The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

# Report 419

Inquiry into the *Auditor-General Act 1997* 

**Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit** 

December 2010 Canberra © Commonwealth of Australia 2010 ISBN 978-0-642-79400-0 (Printed version)

ISBN 978-0-642-79401-7 (HTML version)

## **Contents**

Foi	reword	V
Me	embership of the Committee	vii
Tei	rms of reference	X
Lis	st of abbreviations	xii
Lis	st of recommendations	X\
1	Introduction	1
	Background	1
	The Auditor-General Act 1997	3
	Purpose of the inquiry	4
	Conduct of the inquiry	5
	Structure of the report	5
2	Legislative support for new functions	7
	Introduction	7
	Explicit recognition of assurance activities	9
3	Clarification of rights and responsibilities	15
	Introduction	15
	Government Business Enterprises	16
	Auditing performance indicators	20
	Legal professional privilege	25
	Fees for financial statement audits	30
	Acting as auditor under the Corporations Act	31
	Providing advice and information	33

	Auditing standards	34
	Parliamentary privilege	34
	Exemptions from FOI and the Privacy Act	36
	Definitions of 'persons' giving evidence	40
	Explicit access to Cabinet documents	41
	Whistleblowers	41
	Comments on reports and extracts of reports	43
	Tabling embargo during the caretaker period	45
	Provision of information to committees	46
4	Strengthening the audit independence of the Auditor-General	51
	Background	51
	Appointment of the Auditor-General	52
	Budget resourcing	54
5	Jurisdictional issues – 'following the dollar'	57
	Introduction	57
	Cross-jurisdictional arrangements – grants to States/Territories	58
	Commonwealth jurisdiction – auditing related entities/contractors	68
	Other Commonwealth activities	71
	Conclusion	72
Appendix A – List of Submissions		
Аp	ppendix B – List of Exhibits	77
Αp	ppendix C – List of Public Hearings	79

### **Foreword**

This report completes an inquiry into the provisions of the *Auditor-General Act* 1997 undertaken by the Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit in the 42<sup>nd</sup> Parliament.

The *Auditor-General Act 1997*, which replaced the *Audit Act 1901*, formally recognised the Auditor-General as an "Independent Officer of the Parliament", and greatly strengthened the audit independence of him and the Australian National Audit Office (ANAO). The Act reflected many of the recommendations made by the Committee in its October 1996 report *Guarding the Independence of the Auditor-General*, and earlier reports.

In February 2009 the Committee resolved to review whether the provisions of the *Auditor-General Act* 1997 remain adequate in the modern public sector environment, noting at the time that eight years had passed since the Committee's last such review.

This report contains 13 recommendations. Amongst other things, the recommendations are directed to:

- ensuring that the Auditor-General has sufficient legislative backing for assurance reviews the Parliament may wish him to carry out (for example, the ANAO's work on the annual Defence *Major Projects Report* and its former role in scrutinising proposed government advertising campaigns);
- removing antiquated restrictions on the Auditor-General's capacity to initiate audits of Commonwealth Government Business Enterprises;
- enhancing the Auditor-General's role in reviewing the adequacy of agencies' performance indicators; and
- giving the Auditor-General greater authority to "follow the dollar" where non-Commonwealth bodies are in receipt of Commonwealth funding to deliver agreed outcomes.

Although this report is being released by the Committee in the 43<sup>rd</sup> Parliament the work for the inquiry, including the conduct of the public hearings and the preparation of this report, was undertaken by the previous Committee. I thank the members of that Committee, chaired by Sharon Grierson MP, for their work. I also thank those who gave evidence to the inquiry for their contribution.

Robert Oakeshott MP Chair

## **Membership of the Committee**

### 43<sup>rd</sup> Parliament

**Chair** Mr Robert Oakeshott MP

**Deputy Chair** Mrs Yvette D'Ath MP

Members The Hon Dick Adams MP

Mr Jamie Briggs MP

Ms Gai Brodtmann MP

Mr Darren Cheeseman MP

Mr Josh Frydenberg MP

Ms Deb O'Neill MP

Ms Laura Smyth MP

The Hon Alex Somlyay MP

Senator Guy Barnett

Senator Mark Bishop

Senator Annette Hurley

Senator Helen Kroger

Senator Glenn Sterle

### **42nd Parliament**

**Chair** Ms Sharon Grierson MP

Deputy Chair Mr Petro Georgiou MP

Members The Hon Dick Adams MP (from 17/08/09) Senator Guy Barnett

The Hon Arch Bevis MP Senator Mark Bishop

The Hon Bronwyn Bishop MP Senator David Bushby (until 02/02/10)

Mr David Bradbury MP Senator David Feeney

Mr Jamie Briggs MP Senator Helen Kroger (from 02/02/10)

Mr Mark Butler MP (until 15/06/09) Senator Kate Lundy

Ms Catherine King MP

The Hon Sussan Ley MP (from 03/02/10)

Mr Shayne Neumann MP

Mr Stuart Robert MP (until 03/02/10)

## **Committee secretariat**

**Secretary** Mr Russell Chafer

Inquiry Secretary Dr Kris Veenstra

Other research staff Ms Pauline Cullen

Dr Narelle McGlusky

Mr Ian McDonald

# **Terms of reference**

On 25 February 2009, the Committee resolved to review and report on whether the provisions of the *Auditor-General Act* 1997 remain adequate in the modern public sector environment, including but not limited to:

