

**Submission Number: 45**

**Date Received: 27/8/08** *A.*

**The House of Representatives Standing  
Committee  
on Employment and Workplace Relations  
inquiry into  
Pay equity and associated issues related to  
increasing female participation in the workforce**

**Submission  
from  
Group Training Australia Ltd**

**Prepared by WorkSight Pty Ltd**

**August 2008**

Introduction .....	3
Background .....	3
Impact of Pay Inequity on Women .....	6
Factors Impacting on Pay Equity .....	7
Female apprentices and trainees in the Australian Workforce .....	8
Pay Equity and Industrial Allowances .....	10
Occupational Segregation.....	10
Case study Hairdressers and Mechanics .....	11
Apprentices regardless of their gender should receive a living wage.....	15
Female Apprentices and workforce participation .....	17
Conclusion .....	18
Recommendations: .....	18
Bibliography .....	20
Appendix A - Comparisons of Apprentice % in Selected Industries .....	24
Appendix B – Comparison of Allowances .....	34

## **Introduction**

Group Training Australia (GTA) is the largest employer network of apprentices and trainees in the country. It has been active in commissioning research and developing policy on apprenticeships and traineeships in the interests of a more informed public debate about national skills formation.

The GTA submission addresses issues that impact pay equity and the related ramifications for apprentices and trainees. GTA's research indicates that the significant difference between pay outcomes for apprentices and trainees employed in female dominated occupations arises from the extensive range of allowances which are paid in addition to the basic periodic rate of pay for male compared to female dominated occupations.

Statistics outlined in this submission identified that previous pay equity inquiries have not lead to a higher number of women apprentices employed in the trades nor have they increased the number of apprentices and trainees entering the female dominated trades.<sup>1</sup> Further, the current structural arrangements have not dealt with the inequities of industrial allowances and their application in the trades, particularly their limited use in female dominated occupations.

## **Background**

International bodies such as the United Nations (UN) have established criteria for national action on sex equality. This has resulted in marked similarities in anti-discrimination legislation, policies and concepts across nations on broad human rights principles. The similarities in prohibitions of discrimination in legislation across the industrialised countries are generally based upon the definitions in international conventions.

---

<sup>1</sup> Australian vocational education and training statistics - apprentices and trainees, December QTR, 2008

The ILO Convention 100, *Equal Remuneration for Work of Equal Value* (the Equal Remuneration Convention) requires ratifying countries to ensure the application to all male and female workers the principle of equal remuneration for equal value work. It requires a continuing program of action, rather than the achievement of the Convention's objectives prior to ratification. Whilst Australia ratified the convention in 1974 and equal remuneration provisions have been included in workplace relations and discrimination legislation, the extent to which it has been successful is still questioned, particularly when comparing female and male dominated jobs and industries.

The Equal Remuneration Convention covers pay equity work across occupations as well as within occupations.<sup>2</sup> The ILO Committee<sup>3</sup> is on record as stating that cross-industry comparisons are necessary when implementing and construing the Equal Remuneration Convention.

ILO Convention 111, *The Convention Concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation* ("the Discrimination Convention") requires parties to prevent discrimination in employment and occupation and advises that the principle of remuneration for work of equal value should be upheld and implemented.

The key link between the two Conventions is the recognition of the fundamental importance of pay equity as a measure of more general equality.

Discrimination is defined as:

(any) distinction, exclusion or preference, which has the effects of nullifying or impairing equality of opportunity or treatment in employment or occupation.

The ILO Committee of Experts, responsible for reporting on the Convention and its implementation at the national level, interprets the requirements of the Convention and provides guidance on key issues.

---

<sup>2</sup> Pittard 1994

<sup>3</sup> . ILO Equal remuneration: General Survey by the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations International Labour Office, Geneva 1986 at p. 10

This Committee has noted repeatedly that most ratifying countries have difficulty in applying the main requirement of the Convention, i.e. the application of equal pay for work of equal value. They point to a deficiency in knowledge of the inequality dynamics due to:

- Insufficient data and research;
- Lack of understanding of “equal value”;
- Ignorance of the job evaluation processes necessary for determining the relative value of jobs; and
- Inadequate financial resources for collection of data and instituting appropriate job evaluation schemes. (ILO 1986, 1990, 1993)

The Committee<sup>4</sup> has also stressed what it terms as “**the indivisibility of equality**”. That is, specific moves towards equality for women, such as equal pay and equal opportunity strategies, are inextricably linked to the general status of women. Justice Mary Gaudron, the first woman appointed to the High Court of Australia, put it best when stating, “Equality is a meaningless abstract unless it is founded on economic security and economic strength”.

The broad scope of the Conventions is recognition of that indivisibility. ILO 100, for example, requires that:

- All workers are covered;
- All forms of remuneration are included;
- Comparisons should be available across enterprises and across dissimilar work; and
- Comprehensive and explicit criteria should be used in describing and evaluating work.

---

<sup>4</sup> ILO 1986 p72, ILO p. 129-30

## Impact of Pay Inequity on Women

The implementation of pay equity has an important implication for equity and discrimination in the workplace. The undervaluing of women's work compared to men's and the clustering of women in low-paying occupational groups may involve discrimination on the basis of sex and therefore may be unlawful under human rights and anti-discrimination legislation. It is also contrary to basic human rights outlined in international conventions and in international human rights law.

Consideration should be given to the cost to society of pay inequity between men and women. These costs include the impact of low wages on women's economic independence both within and outside the family and their ability to maintain and support their families.

This position is supported in a discussion paper by Rubery (1992) that focuses in more detail on the benefits of introducing pay equity. Rubery argues that implementing the principle of equal pay for work of equal value would result in a reduction in household poverty and alleviation of the poverty trap. Benefits include an increase in economic freedom, and in the status and dignity attached to women's work for individuals.

