their families?	31

Introduction 39 Australia and the OECD 39 Government's policy goals 41 Growth in assistance 42 More families are receiving transfer payments 43 Government payments to families 44 General payments to families 44 General payments to families 51 Payments for specific circumstances 51 Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for the elderly 63 Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 S	2	Taxation and Government assistance to families	39
Australia and the OECD		Introduction	
Growth in assistance 42 More families are receiving transfer payments. 43 Government payments to families 44 General payments to families 45 Payments for specific circumstances 51 Payments to help with the cost of child care 53 Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for the elderly 63 Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95			
More families are receiving transfer payments. 43 Government payments to families. 44 General payments to families. 45 Payments for specific circumstances 51 Payments to help with the cost of child care 53 Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Paxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 <t< td=""><td></td><td>Government's policy goals</td><td> 41</td></t<>		Government's policy goals	41
Government payments to families 44 General payments to families 45 Payments for specific circumstances 51 Payments to help with the cost of child care 53 Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for the elderly 63 Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 72 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 74 Starting families 75 Pinancial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 91 HCS debts 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs. 98		Growth in assistance	
General payments to families 45 Payments for specific circumstances 51 Payments to help with the cost of child care 53 Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for the elderly 63 Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 72 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 74 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 98 Child care 98 Child care 98		More families are receiving transfer payments	
Payments for specific circumstances 51 Payments to help with the cost of child care 53 Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for the elderly 63 Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 74 Starting families 75 Cost of raising children 70 Loss of salary and wages 70 Superannuation 72 Cost of raising children 73 HECS debts 74 Starting costs 74 Starting children 75 Pinancial disincentives to starting a family 74 Starting children 75 Pinancial disincentives to starting a family 76		Government payments to families	
Payments to help with the cost of child care 53 Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for the elderly 63 Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 90 Loss dests 98 Child care 90		General payments to families	
Payments for carers and those who need care 60 Payments for the elderly 63 Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care. 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 100		Payments for specific circumstances	51
Payments for the elderly 63 Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 74 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 98 Child care 98		Payments to help with the cost of child care	53
Other payments for families and carers 65 Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate. 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 98 Child care 98		Payments for carers and those who need care	60
Conclusion 68 3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 98 Child care 98		Payments for the elderly	63
3 Family taxation 69 Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 100		Other payments for families and carers	
Personal income taxation 69 Taxation measures relevant to families and carers 70 Child Care Tax Rebate 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 100		Conclusion	68
Taxation measures relevant to families and carers70Child Care Tax Rebate71Tax offsets71Effective marginal tax rates73Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care76Tax deductibility status of child care84Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care864Starting families89Financial disincentives to starting a family90Loss of salary and wages90Superannuation92Cost of raising children93HECS debts95Housing costs98Child care100	3	Family taxation	69
Taxation measures relevant to families and carers70Child Care Tax Rebate71Tax offsets71Effective marginal tax rates73Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care76Tax deductibility status of child care84Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care864Starting families89Financial disincentives to starting a family90Loss of salary and wages90Superannuation92Cost of raising children93HECS debts95Housing costs98Child care100		Personal income taxation	
Child Care Tax Rebate. 71 Tax offsets 71 Effective marginal tax rates 73 Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 100		Taxation measures relevant to families and carers	
Effective marginal tax rates73Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care76Tax deductibility status of child care84Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care864Starting families89Financial disincentives to starting a family90Loss of salary and wages90Superannuation92Cost of raising children93HECS debts95Housing costs98Child care100		Child Care Tax Rebate	
Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care 76 Tax deductibility status of child care 84 Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care 86 4 Starting families 89 Financial disincentives to starting a family 90 Loss of salary and wages 90 Superannuation 92 Cost of raising children 93 HECS debts 95 Housing costs 98 Child care 100		Tax offsets	71
Tax deductibility status of child care84Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care864Starting families89Financial disincentives to starting a family90Loss of salary and wages90Superannuation92Cost of raising children93HECS debts95Housing costs98Child care100		Effective marginal tax rates	73
Tax deductibility status of child care84Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care864Starting families89Financial disincentives to starting a family90Loss of salary and wages90Superannuation92Cost of raising children93HECS debts95Housing costs98Child care100		Fringe benefits tax exemption for employer-provided child care	
4 Starting families			
Financial disincentives to starting a family90Loss of salary and wages90Superannuation92Cost of raising children93HECS debts95Housing costs98Child care100		Goods and Services Tax (GST) treatment of child care	86
Loss of salary and wages	4	Starting families	89
Loss of salary and wages		Financial disincentives to starting a family	
Cost of raising children		Loss of salary and wages	
HECS debts		Superannuation	
Housing costs		Cost of raising children	
Child care 100		-	
Child care 100		Housing costs	
Career disincentives to starting a family103			
		Career disincentives to starting a family	103

