

**Australian Trade and Investment Commission** - Hearing Date: 25 October 2018; Due date for answers: 7 December 2018

Portfolio QNo	Senator	BroadTopic	QuestionText	Written Hansard	Proof Hansard Page
1	Eric Abetz	Austrade's office in Tehran	<p>Senator ABETZ ... How much does it cost the taxpayer to keep an Austrade presence in Tehran? If you don't know the exact figure, take it on notice.</p> <p>Mr Beresford: I'll have to take that on notice.</p>	Hansard	115
2	Alex Gallacher	Australia's Nation Brand	<p>Senator GALLACHER: ... How much money has been spent on developing brand Australia?</p> <p>Ms Ralston: Around \$10 million was allocated to the project over three years. I think it's about a million dollars to this point. I couldn't be absolutely certain, but it has largely been around the research and other consultations processes.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: How much goes to external contractors, or does all of it go to contractors?</p> <p>Ms Ralston: I would have to take that on notice. There is a component for some external contracts—the experts in market research. There are some components for own operating costs for that as well, and then providing the various forums around the various states and territories had hire costs around venues, et cetera. So I would have to take that on notice.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contracts relating to Brand Australia:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3516696 (Bloom Consulting - \$24,355)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3512154 (PriceWaterhouse - \$340,134).</li> </ul>	Hansard	116
3	Alex Gallacher	Recruitment/temporary personnel services expenditure	<p>Senator GALLACHER: What have you spent on recruiting since January 2017?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: I would have to take that specific question on notice.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: ... On notice could you tell us how much you spent with recruitment companies since January 2017, and how much you've spent on temporary personnel services since January 2017?</p> <p>Mr Hazlehurst: Certainly.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the</p>	Hansard	\117

			<p>following contracts relating to recruitment/temporary personnel:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3540321 (Hays Specialist Recruitment - \$153,000)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3536076 (Paxus Australia Pty Ltd - \$227,541.60)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3532960 (Chandler Macleod Group Limited - \$50,000)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3532955 (Bethomas Consulting Pty Ltd - \$17,600)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3529660 (Talent International [ACT] Pty Ltd - \$145,200)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3521070 (Hays Specialist Recruitment [Australia] - \$49,747.50)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3521070.A1 (Hays Specialist Recruitment [Australia] - \$49,747.50).</li> </ul>		
4	Alex Gallacher	Code of Conduct investigations	<p>Senator GALLACHER asked for the following information with respect to the 10 Code of Conduct investigations Austrade has conducted in the last financial year:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- total expenditure</li> <li>- nature of the proceedings</li> <li>- final outcome.</li> </ul> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contracts relating to code of conduct investigations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3540325 (Slopline Pty Ltd - \$27,000)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3540322 (Clayton Utz CBR - \$38,500)</li> <li>- AusTender Number - CN3528000 (ZRA Consulting - \$30,000).</li> </ul>	Hansard	118, 122-123
5	Alex Gallacher	Export Awards tenders	<p>Senator GALLACHER: ... Export Awards: how many separate tenders were issued under the 56th Australian Export Awards?</p> <p>Ms Ralston: I don't have the details of the various contracts with me, but I can certainly take that on notice. The major tender is for the event management company who actually runs the event around the annual Export Awards ceremony, which takes place at the end of November.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: You will note that the very diligent preparers of these questions have got the AusTender events management at \$35,00 and \$178,000. Was the \$178,000 the largest tender?</p> <p>Ms Ralston: From memory, I think it was, but I'll check that and make sure we have the full information. It covers a range of aspects of the event—the event management, the actual hiring of venues, the catering, the entertainment elements. There are a large number of elements in that particular contract, so I'd have to have the details in front of me.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: Would there have been more than two contracts in this events</p>	Hansard	118-119

			<p>management space?  Ms Ralston: I don't think there are, but I'll have to check.  Senator GALLACHER: You can take that on notice to clarify. We've got two and you're going to take on notice whether there were any more. And you said the largest tender was the \$178,000 to Events Management Group?  Ms Ralston: I will confirm that, but I think that's the case.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contracts relating to the Export Awards:  - AusTender Number - CN3508638 (Scenovia Pty Ltd - Trading as eAwards - \$35,702)  - AusTender Number - CN3508613 (Event Management Group - \$176,000)</p>		
6	Alex Gallacher	Tenders for legal advice	<p>Senator GALLACHER: ... How many tenders have Austrade had for legal advice outside the department [in the last 12 months]? I take it we've covered a bit of that with the code of conduct investigations.  Mr Nichles: I will take that on notice. I might have the information here, but, for the sake of time, we'll take that on notice.  Senator GALLACHER: ... just for completeness, how many tenders have you had for legal advice outside the department in the last 12 months? What was the most expensive tender? What do you commonly seek legal advice for?  Mr Nichles: It could be a range of matters. It could be around a public information disclosure. It could be around a lease. It could be around industrial relations. It could be where we are looking for certainty or we're looking for a second opinion not from our in-house legal team.  Senator GALLACHER: Can we get what you have sought over the last 12 months? We have done some work and we know that you've done some stuff on AusTender, but, for completeness, if you could give us the full list of the last 12 months and the purpose for which you sought the legal advice, that would be excellent.  Mr Nichles: Certainly.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contracts relating to legal advice:  - AusTender Number - CN3536080 (DLA Piper - \$15,000)</p>	Hansard	119-120