In 2006 GTA commissioned the Centre for Applied Research in Social Science (CARSS) at the University of New England to examine apprentices' income in relation to their cost of living. This work was undertaken as a precursor to the Australian Fair Pay Commission's then review of junior and training wages and was included in the GTA submission on Award Modernisation. In 2007 GTA released the report "*Living standards of Apprentices*"<sup>5</sup> which provided a detailed analysis of the income of apprentices in several key industry sectors against a variety of benchmarks.

This research which is addressed in more detail later in the submission postulates that a reasonable living standard is unattainable for a first year apprentice regardless

---

<sup>5</sup> Bittman, M. Reavell, R. Smith, G. Battin, T. (2007)

of their gender. Coupled with the absence of significant industrial allowances in the female dominated trades pay inequity is more likely to occur.

### Factors Impacting on Pay Equity

Factors that result in remuneration discrimination can be characterised as built-in and external sources, Table 1. The factors are inter-linked and have impact on each other. Both built-in and external factors affect the valuation of work determined by remuneration.

Table 1 - Summary of Factors Relevant to the Determination of Remuneration <sup>6</sup>

Built-in	External
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Qualifications</li> <li>• Skills</li> <li>• Individual productivity</li> <li>• Experience or tenure</li> <li>• Job endowments, allowances (such as strength, creativity and other broad descriptor)</li> <li>• How work is described</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Institutional factors               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Tribunals</li> <li>Governments</li> <li>Union</li> <li>Regulation</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Market factors               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Nature of the product/service market</li> <li>Geographical location</li> <li>Location of workplace</li> <li>Size of organisation existence of pace setters</li> <li>Public or private sector</li> <li>Recognition of qualifications</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Sector productivity gains</li> <li>• Segmentation or segregation</li> <li>• Discrimination               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Age and gender characteristics</li> <li>Family status</li> <li>Nature of engagement (permanent, full-time, part-time, casual)</li> <li>Access to overtime and over award or above base payments or other such payments</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Nature of industrial arrangements:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Collective agreements</li> <li>Informal arrangements</li> <li>Individual contracts</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Consideration should be given to the following actions when addressing the built-in factors impacting on pay equity:

<sup>6</sup> Gregory, 1998

- The need for a properly considered base rate of pay;
- Provision of career paths;
- Consideration of post qualification skills;
- The need to test rates of pay in a formal way against a relevant market group in male and/or female sectors;
- Ensuring regular review of rates;
- Providing relevant skills descriptors; and
- Recognition of hard and soft skills.

Consideration should be given to the following actions when addressing the external factors impacting on pay equity:

- Access to overtime and bonus payments;
- Operation of the market and interaction with the other job markets;
- Existence of promotional and /or incremental payments;
- Relevance of penalty rates and allowances
- Recognition of occupational segregation;
- Access to all positions;
- Access to a range of work models- full-time, part-time, casual or permanent;
- Consideration of job size;
- Size of employer; and
- Access to career breaks;

## Female apprentices and trainees in the Australian Workforce

The factors outlined previously in this paper apply to all women workers including apprentices and trainees. Their wages and conditions are linked directly to those of the trade or appropriately qualified person in their chosen vocation. On that basis,



the impact of the inequities on the apprentice or trainee, which may or may not be applied in that vocation, continue during their period of training.

The majority of female apprentices are located in the ASCO 45 classification Food Tradespersons and 49 Other Tradesperson and related workers (where hairdressers can be found). In the October to December 2007 quarter, there were 4,722 and 12,946 new entrants to training respectively in these trades. During the same quarter 20,208 females entered apprenticeships compared with 151,777 male new entrants. These statistics confirm larger numbers of males are entering trades. Where women are entering they continue to be located in the female dominated vocational groups perpetuating the ongoing occupational and gender segregation in the Australian workforce.

The reasons for the ongoing pattern may vary, including females not wishing to undertake the type of work in some trades, their knowledge of the trade due to the gender stereotyping and lack of promotion of all trades during career counselling or employment and training organisations.

The industrial instruments that regulate the pay and conditions for tradespeople also regulate the pay and conditions for apprentices and trainees. In most instances the basic rate of pay for a tradesperson is the same regardless of whether they are working in female or male dominated occupations. The majority of apprenticeship rates of pay are structured as a percentage of the relevant trade's rate with the rates of pay increasing on an annual basis. Most recently this has been as a result of the Australian Fair Pay Commission (AFPC) increases to the minimum rates of pay.

There is significant variation in the apprenticeship percentages even when the trade rate is the same, as shown in **Appendix A**. It would be expected that, if the trade monetary rate is equal, then the level of skill required to complete the trade would also be equal. However, the application of different percentages when calculating apprentice rates of pay results in the varying rates of pay for apprentices. This seems to defy any logic – if it is agreed that the tradesperson in a variety of trades should be rewarded on the same basis, why not the apprentices?

## Pay Equity and Industrial Allowances

Allowances are additional payments made to employees over and above their base rate of pay. Allowances can be provided as either specified in an employment agreement, as a discretionary payment, or as an additional component of remuneration paid to a group of employees such as managers. The application of allowances to different classifications of workers may contribute to pay equity problems. There are significant differences in the range and amount of allowances paid in male dominated industries when compared to their female counterparts.

Allowances have been introduced in some industries to compensate for working in unpleasant conditions, the provision and maintenance of tools, working unsociable hours and being on call to return to work. In many instances allowances were introduced to increase wages without increasing the hourly or weekly rates of pay. Those industries and occupations that have had industrial strength or are well unionised have benefited most from this system. The use of allowances in female dominated industries is limited and are usually significantly lower in value than those of training in male dominated trades. This is likely to lead to a pay inequity even when the trade rate, thus skill level, has been deemed to be equal. **Appendix B** outlines these allowances.