iv

	Loss of career path	103
	Reduced training and professional development	105
	Social disincentives to starting a family	106
	Families devalued	106
	Increased life risks	107
	Gender roles	
	Explaining fertility rates	111
	International comparisons	111
	Factors in fertility decisions in Australia	114
	Age and delays in partnering	116
	Partnering in the future	
	Quality of the relationship	
	Recent changes to Australia's fertility rate	
5	Returning to paid work	131
	Introduction	
	Employment rates for women	
	Australia – the effects of economic factors	
	Australia – the effects of family responsibilities	
	Australia – the role of child care	
	Comparisons against the OECD	
	Discussion	
	Work practices and culture	
	Introduction	
	What can go wrong in the workplace?	
	Workplace better practice	
	Use of family friendly arrangements	
	Australian Workplace Agreements and WorkChoices	
	Are family friendly arrangements changing over time?	
	How are workers adapting?	
	What arrangements do workers want?	
	What does a flexible workplace look like?	
	Business case for family friendly working arrangements	
	Driving cultural change	
	Is regulation required?	

Paid maternity leave	
Access in Australia	
Comparison with OECD countries	
Discussion	
Welfare to work	
Jobless households in Australia	
Australian Government policy	
Conclusion	
Choice and flexibility in child care	187
Use of child care in Australia	
Types of care	
Work-related child care	
Child care costs	
Informal care arrangements	
Child care and the economy	
Facilitating economic activity	
Long-term socio-economic outcomes	
Problems in accessing care	
Parents' working hours and working patterns	
Waiting lists for child care places	
Child care affordability	
Difficulties related to the age of children	
Preferences for child care	
Children's development	
Children's care needs	
Reliability and security	
In-home care sector	
Australian Government's In-Home Care program	
In-home (nanny) care industry	
Black market in in-home care	
Encouraging a professional in-home care sector	
Au pairs	
Supporting all child care choices	
rr	

6

	Inconsistencies in approved and registered care	
7	Tax relief for child care	233
	Salary sacrifice	
	Who is salary sacrificing for child care?	
	Business premises limitation	
	Small and medium-sized workplaces	
	Regional and rural workplaces	
	Are workplaces places for children?	
	Reforming the business premises limitation	
	Child care facility limitation	
	Business support for reform	
	Tax deductibility for child care	
	Child Care Tax Rebate	
	Essential cost of working	
	Nexus between child care and income	
	'Private and domestic' expense	
	Benefits of a tax deduction for child care	
	Ensuring a fair distribution of assistance	
	Note for implementation	
	Conclusion	
	Additional comments by the Hon Alan Cadman MP	
8	Elder and disability carers	271
	Introduction	
	Profile of elder and disability caring in Australia	
	Economic value of informal care	
	Effect of caring on labour force status	
	Family friendly work arrangements	
	Psychological and physical impact on carers	
	Policy issues	
	Cost of care	
	Program flexibility	

viii

Clarifying Statement - Mrs Louise Markus MP
Dissenting Report - Julia Irwin MP, Jennie George MP, Harry Quick MP, Kate Ellis MP
Appendix A - List of submissions
Appendix B - List of Exhibits
Appendix C – List of Public Hearings
Appendix D – Consultant's Report - Access Economics Pty Ltd
Appendix E– Consultant's Report - Econtech Pty Ltd
Appendix F– Source Notes for Table 2.8401

Foreword

This inquiry into balancing work and family has been comprehensive. It has covered social change since the 1960s, the tax system, the benefits system, fertility, workplace relations, child care and care of the disabled. Each of these topics could be an inquiry in their own right, but what makes this inquiry stand out is the committee has examined how each of these interacts with the others.

