

The Secretary,
 DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY AFFAIRS
 ATTENTION THE COMMITTEE SECRETARIAT,
 DEPARTMENT OF THE SENATE
 PARLIAMENT HOUSE
 CANBERRA
 P.O. BOX 6100

re: Wind Turbine Objection

Dear Secretary,

Attached please find
 copy of submission made by me to
 the Hon Justice Madden, Victorian State
 Minister for Planning on 4th August 2008.

This submission was verbally
 expanded upon at a hearing before a
 panel of three persons.

My three sons also made
 submissions and spoke to them at
 the same panel hearing.

As far as I am aware, absolutely
 no notice was taken of our submission
 nor of any of the other numerous
 submissions opposing the
 Lal Lal / Yendon, Elaine wind farm.

I would be pleased to
 elaborate our concerns before the
 Senate Committee.

Yours faithfully,
 J

The Hon. Justin Madden,
Minister for Planning,
C/-Planning Panels Victoria,
Department of Planning and Community Development,
Level 1,8 Nicholson Street,
Melbourne 3000.

Dear Mr. Minister,

Re: Application for a planning permit for the
building of a wind farm at Lal Lal/Yendon and Elaine No.PL-SP/05/0461

This letter is written on behalf of my wife (Mrs S. Kelly) our three sons, their three wives, six grandsons, two granddaughters and myself.

We most strenuously object to the windfarm proposed by Westwind Energy Pty.Ltd.. We would like to speak at the Panel Hearing.

Our property, Rothbury, is 850 acres in area, is bounded by Yendon Lal Lal Road, Old Racecourse Road, Lal Lal Falls Road and a Government Road which runs from Old Racecourse Road to Lal Lal Falls Road. There are two houses on the property, one of which dates from 1859 and is classified by the National Trust and is listed with Heritage Victoria as VHR H1697 (details attached). Both houses are located less than 900 metres from the proposed windfarm site.

There is a significant area of very tall old growth forest within 700 metres of the proposed windfarm site. This section of forest is home to successive generations of wedge-tail eagles. (Photographs and a videotape are available for viewing.)

Most of our land is subject to flooding in wet years so it is necessary for houses to be built on the higher ground. The highest ground is the strip of land which has a frontage to Old Racecourse Road.

We are entitled to build one house to each 100 acres under the planning scheme and those houses are proposed to be built along the Old Racecourse Road frontage.

We object to the proposed wind farm for the following reasons:-

1. It will destroy the visual amenity of the whole area and particularly of our farm.

2. There will be an annoying and continuous noise whenever the turbines are turning.

3. There will be electrical interference from the turbines.

4. The presence of the windfarm will interfere with our existing rights under the Planning scheme.

5. The wind turbines will kill our native birds and will be especially likely to kill our beautiful and hugely admired wedgetail eagles.

6. The scenic drive to Lal Lal Falls and Lal Lal Reservoir will be ruined because the colossal turbines will completely change the landscape. *x1815
CORRECTION
GRANDS*

7. There is no way of storing the power generated by the turbines so there is no way in which existing power generating facilities can be shut down because they will always be needed to cover windless periods.

2.

8. When a turbine catches fire due to a malfunction it will pose a tremendous risk to this densely forested hinterland given that the prevailing wind is from the North West. Existing fire units would be unable to cope.

9. The Lal Lal Yendon Dunnstown Millbrook Gordon Districts are far too densely settled for the population to passively accept the massive intrusion which the proposed windfarm would be.

10. Notice Boards at the Lal Lal Falls picnic area and at the Lal Lal Reservoir at the site of the Bungal Dam wall indicate that the Aboriginal Community with active links to this area would have concerns about the safety of their Sacred Bird Bundjil (the Wedge Tail Eagle) (Photographs of the signs at both sites are available for viewing by the Panel Members)

11. There are huge areas of Victoria which are not forested, have sparse populations and have plenty of wind which would be much more suitable than this ill-chosen Lal Lal Yendon site.

12. It is our fervent hope that the Minister in his wisdom will determine that a permit be NOT granted; however, if his decision is otherwise, we request that a condition of the permit be that no wind turbines be allowed within two kilometres of Old Racecourse Road so that houses can be built on the Old Racecourse Road frontage. (a planning officer told me that two kilometres is the minimum distance between a wind turbine and a house site which is proposed currently in Europe).

Attachments:

1. Victorian Heritage listing for main house on Rothbury.

Available for viewing at Panel Hearing

1. Photographs of Wedgetail Eagles nest taken 29th July 2008

2. Photographs taken from video tape taken on 24th October 2007. with wedgetail eagle on lookout from nest.

3. Photographs taken 29th July 2008 at Lal Lal Falls picnic area and Bungal Dam wall site at Lal Lal Reservoir.

Yours sincerely,

R.F.B.Kelly

ROTHBURY

Location

LAL LAL ROAD YENDON,
Moorabool Shire

VHR Number

H1697



Statement of Significance

What is significant?

