Senate Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade References Committee

SUBMISSION COVER SHEET

Inquiry Title:	Effectiveness of Austral	lia's Military Justice System
Submission No:	P13	
Date Received:	05.02.04	
Submitter:	Ms Liddell	
Organisation:		
Address:		
Phone:		
Fax:		
Email:		
Name/Contact:	Ms Dulcie Liddell	
Date Authorised:	:	

16. THE SENATE COMMITTEE INQUIRY SEE

My SON MATTHEW JOHN LIDDELL SERVED ON THE HIMAS.
"WESTKALIA" IN THE CAPACITY OF A MARINIE TECHNICAL
NESTRALIA"
RATE. - HE WAS INVOLVED WITH THE FIRE, ON THE, 5 MAY 1998
AS THE DIRECT RESULT OF THIS DISASTER, HE THEN
SUFFERED WITH POST TRAUMATIC STREET DISORDER.

MATTHEW WAS HOSPITALISED IN ST. JOHN OF GOD BACK POR A FEW DAYS, THEN TRANSFERRED, TO. HMAS. " TEXAMINE" "STIRLING" MEDICHL FACILITY. AFTER DISCHARGE ABOUT A WEEK OR SO LATER HE WAS THEN SENT BACK TO HMAS "WESTRALIA" WHICH WAS IN MY OPINION VERY WRONG, THIS DID A LOT OF DAMAGE TO 14'S MIND - IT IS A LOT LIKE SENDING SOMEONE BACK INTO THE LEON'S DEN AFTER THEY'VE BEEN ALREADY ATTACKED AMADLED. MATTHOW DID NOT WANT TO GOBACK TO THE "WESTRANIA" THERE WERE TOO MANY TRAUMATIC MEMORIES, HE COULDN'T COPE WITH EMOTIONALLY WHICH RESULTED IN BAD NIGHTMARES, A GREAT LOSS OF SLEEP WHICH CONSEQUENTLY RESULTED IN A HIGH DEGREE OF IRRITABILITY AND ANXIETY. EVEN THOUGH HE'D HAD COUNCIALING ON A FEW OCCASIONS, THIS DID NOTHING TO ELEVIATE HIS PROBLEMS, MAYBE HIS TREATMENT WAS NOT TAKEN SERIOUSLY ENOUGH.

JUST BEFORE XMAS OF 1998 MATTHEW WAS
HOSPITALISED WITH SEVERE DEPRESSION, THIS SHOULD
HAVE BEEN A WARNING THAT SOMETHING WAS VERY
WRONG AND TO HAVE SOMETHING CONSTRUCTIVE DONE—
THE NAVY THEN DECIDED FOR THE PURPOSES OF
MAINTAINING HIS MENTAL HEALTH HE COULD NOT STRY

ON THE WESTRALIA" IT ONLY TOOK THEM
MONTHS TO COME TO THIS DISUIDUS CONCLUSION
THAT IN ITSELF IS AN ABOMINATION, HE THEN
WENT TO SHORE DUTIES, ONLY AFTER HE
PRACTURED HIS LEG AND HAD COME HOME ON
LEAVE. THE MEDICAL FACILITY AT "STIRLING"
SET HIS LEG WRONG, SO CONSEQUENTLY AFTER
PAINS MISLRY, THE HOSPITAL AT SPIELD ENNOGERRA
HAD TO PUT HIM UNDER G.A. AND REDO HIS
LEG. HE WENT BACK TO "STIRLING" ABOUT IDDAYS
LATER & ENDED UP ON SHORE DUTIES AT THE

SO MUCH FOR THE BEHVACRATS PROMISE

AT THE MEMORIAL SERVICE OF LETTING THESE YOUNG

MEN WHO HAD BEEN TRAUMATISED & INTURED LEAVE

PERTH AFTER THE DISASTER. IF THEY SO WISHED - BUT

FOR MATTHEW. INSTEAD HE VIEWED THE OBJECT

OF HIS PAIN & MISERY "THE WESTRAKIA" EVERY DAY

UNTIL HE COULDN'T LOPE WITH IT ANY LONGER

SO HE STHRTED RETICTIVES WITH BAD BEHAVIOUR.

