



*“Declaring criticism of Israel as being inherently antisemitic has already created significant risks to the safety of Jews that oppose the Israeli government. Recently, the Australian Jewish Association (a far-right representative body that has been particularly vocal following the October 7 terrorist attack) held a seminar and published articles on how Jews can deal with “the enemy within”- the enemy being Jews (like myself) that oppose Israel. This is clearly antisemitic (and I would argue borders on incitement to violence), and the notion that the authenticity of one’s Jewishness should be called into question for supporting Palestine is not directly contemplated by the IHRA definition. However, the fact that the definition (specifically the examples) entwines (support for) Israel with Jewishness, infers that one cannot be Jewish and not support Israel.”*

The claims of Dr Naama Carlin above are false and potentially defamatory. The comments reflect gross ignorance of Judaism, Jewish history and antisemitism. To address several briefly:

- The Australian Jewish Association (AJA) is a centre-right organisation for the Jewish community.
- AJA has never published articles on how to ‘deal’ with the enemy within. Instead, AJA has spoken about the well-known phenomenon of Jews who turn on their own people. This topic has been extensively studied and engaged with by thinkers across the world. From ancient times, there has been a tiny minority of Jews who turn on their own people. This has included Jews denouncing their co-religionists in Medieval times or collaborating with the Nazis (Association of German National Jews) or Soviets (Yevseksiya). This is a well-documented fact of history. The modern incarnation of this phenomenon is Jews who spread hatred of the Jewish State, Israel. These extremists hide behind their ethnic background to spread antisemitism.
- AJA CEO Robert Gregory has been published in several places on this issue, including in the Australian Jewish News. Recently, AJA hosted a Zoom seminar on this topic with a well-respected expert who is a columnist for the Jerusalem Post. Hundreds of members of the Jewish community attended. We have received no negative feedback aside from this submission from Dr Carlin.
- AJA has never ‘Declared criticism of Israel as being inherently antisemitic’. Nor are we aware of any legitimate group which has done so. Dr Carlin should explain why she spreads this false fantasy. Criticism of Israel is valid as is criticism of any country. Holding Jews and the Jewish State to a different standard than every other country is antisemitism. AJA frequently advocates for freedom of speech.
- Dr Carlin claims that AJA content applies to her. Nobody involved in management of AJA has heard of her so if she self-identifies as an enemy of the Jewish people, that is an issue for Dr Carlin.
- Dr Carlin’s submission which calls a seminar and articles by the Australian Jewish Association ‘clearly antisemitic’ belittles the seriousness of antisemitism. Anyone who engages in such mocking of an issue as serious as antisemitism should not be taken seriously.