			<p>- AusTender Number - CN3536078 (DLA Piper - \$15,000)</p> <p>- AusTender Number - CN3536079 (DLA Piper - \$15,000)</p> <p>- AusTender Number - CN3529492-A1 (Maddocks - \$80,000)</p> <p>- AusTender Number - CN3529493 (Ashurst Australia - \$30,000)</p> <p>- AusTender Number - CN3529491 (Kemp Strang - \$50,000)</p>		
7	Alex Gallacher	LinkedIn expenditure	<p>Senator GALLACHER: ... Can you take on notice how much was spent on LinkedIn [over the last 12 months]?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: Yes.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: And why does Austrade have a tender approved for not Dentsu Mitchell for LinkedIn, not LinkedIn directly? Is there an intermediary here?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: Dentsu Mitchell used to be the federal government's master media buying agency, so any additional paid work that we would want to do for recruitment or any other type of non-campaign advertising would have to be placed through Dentsu Mitchell.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: So it's possible that this could be services other than LinkedIn?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: Absolutely.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: Okay. Could you detail that for us, please, and advise us why those services couldn't have been produced in-house?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: It's impossible to get efficiencies from media. It's also a federal government requirement that any expenditure goes through the master media agency.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: Okay. So, on notice, if you could put that in writing, that would be fine.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contract relating to LinkedIn:</p> <p>- AusTender Number - CN3536085 (Dentsu Mitchell - \$91,732.72).</p>	Hansard	120
8	Alex Gallacher	Four Square Design Studio expenditure for Australia Lounge February 2019	<p>Senator GALLACHER: ... Four Square Design Studio [Forequarter design studio] had \$105,000. 'Australia lounge build for mining'—what are the services provided in this tender? ... How many people would have come through this lounge?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: I'd have to check which lounge that is. I'm assuming it is Mining Indaba, but I would have to confirm on notice.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: It was 4 February to 7 February, so, this must be prospective. This is for next year, is it? You have let a tender out for 4 February 2019 to 7 February 2019?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: Austrade manages a number of trade show presences around the world, so I</p>	Hansard	120-121

			<p>would have to take that on notice.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: If you have got those two dates, you will be able to match up the spend. How do you assess value for money in this area? What does it look like? Do you have a template that fits over it and says, 'Righto, Ms Fahey; close your eyes and sign off on that expenditure'? How do you put it up to the executive or whoever authorises it?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: As I said, we have been doing this for a number of years and we do it around the world, so we've got a reasonably good benchmark. The costs are going to vary by markets. We can be in some low-cost markets, so building a trade show presence could be a smaller amount. If we're in high cost markets like the US, building it will cost more. But certainly we have benchmarks so we know whether or not we're getting value for money.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: Okay. On notice, could you give us the analysis that's presented to the executive who signs off on this as value for money and any sort of publicity photos or success stories from it?</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contracts relating to the Australia Lounge for build for mining: - AusTender Number - CN3529489 (Fourquarter design studio - \$104,482).</p>		
9	Alex Gallacher	Proximity Advisory Services expenditure	<p>Senator GALLACHER: There is also a tender here for almost \$13,000. It was \$12,872 for presentation material. The publish date was 27 August. The contract period was 20 August to 18 to 20 September. The successful supplier was Proximity Advisory Services. What would all that be about?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: I don't know the detail of that.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: Can you take that on notice?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: Yes.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER: What was the presentation material? Why would it need to be developed externally from Austrade? Do you have the resources or do you these sort of presentation materials in-house? Perhaps if we could get a snapshot of the presentation material supplied.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contract relating to presentation material development:</p>	Hansard	121