In some industries allowances form a significant proportion of the apprentice's wage. The application and disparity across industries creates further complexity and possible inequity in the current system of apprentice pay and adds to opportunities for gender pay inequity. The criteria for determining whether an apprentice has an entitlement to an allowance can be involved. It can be further complicated by differing rules as to whether they receive the full allowance which would be received by the tradesperson or only a proportion of it. **Appendix B** shows the variations in the application of allowances across industries.

## Occupational Segregation

Issues of the value of work underpin both horizontal and vertical segregation of occupations. Vertical segregation prevents women accessing highly paid positions.

This may be through barriers to career progression and/or work undertaken being undervalued when set against the occupation hierarchy. Horizontal segregation can provide a negative impact on women's earnings as areas of work in which women are predominantly employed are viewed as unskilled, subject to deskilling strategies and undervalued. The following case study provides an example of the impact of occupational segregation, the application of industrial allowances and the value placed upon the work undertaken.

### ***Case study Hairdressers and Mechanics***

In 1996 the NSW Department of Industrial Relation commissioned a research project *Trade Credentials: Do They Help Pay equity?* comparing Hairdressers to Mechanics. This research was submitted as evidence before the NSW Industrial Relations Commission Pay Equity Inquiry.

The case study measured the effects of the formal recognition of skills exercised by working women on pay equity. The data was obtained from the vocational education system, trade unions, industry associations, industrial tribunals and government organisations.

The research outlined:

*The choice of hairdressers and motor mechanics as female and male counterparts respectively was prompted by several factors: both occupations are underpinned by trade credential; both are in the service sector; both are characterised by high rates of employee turnover; both are licenced by a regulatory body; and motor mechanics rank among the lowest paid of those employed in the male dominated trades.*

*Hairdressers in NSW are covered by the Hairdressers &c. (State) Award. Most motor mechanics are covered by the Federal Vehicle Industry Repair, Service and Retail Award 1983.*

*The hairdressing and motor mechanical trades workforces are relatively young, with low proportions of workers over 40 years of age. Employment is dispersed across a large number of small enterprises, the majority of which employ less than five people. Both groups have a high degree of mobility out of their respective sectors. Both*

*occupations are highly gendered, with 76 per cent of hairdressers being women and 99 per cent of motor mechanics being men.*

*To qualify as a tradesperson in both these fields, an apprenticeship must be completed. In both cases, this requires satisfactory completion of a TAFE course plus on the job training, and the licensing of tradespeople is practised. In the motor vehicle repair trade, the licensing of workplaces is also required. In relation to hairdressing sections of the Local Government Act 1919 (NSW), which set certain standards for hairdressing premises and required those premises to be licensed, have been repealed and this has contributed to the rapid growth in mobile and home based hairdressers.*

### **Findings**

*The case study tests the extent to which the formal recognition of skill exercised in a female dominated occupation contributes to gender pay equity. The following pay equity issues were identified as a result of this investigation:*

### **Regulation**

*Since 1987, the inclusion in the hairdressers' award of wage movements available through successive state wage case decisions has been consistently delayed.*

*While motor mechanics have found their labour market indirectly tightened by consumer protection legislation, regulatory arrangements in hairdressing have been wound back.*

### **Skills and Training**

*Traditional assumptions that value technical skills over creativity and which under represent technical skills in hairdressing have affected remuneration levels in these occupations.*

*Motor mechanics have better access to career paths, which is reflected in post trade classifications and rates of pay in formal and informal workplace agreements. The*

*hairdressing award fails to recognise post trade training, skills and experience in its classification structure.*

*The hairdressing award contains an anomaly whereby beauticians are paid only 92 per cent of the trade rate, even though this rate is lower than that which salon assistants/receptionists receive under the same award.*

### **Remuneration**

*The difference in average weekly earnings at the time of the research was as follows:*

*Male motor mechanics earn \$119.80 more per week than female hairdressers on ordinary time measures for very similar hours. The gap widens to \$170.60 per week on total earnings for an average of 2.2 hours more work.<sup>7</sup>*

*Higher ordinary time earnings for motor mechanics occur through higher over award payments, penalty rates, shift allowances, and other allowances, such as tool allowance. The difference in total earnings is due to overtime payments received by motor mechanics.*

*Penalty rates in hairdressing have been progressively reduced over the past 20 years as a result of deregulation of retail trading hours.*

*Over award payments for motor mechanics are significantly more accessible, and are paid for a combination of additional skill, experience and training.*

*Hairdressers rely on commissions based on market share (the number of clients they attract), for over award payments.*

*A series of inspections conducted by the Arbitration Inspectorate on the south coast of NSW, and supported by the Australian Workers' Union and the Professional Hairdressers' Association, identified significant breaches of the award in hairdressing.*

---

<sup>7</sup> note the wages outlined in the research are from 1996 however the disparity has not altered

## **Recommendations**

*A number of recommendations were made, based on the findings of the case study, in order to achieve pay equity for women working under the hairdressers' award.*

*These include:*

*the development of a post trade classification structure tied to reforms of the present licensing system, including recognition of all aspects of beauty treatment and new license classes for hairdressers which recognise post trade qualifications.*

- the establishment of an apprenticeship development working party to investigate further development of apprenticeships in the beauty trades and consider the reform of the beautician classification into a number of trades;*
- that the Women's Equity Bureau monitor key awards for women and advise respondents of their currency and rates relative to wage case decisions. This information could be used in the three yearly review of awards under Section 19 of the Industrial Relations Act 1996 (NSW); and,*
- that DIR consider recommending to the Minister that he refer or initiate proceedings on this matter to the NSW Industrial Relations Commission under Section 146 and Section 167 of the Industrial Relations Act 1996 (NSW).*

## **Pay Equity Inquiry**

*The case study was submitted by the Crown in evidence at the NSW Pay Equity Inquiry consistent with the case studies recommendations.*

*Consistent with the case study, Glynn J., hearing the Inquiry, reported that the hairdressers' award contained a number of shortcomings. Post trade qualifications and training are not recognised in the award and should be. The failure to reward additional skills demonstrates undervaluation of work. Additionally, the Inquiry found that the 1973 Equal Pay Principles have not been fully applied to the award. Her Honour also found that the setting of rates of pay in hairdressing is affected by*

*factors that contribute to undervaluation in female dominated industries, including small workplaces, low union membership, and low levels of industrial activity.*

This case study highlights the disparity in wages for female dominated occupations and male dominated occupations. The penalty rates and allowances applied in the trades directly relate to apprentices undertaking these trades and as a consequence the inequity commences from training.