AND TRYING TO DESTROY EVERYTHING AROUND HIM

THIS IS WHERE STEPPED IN BECAUSE
HE WAS PLEADING FOR HELP, HIS MIND WAS IN
CHAOS AND HE WAS NOT TAKEN SERIOULY
ENOUGH TO GET PROPER HELP.

/ ENLISTED THE HELP OF GARY HARGRAUS MP.
TO GET MATTHEW OUT OF PERTH. & TO GET THE
HELP MATTHEW DESPERATELY NEEDED, I HAD A
FIGHT ON MY HANDS & I THREATENED TO GO TO
THE MEDIA IF NOTHING WAS DONE. THIS WOULD
BE DOCUMENTED BELAUSE I FOUND MENTION OF IT
IN MATTHEW'S MEDICAL FILES

INAS TERRIBLY AFRAID & WORRIED SICK WHERE

ALL THIS WAS GOING TO LEAD IF I WAITED FOR

THE NAVY TO DO SOMETHING. —WHICH DON'T

IDELIEVE THEY WOULD HAVE, MATTHEW NAS

IN A TERRIBLE STATE. OF MENTAL COLLAPSE AND

NOTHING CONSTRUCTIVE WAS IDETING DONE TO HELP

Aim.

IT. IHAD TAKEN FROM STH MAJ 98 THE DAY OF
THE DISHSTER, WHEN HE LOST 2 FRIGNOS, DINE HE
TRIED TO REVINE Y POTON ASTRUBACHER TILL 4 HH JAN 99
FOR THE NAVY TO THE HIM TO THE ACCOMMODATIONS
BLOCK IN "STIRLING" - NOT OUT OF HERTH - SO
HE WAS IN RETHITY NO BETTER OFF.

MATHEW WAS IN TRANSIT HOME WHEN HIS POSTING WAS BEING AFFECTED AS !

SAID BEFORE ! THREATENED TO GO TO THE MEDIA.

THIS WAS IOMONTHS APPROX AFFER THE DISASTER.

THERE HAD BEEN MORE THAN ENOUGH TIME FOR THE

NAVY TO DO THE DECENT THING BY SOMEONE WHO

CAME CLOSE TO LOCKING HIS LIFE (WORDS FROM

A COMMANDER AT STREING) JUST AFFER THE DISASTER.

MATHEN BY THIS TIME - DURING THESE
MONTHS HAD REVERTED TO ALLOHOL TO HS HE SHW IT
TO HELP HIM COPE & BLOCK ISSUES OUT OF HIS
MINIO - SO THIS IN TURN CREATED HNOTHER PROBLEM

ON HIS MEDICAL FILES A. "MINUTE" DATED

10-8-99 THERE WAS A RECOMMENDATION. WHETHER

THAT WAS EVER EFFECTED / DO NOT KNOW. IT WAS

CONCERNING ALCOHOL.

THE ASSESSMENT TEAM OF PSYCHIATRISTS,

SOCIAL WORKERS & PYSCHOLOGISTS WHO FOLLOW

THE GUIDELINES OF THE NATIONAL CENTRE FOR

WAR RELATED P.T.S.D. FOUND MATTHEW GUALIFIED

FOR ADMISSION TO THE P.T.S.D. TREATMENT PROGRAMME

THIS PROGRAME COMMENCED 24-9-99. THIS IS

16-17 MONTHS AFTER THE WESTRALIA! DISHSTER.

WHY SO LONG

THE PRIME MINISTER THE POR ITITIONS ALL SAY
WE NOTED A. STRONG DEFENCE FORCE. —— I SAY
YOU NEED A VERY STRONG RELOVERY FORCE OF
PROFESSIONAL PEDALE WHO KNOW THEIR JOB &
CARE
MAINTAIN A HIGH LEVEL OF MEDICAL, MENTAL, LETC
TO CAME & MAINTAIN YOUR DEFENCE FORCE. IF
OUR KIDS LIVES ARE ON THE LINE (IN NO MATTER
WHAT CIRCUMSTANCES) IT SHOULD BE A FOREGONE
THE BEST OF
CONCLUSION THAT THEY GIET, THE HELP THEY DESERVE
IN THE REALMS OF THE DEF. FORCE.