			- AusTender Number - CN3536072 (Proximity Advisory Services Pty Ltd - \$12,672).		
10	Alex Gallacher	Newgate Communication expenditure	<p>Senator GALLACHER: ... Newgate Communications had a contract for about \$10,000 worth of public relation services. Can we get a snapshot of what the nature of this work was? You've got your own media team; can you not do that yourself? Are you so disparate that you have no knowledge of these? Is it that we have plucked them out of AusTender and they are confounding you? With a tender to Newgate Communications on that timetable, with a contract period of 31 May to 8 June, what would that have been for?</p> <p>Mr Nichles: Any part of the organisation, particularly our trade and investment people, could have engaged Newgate Communications. They could have prepared marketing material. They could have prepared media releases. They may have been unique, as we didn't have the resources or the skills in-house.</p> <p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contract relating to media:</p> <p>- AusTender Number - CN3528008 (Newgate Communications Pty Ltd - \$10,395).</p>	Hansard	121
11	Alex Gallacher	Financial Management Framework and Budget Model Review	<p>Senator GALLACHER tabled a list of AusTender entries seeking more information on a number of contracts entered into by Austrade. Please provide more detail on services provided for the following contract relating to the Financial Management Framework and Budget Model Review:</p> <p>- AusTender Number - CN3537338 (Ernst &amp; Young - \$264,000).</p>	Hansard	121
12	Carol Brown	Tourism infrastructure investment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How many stand-alone programs exist aimed at investing in tourism infrastructure?</li> <li>• Can you confirm that Austrade no longer has oversight of any tourism infrastructure investment related programs, following the conclusion of the TDDI?</li> <li>• Have any stakeholders or industry members written to you or contacted you regarding their concerns over this lack of future investment?</li> </ul>	Written	
13	Carol Brown	Tourism Refund Scheme	Has Austrade met with any further stakeholders or third parties in relation to the TRS since last estimates? If so please list meetings with names, dates, time, location, agenda and minutes.	Written	
14	Carol Brown	Stakeholder Meetings	Which tourism stakeholders has Austrade met with since last estimates? Please list meeting date, company/organisation, nature of meeting and topics discussed.	Written	

15	Carol Brown	Tourism Research Australia	Please provide a list of all staffing changes including overall numbers, date, reason since the previous estimates.	Written	
16	Carol Brown	Tourism Research Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What were the outcomes of the TRC held on 13-14 August in Melbourne?</li> <li>• Have there been other meetings since the August meeting? What were the outcomes of these?</li> <li>• When will the next TRC be held?</li> <li>• Please detail any changes to membership since the last estimates?</li> <li>• Please provide the forward schedule of meetings for 2018.</li> </ul>	Written	
17	Carol Brown	Staffing	Please provide a list of all staffing changes including overall numbers, date, reason since the previous Estimates.	Written	
18	Carol Brown	Research	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Have there been any changes to the expected publication schedules since last estimates?</li> <li>• If yes, please detail with original expected publication date and actual publication date.</li> <li>• Does Austrade or Tourism Australia anticipate any additional delays to publications over the next year aside from those detailed in last estimates answers? If so, please detail publication, reason, and expected length of delay.</li> </ul>	Written	
19	Carol Brown	Research Roundtables	Will any future research roundtables be held?	Written	
20	Carol Brown	Australian Standing Committee on Tourism (ASCOT)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• When was the last meeting held and what is the forward meeting schedule?</li> <li>• What were the outcomes of the last meeting?</li> <li>• Have there been any changes to membership since the last Senate Estimates?</li> </ul>	Written	
21	Carol Brown	Tourism Major Project Facilitation service	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How many projects are currently being facilitated? What progress has been made since last estimates?</li> <li>• Have any of these projects moved into the construction phase? If not, why not?</li> <li>• How much funding has the government provided to each of these projects?</li> <li>• Please provide detailed updates on the status of all projects utilising the service including project name, proponent name, value of project, expected start and completion date and funding partners.</li> <li>• What is the process for determining which projects are supported by the government?</li> </ul>	Written	
22	Carol Brown	Minister	Has Minister Birmingham visited the offices of Austrade, Tourism Australia or Tourism Research Australia since his appointment? If yes, what dates and what was the nature of the visits?	Written	
23	Carol Brown	Tourism 2020	• What progress has the Beyond 2020 Steering Committee made since it was established in February?	Written	

