

2002-03

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

## VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 82

WEDNESDAY, 19 MARCH 2003

1 The House met, at 9 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—ROUTINE OF BUSINESS FOR 19 MARCH 2003**

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House), pursuant to notice, moved—That for the sitting on Wednesday, 19 March 2003, so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the routine of business being as follows, unless otherwise ordered:

1. Order of the day, government business, being resumption of debate on the Prime Minister's motion relating to Iraq and the commitment to the coalition in the Gulf;
2. Presentation and adoption of the report of the Selection Committee; and
3. Notices and orders of the day, government business.

Mr Swan moved, as an amendment—That the following words be added to the motion:

“4. Questions without notice from 2 to 3.30 p.m.”

Debate ensued.

Question—That the amendment be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 63

Mr Adams	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Ms Roxon
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Andren	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms J. S. McFarlane*	Mr Sawford
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Burke	Ms Grierson	Mr Mossfield	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Mr Murphy	Mr Snowdon
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr Organ	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	Mr Windsor
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr Quick	Mr Zahra
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Mr Ripoll	

## NOES, 73

Mr Abbott	Mr Dutton	Mr P. E. King	Mr Slipper
Mr Anderson	Mrs Elson	Mrs Ley	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Somlyay
Fran Bailey	Mr Farmer	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr Ticehurst
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Tollner
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker	Ms Panopoulos	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Hockey	Mr Pearce	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Ciobo	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Schultz	
Mr Downer	Jackie Kelly	Mr Scott	
Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Secker	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

Question—That the motion be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mrs Draper	Jackie Kelly	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Dutton	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mrs Elson	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr Entsch	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mr Farmer	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr C. P. Thompson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Ticehurst
Mr Brough	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Tollner
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Cameron	Mr Hartsuyker	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Causley	Mr Hawker	Ms Panopoulos	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Charles	Mr Hockey	Mr Pearce	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Ciobo	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cobb	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Mr Jull	Mr Randall	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth

## NOES, 62

Mr Adams	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr Rudd
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Sawford
Mr Andren	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms J. S. McFarlane*	Mr Sciacca
Mr Beazley	Ms George	Ms Macklin	Mr Sercombe
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Mr McLeay	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Ms Burke	Ms Grierson	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Byrne	Mr Griffin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hall	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr Organ	Mr Wilkie
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Ms Plibersek	Mr Windsor
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr Ripoll	
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Ms Roxon	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

### 3 IRAQ—COMMITMENT TO COALITION IN THE GULF

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the motion of Mr Howard (Prime Minister)—That this House:

- (1) condemns Iraq's refusal, over more than 12 years, to abide by 17 resolutions of the United Nations Security Council regarding the threat it poses to international peace and security;
- (2) recognises:
  - (a) that Iraq's continued possession and pursuit of weapons of mass destruction, in defiance of its mandatory obligations under numerous resolutions of the United Nations Security Council, represents a real and unacceptable threat to international peace and security;
  - (b) that Iraq's behaviour weakens the global prohibitions on the spread of weapons of mass destruction, with the potential to damage Australia's security; and
  - (c) that, as more rogue states acquire them, the risk of weapons of mass destruction falling into the hands of terrorists multiplies, thereby presenting a real and direct threat to the security of Australia and the entire international community;
- (3) abhors:
  - (a) Iraq's continued support for international terrorism; and
  - (b) the institutionalised widespread and grave abuse of the human rights of the Iraqi people over many years;
- (4) notes that United Nations Security Council resolutions adopted under Chapter VII of the United Nations Charter, in particular resolutions 678, 687 and 1441, provide clear authority for the use of force against Iraq for the purposes of disarming Iraq of weapons of mass destruction and restoring international peace and security to the region;
- (5) endorses the Government's decision to commit Australian Defence Force elements in the region to the international coalition of military forces prepared to enforce Iraq's compliance with its international obligations under successive resolutions of the United Nations Security Council, with a view to restoring international peace and security in the Middle East region;
- (6) expresses its unequivocal support for the Australian service men and women, and other personnel serving with the international coalition, our full confidence in them and the hope that all will return safely to their homes;
- (7) extends to the innocent people of Iraq its support and sympathy during the military action to disarm Iraq of its weapons of mass destruction and the reconstruction period that will follow; and

