

1913.

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH.

No. 52.

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES.

TUESDAY, 11TH NOVEMBER, 1913.

1. The House met, at three o'clock p.m., pursuant to adjournment.—Mr. Speaker took the Chair, and read Prayers.
2. PRIVILEGE.—Mr. Joseph Cook directed attention to a statement reported to have been made at Ballarat, on 9th November instant, by the honorable Member for Ballaarat (Mr. McGrath). While this matter was under consideration—

Member Named.—The honorable Member for Barrier (Mr. Thomas) having been named by Mr. Speaker, for disregarding the authority of the Chair, Mr. Joseph Cook moved, That the honorable Member for Barrier be suspended from the service of the House.

And the question having been put, and a division being called for, and Mr. Speaker calling, in turn, upon several Members voting with the "Noes" to act as Tellers for the "Noes" and they not obeying such call, Mr. Speaker appointed Mr. Orchard and Colonel Ryrie as Tellers for the "Noes."

The House divided—

Ayes, 36.

Mr. Abbott	Mr. Kelly
Mr. Ahern	Mr. Kendall
Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Livingston
Mr. James Bennett	Mr. Manifold
Sir Robert Best	Mr. Orchard
Mr. Boyd	Mr. Palmer
Mr. Chapman	Mr. Patten
Mr. Conroy	Mr. Pigott
Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Rodgers
Mr. Falkiner	Colonel Ryrie
Mr. Fleming	Mr. Sampson
Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sinclair
Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Bruce Smith
Mr. Fowler	Mr. Stumm
Mr. Glynn	Mr. Wynne
Mr. Gregory	
Mr. Groom	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. Hans Irvine	Mr. Greene
Mr. W. H. Irvine	Mr. John Thomson

Noes, 36.

Mr. Anstey	Mr. Mathews
Mr. Archibald	Mr. McDonald
Mr. Arthur	Mr. McGrath
Mr. Bamford	Mr. O'Malley
Mr. Brennan	Mr. Page
Mr. Burchell	Mr. Poynton
Mr. Burns	Mr. Riley
Mr. Carr	Mr. Roberts
Mr. Catts	Mr. Sharpe
Mr. Charlton	Mr. Laird Smith
Mr. Dankel	Mr. Spence
Mr. Fenton	Mr. Thomas
Mr. Finlayson	Mr. Tudor
Mr. Fisher	Mr. Watkins
Mr. Frazer	Mr. Webster
Mr. Hannan	Mr. West
Mr. Higgs	
Mr. Howe	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. Hughes	Mr. Orchard
Mr. W. Maloney	Colonel Ryrie

[These Tellers voted with the "Ayes."]

The numbers for the "Ayes" and the "Noes" being equal, Mr. Speaker gave his casting vote with the "Ayes."

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

11th November, 1913.

The honorable Member was, therefore, under Standing Order No. 59, suspended for the remainder of the day's sitting, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

The consideration of the question of Privilege was resumed, and certain Points of Order having been dealt with—the honorable Member for Ballarat was asked by Mr. Speaker to state if the newspaper report of his speech at Ballarat was correct; and the honorable Member having spoken and not availing himself of the opportunity to admit or to deny the correctness of the report, Mr. Joseph Cook moved, That the honorable Member for Ballarat be suspended from the service of this House for the remainder of the Session unless he sooner unreservedly retracts the words uttered by him at Ballarat on Sunday, the 9th October, and reflecting on Mr. Speaker, and apologises to the House.

Debate ensued.

And the newspaper report having been read by the Clerk, and the honorable Member for Ballarat having again been asked by Mr. Speaker if the report was correct, and having spoken and again not availing himself of the opportunity to admit or to deny the correctness of the report—

Debate on motion resumed.

Mr. Groom moved the following amendment:—Omit the word "October" and insert the word "November."

Debate ensued.

Mr. Joseph Cook moved, That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided—

Ayes, 35.

Mr. Abbott	Mr. Kendell
Mr. Ahern	Mr. Livingston
Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Manifold
Mr. James Bennett	Mr. Orchard
Mr. Boyd	Mr. Palmer
Mr. Chapman	Mr. Patten
Mr. Conroy	Mr. Pigott
Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Rodgers
Mr. Falkiner	Colonel Ryrie
Mr. Fleming	Mr. Sampson
Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sinclair
Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Bruce Smith
Mr. Fowler	Mr. Stumm
Mr. Glynn	Mr. Wynne
Mr. Gregory	
Mr. Groom	
Mr. Hans Irvine	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. W. H. Irvine	Mr. Greene
Mr. Kelly	Mr. John Thomson

Noes, 34.

