

**Further written submission to the Human Rights Sub-Committee of the Joint Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade – inquiry into Australia’s advocacy for the abolition of the death penalty**

**Dr Amy Maguire, University of Newcastle Law School**

**8 March 2016**

Introduction

I appeared before the Sub-Committee hearing on 27 November 2015. The Sub-Committee requested that I make a further written submission. I have had correspondence with Nathan Fewkes, research officer, to clarify how written submissions are dealt with. Along with a co-author, Shelby Houghton, I have recently had an article accepted for publication in the journal *Current Issues in Criminal Justice*. I hope to be able to put this article forward for consideration by the Sub-Committee, but am required to make some revisions and collaborate with the Editor to have the manuscript proof-read, edited and typeset. I anticipate that this process will be complete by the end of April or start of May, and have a plan in place with the Editor to ensure this timeframe. The Editor is happy for me to submit the article for the Sub-Committee’s consideration as soon as this process has been completed (which will be two-three months prior to the journal appearing in print).

In the meantime, Mr Fewkes advised that I could submit some previously published materials for the Sub-Committee’s consideration. Below I set out the reference list from our forthcoming article. I have highlighted those sources which I have provided in soft copy by email. In a separate document, I will include the short articles I have recently published online in relation to death penalty abolition.

References

ABC (2015) ‘Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran ‘relieved’ over transfer delay, says Julie Bishop’, *ABC News* (online), 19 February 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-02-18/bali-nine-abbott-asks-indonesia-remember-australias-past-help/6139032>>.

ABC (2015) ‘Indonesian ambassador Paul Grigson returns to Jakarta after recall in protest of Bali Nine executions’ *ABC News* (online), 10 June 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-06-10/indonesian-ambassador-returns-to-jakarta-following-withdrawal/6534176>>.

Abjorensen N (2015), 'Death penalty: are we really united in our opposition?', *The Drum* (online), 1 May 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-05-01/abjorensen-are-we-really-united-in-our-opposition/6436942>>.

AFP Governance 2010, *AFP National Guideline on international police-to-police assistance in death penalty situations*, viewed 27 June 2015 <<http://www.afp.gov.au/~media/afp/pdf/ips-foi-documents/ips/publication-list/afp%20national%20guideline%20on%20international%20police-to-police%20assistance%20in%20death%20penalty%20situations.pdf>>.

Amnesty International (2014a) *Death Penalty: Overview*, Amnesty International Australia <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/what-we-do/death-penalty/>>.

Amnesty International (2014b) '2014 World Day Against the Death Penalty: Protecting people with mental and intellectual disabilities from the use of the death penalty', 2014 <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/ACT51/005/2014/en/>>.

Amnesty International (2015) *Death Sentences and Executions 2014*, February 2015, 7, 11-13 <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/research/2015/02/death-sentences-and-executions-2014/>>.

Abbott T (Prime Minister) (2015), *Executions of Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran*, media release, 29 April 2015, Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet, Canberra, viewed July 29 2015 <<http://www.pm.gov.au/media/2015-04-29/executions-andrew-chan-and-myuran-sukumaran-0>>

Associated Press (2015) 'Indonesian Court rejects Serge Atlaoui's final appeal against execution', *The Guardian Australia* (online), 22 June 2015 <<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/jun/22/indonesian-court-rejects-serge-atlaouis-final-appeal-against-execution>>.

Australian Coalition Against Death Penalty (2004) *Interview with Dr Philip Opas QC*, 1 March 2004 <<http://www.acadp.com/>>.

Bae S (2007) *When the State No Longer Kills: International Human Rights Norms and Abolition of Capital Punishment*, State University of New York Press, 2.

Byrnes A (2007a) 'The Right to Life, the Death Penalty and Human Rights Law: An International and Australian Perspective' *University of New South Wales Faculty of Law Research Series* 35.

Byrnes A (2007b) 'Drug Offences, the Death Penalty and Indonesia's Human Rights Obligations in the Case of the Bali 9: Opinion Submitted to the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Indonesia 3(a)', *University of New South Wales Law Resolution Series, Paper No. 44*; cited in Lynch C (2009) 'Indonesia's Use of Capital Punishment for Drug Trafficking

Crimes: Legal Obligations, Extralegal Factors and the Bali Nine Case', *Columbia Human Rights Law Review* 40, 523, 535.