### **Apprentices regardless of their gender should receive a living wage**

GTA believes that improvements to the apprenticeship and traineeship system is fundamental to addressing the current skills shortage in Australia. A range of reforms is currently the subject of COAG deliberations to ensure that the system has the capacity to support Australia's economic aspirations in the early decades of the 21<sup>st</sup> century.

As mentioned previously in this submission in 2006 GTA commissioned the Centre for Applied Research in Social Science (CARSS) at the University of New England to examine apprentices' income in relation to their cost of living. In 2007 GTA released the report "*Living standards of Apprentices*"<sup>8</sup> which provided a detailed analysis of the income of apprentices in several key industry sectors against a variety of benchmarks.

Specifically, the report compared apprentice earnings to those of (a) qualified tradespersons; (b) unskilled labourers; (c) minimum wages (determined by relevant tribunals/commission); (d) average male earnings (as used in the Henderson Poverty Line); (e) *Newstart* (the Australian government benefit that would be paid to apprentices if they were unemployed); and, finally (f) to government-developed *Indicative Budget Standards for Australia*.

A strong test of the adequacy of income is to explore whether it is sufficient to buy the necessities of life. The most comprehensive study of this kind was prepared for the Department of Family, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs in 1997.

---

<sup>8</sup> Bittman, M. Reavell, R. Smith, G. Battin, T. (2007)

Known as *Indicative Budget Standards for Australia* this study put together a comprehensive basket of goods that covered all categories of expenditure.

As indicated above, in the “*Living standards of Apprentices*” report income is also compared with the adapted and updated *Indicative Budget Standards for Australia* as a way of examining whether an apprentice’s income supports a standard of living acceptable to the Australian community. Budget standards are calculated at two levels - an austere (near poverty) **low cost** standard and a **modest but adequate** standard (which represent the living standard of middle Australia).

The relevant budget standards have been adapted to represent the needs of apprentices, updated to reflect current prices and recalculated for different regions (each of seven capital cities). Three housing scenarios have been modelled. In the *first* scenario the apprentice lives with their parents and pays no board (that is, the parents meet the costs of housing the apprentice). In the *second* scenario the apprentice pays their parents \$80 for accommodation. In the *third* scenario the apprentice shares a rented unit with another young person and pays half a median market rent.

Using the Commonwealth Government’s indicative budget standards with its two benchmarks the research demonstrated that:

*In all jurisdictions, first year apprentices cannot achieve even the low cost standard if they pay their parents a nominal \$80 for their accommodation. The living standard typical of ‘middle Australia’ is unattainable for a first year apprentice even if they are wholly dependant on their parents for accommodation. The prospects of living away from the parental home, even at a meagre low cost standard is beyond the reach of most second year apprentices.*

As the report concluded:

*... This is likely to lead [to] apprenticeships being perceived as an unattractive lifestyle for those leaving school and seeking employment...<sup>9</sup>*

---

<sup>9</sup> Bittman, M. Reavell, R. Smith, G. Battin, T. (p. 18, 2007)



The report made for sobering reading at a time when policy makers have been trying to both increase the number of commencements in the traditional trades as well as staunch the high attrition rates in the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> years.

### Female Apprentices and workforce participation

Female apprentices are concentrated in two occupational groups, hospitality and hairdressing. Statistics from the National Centre for Vocational Education Research (NCVER) indicate that there has been an overall increase in the number of women apprentices in traditional trades since 1995.

In the female-dominated ASCO *Food Tradespersons* category, the statistics show that the number of female commencements increased from 1,479 in 1995 (or 27.77% of all female traditional trade commencements in that year) to 3,588 in 2007 (or 30.16% of all female traditional trade commencements in that year). However the total number of commencements (males and females) in this ASCO category as a percentage of commencements in all trades decreased from 14.85% in 1995 to 14.61% in 2007.

In the other female-dominated ASCO category *Other Tradespersons and Related Workers* (where hairdressers are categorised) the total number of commencements (males and females) decreased as a percentage of commencements in all trades from 15.27% in 1995 to 13.60% in 2007. The number of female commencements in this ASCO category also decreased as a percentage of the total number of female commencements in all traditional trades from 3,271 (61.43%) in 1995 to 6,456 (54.26%) in 2007.

These figures appear to indicate that the pay equity inquiries held in the early part of the 2000s have not been successful in attracting women to the trades. Minor increases in women entering trades have occurred in ASCO 43 Electrical and Electronics Tradespersons, ASCO 44 Construction Tradespersons and ASCO 46 Skilled Agricultural and Horticultural Workers. However there has been a significant decrease in women entering the ASCO 42 Automotive Tradespersons.

## Conclusion

Australia's workforce is still highly segregated and, as consequence the opportunity for pay inequity arises. Apprentices' and trainees' wages and conditions are directly impacted upon by the outcomes achieved for the relevant tradesperson. Consequently, where inequities occur in the trade it would also be experienced by the apprentice or trainee who is earning a proportion of the tradesperson's wage. As noted in this submission, Bittman (2007) identified that those apprentices in their first year of training have a very limited income and thus pay inequity would only increase their level of dissatisfaction.

