

2002-03

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 96

TUESDAY, 3 JUNE 2003

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

**2 QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice being asked—

*Paper*

Mr Crean (Leader of the Opposition), by leave, presented the following paper:

Higher Education: Government Policy—Extract from House *Hansard*, 19 October 1999.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Paper*

Mr L. D. T. Ferguson, by leave, presented the following paper:

Donor to Political Parties Annual Return—Copy of form received by the Australian Electoral Commission from Dante Tan, 18 December 2002.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Member ordered to withdraw*

At 3.22 p.m. the Member for Watson (Mr McLeay) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a warning had been given from the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Questions without notice continued.

**3 PAPERS**

The following papers were presented:

Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade—Joint Standing Committee—Reports—From Phantom to Force: Towards a more efficient and effective Army; A model for a new Army: Community comments on 'From Phantom to Force' parliamentary report into the Army—Government response, May 2003.

Sydney Airport Demand Management Act—Quarterly reports on movement cap for Sydney airport for periods—

1 October to 31 December 2001.

1 January to 31 March 2002.

1 April to 30 June 2002.

1 July to 30 September 2002.

1 October to 31 December 2002.

1 January to 31 March 2003.

**4 PAPER—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER**

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following paper:

Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade—Joint Standing Committee—Reports—From Phantom to Force: Towards a more efficient and effective Army; A model for a new Army: Community comments on 'From Phantom to Force' parliamentary report into the Army—Government response, May 2003.

Debate adjourned (Mr Swan), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**5 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—ROADS OF NATIONAL IMPORTANCE PROJECTS FUNDING**

The House was informed that Mr Zahra had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The breaking of election commitments by the Commonwealth Government relating to funding for the Pakenham Bypass, the Calder Highway and other Roads of National Importance projects”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Zahra addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

**6 SELECTION COMMITTEE—REPORT**

Mr Causley (Chair) presented the following paper:

Selection Committee—Report relating to the program of private Members’ business on Monday, 16 June 2003.

**7 CRIMINAL CODE AMENDMENT (TERRORIST ORGANISATIONS) BILL 2003**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Lindsay, in the Chair)—

AYES, 69

Mr Anderson	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Secker
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Neville	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cameron	Mr Hawker	Ms Panopoulos	Dr Washer
Mr Causley	Mr Hockey	Mr Pearce	Mr Williams
Mr Charles	Mrs Hull	Mr Pyne	Mr Windsor
Mr Ciobo	Mr Hunt	Mr Randall	Ms Worth
Mr Cobb	Mr Johnson	Mr Ruddock	
Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Schultz	
Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Scott	

## NOES, 65

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Andren	Ms George	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Mrs Irwin	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mrs Crosio	Ms Jackson	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Organ	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Price	
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Quick*	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Ripoll	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

Mr Williams (Attorney-General) moved—That the Bill be now read a third time.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Lindsay, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 75

Mr Anderson	Mrs Draper	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Dutton	Jackie Kelly	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mrs Elson	Dr Kemp	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr Entsch	Mr P. E. King	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mr Farmer	Mrs Ley	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Baldwin	Mr Forrest*	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gallus	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Ticehurst
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Tollner
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Hawker	Ms Panopoulos	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Hockey	Mr Pearce	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Mr Williams
Mr Ciobo	Mr Hunt	Mr Pyne	Mr Windsor
Mr Cobb	Mr Johnson	Mr Randall	Ms Worth
Mr Downer	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	

## NOES, 65

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Andren	Ms George	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Mrs Irwin	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mrs Crosio	Ms Jackson	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby*	Mr Jenkins	Mr Organ	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Ms C. F. King	Mr Price	
Mr Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Quick*	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Ripoll	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—Bill read a third time.

#### 8 CRIMINAL CODE AMENDMENT (HIZBALLAH) BILL 2003

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Williams (Attorney-General), the Bill was read a third time.

