
The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

**A MODEL FOR A NEW ARMY:
COMMUNITY COMMENTS ON THE 'FROM
PHANTOM TO FORCE' PARLIAMENTARY
REPORT INTO THE ARMY**

Joint Standing Committee on
Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade

September 2001
Canberra

© Commonwealth of Australia 2001

ISBN 0 642 36628 4



Contents

Contents.....	iii
Foreword.....	vii
Membership of the Committee –39 th Parliament.....	ix
Membership of the Defence Sub-Committee - 39 th Parliament	xi
Terms of reference.....	xiii
List of abbreviations	xv
1 Report Rationale and Structure.....	1
Introduction.....	1
The Response	2
The Evidence Received	2
Outline of Views.....	3
Report Structure	4
2 The Necessity for Enhanced Capability	5
Introduction.....	5
The Necessity for Force Restructuring.....	5
More Change – The Cure is Worse than the Cold.....	6
The Importance of Tradition and History	7
The Veracity and Utility of Tradition	8
Using Skeletal Structures for Force Expansion	9
The Impact on Regional Australia.....	9
The Standardisation of Brigades.....	11
Auditing of Brigade Capabilities	13
The Need for an Army Capability Enhancement Project.....	14
Conclusion.....	15

3	Affordable Change or Expensive Whim?	17
	Introduction.....	17
	The Cost of Heightened Readiness	18
	Depot Costs	21
	Redirection of Headquarter and Administration Staff	21
	Effect on Personnel Costs	21
	Conclusion.....	22
4	What can be achieved?	23
	Introduction.....	23
	The Force Expansion Capability	23
	Warning Time.....	24
	The Personnel Base	24
	Industrial Support for Expansion.....	26
	The Personnel Model	26
	Conclusion.....	28
5	Community Feedback	29
	Introduction.....	29
	Recommendation 1	29
	Recommendation 2	30
	Recommendation 3	31
	Recommendation 4	32
	Recommendation 5	32
	Recommendation 6	33
	Recommendation 7	34
	Recommendation 8	35
	Recommendation 9	35
	Recommendation 10	36
	Recommendation 11	36
	Recommendation 12	37
	Other Issues	38
	Rotation Policy.....	38
	National Service	39
	Conclusion.....	39
6	Changes to the Report?	41
	Introduction.....	41
	Recommendation 1 – Develop a National Security Policy	41
	Recommendation 2 – Develop a Well Balanced Force.....	41
	Recommendation 3 – An Army of Four Brigades with an Expansion Capability	42
	Recommendation 4 – Annual Reporting of Army Capability	42
	Recommendation 5 – A Review of Army Force Structure.....	43
	Recommendation 6 – Army Capability Focus on Warfighting.....	43
	Recommendation 7 – An Increase in Army's Funding	44
	Recommendation 8 – A Unified Army Personnel Structure	44

Recommendation 9 – Units Staffed to Operational Levels	45
Recommendation 10 – Equipment Projects to Acquire Full Operational Liability	45
Recommendation 11 – A Review of Army’s Equipment and Stock Acquisition Strategy.....	45
Recommendation 12 – An Army Capability Enhancement Project	46
The Measure of our Army.....	46
Appendix A - Submissions	49
Appendix B - Public Hearings and Witness List.....	51
Appendix C – Recommendations from the <i>From Phantom to Force</i> Report	53



Foreword

This report is based on community feedback received on a previous committee report into the army, *From Phantom to Force: Towards a More Effective and Efficient Army*. That report was one of the most detailed studies of the Army in recent times, and came at a time when Australian forces were engaged in military commitments not seen for a generation.

In a departure from usual practice, we decided to seek public comment on the report following its release. We did this because, if the model for a future Army we proposed is to be successful in increasing the capability and efficiency of the Army, it will need to be refined through consultation and discussion. It needs to be owned and supported broadly by the community, the Army and the Defence Department.

There has been considerable change since the release of *From Phantom to Force*. In the first instance the Government released the Defence White Paper entitled 'Defence 2000: Our Future Defence Force'. In this document the Government took up many of the recommendations of our paper, including a significant boost to Defence spending over the next 10 years. In other areas, such as a change in role for the Reserve, Government policy took a different course from that recommended in the report. An additional issue was the important change to Defence Reserve legislation adopted in early 2001 whereby the procedure for calling out Reserves was simplified, and Reserves were given greater employment and education protection.

This paper has taken account of the new information provided by both the community consultation, and the changes in the Defence landscape since the release of *From Phantom to Force*. What this report aims to do is consolidate what the committee believes was a well researched and well received report, and update the report's recommendations. It also benefits from being an external report and thus not constrained by preconceived ideas, but able to take an objective assessment of where the future of the Army should lie.