Rothbury was probably built in the early 1860s and first occupied by JP Howard. It is a single storey, rendered brick house with a corrugated iron roof and return verandah with simple and elegant cast iron decoration. Three rooms along the front have french doors opening onto the verandah and the drawing room has an octagonal bay window.

The two main rooms, the drawing room and dining room, have painted decoration which was uncovered when wallpapers were removed in late 2001. The drawing room features the most extensive decoration with a Classical Revival decorative scheme painted on the ceiling and walls. The ceiling has female busts, horns and flowers painted in panels with elaborate borders. The walls have painted Corinthian pilasters with arches above and delicate floral swags between. The joinery and cornices have been painted white at a later stage, but there is evidence to suggest that they originally matched the early colour scheme. There are many plaster marks on the ceiling and walls. The unpainted shield shapes around the wall possibly mark the location of gas lamp brackets. There is evidence of further decoration under later paintwork.

The decoration in the dining room is more restrained. It is mainly a single colour with a stencilled dado and another dado line. There is another unpainted shield shape over the fireplace. Underneath later paintwork, further decorative work can be detected.

How is it significant?

Rothbury has aesthetic and historical significance to the State of Victoria.

Why is it significant?

Rothbury has historical significance for the rarity, quality and relative intactness of its early decorative schemes. Although elaborate interior decorative schemes were popular in Victorian times, remarkably few have survived. The painted decoration at Rothbury is a rare surviving essentially intact example of 19th century domestic decoration. The Rothbury example is also rare as an entirely painted scheme which does not feature wallpapers and elaborate plaster and timber work. The walls of the drawing and dining rooms and other areas in the house have the potential to reveal further early paint schemes.

Rothbury is aesthetically important for its decorated interior which is particularly sophisticated for this rather modest residence. The design on the drawing room ceiling combined with the simple columns and arches on the walls has been created as a comprehensive artistic work. The simplicity and delicacy of its style and execution set it apart from some of the more opulent decorative schemes of the time.

Heritage Act Categories Heritage place
LGA names Moorabool Shire

There are about 25 known houses in Victoria where significant interior decoration survives in various states of preservation. Most of these examples include embossed or patterned wallpapers. Painted decoration is usually employed to enhance plasterwork eg. cornices, or consists of painted scenes. While Rothbury is not amongst the most elaborate, it remains relatively unusual in that the decoration is entirely painted on flat areas and includes the walls as well as the ceiling.

Extensive, elaborate or particularly intact examples:

Mandeville Hall, Toorak, 1869, 1876, H676. Very elaborate embossed wallpapers, including leather and patterned silk, painted scenes, painted detailing on elaborate plaster ceilings, arches etc., leadlight, marble, in ground floor rooms.

Labassa, Caulfield, 1890, H135. Very elaborate wallpapers and painted finishes in all ground floor rooms, one room Louis XVI, painted scene on ceiling above stairs.

Wardlow, Parkville, 1888, H1922. Wallpapers and painted finishes in all ground floor rooms, except one.

Mintaro, Monegeeta. Elaborate painted decoration in all ground floor rooms and wallpapers in first floor (poor condition).

Villa Alba, Kew, pre 1863, 1883, H605. Villa Alba is of significance for the outstanding late Victorian painted decoration throughout its interior. It has painted murals and decoration in most rooms under a layer of paint.

Former Macaroni Factory, Hepburn Springs, 1859, 1862-64, H407. Aesthetically significant for its interior decorative scheme, one of the largest and most intact domestic, secular murals in Australia. The comprehensive treatment of walls and ceilings in the naïf style is both an early and rare example in Victoria. Executed by Giacomo Lucini in 1862-64, the murals are secular and political, depicting different aspects of the Lucinis lives.

Comparisons

Belmont, Beaufort, 1861, 1886, H644. The 1886 drawing room is intact with paint, fabrics and furniture. Belmont also has historical significance for the completeness of its setting-house, interior decoration, significant contents, garden outbuildings and contents and is outstanding as a rare survivor of a small rural estate and its associated way of life.

Reedy Creek Homestead, Reedy Creek, 1850s, 1880s, H273. It has three 1880s rooms elaborately decorated with wallpapers and stencilling.

Woodlands, c. 1863, Crowlands. Embossed and gilt dados, stencilled friezes, partly painted over.

Mount Rothwell, Little River, 1872, H1107. Extensive 1870s hand and stencilled decoration to drawing room, hallway and dining room.

Navarre Homestead, Navarre. 1901 parlour and dining room with wallpapers, stencilling, coloured cornice, star-spangled ceiling.

Rio Vista, Mildura, 1889, H729. Hall, stair, smoking room, drawing and dining room ? timber dado and timber panelled ceilings and wallpapers.