Byron M (2000) 'Why My Opinion Shouldn't Count: Revenge, Retribution, and the Death Penalty Debate' *Journal of Social Philosophy* 31, 307.

Carne G (2011), 'Abolitionist or Relativist? Australia's legislative and international responses to its international human rights death penalty abolition obligations' *University of Western Sydney Law Review* 3, 40, 47-9.

Commonwealth of Australia (2015) *Parliamentary Debates: House of Representatives: official Hansard*, 12 February 2015, 656 (Julie Bishop, Foreign Minister).

Commonwealth of Australia (2009) *Parliamentary Debates: House of Representatives: official Hansard*, 19 November 2009, 12197 (Robert McClelland, Attorney-General).

Connelly A (2015) 'Sovereignty and the Sea: President Joko Widodo's Foreign Policy Challenges' *Contemporary Southeast Asia: A Journal of International and Strategic Affairs* (37) 6, 17.

Cohen-Cole E, Derlauf S, Fagan J and Nagin D (2009) 'Modern Uncertainty and the Deterrent Effect of Capital Punishment' *American Law and Economics Review* 11, 335, 364.

Cornell University Law School, *Death Penalty Worldwide*, viewed 26 April 2015 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/search.cfm>>.

Cornell University Law School (2011) *Death Penalty Database: Saudi Arabia*, 4 April 2011 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=Saudi+Arabia#f72-3>>.

Cornell University Law School (2012) *Death Penalty Database: Afghanistan*, 11 December 2012 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=Afghanistan>>.

Cornell University Law School (2014a) *Death Penalty Database: Iran*, 7 April 2014 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=Iran>>.

Cornell University Law School (2014b) *Death Penalty Database: China*, 10 April 2014 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=China#f97-3>>.

Cornell University Law School (2014c) *Death Penalty Database: United States of America*, 10 March 2014 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=United+States+of+America>>.

de Wet E (2004) 'The Prohibition of Torture as an International Norm of *jus cogens* and Its Implications for National and Customary Law', *European Journal of International Law*, 15, 97.

Doherty B (2015) 'Death penalty shunned in Pacific, but Asia re-adopts executions – report', *The Guardian* (online), 1 April 2015  
<<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/apr/01/indonesias-renewed-use-of-death-penalty-is-part-of-wider-trend-report>>.

Drilling A (2013-2014) 'Capital Punishment: The Global Trend toward Abolition and Its Implications for the United States' *Ohio Northern University Law Review* 40, 847, 850-859.

Duff X (2014) *Noose*, Five Mile Press.

Finlay L (2011) 'Exporting the Death Penalty? Reconciling International Police Cooperation and the Abolition of the Death Penalty in Australia' *Sydney Law Review* 33, 95-98.

France Diplomatie (2015) *Fiji – Permanent abolition of the death penalty*, Press Release, 13 February 2015 < <http://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/country-files/fiji-islands/france-and-fiji-islands/political-relations-6849/article/fiji-permanent-abolition-of-the>>.

Fullilove M (2006) *Capital Punishment and Australian Foreign Policy* (Lowy Institute, 2006) 7.

Garkawe S (2013) 'The Role of Abolitionist Nations in Stopping the Use of the Death Penalty in Asia: The Case of Australia' in Hood R and Deva S (eds) *Confronting Capital Punishment in Asia: Human Rights, Politics and Public Opinion*, Oxford University Press, 101-102.

Gaughran A (2015) 'One hundred death penalty free countries within reach after Fiji becomes number 99', *Amnesty International* (online), 13 March 2015 < <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/campaigns/2015/03/one-hundred-death-penalty-free-countries-within-reach-after-fiji-becomes-number-99-1/>>.  
General Affairs Council of the European Union (2008) *EU Guidelines on the Death Penalty*.

Grattan M (2015) 'Australia withdraws its Indonesian ambassador in execution response', *The Conversation*, 29 April 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/australia-withdraws-its-indonesian-ambassador-in-execution-response-4095>>.

Harrison N (2006) 'Extradition of the "Bali Nine": Can and should the risk of capital punishment facing Australians be relevant to extradition decisions?' *International Journal of Punishment and Sentencing* 1(4), 221.