The basic rate of pay in Australia is seen as providing equal pay for work of equal value. However the lack of the additional allowances and penalties paid in female dominated industries and the limited penetration of females into male dominated industries may perpetuate pay inequity in Australia. Those industries which are female dominated do not attract the same level of additional payments as those which are male dominated. The literature suggests that skills associated with female dominated industries are not as highly valued. Historically male industries that are highly unionised are more likely to receive additional allowances paid for unpleasant working conditions or provisions of tools. The question arises at this point as to whether some disabilities are worth more than others.

## Recommendations:

In the Committee's considerations GTA would recommend:

The collection of disaggregated data regarding the application of industrial allowances and other over award payments across trades and occupation which impact upon pay equity.

Investigate the impact of lower overall wages for apprentices in female dominated industries on their commencement in a trade.

Collect information about barriers to women participating in male dominated apprenticeships

Ensure career advisors and other employment bodies have knowledge of pay equity issues and an understanding of trades.



## Bibliography

Acker, J. Doing Comparable Worth Philadelphia: Temple Press 1989

Bellak, A. Specific job evaluation systems: the Hay Guide Chart-Profile Method. Chapter 15 in Milton L. Rock (ed).

Bevan, S. and Thompson, M. Merit Pay, Performance Appraisal and Attitudes to Women's Work, Institute of Manpower Studies Report No. 234, prepared for the UK Equal opportunities Commission, Brighton, October 1992

Bittman, M. Reavell. R, Smith. G and Battin. T. University of New England's Centre of Applied Research in Social Science in to the Living Standards of Apprentices October 2007

Brown, H The Inequality of Pay. California: University of California Press 1997

Burton, C. Witness Statement NSW Pay Equity Enquiry 1998

Burton, C. The Promise and the Price, Allen and Unwin, Sydney, 1991

Burton, C. Jobs, Skills and Women in a Community Services Organisation Report prepared for the Affirmative Action Agency Model Directions Program. Sydney Affirmative Action Agency 1994

Chapman, B J and Mulvey, C An Analysis of the Origins of Sex Differences in Australian Wages The Journal of Industrial Relations, December 1986 Vol 28, No 4, pages 504 - 520

Cornish, C, cited in McColgan, A. Legislating Equal Pay? Lessons from Canada Industrial Law Journal, Vol. 22 1993

Equal Opportunities Review, Eclipse Group, London (journal published six times a year)

Equal Opportunities Commission, Code of Practice on Equal Pay, Manchester UK, January 1997

ILO Equal remuneration: General Survey by the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations International Labour Office, Geneva 1986

ILO Equal remuneration: General Survey by the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations International Labour Office, Geneva 1990

ILO Equal remuneration: General Survey by the Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations International Labour Office, Geneva 1993

Gregory G. Labour Council of NSW, Witness Statement NSW Pay Equity Inquiry 1998

Gunderson, M. Comparable Worth and Gender Discrimination: An International Perspective ILO Geneva 1994

Hutson, J Six Wage Concepts Surrey Hills, Sydney: Amalgamated Engineering Union.

Kidd, M P Sex Discrimination and Occupational Segregation in the Australian Labour Market The Economic Record 69 (204) March 1993, p 44-55)

Kidd, M P and Shannon, M Does the Level of Occupational Aggregation Affect Estimates of the Gender Wage Gap? (Industrial and Labour Relations Review, Vol 49, No 2 January 1996, p 317-329

Lambert, S, Petridis, R and Galea, J Occupational Segregation in Full-time and Part-time Employment Australian Bulletin of Labour; Vol 22, No 3, September 1996, p 212-231

Langford, M S The Gender Wage Gap in the 1990s Australian Economic Papers, Vol 34, No 64, June 1995, pages 62-85)

Pittard, M.J “International Labour Standards in Australia: Wages Equal pay, Leave and Termination of Employment” (1994) 7 Australian Journal of Labour Law 170 at 195.

Rimmer, S Occupational Segregation, Earnings Differentials and Status among Australian Workers The Economic Record, September 1991, Vol 66, No 198, pages 205-216

Rimmer, S Australian Labour Market and Microeconomic Reform (LaTrobe University Press, 1994

Rosenbaun, J. Hierarchical and individual effects on earnings Industrial relations Vol. 19No.1 winter 1980.

Rubenstein, M. Equal Pay for Work of Equal Value: the new regulations and their implications London: Macmillan.

Rubery, J. Economic of Comparable Worth, Equal Opportunity Commission Research Discussion series, No.3 1992

Schwab, D. Job Evaluation and pay setting: concepts and practices, in E. Robert Livernash (ed)

Smith, L The EEOCs bold foray into job evaluation Fortune 98 11 September 1978

Sorensen, E. Equal pay for comparable worth: a policy for eliminating the under valuation of women’s work Journal of Economic Issues Vol.18 No.2 June 1984

Thomson, P Assessing Prior Achievement: Methods for recognising Learning Gained Through Experience NOOSR Discussion Paper July 1992

Thurow, L. Equity concepts and the world of work. Ch.10 in Albert Biderman and Thomas Dury (ed)

Thornton, M (Un)equal pay for work of equal value The Journal of Industrial Relations Vol. 23 No.4 December 1981

Vella, F, Gender Roles, Occupational and Gender Wage Differentials. Economic Record 1993

Warren, B and Boone, C. AFSCME v State of Washington: Title VII as a winning strategy to end wage discrimination Women's Rights Law Reporter Vol.8

Whitehouse, G. Legislation and the Labour Market gender Equality: An Analysis of OECD Countries Work Employment and Society, Vol 6, 1992