THERE SHOULD BE PEOPLE WHO FOLLOW THRU

EXHAUSTING HLL AVENUES TO HELP THESE KIDS

NOT THEIR SUPERIORS LIKE WARRANT EFFICERS ETC

ETC WHO IN A LOT OF CASES ARE BIASED CRITICAL

PREDUCIESED. THIS RANKING FROM THE ABOUT

CAUSES INTIMIDATION AND OTHER SIDE EFFECTS

LIKE LOW SELF ESTEEM AMONG OTHER THINGS, THIS

LEADS TO SERIOUS PROBLEMS FOR THE UNFORTUNATE

PERSON WHOSE AND WHO IS IN A CRISIS, WITH

ALL THE OVERSEAS AID AMONG OTHER THINGS SURELY

IF THE GOULD AN SERVE EVERYONE ELSE WHO DOESN'T

BELONG HERE THEN THEY CAN CLEAN UP OF ROWN

BACK YARD FIRST. AS THE SAYING GOES IN SIMPLICITY

'IF YOULDN'T HELD YOURSELF & YOUR OWN — HOW

CAN YOU HELP ANYONE ELSE "

MAYBE IF THE DEF. MEMBERS BET THE RIGHT HELP - NOT RIDICULE & INTIMIDATION FROM THEIR IMMEDIATE SUPERIORS - THINGS WOULD BE A LOT BETTER ALL ROUND. - AND/AM NOT TALKING ABOUT. SOCIAL WORKERS FROM THE DEFENCE COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION EITHER. THEY ARE TRUELY A WASTE DE SPACE & GOU. FUNDS AND THAT IS FROM MY MERSONAL EXPERIENCE THE "WESTRANIA" IS ONLY ENE EXAMPLE. A. BATCH OF PAMPHLIETS DHOPMED OFF. FOR US TO READ AMOUT HOW TO COPE - NO TALK -NO NOTHING. THEY CAN'T EVEN RETURN SIMPLE PHONE MESSHOSES. MAYBE THEY SOCIALISE TOO MUCH. - IN 30 YEARS I'VE NEVER SEEN ANY OF THEM DO MUCH CONSTRUCTIVE , - I HAVE HEARD THE SAME REACTION FROM A LOT OF OTHER FAMILIES OVER TIME - THERE ARE STILL MEMBERS DE MY FAMILY & RELATIVES SERVING IN THE DET. FORCE THERE ARE PROBABLY 200 YRS PLUS OF SERVICE IN OUR GROOF ALONE.

M.C.RS. AND M.S.B.S needs

BLEWHARDING - ALL YOU GET IS THE KUN ARGUND.

THE LEGHISLATION GOVERNING THESE DEPT'S.

IS # SURELY IN NEED OF REVIEW - ITS

BRUIDUS TO ME YOU DON'T NEED AN EDUCATION

TO WORK IN THESE DEPT'S. A. IZYEAR OLD CHILD

COULD PROBABLY DO THE WORK THEY DO WITH BETTER

MANNERS AND COURTESY

ALL MY SON WANTED WAS TO GO BACK TO WORK, HE NEEDED TO FINISH GRADE IR TO QUALIFY HIM TO START ANOTHER CHREER.

NOT 3 MONTH COURSES WHICH WAS ALL HE WASN'T AND OFFICIEN. THESE HIGHER KHNKS HAVE EVERY AVENUE AT THESE HIGHER KHNKS HAVE EVERY AVENUE AT THESE DISPOSAL _ LOWER KHNKS

DON'T AND THIS IS WRONG. — I'D WASER MY SON WAS AS INTELLIGENT IF NOT MORE SO THAN SOME OF THE OFFICERS I'VE SEEN IN MY 63 YEARS THESE GO DAY WONDERS YOU LET LOOSE ON THE LOWER RANKS. THEY ARE SO FULL OF THESE OWN IMPORTANCE.

MATTHEW WROTE TO A FEB. M.P. AND
ALSO HAD AN INTERVIEW WITH A. MR. PETET SLIPPET.

(CHLOUNDRA. Noth Sonshine (OAST), WHO WAS
SUPPOSED TO HE IN THE PROCESS OF HELPING HAM.