(8) notes that the Government is committed to helping the Iraqi people, including through humanitarian assistance, to build a new Iraq at peace with itself and its neighbours—

*And on the amendment moved by Mr Crean (Leader of the Opposition), viz.—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “This House:*

- (1) insists that Iraq must disarm under the authority of the United Nations;
- (2) believes that, in the absence of an agreed UN Security Council resolution authorising military action against Iraq, there is no basis for military action to disarm Iraq, including action involving the Australian Defence Force;
- (3) insists that there should be no commitment of Australian troops to a war in Iraq outside the authority of the United Nations;
- (4) concludes that Australian involvement in a war in Iraq without UN authorisation is not in Australia’s national interests or in the interests of maintaining international peace and security; and
- (5) expresses its confidence in our servicemen and women and our full support for them and their families”—

Debate resumed.

---

*Suspension of standing and sessional orders moved*

Mr Crean (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving: “That this House:

- (1) notes the comments of the US Homeland Security Secretary, Tom Ridge, overnight that: ‘*The Intelligence Community believes that terrorists will attempt multiple attacks against U.S. and Coalition targets worldwide in the event of a U.S-led military campaign against Saddam Hussein*’;
- (2) insists that the Prime Minister and Minister for Foreign Affairs explain to Australians the increased terrorist threats to all of us from the Prime Minister’s and the Government’s decision to commit Australia to war without the authority of the United Nations;
- (3) insists that the Manager of Government Business explain his statement to the House last night that the Prime Minister’s decision to commit Australia to war in Iraq without the authorisation of the United Nations would increase the terrorist risks to Australia—something which the Prime Minister and the Government have refused to tell the Australian people the truth about;
- (4) recalls that the Government was asked about this issue on three occasions this year with no answers and demands that the Prime Minister immediately come into the Parliament and explain to Australians the heightened terrorist threat for Australia of the Government’s decision to commit Australia to war in Iraq without the authorisation of the United Nations; and
- (5) calls on the Prime Minister to immediately outline the urgent steps being taken by his Government to protect Australia and Australians from the increased terrorist threats to Australia from his decision to commit Australia to war without the authority of the United Nations”.

Mr Rudd (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member*

Mr Abbott (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Ms Corcoran, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Mr Anderson	Mrs Draper	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mr McArthur*	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Bartlett	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mr Ticehurst
Mr B. K. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mr Nairn	Mr Tollner
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Haase	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hartsuyker	Ms Panopoulos	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Hawker	Mr Pearce	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Ciobo	Mr Jull	Mr Randall	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Jackie Kelly	Mr Schultz	

## NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms J. S. McFarlane*	Mr Sawford
Mr Albanese	Ms George	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Mr Organ	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms Plibersek	Mr Windsor
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Mr Ripoll	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Ms Roxon	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Ms Corcoran, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 61

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms J. S. McFarlane*	Mr Sawford
Mr Albanese	Ms George	Ms Macklin	Mr Sciacca
Mr Beazley	Mr Gibbons	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Brereton	Ms Grierson	Mr Melham	Mr S. F. Smith
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Cox	Mr Hatton	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Ms Hoare	Mr B. P. O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Danby*	Mrs Irwin	Mr G. M. O'Connor	Ms Vamvakinou
Mr Edwards	Ms Jackson	Mr Organ	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Ms Plibersek	Mr Windsor
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Evans	Ms C. F. King	Mr Ripoll	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Ms Roxon	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd	

## NOES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott
Mr Anderson	Mrs Draper	Mr P. E. King	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Dutton	Mrs Ley	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr A. D. H. Smith
Mr Baird	Mr Entsch	Mr McArthur*	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baldwin	Mr Farmer	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest*	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Bartlett	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mr Ticehurst
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mr Nairn	Mr Tollner
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Haase	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hartsuyker	Ms Panopoulos	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mr Hawker	Mr Pearce	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Hunt	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Johnson	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Ciobo	Mr Jull	Mr Randall	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Jackie Kelly	Mr Schultz	

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

---

Debate continued.