Consistent with the broad scope of the inquiry, the committee received 225 submissions and held 25 public hearings, covering every state and territory. The committee received evidence from over 200 witnesses at these hearings.

One of the common themes throughout the inquiry has been the effect of women's education on Australia's economic growth. Women now comprise the majority of people obtaining post school qualifications and finishing Year 12. If this trend continues, women will hold the majority of Australia's human capital. Women's workforce participation has been consistently increasing over the past few decades, while men's participation has been gradually declining.

The government needs a return on the investment in these women's education, in particular from their participation in the paid workforce, but without forcing them to become the 'overstressed supermum'.

In research commissioned by the committee, Access Economics have found that improved women's workforce participation could add an additional 2.8 to 4.4 per cent to national income over the estimates made in the 2002 intergenerational report. As a policy initiative, improved women's participation would add more to national income than the 2000 tax reforms (2.5 per cent), and could almost be as much as national competition policy (5.5 per cent).

Throughout the inquiry, the committee heard evidence of the stress placed on families by the current child care policies. This has occurred not by design, but because they do not meet the needs of people who want to have a working life and a family life.

For example, a major recurring theme to emerge during the inquiry has been the manner in which our tax system unfairly burdens women in the workforce. It fails to value their growing contribution to taxation revenue. Currently, child care expenses are not tax deductible except by way of salary sacrifice, which is currently very limited. This constitutes a barrier to women wanting to return to the paid workforce and a disincentive to starting families.

This approach may have had some justification when women's participation rate in the workforce was low. Home and work were separate from each other and operated independently.

All this has changed. Women now have a major role in the paid economy whilst still managing their households. Home and work are no longer independent of each other, so to disallow child care expenses as a tax deduction because of their perceived private character no longer makes sense. If the Welfare to Work program recognises that access to suitable child care is a pre-requisite for a parent to be made to participate in the workforce, then so should the tax system.

Giving workers a tax concession for child care expenses would acknowledge the economic contribution made by personal income tax dollars, and give back to these workers some of what they have earned through their own exertions. It acknowledges that, in a competitive global economy, Australia cannot afford to lose some of its most highly-educated and highly-skilled workers.

For the 2003-04 income year, the last year for which tax return data is available from the Australian Taxation Office, 50 per cent of personal income tax - or \$47.8 billion - was collected from the 14 per cent of taxpayers who were in the top marginal bracket in that financial year. While this distribution may have been flattened somewhat by structural tax cuts announced in the 2006-07 Budget, there is no doubt that tax paid by higher income earners represents a significant contribution to government revenue.

Higher income earners, which includes women who have worked and studied hard, contribute to the necessary subsidies paid by way of the excellent Family Tax Benefits and Child Care Benefit to lower and some middle income earners. However, higher income earners receive no recognition of the additional taxation dollars they are generating by remaining in paid work.

One consequence of the Family Tax Benefits and the Child Care Benefit is that families with children now have a higher net tax threshold. This is the income a family needs to earn before its income tax payments exceed benefits and assistance received. The table shows that, over the last 10 years, the real net tax threshold has risen by \$15,000 for many families.

Family type	Real net tax threshold (\$)		
	1996-97	2006-07	Change (%)
Sole parent	34,594	48,065	38.9
Single income couple with children	34,021	48,065	41.3
Dual income couple with children (75:25 split)	34,650	51,829	49.6
Dual income couple with children (60:40 split)	34,749	50,910	46.5
Dual income couple with children (67:43 split)	34,703	51,808	48.1

Increases in real net tax thresholds for families, 1996-97 to 2006-07

Source Budget Paper no 1, 2006-07 Federal Budget, Statement 5: Revenue, table B1, p 5-26. Families are assumed to have two children, one aged three and the other aged eight. The figures in brackets represent the wages of each adult in the family, expressed as a proportion of average weekly ordinary time earnings for full time employees.

In terms of women's participation, Access Economics' report to the committee states that the highest growth in national income will come from more women becoming full time workers. Thus, Australia needs to actively encourage its highincome earners to participate in the workforce, both to their own advantage and that of the nation. A tax deduction gives people an incentive to move from part time to full time work and increase both family income and national income.