THIS WAS GOVERS OR THERE HIGHTS BEFORE

MATTHEW DIED _ / HAVE ASKED HIS OFFICE
ON A COUPLE OF OCCASIONS FOR COPIES OF

WHAT HE WAS DOING TO NO AVAIL _

THE ONLY REFERENCE IS THE ENCLOSED VETLY

ROUGH COPNIE. BUT IT SERVES THE PURPOSE

I SUPPOSE, FOR THE CONTENTS, OF WHAT HE

WAS TRYING SO HARD TO ACCOMPLISH.

DURING THIS TIME MATTHEW AFTER NOT
HEARING ANYTHING BACK - SENT AWAY FOR THE
PAPERWORK FOR HUSTUDY (THIS IS HOW SERIOUS HE WAS
ABOUT STUDYING TO GO BACK TO THE WORKFORCE)
HE WAS PREPARED TO APPLY FOR AUSTUDY &
LIVE ON THE SMELL OF AN OIL RAG **TO
ACCOMPLISH WHAT HE WANTED TO DO) WE
AGGRED TO HELP IN ANY WAY & BY US
GIVING Him HIS DAILY NEED, A COMFORTABLE

BEDROOM, WE EVEN GOT A COMPUTED FOR

HIM, TO SET HIM UP SO HE LOULD GO EFF

HIS PENSIONS & DO WHAT HE WANTED.

MCRS & COMCITE WOULDN'T HELP HIM.

AND WE WERE WILLING TO SEE THIS THROUGH

(HAVE THE AUSTUDY PADERWORK HERE. HE ASKED FOR)

THAT WAS THE WEEKEND HE THREW THE

TOWEL IN AND KILLED HIMSETF. — WE HAD

GONE TO BRISDANE TO GET THE COMPUTER

AND HAD HOPED WE WERE BRINGING HIM

HOME FROM HOSPITAL - WHERE HE'D BEEN FOR

ZWEEKS PRIOR.

Attachment A Collissent ~2000 by Gray Margreaues.

Dulcie Liddell

Dear Mr. Howard,

I am writing to you and Mr. Moore and a couple of other people about my son ,who was part of the disaster of the H.M.A.S.'Westralia',Matthew was one of the group that was airlifted off after the explosion. He was in close contact [a matter of a few feet] as I understand it. To where Bradley Meek was killed he tried to revive him not realizing he was dead, Matthew lost two friends in that tragedy, this has had terrible ramifications for him, he doesn't have much of a life anymore in his eyes.

He's living with this every day of his life Idon; texpect you to realize the full ramifications of how this has effected him but as a father yourself maybe you can relate to the anguish we feel as parents as to his future and daily living and trying to move on from the tragedy.

Six weeks or there about later Mathew's leg was fractured playing football, an intership game he was sent home on sick leave after his leg was set in plaster, he was in so much pain we sent him to 2 FD Hospital Enoggera Army base where they found it had been set wrong and had to redo a manipulation under general anesethic after this he was then deployed to work at the Accommodations block at H.M.A.S. Sterling where he stayed for some time (approx 5 months) forgotten about is the phrase! He tried to be released from there several times as the stress level was starting to build then.

I received several phone calls from him in that time as to how he was feeling but to no avail even after the guys directly involved in the fire were told they have a choice of transfers as I see it Mathew was never given that choice.

The pressure and frustration grew until Mathew blew a fuse consequently an incident occurred in the office of the accommodations block (in between all this Mathew had received some counseling from an independent physcologist the navy had sent him to, this did not appear to have much effect as this incident previously stated shows) the upshot of all this was me trying to intervene to get something done to help him.

The doctor in charge of HMAS Sterling medical facility informed me that Mathew was throwing tantrums now I ask how uneducated is the doctor that can come to that diagnosis when the patient is suffering from Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PSDS) which was diagnosed by the army hospital at Enoggera

Going back I tried to help my son and I didn't go through normal channels I went through Gary Hargrave (who approached John Moore about getting Mathew sent away from Sterling and at that point things had started to change, he was redeployed to Penguin where another incident happened.

Mathew was charged with two counts of prejudicial behavior because he used unbecoming language and behavior to a superior. At this time Mathew had a drinking problem due to stress and his inability to cope which was aggravated by the superiors who due to their inexperience and ignorance of the medical condition suffered by Mathew.

Mathew was taunted by his superiors on many occasions in particular POET C.L.Hockings S127788. Who taunted Mathew about the "westralia' remarks like (how's the westralia today AB) I believe the conduct is unbecoming of a Senior Sailor of the RAN. Ibelieve Mathew reaction was directly due to the behavior of this particular Superior officer.