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• On how many occasions has it met?</li> <li>• A media release from the Minister at the time of the announcement of the committee indicated that this group would present its findings in 2018. Precisely when will this occur?</li> </ul>		
24	Carol Brown	Tourism Access Working Group	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• When did the Tourism Access Working Group last meet? How many times has it met in the past year? When will it next meet?</li> <li>• What has it achieved this year?</li> <li>• The Tourism Access Working Group's membership is composed of serious contributors to the tourism and aviation sector – how do you make the most of their expertise?</li> <li>• How will the Tourism Access Working Group inform the Beyond 2020 strategy?</li> </ul>	Written	
25	Carol Brown	Working Holiday Makers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How much revenue has the Working Holiday Maker tax generated since its implementation on 1 January 2017?</li> <li>• Have you had conversations with the National Farmers Federation or any other organisation about the impact of the Working Holiday Maker tax on the shortfall of farm labourers?</li> <li>• What consultation has the Government had with Austrade regarding the interaction between a potential new foreign farm workers scheme and the existing Pacific Islands Seasonal Workers Programme?</li> <li>• How many workers under the Pacific Islands Seasonal Workers Programme have been employed in the tourism and accommodation sector?</li> </ul>	Written	
26	Carol Brown	Regional Dispersal	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What ongoing consultation is occurring between the Department of Infrastructure and Austrade regarding the \$45 million for 'tourism-related infrastructure'?</li> <li>• What input has Austrade provided in terms of developing guidelines for this part of the program?</li> <li>• Do you believe that this \$45 million is sufficient in terms of providing support for regional tourism infrastructure? Or is there a need for further investment?</li> <li>• Will Austrade play any role in determining the successful applicants?</li> <li>• Answers provided to QON indicated that the Tourism Research Committee had commissioned Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu to undertake destination research into regional dispersal and technology disrupters. When will this research be completed? Are there any early findings that you can share with us?</li> </ul>	Written	
27	Alex Gallacher	Australian Export Awards	<p>Senator GALLACHER: These are quite detailed questions, so they may lend themselves to be taken on notice. Where was the event held? You've explained that it was held at multiple places. What was the cost of venue? You're saying you co-chair. How much money was spent on entertainment? Who was the entertainment? Did you have a headline act? How much was</p>	Hansard	119



			<p>spent on catering and lighting? How much was spent in total on the awards?          Could you please provide a breakdown of all costs associated with the event, a list of food and beverages and, importantly, a list of all attendees? Presumably you've got all that in your back pocket. Ms Ralston: Not exactly. The event will take place at the end of November. All the details will be settled after 27 November.          Senator GALLACHER: All right. Thank you.</p>		
28	Claire Moore	Beyond Tourism 2020	<p>Mr Boyer: We are working very closely with Tourism Australia to help provide support for the Beyond Tourism 2020 committee, which was originally established by Minister Ciobo. Since February, when the committee met for the first time on 9 February, there have been a large number of meetings of the group. The committee has focused on a broad range of topics, including targeted demand activity, investing in consumer data, addressing capacity constraints, using technology to enhance visitor experience, suitably skilled and available workforce, and how to build a sustainable tourism industry. In April 2018 the steering committee invited submissions from a range of tourism industry representatives and state and territory governments. A total of 29 were received. A draft strategy will be prepared and provided to Minister Birmingham in due course for his consideration.          Senator MOORE: You said it has met on a number of occasions. Do you have in front of you how many times they have met as a KPI? Or we can put it on notice. You seem to have a detailed brief there. I thought you might have.          Mr Boyer: I do, but I don't have that particular information. I'll take that on notice.</p>	Hansard	134
29	Claire Moore	Tourism Access Working Group	<p>Senator MOORE: I have questions on the Tourism Access Working Group. This is another group established by government, a while ago, in 2010. When did the Tourism Access Working Group last meet and how many times has it met in the past year?          Mr Boyer: My apologies, I might have to take this on notice. Of all of my back-pocket briefs I do not have one on the TAWG. I can tell you the last time it met would have been earlier this year, I recall. Senator Ciobo chaired a meeting in Parliament House. I will have to take that on notice.          Senator MOORE: That is the threshold question. I will read these into the record. When did it meet? When will it next meet? Are there any lists of achievements in terms of what their work pattern is and what their goals were and what they've achieved? The Tourism Access Working Group's membership is composed of serious contributors to the tourism and aviation sector, so I'd like to know on notice who they are and what is the expectation of the best use of their expertise. When you read through the list of the members of the previous working group, you</p>	Hansard	135

			could see their links. I'd like the same thing.		
30	Claire Moore	Tourism Access Working Group	<p>How will the Tourism Access Working Group inform the Beyond Tourism 2020 strategy, and how are they working with the steering committee that's been established for that particular group? Are you making sure that people are sharing their talents and expertise?</p> <p>Mr Boyer: To a degree. There is some crossover membership.</p> <p>Senator MOORE: I noticed a couple.</p> <p>Mr Boyer: Forums are quite different. The Tourism Access Working Group is a forum for discussion of key tourism issues in part as they affect other portfolios, such as the infrastructure portfolio around aviation, the immigration portfolio and the home affairs portfolio which determines visas and those sorts of issues as well. It's a bit different from the scope of work associated with the Beyond Tourism 2020 strategy.</p> <p>Senator MOORE: It would have to be, otherwise you wouldn't have two committees. I'm trying to find out whether there is anything they do work together on, particularly with that couple of joint members.,</p> <p>Mr Boyer: We will answer on notice.</p>	Hansard	135