

1998-1999-2000

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 137

WEDNESDAY, 6 SEPTEMBER 2000



1 The House met, at 9.30 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **NATIONAL HEALTH AMENDMENT (IMPROVED MONITORING OF ENTITLEMENTS TO PHARMACEUTICAL BENEFITS) BILL 2000**

Dr Wooldridge (Minister for Health and Aged Care), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *National Health Act 1953* to improve the monitoring of entitlements to pharmaceutical benefits, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Dr Wooldridge moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper*

Dr Wooldridge presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Horne), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

3 **POSTPONEMENT OF NOTICE**

Ordered—That notice No. 2, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

4 **COMMONWEALTH ELECTORAL AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 1) 2000**

Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *Commonwealth Electoral Act 1918*, and for other purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Slipper moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper*

Mr Slipper presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr Horne), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**5 STATES GRANTS (PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION ASSISTANCE)  
BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Lee, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words:

“whilst not declining to give the bill a second reading, the House:

- (1) notes that the preliminary data available suggest that the proposed distribution of funding among non-government schools is profoundly unfair;
- (2) is of the opinion that, before the bill is debated, the Government must provide detailed, final figures on the cost of the policy changes contained in the bill and the new funding figures for each non-government school; and
- (3) condemns the Government for:
  - (a) failing to provide a matching increase in funding for government schools; and
  - (b) continuing its unfair Enrolment Benchmark Adjustment policy”—

Debate resumed.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Nehl, in the Chair)—

AYES, 73

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lieberman	Mr Secker
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Somlyay
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Ms Worth
Mr Downer	Jackie Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	
Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr St Clair	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lawler	Mr Scott	

## NOES, 62

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms Macklin	Mr Rudd
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Sciacca
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Dr Martin	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Morris	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

*Messages from the Governor-General*

The following messages from His Excellency the Governor-General were announced:

No. 234, 27 June 2000, recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the Bill; and

No. 235, 4 September 2000, recommending an appropriation for the purposes of amendments to the Bill.

*Consideration in detail*

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

Dr Kemp (Minister for Education, Training and Youth Affairs), by leave, moved Government amendments (1) to (4) together.

Debate continued.

Amendments agreed to.

Dr Kemp, by leave, moved Government amendments (5) and (6) together.

Debate continued.

Mr Lee having sought to move an amendment—

*Deputy Speaker's ruling:* The Deputy Speaker ruled that the proposed amendment was out of order as it would involve an increase in the appropriation of revenue and thus, if successful, would run contrary to the constitutional and parliamentary principle of the financial initiative of the Crown.

Mr Lee addressing the House—

*Closure*

Mr Ronaldson (Chief Government Whip) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Nehl, in the Chair)—

AYES, 72

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lawler	Mr St Clair
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Secker
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Slipper
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Somlyay
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth

NOES, 61

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Ms Roxon
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Rudd
Mr Andren	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Mr McLeay	Mr Sciacca
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Dr Martin	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Mr Morris	Mr Smith
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Horne	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr O'Connor	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Ms Plibersek	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Price	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Quick	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Ripoll	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the amendments be agreed to—was put accordingly, and passed.

Dr Kemp, by leave, moved Government amendments (7) to (10) together.

Debate continued.

Mr Latham addressing the House—

*Closure*

Mr Ronaldson moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Nehl, in the Chair)—

AYES, 73

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Secker
Mr Anderson	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Somlyay
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Dr Southcott
Fran Bailey	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Stone
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Dr Washer
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Causley	Mr Katter	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Costello	Dr Kemp	Mr Ruddock	
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr St Clair	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz	

## NOES, 62

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Ripoll
Mr Andren	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Ms Roxon
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Mr Rudd
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Dr Martin	Mr Smith
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mr Crean	Mr Horne	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Zahra
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Ms Plibersek	
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the amendments be agreed to—was put accordingly, and passed.

Dr Kemp moved Government amendment (11).

Debate continued.

Mr Lee addressing the House—

*Closure*

Mr Ronaldson moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Nehl, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 72

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Dr Stone
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr C. P. Thompson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	Ms Worth

## NOES, 62

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Ms Roxon
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Rudd
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Ms Plibersek	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the amendment be agreed to—was put accordingly, and passed.

Question proposed—That the bill as amended be agreed to—

*Closure*

Mr Ronaldson moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Nehl, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 72

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Dr Stone
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr C. P. Thompson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair	Ms Worth

## NOES, 62

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Ms Roxon
Mr Breton	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Rudd
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Ms Plibersek	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley



And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—that the Bill as amended be agreed to—was put accordingly, and passed.

*Paper*

Dr Kemp presented a supplementary explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Consideration in detail concluded.

Dr Kemp asked leave to move—That the Bill be now read a third time.

Objection being raised, leave not granted.

Dr Kemp, pursuant to contingent notice, moved—That so much of the standing orders be suspended as would prevent the motion for the third reading being moved without delay.