Hood R (2002) *The Death Penalty: A Worldwide Perspective* (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed, Oxford University Press), 7.

Hood R and Hoyle C (2009) 'Abolishing the Death Penalty Worldwide: The Impact of a 'New Dynamic'' *Crime and Justice* 38, 1, 22.

Hood R and Hoyle C (2015) 'There is no evidence that the death penalty acts as a deterrent', *The Conversation*, 25 April 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/there-is-no-evidence-that-the-death-penalty-acts-as-a-deterrent-37886>>

Human Rights and Democracy Department (2011) *HMG Strategy for Abolition of the Death Penalty 2010-2015*, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, 3.

Klein N and Knapman L (2011) 'Australians Sentenced To Death Overseas: Promoting Bilateral Dialogues To Avoid International Law Disputes' *Monash University Law Review* 37(2), 89, 106.

Lamb K (2015) 'Bali Nine: Indonesia has death penalty double standard, says brother of spared maid' *The Guardian* (online), 16 February <<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/feb/16/bali-nine-indonesia-has-death-penalty-double-standard-says-brother-of-spared-maid>>.

Letter from Law Council of Australia to Federal Attorney-General and Minister for Home Affairs, 'AFP Practical Guide on International Police to Police Assistance in Potential Death Penalty Situations, 29 January 2010, 2 <<http://www.lawcouncil.asn.au/lawcouncil/images/LCA-PDF/docs-dated/20100129-MinisterforHomeAffairsrenewAFPGuide.pdf>>.

Lehrfreund S (2013) 'The Impact and Importance of International Human Rights Standards: Asia in World Perspective' in Hood R and Deva S (eds) *Confronting Capital Punishment in Asia: Human Rights, Politics and Public Opinion*, Oxford University Press, 25.

Lennan J and Williams G (2012) 'The Death Penalty in Australian Law' *Sydney Law Review* 34, 659, 663.

Lindsey T (2015) 'Indonesia's stance on the death penalty has become incoherent', *The Conversation*, 16 February 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/indonesias-stance-on-the-death-penalty-has-become-incoherent-37619>>.

Lowy Institute (2015) *New Lowy Institute Poll finds that 62% of Australians Oppose the Execution of Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran*, Media Release, 16 February 2015 <<http://www.lowyinstitute.org/news-and-media/press-releases/new-lowy-institute-poll-finds-62-australians-oppose-execution-andrew-chan-and-myuran-sukumaran>>.

Lynch C (2008-2009) 'Indonesia's Use of Capital Punishment for Drug-Trafficking Crimes: Legal Obligations, Extralegal Factors, and the Bali Nine Case' *Columbia Human Rights Law Review* 523, 558.

Maguire A (2015) 'Hardline on refugees undermines principled opposition to execution', *The Conversation*, 30 April 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/hard-line-on-refugees-undermines-principled-opposition-to-execution-40953>>.

Malkani B (2013) 'The Obligation to Refrain from Assisting the Use of the Death Penalty' *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* 62, 523, 549.

Marcus C (2015) 'The Bali Nine ringleaders traded in death by smuggling heroin and now must face the consequences', *The Sunday Mail (QLD)* (online), 18 January 2015 <<http://www.couriermail.com.au/news/opinion/opinion-the-bali-nine-ringleaders-traded-in-death-by-smuggling-heroin-and-now-must-face-the-consequences/story-fnihsr9v-1227188153470>>.

Margarey K and Jordan R (2010) 'Parliament and the Protection of Human Rights', *Parliamentary Library Briefing Book*, 12 October 2010 <[http://www.aph.gov.au/About\\_Parliament/Parliamentary\\_Departments/Parliamentary\\_Library/pubs/BriefingBook43p/humanrightsprotection](http://www.aph.gov.au/About_Parliament/Parliamentary_Departments/Parliamentary_Library/pubs/BriefingBook43p/humanrightsprotection)>.

Marr D (2010) 'Death and the State' *The Sydney Morning Herald* (online), 23 October 2010 <<http://www.smh.com.au/national/death-and-the-state-20101022-16xw5.html>>.

McInerney M (2015) 'Australian campaign to abolish the death penalty', *BBC News* (online), 4 May 2015 <<http://www.bbc.com/news/world-australia-32579232>>.

Méndez J.E (2013) *Report of the Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment*, UN Doc A/HRC/25/60/Add.2 (11 March 2013), para 56.