Also the ignorance demonstrated by the CO Penguin at the time Mathew was charged whom I rang and spoke to about his behavior and charge that he was on, she was blissfully unaware of the circumstances of his reasons for posting to penguin even though he had been her Duty driver on some occasions. Mathew was fined on both counts and given a confinement to base on both accounts. PO Hockings was Mathew's divisional officer at this time; now you tell me how he could go to his superior officer when he was being taunted by the same.

The follow on from before he faced the captains table he was given a choice of going to sea on the Geraldton where another incident happened, happily this was resolved by the skipper of the Geraldton who I think handled the situation with the utmost care and understanding he is a credit to the navy and what it should stand for. Mathew came home on leave in the august of 99 where he was admitted to the hospital at Enoggera where for the first time since the tragedy he was starting to get help thanks to the army and a wonderful doctor, DR. Ash who took the time to take Mathew's situation and problems seriously. APSDS course was begun, this course is costing around \$ 16,000 which the navy wasn't happy about which I think is pathetic considering there is alife involved and, quality of life.

Mathew is being medically discharged the process is going through now I believe. The surgeon general has stopped it twice, is that good or bad? Which brings me to what happens to him after discharge, is he filed away in archives or is there going to be ongoing help for him? which he desperately needs.

Mathew is the youngest of six children and the family find it hard to know how to react to him on a daily ,basis we don't understand all the ramifications of PSDS but we are trying. My husbands as well as my own health had deteriorated to a point of daily stress and worry over Mathew because of his irregular sleep patterns and mood swings, he could not hold a job at this stage if his life deepened on it apart from the PSDS he also has ongoing problems with his leg that was fractured and we do not know where to go from this point in time.

How does the military compensation scheme (MCS) justify the percentages they base these cases on , Mathew was granted 20 % disability and he couldn't hold a job down . Out of \$23,000 interim payment or there about he has had to pay a lawyer over \$6,000 fees to fight his PSDS case ,why is this so?

Independent doctors reports cost \$600 plus which to make his case he had to pay on top of the solicitors fees he is <u>supposed</u> to get refunded the doctors reports fees why is this procedure necessary when the fact of the westralia explosion is common knowledge. What is wrong with the MCS when you have to go out side for help to prove to them there is something very wrong.

I think you need to upgrade the system especially consulting GP's who make these decisions for the department when there should be specialists involved in decision making especially PTSD problems. Mathew has not only lost his health and mental wellbeing he has lost his career (which is loss of income) and the will to be able to make something of his life, he has problems with interaction with people and relationships , everything that goes to having a normal life.

I am not a stranger to Defence force life; my husband had 20 years service with the RAN, my oldest son 6 years service in the RAN currently a fire officer in the Queensland Fire Brigade, two son in laws in the army one served 21 years and discharged a Saff Sgt. and one currently serving as a WO2 who went to East Timor last year with 18 years service at this time so I am not ignorant to the routine of service life.

I have had my ups and downs over the years with living all over the place with the problems that inevertabley arise. I know things should be done through certain channels the proper way but Iam at my wits end with Matthew's situation he is an intelligent young man and was a caring and loving son who was only ever interested in making a career as a clearance diver in the Navy, that was all he wanted now he is a lost soul floundering in heavy seas whipped by the wind and not knowing where life will take him.

He can't erase the memory of Bradley meeks' skin that came off on to him when he was trying to revive him but didn't realize that he was already dead. He has a recurring dream where the skin is all over him and he sees Bradley's staring eyes, have you ever seen a human being cry from his heart and soul sometimes without even making a sound, this is what I call crying fom asoul that needs healing.

Many such incidents have occurred where he has sobbed to his father; I want my life back, all I want is my life back! The last instance was two weeks ago, what do you say to him? What do you do? he's to old for Band-Aids and dry the tears, he's not a little boy who has come to me hurt that I can sooth the hurts for. Mathew is a very moral person right is right and there is no grey area between right and wrong as far as he's concerned. He is as honest as the day is long, he's not perfect by any manor of means but he is my son and I love him dearly, my heart aches for him because of my inability to be able to remove the pain that he endures both physically and emotionally.