- a) whether the Act's focus on the Auditor-General's traditional assurance audit and performance audit roles gives the ANAO sufficient legislative backing for newer functions, for example the Defence "Major Projects Report" and, from July 2008, the Auditor-General's reviews of government advertising to give the public confidence that campaigns are legitimately authorised, properly targeted and non-political;
- b) any amendments necessary to clarify the ANAO's rights and obligations in relation to conducting audits and reviews;
- c) whether there should be changes to the categories of agencies that the Auditor-General audits, in particular section 16 of the Act which limits the Auditor-General's capacity to audit Government Business Enterprises (GBEs);
- d) any proposed amendments to the Act which would strengthen the audit independence of the ANAO and the Auditor-General's capacity to fulfil his role as an Independent Officer of the Parliament; and
- e) the Auditor-General's capacity to examine the financial and performance outcomes from Commonwealth investments in the private sector and Commonwealth grants made to State and local governments.

The inquiry shall have regard to the recommendations made by the Committee in its August 2001 *Report 386: Review of the Auditor-General Act 1997* and the consequent amendments to the Act made by the *Auditor-General Amendment Act 2009*.

### List of abbreviations

ACAG Australasian Council of Auditors-General

A-G Auditor-General

ANAO Australian National Audit Office

APRA Australian Prudential Regulation Authority

ASAE Standard on Assurance Engagements

BER Building the Education Revolution

CAC Act Commonwealth Authorities and Companies Act 1997

CEO Chief Executive Officer

COAG Council of Australian Governments

DEEWR Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations

DMO Defence Materiel Organisation

FMA Act Financial Management and Accountability Act 1997

FOI Act Freedom of Information Act 1982

GBE Government Business Enterprise

GST Goods and Services Tax

IPAA Institute of Public Administration Australia

JCPA(A) Joint Committee of Public Accounts (and Audit)

MPR Major Projects Report

NBN National Broadband Network

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

PBS Portfolio Budget Statement

SPPs Specific Purpose Payments

## **List of recommendations**

#### Recommendation 1 (page 13)

That the *Auditor-General Act* 1997 be amended to provide the Auditor-General with explicit authority to conduct assurance engagements. In circumstances where such assurance engagements have been identified as priorities by the Parliament, they should be subject to the same information-gathering powers that pertain to performance audits undertaken by the Auditor-General. The Auditor-General should have the authority to determine arrangements, including reporting arrangements to the Parliament, to be followed in the conduct of these assurance engagements.

#### Recommendation 2 (page 20)

That the Act be amended to provide the Auditor-General with the authority to initiate performance audits of Commonwealth controlled Government Business Enterprises.

#### Recommendation 3 (page 25)

That the Act be amended as necessary to enable the Auditor-General to review an agency's compliance with its responsibilities for a sub-set of performance indicators. Proposed performance indicators to be audited should be identified annually by the Auditor-General and forwarded to the Parliament, via the JCPAA for comment, in a manner similar to the annual performance audit work program for the ANAO.

The Auditor-General should be resourced appropriately to undertake this function.

#### Recommendation 4 (page 30)

That the Act be amended to make clear that claims of legal professional privilege do not override the Auditor-General's information gathering powers. The Act should also be amended to make clear that access to documents upon which legal professional privilege is claimed does not amount to a waiver of such privilege.

#### Recommendation 5 (page 31)

That subject to consultation with affected bodies, consideration be given to amending the Act so that all statutory authorities or other bodies that fall outside the ambit of the CAC Act are liable to pay audit fees for financial statements.

#### Recommendation 6 (page 32)

That section 21 of the Act be amended to reflect that the Auditor-General is able to audit any Commonwealth-controlled entity including Commonwealth-controlled companies and their subsidiaries.

#### Recommendation 7 (page 34)

That the Act be amended to require the Auditor-General to set auditing and assurance standards.

#### Recommendation 8 (page 36)

The Committee suggests that the Privileges Committee of both the Senate and the House of Representatives examine in more detail the application of parliamentary privilege to ANAO draft reports, extracts of draft reports and working papers, noting the Auditor-General's status as an 'independent officer of the Parliament'.

#### Recommendation 9 (page 45)

That the Auditor-General continue to provide the recipients of extracts of proposed audit reports with clear guidelines to clarify expectations around the submission of comments (e.g., the importance of brevity and clarity) and also the implications for naming other persons/entities /organisations in those comments which are published in full.

#### Recommendation 10 (page 64)

That all funding agreements between the Commonwealth and other levels of Government include standard clauses providing the Auditor-General with access to all information and records, and a capacity to inspect work on all projects, relating to the use of Commonwealth funds under those agreements.

#### Recommendation 11 (page 67)

That the Act be amended as necessary so that the Auditor-General may conduct a performance audit to directly assess the performance of bodies that receive Commonwealth funding in circumstances where there is a corresponding or reciprocal responsibility to deliver specified outcomes in accordance with agreed arrangements if a Minister or the Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit requests the audit.

The Auditor-General may ask a Minister or the Joint Committee of Public Accounts and Audit to make such a request.

#### Recommendation 12 (page 71)

That the Act be amended so that the functions performed by entities including private contractors on behalf of the Commonwealth in the delivery of government programs can be subject to direct audit by the Auditor-General.

#### Recommendation 13 (page 71)

That the Act be amended to ensure that when a decision is made by the Auditor-General to conduct an audit of a non-Commonwealth body, the reasons for that decision should be disclosed in the publication of the report.