Fringe benefits tax was introduced in 1986. The fringe benefits legislation made employer-provided child care exempt from the tax, provided it occurred at a child care centre on the employer's business premises. This 'business premises' test has been interpreted by the Australian Taxation Office so that the employer must demonstrate control over the child care centre by being the owner or leaseholder of the property. Only large employers such as the banks, universities and governments have been able to meet these requirements. Across the economy, the value of salary sacrificing for child care has been marginal at best.

The committee's vision for employers is to greatly increase the options available to them to offer employees better child care options. For example, they are currently limited to building or leasing child care centres at enormous expense and financial exposure. Employers would be able to do a lot more for their staff if they had the choice of paying for: any number of places in a child care centre, an in-home (nanny) carer, family day care, occasional care, vacation care, or outside school hours care, without the penalty of fringe benefits tax.

Government policy has focussed on institutional or collective child care centres and, to a lesser extent, family day care in providing care to children under school age. Governments have overlooked the in-home care sector, including nannies. During the inquiry, the committee took evidence from a number of people who found that in-home care gave them the flexibility required to meet their work commitments. The committee also talked to people who would enter the workforce if they could afford the sort of flexible care that the in-home sector can provide. Parents might need in-home care if they work night shifts, irregular hours, weekends, or if they have special care requirements. Further, in-home care can be more cost effective for families with more than two children. Governments need to recognise that, as more and more older people continue to work longer, families will be less able to rely on grandparents to fill the child care gaps.

These issues are important to Australia's economic development. The Australian Bureau of Statistics has reported that there are currently 162,000 women in Australia who would join the workforce if they could access child care. If these women were to find child care immediately, this would increase the workforce participation rate for both men and women by over one per cent, with a similar effect on our national income.

The centrepiece of the report, therefore, is a suite of recommendations around the tax and child care systems that will make care more affordable and more flexible. In particular, the committee wished to give choices to mothers returning from the workforce to suit their family and personal circumstances at all incomes and levels of participation.

The committee commissioned research from Econtech to cost these recommendations. Due to time constraints and the fact that the Australian Bureau of Statistics' Child Care Survey is net of Child Care Benefit,¹ Econtech modelled a slightly different proposal.

The proposal modelled by Econtech was the same as the recommendations in this report, except that the tax deduction had some elements of the Child Care Tax Rebate. For example, it was applied to a family's child care costs net of the Child Care Benefit. Econtech found that the additional cost to the Australian Government of this modified proposal would be \$262 million per annum. Although this is slightly different to the recommendations in this report, the committee is confident that these estimates provide a useful indication of the costs of what should be implemented.

The effect of women's education and workforce participation was also reflected in the report's analysis of fertility rates. Evidence taken showed that obtaining post school qualifications tends to reduce a woman's fertility because she delays partnering while initially pursuing a career.

What is less well known is that having paid employment, and a workplace supportive of her wish to raise a family, in fact promotes a woman's fertility. In patriarchal societies where married women are still required to solely undertake domestic tasks, such as Italy, Spain and Japan, the fertility rates are low and are a

¹ The Bureau's data does not show both the amount of Child Care Benefit received and what the child care provider initially charged. They publish the net figure from combining the two.

major concern for their governments. In countries where women have more support to work, such as France, the Scandinavian and English-speaking countries, the fertility rates are significantly higher. This is a fundamental change to fertility patterns from previous generations.

Other aspects of fertility continue to change. For example, although more children are born before their parents marry, more fathers are being registered for these exnuptial births.

A key aspect to this inquiry is how workplaces in Australia are run and to what extent they recognise employees' family responsibilities. The committee found significant evidence that workplaces are changing to meet the needs of their staff. Since 1993, both men and women are now more likely to use work arrangements to care for their children. The arrangement growing the most rapidly is flexible hours, followed by part time work. Further, Australia had high levels of staff working flexible hours, compared with other OECD countries.

Under these circumstances, the committee has not recommended any additional regulation, such as the 'right to request' legislation in the United Kingdom. However, the committee has made some recommendations to improve the climate of negotiation in Australia and to clarify the business case to employers of flexible working. There is much to be gained by both management and staff in effective workplace negotiations. Businesses are more profitable and workers have more options in enjoying their family life.

The last chapter of the report covers carers of the elderly and people with a disability. These people do an enormously demanding job with only modest support from government. Many carers end their working lives socially isolated, with few assets and compromised health. The best way of giving these carers relief is to let them participate in the workforce.