Mr Lee rising to address the House—

*Closure*

Mr Ronaldson moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Nehl, in the Chair)—

AYES, 74

Mr Abbott	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Secker
Mr Anderson	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Somlyay
Fran Bailey	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Mr Neville	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Prosser	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cameron	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mr Katter	Mr Reith	Dr Washer
Mr Charles	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Williams
Mr Costello	Dr Kemp	Mr Ruddock	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr St Clair	Ms Worth
Mr Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz	
Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott	

## NOES, 62

Mr Adams	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Ms Roxon
Mr Brereton	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Rudd
Ms Burke	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Byrne	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Ms Corcoran	Mr Hatton	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Mr Cox	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Snowdon
Mrs Crosio	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Swan
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr Tanner
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Ms O'Byrne	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilkie
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Zahra
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Ms Plibersek	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That so much of the standing orders be suspended as would prevent the motion for the third reading being moved without delay—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 75

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lieberman	Mr Schultz
Mr Anderson	Mr Fahey	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fischer	Mr Lloyd	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Forrest*	Mr McArthur*	Mr Somlyay
Fran Bailey	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Southcott
Mr Baird	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Stone
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mr Billson	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Jackie Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth
Mrs Elson	Mr Lawler	Mr St Clair	

## NOES, 57

Mr Adams	Ms Gerick	Ms Livermore	Mr Quick
Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Mr McClelland	Mr Ripoll
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Ms Roxon
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Byrne	Mr Hatton	Dr Martin	Mr Sidebottom
Ms Corcoran	Ms Hoare	Mr Melham	Mr Snowdon
Mr Cox	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Swan
Mr Crean	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Edwards	Ms Kernot	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Wilkie
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Mr Zahra
Mr Emerson	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe	
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Ms Plibersek	
Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr Lee	Mr Price	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard                      Mr Beazley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Dr Kemp moved—That the Bill be now read a third time.

It being past 2 p.m., the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 101A, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

**6 QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice being asked—

*Paper*

Mr Anderson (Acting Prime Minister) presented the following paper:

FAA Safety Recommendations 99.400 and 99.401—Letter from Mr Harold W. Donner, Acting Director of Accident Investigation, US Department of Transportation to Mr L. Brown, Bureau of Air Safety Investigation, 21 March 2000.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Paper*

Mr Costello (Treasurer) presented the following paper:

Minority Report—Senator Kernot.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Member ordered to withdraw*

At 3.32 p.m. the Member for Maribyrnong (Mr Sercombe) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a warning had been given from the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Questions without notice continued.

**7 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORT**

The Speaker presented the following paper:

Auditor-General—Audit report No. 9 of 1999-2000—Performance Audit—Implementation of Whole-of-Government Information Technology Infrastructure Consolidation and Outsourcing Initiative.

Ordered to be printed.

**8 PAPERS**

The following papers were presented:

Industry Research and Development Board—Report for 1999-2000.

Workplace Relations Act—Agreement making under the Workplace Relations Act—Report for 1998 and 1999.

**9 PAPERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPERS**

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the House take note of the following papers:

Industry Research and Development Board—Report for 1999-2000.

Workplace Relations Act—Agreement making under the Workplace Relations Act—Report for 1998 and 1999.

Debate adjourned (Mr McMullan), and the resumption of each debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**10 NATURAL HERITAGE TRUST MID-TERM REVIEW—MINISTERIAL STATEMENT AND PAPER**

Mr Truss (Minister for Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry), by leave, made a ministerial statement on the Natural Heritage Trust Mid-term review and presented the following paper:

Natural Heritage Trust—Mid-term review of the Natural Heritage Trust—Response by the Natural Heritage Ministerial Board, 6 September 2000.

Mr O'Connor, by leave, also made a statement with reference to the matter.

**11 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—KNOWLEDGE NATION**

The House was informed that Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The need for the Government to respond positively to the series of current reports which are recommending ways for Australia to develop itself as a Knowledge Nation".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Beazley addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

**12 THERAPEUTIC GOODS AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 3) 2000—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE**

The Deputy Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr Scott (Minister for Veterans' Affairs), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

**13 CRIMINAL CODE AMENDMENT (UNITED NATIONS AND ASSOCIATED PERSONNEL) BILL 2000—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE**

The Deputy Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Mr Scott (Minister for Veterans' Affairs), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

**14 STATES GRANTS (PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION ASSISTANCE) BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a third time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a third time.

**15 POSTPONEMENT OF ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Ordered—That orders of the day Nos 2 and 3, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

**16 PUBLIC WORKS—PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE—REFERENCE OF WORK—PROPOSED RESERVE BANK OF AUSTRALIA HEAD OFFICE BUILDING WORKS, SYDNEY**

Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), pursuant to notice, moved—That, in accordance with the provisions of the *Public Works Committee Act 1969*, the following proposed work be referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Public Works for consideration and report: Proposed Reserve Bank of Australia Head Office building works, Sydney.

Question—put and passed.