## Appendix A - Comparisons of Apprentice % in Selected Industries

### BUILDING AND CONSTRUCTION

State	Award		1 <sup>st</sup> yr %	2 <sup>nd</sup> yr %	3 <sup>rd</sup> yr %	4 <sup>th</sup> yr %	
Tasmania	Building and Construction Industry Award AN170010	<i>Roof tiler</i>	55	75	90		
		<i>Artificial stoneworker, bricklayer, carpenter, glazier, painter, plasterer</i>	38	55	75	90	
		<i>Signwriter</i>	38	55	75	90	
	National Building and Construction Industry Award AP790741 (Tasmanian Version)	<i>Note: years have corresponding stages</i>					
		<i>Apprentice Signwriter</i>	38	55	75	90	
		<i>Apprentice other than signwriter</i>	38	55	75	90	
	Building Trades Award AN170011	<i>Carpenter, glazier, boilermaker, painter</i>	38	55	75	90	
<i>Signwriter</i>		38	55	75	90		
Victoria	See federal						
New South Wales	Building and Construction Industry (State) Award AN120089	<i>Carpenter, joiner, stonemason</i>	35.4955	50.3544	65.4745	76.2307	
		<i>Bricklayer &amp; tiler</i>	35.8881	50.9113	66.1987	77.0739	
		<i>Painter</i>	36.5203	51.8082	67.3649	78.4316	
		<i>Plaster, &amp; Floor layer</i>	35.7277	50.6838	65.9029	76.7295	
		<i>Roof Tiler</i>	36.1317	51.2647	66.6581	77.6088	
		<i>Sign Writer</i>	35.3163	50.1002	65.1441	75.8460	



ACT	Building and Construction Industry (ACT) Award AP817145	<i>Construction Apprentice</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 40 2 <sup>nd</sup> 6 months: 45	60	75	90
		<i>Maintenance Joiner and/or Workshop Apprentice</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 40 2 <sup>nd</sup> 6 months: 45	60	75	90
Queensland	Building and Construction Industry Award AN140043	<i>Note: each yr also corresponds to a stage</i>				
		<i>Apprentices – General Construction – see coverage in award</i>	40	55	75	90
		<i>Roof Tiling</i>	45	60	75	90
		<i>Waterproofing</i>	68	78	90	90
		<i>Sign Writing</i>	45	60	75	90
Northern Territory	Building and Construction Industry (Northern Territory) Award AP812941	<i>Carpenter/ Joiner/ Cabinet Maker</i>	40	50	70	85
		<i>Bricklayer, plasterer, tiler</i>	40	50	70	85
		<i>Plumber gasfitter</i>	40	50	70	85
		<i>Painter</i>	40	50	70	85
South Australia						

Western Australia	Building Trades Award (Construction) Award AN160034	4 yr term	42	55	75	88
		3 ½ yr term <i>Note: ignore top headings</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 42	Next yr: 55	Next following yr: 75	Final yr: 88
		3 yr term	55	75	88	
		2 yr term <i>Note: 2 yr term does not appear to apply to Plumbers and Gasfitters</i>	55	75		
	Building Trades Award AN160037	4 yr term	42	55	75	88
		3 ½ yr term <i>Note: ignore top headings</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 42	Next yr: 55	Next following yr: 75	Final yr: 88
		3 yr term	55	75	88	
		adult apprentices – <i>to be advised</i>				
Federal	AWU Construction and Maintenance Award AP815828		Stage 1: 76.565202	Stage 2: 83.794535	Stage 3: 92.459357	
	National Building and Construction Industry Award AP790741	<i>Carpenter and/or Joiner Apprentices</i>	First months: 3 35 Next months: 9 45	55	75	90
		<i>Plasterer Apprentice</i>	First months: 3 35 Next months: 9 45	55	75	90
		<i>Painter Apprentices – completed a pre- apprenticeship course</i>	50	75	90	
		<i>Painter Apprentices – have not completed a pre- apprenticeship course</i>	First months: 6 35 Second months: 6 45	55	75	90

		<i>Signwriter Apprentices – completed a pre-apprenticeship course</i>	50	75	90	
		<i>Signwriter Apprentices – have not completed a pre-apprenticeship course</i>	First months: 6 35 Second months: 6 45	55	75	90
		<i>Bricklayer Apprentices</i>	First months: 3 30 Next months: 9 40	60	80	

## ELECTRICAL

State	Award		1 <sup>st</sup> yr %	2 <sup>nd</sup> yr %	3 <sup>rd</sup> yr %	4 <sup>th</sup> yr %
Tasmania	National Electrical Electronic & Communications Contracting Industry Award AP791396 (Tasmanian Version)		40	52	70	82
Victoria	See federal below					
New South Wales	Electricians & C. (State) Award An 120192	<i>Indentured apprentice</i>	35.9131	48.7373	70.4003	80.8280
		<i>Trainee apprentice</i>	41.3846	55.4544	77.5812	85.1057
ACT						
Queensland	Electrical Contracting Industry Award AN140103	<i>Note: each yr also corresponds to a stage</i>				
		<i>Apprentices</i>	40	55	75	90
		<i>Adult apprentices</i>	75	80	84	90
Northern Territory	Electrical Engineering Contracting and Industries (NT) Award AP819377	<i>Electrical mechanic</i>	40	50	70	85
		<i>Linesman</i>	40	50	70	85

Western Australia	Electrical Contracting Industry Award AN160108	4 yr term	39	51	67	79
		3 ½ yr term <i>Note: ignore top headings</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 39	Next yr: 51	Next following yr: 67	Final yr: 79
		3 yr term	51	67	79	
		Adult apprentices: 4 yr term	67	67	67	79
		Adult apprentices: 3 ½ yr term	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 67	Next yr: 67	Next following yr: 67	Final yr: 79
		Adult apprentices: 3 yr term	67	67	79	
		Federal	Nat Electrical Electronic & Communications Contracting Industry Award AP791396	Victorian Rates	40	52

