

The Senate

---

Select Committee on the  
Scrutiny of New Taxes

---

Final Report -

The Carbon Tax:  
Secrecy and spin cannot hide carbon tax flaws

November 2011

© Commonwealth of Australia 2011

ISBN 978-1-74229-539-8

**Senate Select Committee on Scrutiny of New Taxes Secretariat**

Mr Shon Fletcher, Secretary

Ms Sandra Kennedy, Principal Research Officer

Mr Michael Azize, Principal Research Officer

Mr Hugh Griffin, Research Officer & Administrative Officer

The Senate  
Parliament House  
Canberra ACT 2600

Ph: 02 6277 3269

Fax: 02 6277 5719

E-mail: [newtaxes@aph.gov.au](mailto:newtaxes@aph.gov.au)

Internet: [http://www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/scrutinynewtaxes\\_ctte/index.htm](http://www.aph.gov.au/Senate/committee/scrutinynewtaxes_ctte/index.htm)

This document was produced by the Senate Select Committee on Scrutiny of New Taxes Secretariat and printed by the Senate Printing Unit, Parliament House, Canberra.

# Senate Select Committee on Scrutiny of New Taxes

## 43<sup>rd</sup> Parliament

### Membership of the committee

Senator Mathias Cormann, Chair	Western Australia, LP
Senator Doug Cameron Deputy Chair from 22.07.11	New South Wales, ALP
Senator Matt Thistlethwaite Deputy Chair from 07.07.11 to 15.07.11	New South Wales, ALP
Senator David Bushby	Tasmania, LP
Senator Mitch Fifield	Victoria, LP
Senator John Madigan, from 07.07.11	Victoria, DLP
Senator John Williams	New South Wales, NATS

### Substitute Members

Senator Ron Boswell to replace Senator David Bushby for 23 to 24 September 2011

## 42<sup>nd</sup> Parliament

### Members

Senator Mathias Cormann, Chair	Western Australia, LP
Senator Steve Hutchins, Deputy Chair to 30.06.11	New South Wales, ALP
Senator David Bushby	Tasmania, LP
Senator Doug Cameron	New South Wales, ALP
Senator Mitch Fifield	Victoria, LP
Senator John Williams	New South Wales, NATS

### Participating members for this inquiry

Senator Ron Boswell	Queensland, NATS
Senator Michaelia Cash	Western Australia, LP
Senator Gary Humphries	ACT, LP
Senator Brett Mason	Queensland, LP
Senator Nick Xenophon	South Australia, IND



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS .....</b>	<b>iii</b>
Membership of the committee.....	i
<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>vii</b>
Modelling.....	vii
The trampling of democracy .....	viii
Issues covered by this report .....	ix
Recommendations of the Final Report.....	ix
Recommendations of the Interim Report .....	xi
<b>Chapter 1.....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
Terms of reference.....	1
Conduct of the inquiry to date .....	2
Acknowledgement.....	2
Structure of the report.....	2
<b>Chapter 2.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Government secrecy on Treasury Modelling Information preventing proper scrutiny .....</b>	<b>3</b>
Introduction .....	3
The Joint Select Committee's assessment of the Treasury's modelling .....	3
Submitting the modelling to public scrutiny .....	8
Cherry picking the best pieces of the modelling .....	16
The effect of the carbon tax on the economy .....	19
Committee comment .....	22

<b>Chapter 3.....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>The international trading of carbon emission permits .....</b>	<b>25</b>
Introduction .....	25
Market instability and immaturity .....	26
Dominance of the EU ETS .....	29
Structural flaws with the EU ETS .....	30
Uncertainty of ETS establishment in many countries .....	32
Uncertainty over what constitutes a carbon permit .....	35
'Carbon Criminals' .....	36
Committee comment .....	39
<b>Chapter 4.....</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>Property Rights.....</b>	<b>41</b>
Introduction .....	41
Carbon units and property rights .....	41
Certain Uncertainty .....	42
Committee comment .....	45
<b>Chapter 5.....</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>The rise and cost of the green bureaucracy .....</b>	<b>49</b>
Introduction .....	49
The regulatory structure .....	49
The cost of the regulators .....	56
A deficient consultation process.....	56
Rise of the green machine .....	58
Committee comment .....	59

<b>Chapter 6.....</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>Community understanding of the carbon tax reforms .....</b>	<b>61</b>
Introduction .....	61
Undue haste .....	61
Government advertising and promotion.....	63
<b>Government Senators' Dissenting Report .....</b>	<b>69</b>
Introduction .....	69
Modelling.....	71
Direct Action .....	75
Investment and Business Certainty .....	81
Conclusion .....	86
<b>Government Senators' Dissenting Report: Appendix 1.....</b>	<b>89</b>
<b>Dissenting Report by Senator John Madigan .....</b>	<b>147</b>
<b>Additional Comments by Senator Nick Xenophon.....</b>	<b>149</b>
<b>APPENDIX 1 .....</b>	<b>153</b>
<b>Submissions and Additional Information received by the committee.....</b>	<b>153</b>
Submissions .....	153
Additional Information and Tabled Documents.....	156
Answers to Questions on Notice .....	159
<b>APPENDIX 2 .....</b>	<b>163</b>
<b>Public Hearings and Witnesses .....</b>	<b>163</b>