Mr. Anstey	Mr. McDonald
Mr. Archibald	Mr. McGrath
Mr. Arthur	Mr. O'Malley
Mr. Brennan	Mr. Page
Mr. Burchell	Mr. Poynton
Mr. Burns	Mr. Riley
Mr. Catts	Mr. Roberts
Mr. Charlton	Mr. Sharpe
Mr. Dankel	Mr. Laird Smith
Mr. Fenton	Mr. Spence
Mr. Finlayson	Mr. Tudor
Mr. Fisher	Mr. Watkins
Mr. Frazer	Mr. Webster
Mr. Hannan	Mr. West
Mr. Higgs	
Mr. Howe	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. Hughes	Mr. Carr
Mr. Mathews	Mr. W. Maloney

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question being accordingly put—That the word "October" proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—it was negatived—And then the word "November" having been inserted in place of the word omitted—

Mr. Speaker addressed the House in regard to the proceedings on which the statements complained of were alleged to be founded.

Debate on original motion, as amended, continued.

Mr. Joseph Cook moved, That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided—

Ayes, 35.

Mr. Abbott	Mr. Kendell
Mr. Ahern	Mr. Livingston
Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Manifold
Mr. James Bennett	Mr. Orchard
Mr. Boyd	Mr. Palmer
Mr. Chapman	Mr. Patten
Mr. Conroy	Mr. Pigott
Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Rodgers
Mr. Falkiner	Colonel Ryrie
Mr. Fleming	Mr. Sampson
Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sinclair
Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Bruce Smith
Mr. Fowler	Mr. Stumm
Mr. Glynn	Mr. Wynne
Mr. Gregory	
Mr. Groom	
Mr. Hans Irvine	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. W. H. Irvine	Mr. Greene
Mr. Kelly	Mr. John Thomson

Noes, 34.

Mr. Anstey	Mr. Mathews
Mr. Archibald	Mr. McDonald
Mr. Brennan	Mr. McGrath
Mr. Burchell	Mr. O'Malley
Mr. Burns	Mr. Page
Mr. Carr	Mr. Poynton
Mr. Catts	Mr. Roberts
Mr. Charlton	Mr. Sharpe
Mr. Dankel	Mr. Laird Smith
Mr. Fenton	Mr. Spence
Mr. Finlayson	Mr. Tudor
Mr. Fisher	Mr. Watkins
Mr. Frazer	Mr. Webster
Mr. Hannan	Mr. West
Mr. Higgs	
Mr. Howe	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. Hughes	Mr. Arthur
Mr. W. Maloney	Mr. Riley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

11th and 12th November, 1913.

~~And the question being accordingly put—That the honorable Member for Ballarat be suspended from the service of this House for the remainder of the Session unless he sooner unreservedly retracts the words uttered by him at Ballarat on Sunday, the 9th November, and reflecting on Mr. Speaker, and apologises to the House—~~

The House divided—

Ayes, 35.		Noes, 34.	
Mr. Abbott	Mr. Kendell	Mr. Anstey	Mr. Mathews
Mr. Ahern	Mr. Livingston	Mr. Archibald	Mr. McDonald
Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Manifold	Mr. Arthur	Mr. McGrath
Mr. James Bennett	Mr. Orchard	Mr. Brennan	Mr. O'Malley
Mr. Boyd	Mr. Palmer	Mr. Burchell	Mr. Page
Mr. Chapman	Mr. Patten	Mr. Burns	Mr. Poynton
Mr. Conroy	Mr. Pigott	Mr. Carr	Mr. Riley
Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Rodgers	Mr. Catts	Mr. Roberts
Mr. Falkiner	Colonel Ryrie	Mr. Charlton	Mr. Sharpe
Mr. Fleming	Mr. Sampson	Mr. Dankel	Mr. Laird Smith
Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sinclair	Mr. Fenton	Mr. Spence
Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Bruce Smith	Mr. Finlayson	Mr. Tudor
Mr. Fowler	Mr. Stumm	Mr. Fisher	Mr. Watkins
Mr. Glynn	Mr. Wynne	Mr. Frazer	Mr. Webster
Mr. Gregory		Mr. Hannan	Mr. West
Mr. Groom		Mr. Higgs	
Mr. Hans Irvine	<i>Tellers:</i>	Mr. Howe	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. W. H. Irvine	Mr. Greene	Mr. Hughes	Mr. Atkinson
Mr. Kelly	Mr. John Thomson	Mr. W. Maloney	Colonel Ryrie

[These Tellers voted with the "Ayes."]