Pastoria, Pipers Creek, Pastoria, early homestead subsumed in 1890s redevelopment, H1179. Pastoria has architectural significance for the early influences it displays of the Arts and Crafts movement. It is largely intact; the interiors have been skilfully executed and finely finished. It retains many of its original 1890s wallpapers and also its superb full length French windows which open out into the garden once tended by Chinese gardeners.

Notable, but only one or two rooms, altered or less elaborate:

Stanhope, Moonee Ponds. Some painted decoration recently discovered under later paint and restored. Painted scene in drawing room and painted ceiling in dining room.

Tudor House, Williamstown, 1884, H1857. Some decoration to main rooms survives, the rest restored, or in complementary style to original. Notable Gothic house and sumptuous decoration.

Elizabeth House, East Melbourne, 1855, 1866, c. 1888, H102. Substantially intact late 19th century drawing room is a significant example of interior decoration.

House, 120 Stewart Street, Brunswick, 1887, H1219. 2 rooms with coved plaster ceilings and painted scenes. The house is aesthetically important for its decorated interior which is remarkably ornate for a domestic building of this size. The decorative scheme in the parlour with its coved plaster ceiling, ornate plaster mouldings covered in gold leaf, six landscape panels, and green painted finish, is exceptionally detailed and intact above the cornice line.

Barwon, 38 Cromwell Road, South Yarra, 1881, H825. 2 painted rooms. Barwon is of architectural significance as a remarkable example of high quality late-19th century interior decoration. Of particular note is the drawing room with ceiling and walls that are considered a quite exceptional and rare treatment for houses after the mid-1880s. The front hall contains compositional painting in the scenic panels painted in the frieze, as distinct from stencilling, a very unusual feature in Australia.

Clowance, Ballarat, 1893, H1898. Clowance has aesthetic significance for the richness and intactness of its interior decorative scheme. Notable features include timber detailing, marbling, frescoes, leadlight door surrounds, woodgraining, marble fire surrounds, an early brass pendant light fitting in the hallway and a variety of decorative ceilings including coved, papier m^u and rattan ceilings.

Woodlands, Tullamarine, 1843-50, 1890-1920, 1940, H1612. The early decorative schemes of the west wing of the homestead were painted circa 1849. Elegant floriated decorative schemes were used in four rooms, a columned and marble panelled design in another room, and a tooled ashlar scheme was employed in the hallway. These schemes are representative of the Regency style of decoration and may be the only extant example of the style in Victoria.

Westella, Hawthorn, 1891. 2 rooms with painted ceilings, one with wallpapers.

Cestria, Hawthorn, 1891, H1924. Cestria is architecturally significant as an outstanding domestic example of the American Romanesque style of architecture in Victoria. It is significant for its fine intact interior, particularly the turned timber in the hall and on the staircase. The interior plan is intact, and many decorative elements survive, including fireplaces, overmantels, door furniture and some wallpapers from the time of the first owner.

Ross House, Cotham Road, Kew, 1889, H202. Pressed paper panels, friezes and ceiling, with some redecoration.

Mynda, 9 Molesworth Street, Kew, 1884. Of special interest is the original interior decoration of the entrance hall and octagonal vestibule, drawing-room, main bedroom and former nursery, and including strikingly original mantelpieces. Displays an interesting use of a combination of imitation leather dadoes and painted areas modest monochrome stencilling, except in the drawing-room where the decorative medium is wall-paper.

Edzell, St Georges Road, Toorak, 1892, 1917, 1935, H691. The dining room features panelled timber ceiling and dado, which were executed in New Zealand rimu, embossed floral pattern wall paper, overdoors and a panelled timber mantel and overmantel with carved enrichments.

Campaspe Park, Goornong, c. early 1860s, c. early 1890s, H1923. Built in two phases, the first probably in the early to mid 1860s, the second in the early 1890s, Campaspe Park is of aesthetic significance for the quality of the hallway paintings.

- 1. All the building marked B1 on Diagram Number 1697 held by the Executive Director.
- 2. All the land marked L1 on Diagram Number 1697 held by the Executive Director being part of the land described in Certificate of Title Volume 6549 Folio 667.

Group

Category

Rarity

Extent of
Registration

MOORABOOL PLANNING SCHEME

PS Map Ref	Heritage Place	External Paint Controls Apply?	Internal Alteration Controls Apply?	Tree Controls Apply?	Outbuilding s or fences which are not exempt under Clause 43.01-4	Included on the Victorian Heritage Register under the Heritage Act 1995?	Prohibited uses may be permitted?	Name of Plan under Clause 43.01-2	Aboriginal heritage place?
HO49	Stables at Lal Lal house Yendon-Egerton Rd	Yes	No	No	No	No	No		No
HO50	Portland Flat Road Bridge, Portland Flat Road, Gordon	-	-	-	-	Yes H2054	No		No
HO51	Rouffbury, Lal Lal Road, Yendon	-	-	-	-	Yes H1697	No		No