## FURNISHING

State	Award		1 <sup>st</sup> yr %	2 <sup>nd</sup> yr %	3 <sup>rd</sup> yr %	4 <sup>th</sup> yr %
Tasmania	Furnishing Trades Award AN170038	Junior apprentice (furniture, floor covering and finishing, piano tuning and repair)	42	55	75	88
		Adult apprentice (furniture, floor covering and finishing, piano tuning and repair)	83.5	88	93	98
		Apprentice – junior (glazing and flat glass processing other than safety)	40	50	71	85.5
		Apprentice – adult (glazing and flat glass processing other than safety)	83.5	88	93	98

Victoria	See federal					
New South Wales	Furniture and Furnishing (State) Award AN120222	<i>Indentured apprentice, 21 yrs or under</i>	51	60	75	90
		<i>Trainee apprentice, 21 yrs or under</i>	57	68	78	92
		<i>Adult apprentice – indentured apprentice, over 21 yrs</i>	61	65	75	90
		<i>Trainee apprentice – over 21 yrs</i>	65	70	78	92
ACT						
Queensland	Furniture and Allied Trades Award AN140128		Wage level 1: 40	Wage level 2: 55	Wage level 3: 75	Wage level 4: 90
Western Australia	Furniture Trades Award AN160137	<i>4 yr term</i>	42	55	75	88
		<i>3 ½ yr term</i> <i>Note: ignore top headings</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 42	Next yr: 55	Next following yr: 75	Final yr: 88
		<i>3 yr term (apprentices who have completed a full 12 months training)</i>	55	75	88	
		<i>3 yr term</i>	42	55	88	
Federal	Furnishing Industry National Award AP825280	<i>Apprentices (including NSW)</i>	42	55.3	75.4	88.5
		<i>Pre-apprenticeship (Victoria Only)</i>	55	75.3	Third year for the first 6 mths: 88.4	Thereafter: 100
		<i>Adult apprentices (including NSW)</i>	83.5	88.3	93.4	98.5
		<i>Adult pre-apprenticeship (Victoria Only)</i>	88	93.3	98.4	100

## MEAT

State	Award		1 <sup>st</sup> yr %	2 <sup>nd</sup> yr %	3 <sup>rd</sup> yr %	4 <sup>th</sup> yr %
New South Wales	Butchers Retail (State) Award AN120096	<i>Indentured Apprentice</i>	50	65	85	95
Queensland	Meat Industry (Other than export) Award AN140166	<i>Australian Meat Industry Training Package</i>	Wage level 1: 55	Wage level 2: 75		
		<i>Meat retailing and meat salesperson/packer apprenticeships and traineeships</i>	Wage level 1: 40	Wage level 2: 55	Wage level 3: 75	Wage level 4: 90
		<i>Meat retailing apprenticeships (other than training package)</i>	Wage level 1: 40	Wage level 2: 55	Wage level 3: 75	Wage level 4: 90
Northern Territory	Federal Meat Industry (Retail and Wholesale) Award AP805114		50	65	85	95
Western Australia	Meat Industry (State) Award AN160350	<i>4 yr term</i>	40	50	75	95
		<i>3 yr term</i>	50	75	95	
Federal	Federal Meat Industry (Retail and Wholesale) Award AP805114		50	65	85	95
	Federal Meat Industry (Smallgoods) Award AP805128		50	65	85	95

## HAIRDRESSING

State	Award		1 <sup>st</sup> yr %	2 <sup>nd</sup> yr %	3 <sup>rd</sup> yr %	4 <sup>th</sup> yr %
Victoria	Hairdressing and Beauty Services (Victoria) Award AP806816	<i>Apprentices – apprenticeship entered into on or after 1 January 2002</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 3 months: 35 Thereafter: 45	55	77	
		<i>Apprentices – apprenticeship entered into prior to 1 January 2002</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 3 months: 35 Thereafter: 40	55	70	85
		<i>Pre-apprenticeship – apprenticeship entered into on or after 1 January 2002</i>	First 6 months: 45 Next 12 months: 55 Next 12 months: 77			
		<i>Pre-apprenticeship – apprenticeship entered into prior to 1 January 2002</i>	First 6 months: 40 Next 12 months: 55 Next 12 months: 70 Next 12 months: 85			
		<i>Hairdressing Trainees</i>	See hrs conditions			
New South Wales	Hairdressers & C (State) Award AN120242	<i>Apprentice Hairdresser</i>	40	55	70	85
		<i>Apprentice Hairdresser completed Cert III and 1 yr pre-apprenticeship course</i>		2 <sup>nd</sup> yr for 6 months: 55	70	85
		<i>Apprentice Beautician</i>	40	55	70	85

<b>Northern Territory</b>	Hairdressing and Beauty Industry (Northern Territory) Award AP818691	<i>Junior</i>	40	50	70	85
<b>Western Australia</b>	Hairdressers Award AN160153	<i>4 yr term</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 35 2 <sup>nd</sup> 6 months: 40	50	70	85
		<i>Off the job graduate</i>	50	70	85	
		<i>3 yr term</i>	50	70	85	