Mitchell N (2003) Radio 3AW, *Interview with Prime Minister John Howard*, radio program, 8 August 2003.

O'Malley N (2015) 'Julie Bishop: Ending death penalty worldwide on Australia's UN agenda', *Sydney Morning Herald* (online), 30 September 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/world/julie-bishop-ending-death-penalty-worldwide-on-australias-un-agenda-20150930-gjxxxg.html>>.

Parliament of Australia (2015) *Inquiry: Australia's Advocacy for the Abolition of the Death Penalty* <<http://www.aph.gov.au/deathpenalty>>.

Plibersek T and Shorten B (2015) 'The Execution of Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran', Media Release, 29 April 2015, <<http://tanyaplibersek.com/2015/04/statement-the-execution-of-andrew-chan-and-myuran-sukumaran/>>.

Refugee Council of Australia (2015) *2015-16 Federal Budget in Brief*, 3, viewed 28 July 2015 <<http://www.refugeecouncil.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2014/08/2015-16-Budget.pdf>>.

Reith P (2015) 'Why no outcry over death penalty in the US?', *Sydney Morning Herald* (online), 18 May 2015 < <http://www.smh.com.au/comment/why-no-outcry-over-death-penalty-in-the-us-20150518-gh40v2.html>>.

Roberts G, Jennett G and staff (2015) 'Bali Nine pair Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran 'dignified' ahead of executions', *ABC News* (Online), 29 April 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-04-28/bali-nine-andrew-chan-myuran-sukumaran-dignified-executions/6428222>>.

Rothwell D, Kaye S, Akhtarkhavari A and Davis R (2014), *International Law: Cases and Materials with Australian Perspectives* (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed, Cambridge University Press) 206.

Roy Morgan Research (2009), *Australians say penalty for murder should be Imprisonment (64%) rather than the Death Penalty (23%)*, (Finding No 4411) <<http://www.roymorgan.com/findings/finding-4411-201302260051>>.

Roy Morgan Research (2015), *Australians think Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran should be executed*, (Finding No 6044) <<http://www.roymorgan.com/findings/6044-executions-andrew-chan-myuran-sukumaran-january-2015-201501270609>>.

Saul H (2015) 'Bali Nine: Schizophrenic man Rodrigo Gularte did not understand he was going to be executed until final moments before his death', *The Independent* (online), 30 April 2015 <<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/bali-nine-schizophrenic-man-rodrigo-gularte-did-not-understand-he-was-going-to-be-executed-until-final-moments-before-his-death-10214446.html>>.

Sayed-Khaiyum A (2015) Republic of Fiji, *Parliamentary Debates*, Parliament of Fiji, 9 February 2015, 680.

SBS (2015) 'Bali Nine bribe probe takes evidence', *SBS* (online), 11 May 2015 < <http://www.sbs.com.au/news/article/2015/05/11/bali-nine-bribe-probe-takes-evidence>>.

S (2014) 'The Value of International Standards in the Campaign for the Abolition of the Death Penalty' *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, XXI (1) 41, 44-45.

Shetty

Sifris R (2007) 'Balancing Abolitionism and Cooperation on the World's Scale: The Case of the Bali Nine', *Federal Law Review* 35, 81

Sky News (2015) 'Hundreds Gather for Bali Nine Vigil', *Sky News* (online), April 28, 2015 < <http://www.skynews.com.au/news/top-stories/2015/04/28/hundreds-gather-for-bali-nine-vigil.html>>.

Stoicescu C (2015) 'Indonesia uses faulty stats on 'drug crisis' to justify death penalty', *The Conversation* (online), 5 February 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/indonesia-uses-faulty-stats-on-drug-crisis-to-justify-death-penalty-36512>>.

Sydney Morning Herald (2015) 'Opposition to the death penalty is a moral absolute', *SMH* (online), 6 March 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/comment/smh-editorial/opposition-to-the-death-penalty-is-a-moral-absolute-20150305-13vmjf.html>>.

Tapsell R (2015) 'Of course I'm going to try to save my citizens from execution', *Inside Story*, 31 March 2015 <<http://insidestory.org.au/of-course-im-going-to-try-to-save-my-citizens-from-execution>>.