**17 NATIONAL CRIME AUTHORITY—PARLIAMENTARY JOINT COMMITTEE—REPORT—STATEMENT BY MEMBER**

Mr Nugent (Chair) presented the following papers:

National Crime Authority—Parliamentary Joint Committee—Witnesses for the prosecution: Protected witnesses in the National Crime Authority.

Report, September 2000.

Evidence received by the committee.

Ordered—That the report be printed.

Mr Nugent, by leave, made a statement in connection with the report.

**18 NATIVE TITLE AND THE ABORIGINAL AND TORRES STRAIT ISLANDER LAND FUND—PARLIAMENTARY JOINT COMMITTEE—REPORT—STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS**

Mr Snowdon presented the following papers:

Native Title and the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Land Fund—Parliamentary Joint Committee—Examination of annual reports 1998-99.

Report, September 2000.

Evidence received by the committee.

Ordered—That the report be printed.

Mr Snowdon and Mr Haase, by leave, made statements in connection with the report.

**19 FAMILY AND COMMUNITY SERVICES AND VETERANS' AFFAIRS LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (DEBT RECOVERY) BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr Swan who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words:

“whilst not declining to give the bill a second reading, the House:

- (1) condemns the Government for the way it has misused compliance and debt processes to brand average families and other decent Australians as welfare cheats;
- (2) condemns the Government in particular for the application of a cold-hearted, zero tolerance policy against families that sees substantial debts raised against people whose only error is their inability to predict future income to the exact dollar;
- (3) calls on the Government, in the spirit of the McClure Report, to make sanctions and penalties a last rather than a first resort, and to turn its attention to the restoration of essential capacity building programs that help people move from welfare to work; and
- (4) calls, above all else, for a change of heart from the Government and a positive approach that provides real opportunities for those with a capacity to work to do so, while affording dignity to those whose circumstances prevent it”.

Debate continued.

Mr Anthony (Minister for Community Services) was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for next sitting.

**20 BILL REFERRED TO MAIN COMMITTEE**

Mr Ronaldson (Chief Government Whip), by leave, moved—That the Health Insurance Amendment (Rural and Remote Area Medical Practitioners) Bill 2000 be referred to the Main Committee for further consideration.

Question—put and passed.

**21 ADJOURNMENT**

Mr McGauran (Minister for the Arts and the Centenary of Federation) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

The House continuing to sit until 8 p.m.—The Speaker adjourned the House until tomorrow at 9.30 a.m.

---

---

**PAPERS**

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 6 September 2000:

Health Insurance Act—Instrument—2000 Health Insurance (Accredited Pathology Laboratories—Approval) Amendment Principles No. 2.

Jervis Bay Territory Acceptance Act—Ordinance—Fee Determination No. 1 of 2000.

Parliamentary Entitlements Act—Advice of decisions under paragraph 18(b) 5 September 2000.

Radiocommunications Act—  
Determinations—2000—

Radiocommunications (Third Party Users—Apparatus Licence) Amendment.

Radiocommunications (Third Party Users—Apparatus Licence) Amendment No. 2.

Radiocommunications (Trading Rules for Spectrum Licences) Amendment.

Rules—2000—Radiocommunications (Third Party Users—Spectrum Licence).

Tradex Scheme Act—Forms—Approvals of application form and supplement for Tradex order—23 June, 8(2) August.

---

---

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Danby, Mr Hollis\* and Mr Howard.

\* On leave

---

---

**I. C. HARRIS**

Clerk of the House of Representatives

1998-1999-2000

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 137

**MAIN COMMITTEE****MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

WEDNESDAY, 6 SEPTEMBER 2000



1 The Main Committee met at 9.40 a.m.

**2 MEMBERS' STATEMENTS**

Members' statements were made.

**3 THERAPEUTIC GOODS AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 3) 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the second reading—Mrs B. K. Bishop (Minister for Aged Care) moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper*

Mrs B. K. Bishop presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

**4 CRIMINAL CODE AMENDMENT (UNITED NATIONS AND ASSOCIATED PERSONNEL) BILL 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

*Consideration in detail*

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole and agreed to, after debate.

Consideration in detail concluded.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.



Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

**5 POSTPONEMENT OF ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Ordered—That orders of the day Nos 3 and 4, government business, be postponed until the next sitting.

**6 STANDING COMMITTEE ON EMPLOYMENT, EDUCATION AND WORKPLACE RELATIONS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the motion of Dr Nelson—That the House take note of the paper (*presented on 14 August 2000*), viz.:

Standing Committee on Employment, Education and Workplace Relations—Report—Age Counts: Issues specific to mature-age workers—Report, August 2000—

Debate resumed.

---

*Suspension of sitting*

At 11.26 a.m, a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of sitting*

At 11.38 a.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---

Debate continued.

Ms Kernot was granted leave to continue her speech when the debate is resumed.

Debate adjourned and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**7 ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Mr Somlyay, the Main Committee adjourned at 12.49 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 9.40 a.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

---

---

**B. C. WRIGHT**  
Clerk of the Main Committee