*See
V.T.P.
1914-15,
p 181.*

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

~~The honorable Member was, therefore, suspended for the remainder of the Session unless he sooner unreservedly retracts the words uttered by him at Ballarat on Sunday, the 9th November, and reflecting on Mr. Speaker, and apologises to the House.~~

3. ADJOURNMENT.—Mr. Joseph Cook moved, That the House do now adjourn.

And the House continuing to sit till after midnight—

WEDNESDAY, 12TH NOVEMBER, 1913.

Debate ensued.

Mr. Joseph Cook moved, That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided—

Ayes, 34.		Noes, 32.	
Mr. Abbott	Mr. Kendell	Mr. Anstey	Mr. W. Maloney
Mr. Ahern	Mr. Livingston	Mr. Archibald	Mr. Mathews
Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Manifold	Mr. Arthur	Mr. McDonald
Mr. James Bennett	Mr. Orchard	Mr. Brennan	Mr. Page
Mr. Boyd	Mr. Palmer	Mr. Burchell	Mr. Poynton
Mr. Conroy	Mr. Patten	Mr. Burns	Mr. Riley
Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Pigott	Mr. Carr	Mr. Roberts
Mr. Falkiner	Mr. Rodgers	Mr. Catts	Mr. Sharpe
Mr. Fleming	Colonel Ryrie	Mr. Charlton	Mr. Laird Smith
Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sampson	Mr. Dankel	Mr. Spence
Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Sinclair	Mr. Fenton	Mr. Tudor
Mr. Fowler	Mr. Bruce Smith	Mr. Finlayson	Mr. Watkins
Mr. Glynn	Mr. Stumm	Mr. Fisher	Mr. Webster
Mr. Gregory	Mr. Wynne	Mr. Frazer	Mr. West
Mr. Groom		Mr. Hannan	
Mr. Hans Irvine	<i>Tellers:</i>	Mr. Higgs	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. W. H. Irvine	Mr. Greene	Mr. Howe	Mr. Atkinson
Mr. Kelly	Mr. John Thomson	Mr. Hughes	Mr. Sampson

[These Tellers voted with the "Ayes."]

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question being accordingly put—That the House do now adjourn.

11th and 12th November, 1913.

The House divided—

Ayes, 34.		Noes, 32.	
Mr. Abbott	Mr. Kendell	Mr. Anstey	Mr. Mathews
Mr. Ahern	Mr. Livingston	Mr. Archibald	Mr. McDonald
Mr. Atkinson	Mr. Manifold	Mr. Arthur	Mr. Page
Mr. James Bennett	Mr. Orchard	Mr. Burchell	Mr. Poynton
Mr. Boyd	Mr. Palmer	Mr. Burns	Mr. Riley
Mr. Conroy	Mr. Patten	Mr. Catts	Mr. Roberts
Mr. Joseph Cook	Mr. Pigott	Mr. Charlton	Mr. Sharpe
Mr. Falkiner	Mr. Rodgers	Mr. Dankel	Mr. Laird Smith
Mr. Fleming	Colonel Ryrie	Mr. Fenton	Mr. Spence
Sir John Forrest	Mr. Sampson	Mr. Finlayson	Mr. Tudor
Mr. R. W. Foster	Mr. Sinclair	Mr. Fisher	Mr. Watkins
Mr. Fowler	Mr. Bruce Smith	Mr. Frazer	Mr. Webster
Mr. Glynn	Mr. Stumm	Mr. Hannan	Mr. West
Mr. Gregory	Mr. Wynne	Mr. Higgs	
Mr. Groom		Mr. Howe	
Mr. Hans Irvine	<i>Tellers:</i>	Mr. Hughes	<i>Tellers:</i>
Mr. W. H. Irvine	Mr. Greene	Mr. W. Maloney	Mr. Brennan
Mr. Kelly	Mr. John Thomson		Mr. Carr

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And then the House, at twenty-five minutes to one o'clock in the morning adjourned until this day at half-past two o'clock p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT.—All Members were present (at some time during the sitting) except—Mr. Jensen, and Mr. McWilliams.

C. GAVAN DUFFY,
Clerk of the House of Representatives.