#### 9 LEAVE OF ABSENCE TO MEMBER

Ms Worth (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Health and Ageing) moved—That leave of absence for the remainder of the current period of sittings be given to Mr I. E. Macfarlane (Minister for Industry, Tourism and Resources) on the ground of ill health.

Question—put and passed.

#### 10 HEALTH CARE (APPROPRIATION) AMENDMENT BILL 2003

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr S. F. Smith, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not opposing the Bill, the House condemns the Government for its health policy failures, including:

- (a) the Howard Government’s withdrawal of \$918 million from public hospitals over the next four years;
- (b) the Howard Government’s unfair Medicare package which will result in bulk billing, in time, only being available to pensioners and concession card holders and families being left to pay more and more for their health care;
- (c) the Howard Government’s decision to increase the cost of essential medicines by up to 30%, hitting the sickest and the poorest hardest; and
- (d) the Howard Government’s refusal to review the \$2.3 billion private health insurance rebate to ensure that it provides value for money for consumers and taxpayers”—

Debate resumed.

Dr Lawrence addressing the House—

**11 ADJOURNMENT**

It being 9 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 9.28 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 9 a.m.



**PAPERS**

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 3 June 2003:

Australian Meat and Live-stock Industry Act—Order—2003 Australian Meat and Live-stock Industry (Export of live sheep and goat exports to the Middle East).

Radiocommunications (Receiver Licence Tax) Act—Determination—2003 Radiocommunications (Receiver Licence Tax).

Radiocommunications (Transmitter Licence Tax) Act—Determination—2003 Radiocommunications (Transmitter Licence Tax).



**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Katter, Mr I. E. Macfarlane\* and Mr M. A. J. Vaile.

\* On leave



**I. C. HARRIS**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives

2002-03

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 96

**MAIN COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

TUESDAY, 3 JUNE 2003

---

1 The Main Committee met at 4 p.m.

2 **APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 1) 2003-2004—BUDGET DEBATE**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr McMullan, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House condemns the Government for:

- (1) its obsession with shifting the cost of health and education from the budget to Australian families;
- (2) imposing higher costs of doctors’ visits on families without concession cards and a 30 per cent hike in essential medicine prices;
- (3) allowing HECS fees to rise by 30%, introducing a loan scheme with a 6% interest rate and doubling the number of places reserved for full fee paying students;
- (4) its cynical attempt to distract the public from these higher costs by offering miserly tax cuts of \$4 a week for the average family;
- (5) its failure to address the complexity of superannuation and its determination to offer super cuts only to the wealthiest families;
- (6) its willingness to deliver tax cuts to corporate Australia while imposing a record tax burden on Australian families;
- (7) its failure to protect the superannuation savings of Australian families by protecting them from corporate greed;
- (8) its decision to hire yet more tax officials rather than take steps to ease the BAS compliance burden on small business; and
- (9) its failure to provide leadership on environmental issues and in particular its failure to address water reform”—

Debate resumed.

*Papers*

Mr Windsor, by leave, presented the following papers:

Importation of commercial rabbits—Correspondence—

Staff of Angora City (Rabbits) Pty Ltd to Mr Tony Windsor MP, 10 March 2003.

E-mail from Tim Harris, AATA European Secretary to Mr W Grave, 1 April 2003.

Ms Meryl Stanton, Executive Director, AQIS, to Mr W Grave, Director, Angora City (Rabbits) Pty Ltd, April 2003.

Mr W Grave, Director, Angora City (Rabbits) Pty Ltd, to Hon W Truss MP, Minister for Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry, 24 April 2003 and 9 May 2003.

Mr W Grave, Director, Angora City (Rabbits) Pty Ltd to Ms Meryl Stanton, Executive Director, AQIS, 7 May 2003, together with appendices.

---

*Suspension of sitting*

At 8.05 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of sitting*

At 8.21 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---

Debate continued.

Debate adjourned (Mr Georgiou), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**3 ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Mr Georgiou, the Main Committee adjourned at 9.02 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 9.40 a.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

---

---

**B. C. WRIGHT**  
Clerk of the Main Committee