However, the committee found that the services to help these people work, especially for the parents of disabled children, were virtually non-existent. The states, territories, and Commonwealth governments have been disputing who has responsibility for these services while the parents and their children continue to go without. If mainstream children are able to socialise and develop at child care, it is discriminatory to deny similar services to disabled children.

The committee has made recommendations to permit child care funding to be used more flexibly for disabled children. On an individual basis, children with a disability and their parents have much to gain from this report because the services currently available are so limited.

Completing a major report such as this requires the assistance of many people and organisations. Firstly, I would like to thank those who provided submissions and gave evidence at public hearings. The work of this committee depends a great deal on the contributions of ordinary individuals, as well as companies and experts,

and we very much appreciate the time and effort they put in to the inquiry. The Parliamentary Library, the Australian Bureau of Statistics and the Australian Institute of Family Studies provided significant assistance, helping the committee with a broad range of information.

I would also like to thank the members of the committee, particularly the Deputy Chair, Julia Irwin MP. My colleagues invested considerable time and effort in collecting the evidence for this inquiry, which is reflected in the report. The Committee Secretary, James Catchpole, and his team also deserve special mention for supporting the committee in its endeavours.

This report represents a snapshot of change in Australian society. Thirty years ago, whilst there were significant numbers of women in the workplace, participation rates have since increased dramatically while male participation has declined. What has also markedly changed is that many more women have post school qualifications. Women are accumulating economic power and this has given them a platform in the workplace and society from which to promote change.

The debate over balancing work and family still has a long way to go. The trend shows that women will ultimately hold as much economic power as men in Australia, in which case the changes that are occurring and will continue to occur are inevitable and to the benefit of our nation. It is not a question of our final destination, but what path we take and how quickly we arrive.

Hon Bronwyn Bishop MP Chairman

Postscript

For the clarification of readers of the report, I provide the following:

- a statement I made to the House yesterday on the conduct of the committee's report consideration meetings;
- correspondence from committee member Mr Ken Ticehurst MP, to the Speaker, on the conduct of the committee's report consideration meetings; and
- an overview of the report consideration process, including attendance at report consideration meetings.

Statement to the House from Hansard, Wednesday, 6 December 2006

'I rise to speak briefly about the matter that was raised after question time today concerning the Standing Committee on Family and Human Services and the consideration of the report which has taken place over some weeks. I just want to put on the record that the chairman's – that is, my – draft report was circulated to all members of the committee on Tuesday, 21 November and that there were then five consideration meetings: on Monday, 27 November, from 9.35 to 11.45 am; on Tuesday, 28 November, from 3.45 to 4.35 pm; on Tuesday, 28 November, from 8.11 to 9.33 pm; and on Thursday, 30 November, from 3.46 to 5.56 pm. Those meetings were attended by opposition members of the report on those occasions – five of the chapters were dealt with. The remaining two chapters were to be dealt with on Monday, 4 December. We met at about 9.10 am and we sat until 12.15. I realise that there was a vote going on for leadership for the opposition members, but I really did think they would come after the ballot had taken place.

There was also a very important reason for continuing with that meeting on 4 December, and that was that we had to deal with the very serious question of the leaking of the recommendations and material contained in the report. I stood in this place earlier this week and said that a journalist had called a staffer of mine and advised that he had been slipped a copy of the recommendations. I then sought advice of the Clerk. I spoke to the editor of the newspaper concerned and confirmed the advice in writing: that to publish would be in breach of the standing orders and that we would discuss that with the committee subsequently. It was an important thing to do, and it was also important to continue dealing with the report.

Because of the leaking of the material I was careful about the distribution of material. Nonetheless, when the report was finally compiled with all of the

amendments and the work that we had done, it was sent by electronic mail to all members of the committee, both government and opposition. There was a further meeting today at 3 o'clock, when we dealt with minutes. But unfortunately the opposition members did not appear at that meeting. They probably had very good reasons for not being there, but in fact they were not with us at that meeting.