As I see it he will probably never be able to marry or have children, I couldn't see any woman being able to cope with his mood swings and his erratic behavior, she would have to be somebody very special but Ihope that there is such a person out there for him. I am out of my depth, Ido not know were to go from here. Are there other avenues where help can be sought for him besides mental health counseling

He needs activities to achieve and have aspirations again for his future I don't know how to give him back the enthusiasm to develop interest in activities because he has lost interest in activities he enjoyed before. He feels that he doesn't have a life at this point in time he is just existing.

Why should our service men and women have to be the last on the list of our priorities when countless time and dollars is spent on overseas aid like what was done for the Kosho's and the people of East Timor just to name a couple of areas although as far as East Timor goes we owed them for their help in saving a lot of our boys during the WW2 doesn't the Australian family rate a first when the politicians send them off to war they go like lambs to the slaughter in the name freedom and democracy and the Australian way of life. I don't consider that my comments are out of line in the above paragraph.

MR. Howard as a father of children and a man of honor, as I sincerely believe you to be, can you find it in your heart and scope to please help me to help my son in our hour of need.

(tatement B (made for purpose of military compensation clam)

STATEMENT OF

DULCIE KATHLEEN LIDDELL

- 1. I am the mother of Matthew John Liddell. Following my son's involvement in the HMAS Westralia tragedy he was placed in a Private Hospital in Perth for several days. He was then transferred to the Base Hospital at HMAS Stirling, Perth. I believe that he was hospitalised at HMAS Stirling for about a week.
- 2. Subsequently he was discharged from Hospital and posted back to HMAS Westralia. This posting only lasted five (5) weeks before he fractured his left leg during an organised Navy sporting event.
- 3. Just before Christmas 1998 Matthew was again hospitalised for severe depression. As a result of this particular hospitalisation it was decided by the Navy that, for the purposes of maintaining his mental health, he could not go back to HMAS Westralia and instead he was posted to Shore Duties.
- 4. In March 1999 he was posted to HMAS Penguin in Sydney, New South Wales. Eventually he was allowed home to Brisbane on leave in September 1999 and during that time he required hospitalisation once again for severe depression. He was hospitalised upon this occasion at 2 Field Hospital, Gallipoli Barracks, Enoggera. The Army Chaplains at Gallipoli Barracks, Enoggera, provided great support to him at this time and indeed they were instrumental in having him admitted to Hospital suffering from severe depression.

- 5. Presently, he attends the Toowong Private Hospital, Post Traumatic Stress Disorder Clinic, and will attend for six (6) weeks full time and six (6) weeks part time.
- 6. I am very concerned over my son's present mental ill health.
- 7. Whilst he was working with the Navy in Perth upon one (1) occasion he actually threw a computer monitor across the room in which he was working and tried to punch his hand through a plateglass door.
- 8. I know that recently in Brisbane his anger and aggression have caused him to physically kick both his car and the motor car of another person, whilst he was in heavy traffic.
- 9. In our home environment Matthew is consistently angry, aggressive, and reclusive. He has great problems in getting a full night's sleep and in consequence is in an ongoing state of irritability and non-communicativeness.
- 10. I need to daily supervise Matthew regarding household tasks. He leaves the television set on continually at night and indeed regularly he leaves the television set on all night. I am also fearful that the stove will be left on all night, thereby creating a risk of fire in the house. Matthew is not capable of living alone and looking after himself. It concerns my greatly that his vagueness and lack of memory around the house could result in accident injury, or at worst the risk of fire. If I don't prepare meals for Matthew, he simply won't eat at all. He appears to have forgotten how to look after his own well-being.

- 11. He leaves lights on in the middle of the day and taps and the shower are left running after he uses them. I have virtually got to follow him around the house making sure that switches and appliances are turned off after he has used them. Additionally, Matthew has difficulty managing his finances and I try to oversee these matters as well.
- 12. Generally and unfortunately my son is now uncommunicative and withdrawn, even with his family. He no longer is the happy-go-lucky young man he once was. His circle of friends is drastically reduced and he now has only perhaps one or two close friends.
- 13. My comments in this my Statement are true and accurate and I would be pleased to elaborate on my comments if the need arises.

DATED at

this 29th day of hovemberggg.

Lui Kathlen Modell
DULCIE KATHLEEN LIDDELL