*Member ordered to withdraw*

At 5.47 p.m. the Member for Grayndler (Mr Albanese) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a warning had been given from the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Debate continued.

Mr Nairn addressing the House—

---

*Adjournment negatived*

It being 7.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Mr Entsch (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Industry, Tourism and Resources) requiring the question to be put forthwith without debate—

Question—put and negatived.

---

Mr Nairn continued his speech.

Debate continued.

Debate adjourned (Mr Bevis), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**4 SELECTION COMMITTEE—REPORT**

Mr Causley (Chair) presented the following paper:

Selection Committee—Report relating to the consideration of committee and delegation reports and private Members' business on Monday, 24 March 2003.

**5 ADJOURNMENT**

Fran Bailey (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Defence) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 7.58 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 9 a.m.

---

---

**PAPERS**

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 19 March 2003:

Public Service Act—Public Service Commissioner's Directions—2003 Amendment (No. 1).

Telecommunications Act 1997—Notice—2003 Telecommunications Labelling (Customer equipment and customer cabling) Amendment (No. 1).

---

---

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mrs Crosio\*, Mr Howard, Mrs Hull, Dr Lawrence, Ms Livermore\* and Mr Lloyd\*.

\* On leave

---

---

**I. C. HARRIS**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives

2002-03

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 82

**MAIN COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

WEDNESDAY, 19 MARCH 2003

---

1 Due to a division having been called in the House, the Main Committee met at 9.46 a.m.

**2 MEMBERS' STATEMENTS**

Members' statements were made.

**3 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 2002-2003**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr McMullan, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House condemns the Government for its failures in economic management, and in particular its failings in relation to both income and expenditure policies because:

- (1) it is the highest taxing Government in Australian history, and:
  - (a) has imposed the highest level ever of income tax;
  - (b) is responsible for introducing the biggest new tax in our history; and
  - (c) is addicted to imposing ever more taxes and special levies;
- (2) it has failed to deliver on its basic responsibilities to the Australian people, for example:
  - (a) bulk billing has collapsed;
  - (b) there is chronic under-investment in our public schools, TAFE colleges and universities;
  - (c) the struggle to balance work and family life continues to get harder; and
  - (d) entry level housing is becoming even less affordable for struggling Australian families; and
- (3) despite the record tax take, and in spite of declining Government services, the Government has failed to keep the Budget in surplus after nearly a decade of strong economic growth, in that:
  - (a) it broke its unequivocal promise to keep the Budget in surplus in 2001-02;
  - (b) future surpluses are dependent on the additional revenue provided by bracket creep;
  - (c) it has presided over enormous waste and mismanagement including billions of dollars of foreign exchange losses and defence procurement losses; and
  - (d) it has lost control over expenditure necessitating wholesale changes to the budgetary management system”—

Debate resumed.

---

*Suspension of sitting*

At 12.56 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of sitting*

At 1.15 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---



Debate continued.

---

*Suspension of sitting*

At 1.30 p.m., the Deputy Speaker left the Chair.

*Resumption of sitting*

At 4.01 p.m., the Deputy Speaker resumed the Chair.

---

Debate continued.

Debate adjourned (Mr Hawker), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

4 **ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Mr Hawker, the Main Committee adjourned at 7.28 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 9.40 a.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

---

---

**B. C. WRIGHT**  
Clerk of the Main Committee