## HOSPITALITY

State	Award		1 <sup>st</sup> yr %	2 <sup>nd</sup> yr %	3 <sup>rd</sup> yr %	4 <sup>th</sup> yr %
<b>Tasmania</b>	Restaurant Keepers Award AN170086	<i>Food and Beverage Trade</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 62 2 <sup>nd</sup> 6 months: 76	3 <sup>rd</sup> 6 months: 76 4 <sup>th</sup> 6 months: 90	5th 6 months: 90	
		<i>Greenkeeper</i>	45	55	75	90
		<i>Kitchen trades</i>	50	65	80	90
<b>Victoria</b>	Liquor and Accommodation Industry – Restaurants – Victoria Award AP787213	<i>Cooking Trade Apprentices</i>	55	65	80	95
	Licensed Clubs (Victoria) Award AP787060	<i>Cooking Trade Apprentices</i>	55	65	80	95
<b>New South Wales</b>	Caterers Employees (State) Award An120106	<i>Apprentices: note that % can also apply to the equivalent training stage</i>	46	54	67	80
	Hospitality Industry – Accommodation, Hotels, Resorts, and Gaming Award AP783479	<i>Cooking Trade Apprentices</i>	55	65	80	95
<b>ACT</b>	Liquor and Allied Industries Catering, Café,		1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 40	60	75	90



	Restaurant, Etc. (ACT) Award AP787016		2 <sup>nd</sup> 6 months: 45			
<b>Queensland</b>	Hospitality Industry – Catering, Rest & Allied Estabs AN 140144		Wage level 1: 40	Wage level 2: 55	Wage level 3: 75	Wage level 4: 90
<b>Northern Territory</b>	Hotels, Motels, Wine Saloons, Catering, Accommodation, Clubs and Casino Employees (NT) Award AP812953		55	69	77	87
<b>Federal</b>	Hospitality Industry – Accommodation, Hotels, Resorts, and Gaming Award AP783479	<i>Apprentices (Victoria Only)</i>	55	65	80	95
		<i>Waiting Trade Apprentices (Victoria)</i>	1 <sup>st</sup> 6 months: 70	2 <sup>nd</sup> 6 months: 85	3 <sup>rd</sup> 6 <sup>th</sup> months: See conditions	4 <sup>th</sup> 6 months: See conditions

## Appendix B – Comparison of Allowances

The following tables provide an insight into the application of allowances that operate for apprentices and trainees. The table looks at the Building and Construction Industry, Metal Industry and Hairdressing industry across the country. It demonstrates that there is little consistency regarding the application of allowances to apprentices and trainees. It should be noted, awards that are classified as NAPSAs have not had their allowances increased since the introduction of Work Choices and the Act does not provide a mechanism for this to happen. Pre reform awards such as those operating nationally or in the ACT and NT had some allowances increased following the 1 December 2006 AFPC decision and they are in the process of varying the allowances once more following the 1 October AFPC decision.

### National Building and Construction Industry Award – Vic allowances weekly

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
Paid in full to apprentices currently \$23.10	Paid as a percentage to apprentices currently a percentage of \$7.70	Paid in full to apprentices - range from \$24.70 to \$5.90 depending on the trade.	N/A	Paid as a percentage - range \$57.75 - \$73.15 depending on year and trade

### NSW - Building and Construction Industry (State) Award - allowances weekly

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
Paid in full to apprentices \$21.70	Amount set in NAPSA varies according to year of apprenticeship	Paid in full to apprentices, ranges from \$23.30 to \$5.60 depending on trade	N/A	Rates set out in NAPSA by year - \$13.30 - \$14.00

### Building and Construction Industry (Northern Territory) Award - allowances weekly

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	Paid as a percentage to apprentices - range from \$4.12 to 21.51 depending on trade and year of apprenticeship	Yes	Paid in full \$46.50

### Qld Building and Construction Industry Award - allowances weekly

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
Paid in full \$21.70	Paid in full \$7.70	* In accordance with decision of QIRC	Yes	Percentage applied range depending on wage level and trade \$53.63 - \$67.93

**Tasmania Building and Construction Industry Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
Paid in full \$21.70	Paid as a percentage of \$7.70	Paid in full range \$23.30 - \$5.60 depending on trade	N/A	Paid as a percentage – range \$51.00 to \$64.60 depending on year

**WA Building Trades (Construction) Award – allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
Paid in full \$21.70	Paid as a percentage of \$7.70	Paid in full to apprentices – range \$22.70 – 5.50 depending on trade	N/A	Percentage applied range \$51.75 - \$65.55

**Hairdressing and Beauty Industry (Victoria) Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	Paid in full to apprentices \$4.90	N/A	

**NSW Hairdressing & C. (State) Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	Paid in full to apprentices \$7.75	N/A	N/A

**Hairdressing and Beauty Industry (Northern territory) Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	Paid in full to apprentices \$5.70	Yes	No

**Qld Hairdressers' Industry Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	* In accordance with decision of QIRC	Yes	No

**South Australia- Hairdressers' and Beauty Salons Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
No	No	Paid in full \$7.00 ( when required to supply all stated equip in award)	N/A	No

**Tasmania Hairdressing Beauty and Health Industry Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
No	No	Paid in full \$8.30	N/A	No

**WA Hairdressers' Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	Paid in full \$6.75	N/A	No

**Metal Engineering and Associated Industry Award (all states) - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	Paid as a percentage to apprentices range \$5.55 to \$11.62	N/A	N/A

**NSW Metal Engineering and Associated Industry (State) Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	Paid as a percentage to apprentices range \$5.21 to \$10.91	N/A	N/A

**Metal Industry (Northern Territory) Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
Paid to construction apprentices only in full \$21.47	N/A	– percentage applied \$3.99 to \$8.36	Yes	Construction \$32.20 Non construction range per KMs \$2.88 - \$8.88

**Qld Engineering (State) Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
N/A	N/A	* In accordance with decision of QIRC	Yes	No

**Tasmania Metal and Engineering Industry Award -**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
Paid in full - called disability allowance \$15.75	N/A	Paid in full \$9.60	N/A	No

**WA Metal Trades General Award - allowances weekly**

Industry	Special	Tool	District	Travel
Construction allowance paid in full \$21.60 for normal sized sites	Paid as percentage of \$7.70	Paid as percentage range - \$5.38 - \$11.26	N/A	Construction only \$73.25