D P M Hawker, MP
Chair Defence Sub-Committee

Membership of the Committee –39th Parliament

Chair	Senator A B Ferguson (from 1/7/99) Senator D J MacGibbon (to 30/6/99)	
Deputy Chair	Mr C Hollis, MP (from 11/8/99) Hon Dr A C Theophanous, MP (to 14/7/99)	
Members	Senator V W Bourne Senator the Hon D Brownhill (from 1/7/99 to 13/4/00) Senator P H Calvert (from 1/7/99) Senator H G P Chapman Senator the Hon P Cook Senator B Gibbs (from 9/8/99) Senator B Harradine Senator S Hutchins (from 17/8/00) Senator J A L Macdonald (to 30/6/99; from 9/5/00) Senator K O'Brien Senator M A Payne (from 1/7/99) Senator J A Quirke (to 15/8/00) Senator the Hon M Reynolds (to 30/6/99) Senator the Hon C Schacht Senator K Synon (to 30/6/99) Ms F E Bailey, MP Hon B G Baird, MP Hon L J Brereton, MP	Hon J A Crosio, MBE, MP (from 9/12/99) Hon G J Evans, QC, MP (to 30/9/99) Mr L D T Ferguson, MP (from 9/8/99) Mr D P M Hawker, MP Hon D F Jull, MP Mrs D M Kelly, MP Hon L S Lieberman, MP Hon Dr S P Martin, MP Hon J E Moylan, MP Mr P E Nugent, MP (to 23/4/01) Hon N P O'Keefe, MP Hon L R S Price, MP Hon G D Prosser, MP Mr C M Pyne, MP Hon W E Snowdon, MP Hon A M Somlyay, MP (from 24/5/01) Dr A J Southcott, MP Hon A P Thomson, MP

Committee Secretariat

Secretary	Ms M Swieringa (from 15/6/99) Mrs J Towner (to 11/6/99)
------------------	--

Membership of the Defence Sub-Committee - 39th Parliament

Chair	Senator D J MacGibbon (to 30/6/99) Mr D P M Hawker, MP (from 1/7/99)
Deputy Chair	Hon L R S Price, MP
Members	Senator V W Bourne (to 11/8/99) Senator the Hon D Brownhill (from 1/7/99 to 13/4/00) Senator P H Calvert (from 1/7/99) Senator A B Ferguson Senator B Gibbs (from 1/7/99) Senator S Hutchins (from 28/8/00) Senator J A L Macdonald (to 30/6/99; from 10/5/00) Senator J A Quirke (to 15/8/00) Senator the Hon C Schacht Ms F E Bailey, MP Hon J A Crosio, MBE, MP (from 16/2/00) Mr L D T Ferguson, MP (from 1/7/99) Mr C Hollis, MP (ex officio) (from 11/8/99) Hon Dr S P Martin, MP Hon W E Snowdon, MP Dr A J Southcott, MP Hon Dr A C Theophanous, MP (ex officio) (to 14/7/99)

Committee Secretariat

Secretary	Ms M Swieringa
Administrative Officer	Mrs L Cowan
Advisers	Lieutenant Colonel M J Ward, CSC (from 18/1/99 to 24/12/99) Lieutenant Colonel L Hogan (from 17/1/00) Lieutenant Colonel M J Milford (from 15/12/00)



Terms of reference

On 27 April 1999 the Minister for Defence referred the following matter to the Joint Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade. Through its Defence Sub-Committee, chaired by Senator David MacGibbon, the Committee will investigate and report on the suitability of the Australian Army for peacetime, peacekeeping and war. The inquiry will review the current and proposed changes to Army to ensure that it provides viable and credible land forces able to meet a range of contingencies. In considering this matter, the Committee shall take into account:

- *The Fundamentals of Land Warfare* document, released in March 1999
- The Restructuring of the Australian Army initiative
- The Defence Reform Program
- ADF force structure and preparedness
- The role and impact on full-time and part-time personnel
- *Australia's Strategic Policy* (1997).



List of abbreviations

ACSI	Area of Critical Security Interest
ADF	Australian Defence Force
ADMI	Area of Direct Military Interest
AIF	Australian Imperial Force
ANAO	Australian National Audit Office
ASP97	Australia's Strategic Policy 1997
Bde	Brigade
CA	Civil Affairs
CDF	Chief of Defence Force
DER	Defence Efficiency Review
FSR	Force Structure Review
JSCFADT	Joint Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade
NTM	Notice to Move
RAAF	Royal Australian Air Force
RAR	Royal Australian Regiment
RAN	Royal Australian Navy
RTA	Restructuring of the Army
RQR	Royal Queensland Regiment