I think the committee worked very hard and very studiously until the matter of the leaking of the recommendations, which really did make life very difficult. The committee really did feel, I think, that when material is leaked you have to take precautions to make sure that more material is not leaked. I would like to place on the record that all members of the committee have worked hard. I think perhaps the spill motion and people wanting to compete for frontbench positions and support other folk got in the way. I have to be very strong and simply say that the work of the committee has been good and that the outcome is important. For the record, I wanted to put those details into the *Hansard*.'

Correspondence from committee member Mr Ken Ticehurst MP

-----Original Message-----

From:	Ticehurst, Ken (MP)
Sent:	Thursday, 7 December 2006 7:49 AM
То:	Hawker, David (MP)
Cc:	Bishop, Bronwyn (MP)
Subject:	Family & Human Services Committee

Good morning Mr. Speaker,

Yesterday, I watched the orchestrated questions of feigned indignation to you by all the Labor members of the above committee. Although I am mainly recovering at home I have access to the webcast of parliament.

Last Monday morning I participated in the committee meeting by phone, as I was only available for the morning. The draft report had been sent via email many days before. As it runs to over 350 pages this is the best way to deliver such a document. This has been the usual practice.

While I was on the phone I had the radio running and was able to advise the committee members of the Labor leadership change shortly after 10:30 am. Soon after both the old & new Labor leaders were on air. This indicated that the meeting had concluded its main business and if Labor committee members were so concerned they could have joined the meeting. The decision not attend the meeting was theirs alone.

I can also confirm that the meeting was conducted in the normal manner, without any sign of haste, and indeed a little too slow for my phone battery (which was giving signals of running out of power). The meeting concluded around 12:15 pm.

Regards Ken Ticehurst Chair's Draft report -

• distributed Tuesday 21 November.

Report Consideration Meetings

Monday 27 November, 9.35am – 11.45am Hon B Bishop MP (Chairman) Mrs J Irwin MP Hon A Cadman MP Mr H Quick MP Ms J George MP

Tuesday 28 November, 3.45pm - 4.35pm

Hon B Bishop MP (Chairman)Mrs J Irwin MPHon A Cadman MPMrs L Markus MPMr D Fawcett MPMr H Quick MPMs J George MP

Tuesday 28 November 8.11pm - 9.33pm

Hon B Bishop MP (Chairman)Ms J George MPHon A Cadman MPMrs J Irwin MPMs K Ellis MPMrs L Markus MPMr D Fawcett MP

Thursday 30 November, 3.46pm – 5.56pm

Hon B Bishop MP (Chairman) Hon A Cadman MP Mr D Fawcett MP Ms J George MP Mrs J Irwin MP Mrs L Markus MP Mr H Quick MP

Monday 4 December, 10.09am - 12.15pm

Hon B Bishop MP (Chairman)Mrs L Markus MPHon A Cadman MPMr K Ticehurst (audio link)Mr D Fawcett MPMr K Ticehurst (audio link)

Final Report (near finalised version for printer)

- Hard copy to Chair, 10.50pm, Tuesday 5 December
- Distributed to Members 11.30am, Wednesday 6 December

xviii

Membership of the Committee

- Chair Hon Bronwyn Bishop MP
- Deputy Chair Mrs Julia Irwin MP

Members Hon Alan Cadman MP Ms Kate Ellis MP

Mrs Kay Elson MP

Mr David Fawcett MP

Ms Jennie George MP Mrs Louise Markus MP Mr Harry Quick MP Mr Ken Ticehurst MP

Committee Secretariat

Secretary	Mr James Catchpole
Inquiry Secretary	Mr David Monk
Senior Research Officers	Dr Louise Mendel (until October 2005)
	Ms Anna Engwerda-Smith (from November 2005)
Research Officer	Ms Belynda Zolotto
Administrative Officers	Ms Cate Dwyer (until April 2005)
	Ms Kyriaki Mechanicos (until November 2005)
	Ms Emily Shum

Terms of reference

"The House of Representatives Standing Committee on Family and Human Services has reviewed the 2003-2004 Annual Report of the Department of Family and Community Services and resolved to conduct an inquiry.

The Committee shall inquire into and report on how the Australian Government can better help families balance their work and family responsibilities. The Committee is particularly interested in:

- the financial, career and social disincentives to starting families;
- making it easier for parents who so wish to return to the paid workforce; and
- the impact of taxation and other matters on families in the choices they make in balancing work and family life."