Tufft B (2015) 'Indonesia hits back at Tony Abbott claims that tsunami aid money should be used as a bargaining chip for convicted drug smugglers', *The Independent* (online), 22 February 2015 <<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/australasia/indonesia-hits-back-at-tony-abbott-claims-that-tsunami-aid-money-should-be-used-a-bargaining-chip-for-convicted-drug-smugglers-10062397.html>>.

Tahls K (2015) 'Pressure on: Indonesia may pause all killings', *The New Daily* (online), 5 March 2015 <<http://thenewdaily.com.au/news/2015/03/05/indonesia-suggests-moratorium-death-penalty/>>.

The Australian (2015) 'Bali 9 due: Myuran Sukumaran and Andrew Chan 'keeping hope alive'', *The Australian* (online), 27 April 2015 <<http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/bali-9-duo-myuran-sukumaran-and-andrew-chan-keeping-hope-alive/story-fn59niix-1227323659045>>.

The Drum (2015) 'How do you feel about the Bali Nine executions?' *ABC* (online), 29 April 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-04-29/drum-australia-reacts-to-bali-nine-executions/6429380>>.

Toohey P (2010), 'Tony Abbott says death penalty fitting for mass killers' *Herald Sun* (online), 20 February 2010 <<http://www.heraldsun.com.au/news/tony-abbott-says-death-penalty-fitting-for-mass-killers/story-e6frf7jo-1225832368108>>.

Topsfield J (2015) 'Bali nine executions: Indonesia responds to Australia withdrawing ambassador', *The Age* (Melbourne), 29 April 2015 <<http://www.theage.com.au/world/bali-nine-executions-indonesia-responds-to-australia-withdrawing-ambassador-20150429-1mvzlp.html>>.

UN Human Rights Council (2015) 'Human Rights Council holds High-Level Panel on the death penalty', Media Release, 4 March 2015, HRC15/015E <<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=15640&LangID=E>>.

Walia S (2015) 'India is slowing killing its death row prisoners without actually hanging them', *Quartz India* (online), 2 April 2015 <<http://qz.com/374310/india-is-slowly-killing-its-death-row-prisoners-without-actually-hanging-them/>>



Whyte S (2015) 'Federal budget 2015: Foreign aid to Indonesia to be slashed' *Sydney Morning Herald* (online), 6 May 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/federal-politics/political-news/federal-budget-2015-foreign-aid-to-indonesia-to-be-slashed-20150506-ggujmd.html>>.

### **Legislation**

*Crimes Legislation Amendment (Torture Prohibition and Death Penalty Abolition) Act 2010* (Cwlth).

*Death Penalty Abolition Act 1973* (Cwlth).

*Extradition Act 1988* (Cwlth).

### **Cases:**

*Atkins v Virginia*, 536 US 304, 316-317 (US, 2002))

### **International legal materials:**

*Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment* 1985, 1465 UNTS 85, opened for signature 4 February 1985, entered into force 26 June 1987.

General Assembly resolution 67/97, *The rule of law at the national and international levels*, A/RES/67/97 (14 December 2012), available from [undocs.org/A/RES/67/97](http://undocs.org/A/RES/67/97).

*International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights* 1966, 999 UNTS 171, opened for signature 16 December 1966, entered into force 23 March 1976.

*Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Aiming at the Abolition of the Death Penalty* 1989, A/RES/44/128, 15 December 1989, entered into force 11 July 1991.

*Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court* 1998, 2187 UNTS 90, opened for signature 17 July 1998, entered into force 1 July 2002, Article 31.1(a).

*Universal Declaration of Human Rights* 1948, GA Resolution 217, A (III).

United Nations Committee Against Torture (2014) 'Concluding observations on the combined third to fifth periodic reports of the United States of America', UN Doc CAT/C/USA/CO/3-5, 19 December 2014, para 25.

*United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples* 2007, GA Res 61/295, UN GAOR, 61<sup>st</sup> sess, 107<sup>th</sup> plen mtg, Supp no 49, UN Doc A/RES/61/295, 13 September 2007.

United Nations Economic and Social Council resolution 1984/50, *Safeguards guaranteeing the rights of those facing the death penalty*, adopted on 25 May 1984, endorsed by the UN General Assembly in resolution 39/118, adopted without a vote on 14 December 1984, paragraph 3.