Adopted by the Committee 9 February 2005

List of abbreviations

ABNs	Australian business numbers
ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ADHD	Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder
AEIOU	Autism Early Intervention Outcomes Units Inc
AWAs	Australian Workplace Agreements
CPI	Consumer Price Index
FBT	Fringe benefits tax
GST	Goods and Services Tax
HACC	Home and Community Care
HECS	Higher Education Contribution Scheme
HILDA	Household, Income and Labour Dynamics in Australia Survey
IVF	In-vitro fertilisation
NACBCS	National Association of Community Based Children's Services
NATSEM	The National Centre for Social and Economic Modelling
OECD	The Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
PBS	Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme
TFNs	Tax file numbers

List of recommendations

4 Starting families

Recommendation 1

The Department of Education, Science and Training arrange for the interest on HECS debts of second earners in couple families, and for single parents, to be frozen until their youngest child reaches school age.

Recommendation 2

The Department of Families, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs fund a public information campaign, aimed at both men and women, on the effects of age and late partnering on fertility.

Recommendation 3

The Department of Families, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs and the Attorney General's Department establish the following additions to the relationship education components of the Family Relationships Services Program:

- programs to be offered at different stages of relationships; and
- a multimedia campaign to highlight the availability of these courses and the benefits of attending and completing them.

5 Returning to paid work

Recommendation 4

The Department of the Treasury, for the 2007 and subsequent intergenerational reports, ensure that the analysis of women's workforce participation includes sensitivity analysis and is at least as rigorous as the analysis of men's workforce participation

Recommendation 5

The Australian Institute of Family Studies be funded to evaluate and report on the immediate and long term effects of AWAs, awards and certified agreements on how employees balance their work and family responsibilities.

Recommendation 6

The Australian Workplace Industrial Relations Survey (last conducted in 1995) be repeated and then conducted on a five year cycle. The survey should also collect the necessary data to assess whether women are paid the same as men for doing work of equal value, before and after the birth of their children.

Recommendation 7

The Department of Employment and Workplace Relations give the National Work and Family Awards greater credibility and impact by ensuring that future awards include a quantitative focus on the effectiveness of family friendly arrangements (eg reduced staff turnover) and management practices that deliver change (eg educating and training staff on the arrangements' use).

Recommendation 8

The Australian Government include in its WorkChoices program, via the Department of Employment and Workplace Relations, a public campaign highlighting the benefits of family friendly arrangements to both management and employees, including the opportunity for staff to negotiate with their employer on these issues.

Recommendation 9

The Department of Employment and Workplace Relations monitor rates of flexible working and caring in Australia and countries with 'right to request' legislation, such as the United Kingdom, and publicly report the results.

Recommendation 10

As a priority, the Australian Government target adults in jobless households with the goal of helping them obtain paid employment to break the cycle of disadvantage in Australia.

6 Choice and flexibility in child care

Recommendation 11

In-home (nanny) care be categorised as approved care, and thus attract payments and tax concessions extended to users of approved care, where providers are registered with the Family Assistance Office, and:

- have or are at an advanced stage of attaining a minimum Certificate II qualification in child care, or an equivalent recognition of prior learning; and
- have a current 'working with children' police record check; and
- have a current first aid certification.

Recommendation 12

The Government investigate the introduction of a national au pair program that would allow child care workers to live-in and work for a host family for 12 continuous months under a special category of visa.

Recommendation 13

Paid care currently categorised as registered, including family day care, occasional care, outside school hours care, private preschools and inhome care; excluding care provided by grandparents, relatives or friends; be re-categorised as approved care, and thus attract payments and tax concessions extended to users of approved care.

Recommendation 14

The registered care category and associated rates of Child Care Benefit continue to apply for work-related care that is provided by grandparents, relatives or friends who are registered with the Family Assistance Office.

7 Tax relief for child care

Recommendation 15

Fringe benefits tax be removed from all child care, so that all or any child care provision made by employers to assist employees is exempt, inclusive of salary sacrificing arrangements for child care

Recommendation 16

The existing Child Care Benefit and Child Care Tax Rebate be retained.

A choice should be afforded to working parents to opt for the Child Care Benefit and Child Care Tax Rebate, or to claim work-related child care costs as a tax deduction, either by way of a claim through their annual income tax return or by salary sacrificing.

Recommendation 17

The *Income Tax Assessment Act 1997* be amended to allow child care expenses incurred for the purposes of earning assessable income to be a tax deduction in the hands of the parent taxpayer who incurs the expenses.

A tax deduction shall only be claimed for the days of work on which the taxpayer can demonstrate that the care was necessary in order for them to work.

A tax deduction between parents in a couple family shall be apportioned between them in proportion to income earned by each.

Any unused portion of the tax deduction shall not be transferable between spouses.

Where a taxpayer elects to claim a tax deduction for child care expenses, Child Care Benefit and the Child Care Tax Rebate shall not be payable.

Where a taxpayer elects to claim the Child Care Benefit and Child Care Tax Rebate, a tax deduction shall not be available.

8 Elder and disability carers

Recommendation 18

The Australian Government consider allowing adults, who incur care costs for the care of elderly relatives or relatives with a disability, to have the choice of either receiving all current carers' benefits or claiming these costs as a tax deduction where they can demonstrate that paid care was necessary to allow them to work.

Recommendation 19

The Department of Families, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs make access to its funding programs more flexible, including the \$19,000 per child per annum under the Inclusion Support Scheme, so that community groups and businesses can establish child care centres that have expertise in the needs of children with a disability and allow the development of after school hours care and vacation care for special needs children.

Overview of the inquiry

Conduct of the inquiry

- 1.1 House of Representatives Standing Order 215(c) permits the committee to, among other things, make any inquiry it wishes to make into the annual reports of specified government departments and authorities. The committee reviewed the 2003-04 Annual Report of the Department of Family and Community Services and resolved on 9 February 2005 to conduct an inquiry into balancing work and family.
- 1.2 The inquiry was advertised in the national print media, through an extensive mail out to relevant parties, and through the House of Representatives' Liaison and Projects Office.
- 1.3 The committee received 225 submissions to the inquiry which are listed at Appendix A.
- 1.4 Eighty-one documents were received as exhibits to the inquiry and are listed at Appendix B.
- 1.5 Given the economic focus of this report, and the complexity of the interactions between families, work and taxation, the committee has invested in specialist analysis. As mentioned above, Access Economics was engaged as a consultant to the inquiry. Access Economics provided specialist macroeconomic modelling and analysis on women's workforce participation and the economic projections of the intergenerational report of 2002. The report is reproduced at Appendix D.
- 1.6 Econtech was also engaged as a consultant to the inquiry to undertake microeconomic modelling on the impact on individual families and on the federal budget of expanded salary sacrificing for child care, and tax deductibility for child care, including in-home carers (nannies). The report is reproduced at Appendix E.

1.7	In order to hear first-hand the views of the community, the committee
	held 25 public hearings between April 2005 and November 2006, taking
	evidence from over 200 witnesses in Sydney, Brisbane, Canberra, Hobart,
	Adelaide, Perth and Darwin. Public hearings for the inquiry are listed at
	Appendix C.

- 1.8 Appendix F contains source notes for Table 2.8: *Summary of major Australian Government payments to families and carers.*
- 1.9 The subject of the inquiry, it became clear, was meaningful to many Australians. It attracted national media headlines throughout, particularly on issues of child care and women's careers.

Structure of the report

- 1.10 This report is largely structured along the three terms of reference adopted by the committee at the initiation of the inquiry.
- 1.11 The second chapter outlines government assistance for families in Australia.
- 1.12 The third chapter examines taxation measures relevant to families and outlines the taxation treatment of child care in Australia.
- 1.13 The fourth chapter examines the financial, career and social disincentives to starting families. It also considers how tension between the labour market and the family, together with other social factors, could be contributing to Australia's low fertility.
- 1.14 The fifth chapter examines how parents and carers cope with the transition to paid work after periods of unpaid work.
- 1.15 The sixth chapter examines child care in Australia, including whether existing services are providing adequate flexibility and choice to parents.
- 1.16 The seventh chapter examines the child care disincentives and inequities that result under the *Fringe Benefits Tax Assessment Act 1986* and the *Income Tax Assessment Act 1997*. It considers taxation relief for child care.
- 1.17 The eighth chapter considers evidence received by the committee on the added pressures of those who care for a child with a disability or for an aged family member.

"