

1998-1999-2000

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 97

TUESDAY, 14 MARCH 2000

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

**2 QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice being asked—

*Member ordered to withdraw*

At 2.11 p.m. the Member for Shortland (Ms Hall) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a warning had been given from the Chair, and she accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Paper*

Mr Costello (Treasurer) presented the following paper:

National Competition Policy payments—Copy of letter from Michael Egan, New South Wales Treasurer to Mr Thomas George, MP, Member for Lismore, 22 December 1999.

Questions without notice continuing—

*Papers*

Mrs B. K. Bishop (Minister for Aged Care) presented the following papers:

Aged care standards—Copies of—

Aged Care Standards Agency—Riverside Nursing Home—

Review audit report, 16 and 17 February 2000.

Serious risk report, 18 February 2000.

Transcript of interview with Professor Gary Andrews, Flinders University on radio station 5AN, 13 March 2000.

Questions without notice continued.

### 3 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORT

The Speaker presented the following paper:

Auditor-General—Audit report No. 33 of 1999-2000—Performance audit—Administration of business entry program: Department of Immigration and Multicultural Affairs.

Ordered to be printed.

### 4 PAPERS

The following papers were presented:

Bundanon Trust—Report for 1998-99.

Queensland Fisheries Joint Authority—Report for 1998-99.

### 5 TRADE MISSION TO THE GULF—MINISTERIAL STATEMENT—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER

Mr M. A. J. Vaile (Minister for Trade), by leave, made a ministerial statement on his trade mission to the Gulf.

Mr Brereton, by leave, also made a statement with reference to the matter.

*Paper*

Mr M. A. J. Vaile presented the following paper:

Trade mission to the Gulf, 24 February to 5 March 2000—Ministerial statement, 14 March 2000—

and moved—That the House take note of the paper.

Debate adjourned (Mr Martin), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

### 6 DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—GOODS AND SERVICES TAX

The House was informed that Mr Albanese had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The failure of the Government to address the concerns of long term residents of caravan parks regarding the impact of the GST”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr Albanese addressed the House.

Discussion ensued.

Discussion concluded.

### 7 MATTERS REFERRED TO MAIN COMMITTEE

Mr Ronaldson (Chief Government Whip), by leave, moved—That:

(1) the following Bills be referred to the Main Committee for further consideration:

Road Transport Charges (Australian Capital Territory) Amendment 2000;

Interstate Road Transport Charge Amendment 2000; and

Interstate Road Transport Amendment 2000; and

- (2) the following orders of the day, committee and delegation reports, be referred to the Main Committee for debate:

Standing Committee on Primary Industries and Regional Services—Report on shaping regional Australia's future—Motion to take note of paper: Resumption of debate; and

Standing Committee on Economics, Finance and Public Administration—Interim report on review of the Reserve Bank of Australia annual report 1998–99—Motion to take note of paper: Resumption of debate.

Question—put and passed.

#### **8 SELECTION COMMITTEE—REPORT**

Mr Nehl (Chair) presented the following paper:

Selection Committee—Report relating to the consideration of committee and delegation reports and private Members' business on Monday, 3 April 2000.

#### **9 MESSAGES FROM THE SENATE**

Messages from the Senate, 13 March 2000, were reported returning the following Bills without amendment:

Message—

No. 318—Superannuation Supervisory Levy Determination Validation 1999.

No. 319—Life Insurance Supervisory Levy Determination Validation 1999.

No. 320—Authorised Non-operating Holding Companies Supervisory Levy Determination Validation 1999.

No. 321—General Insurance Supervisory Levy Determination Validation 1999.

No. 322—Retirement Savings Account Providers Supervisory Levy Determination Validation 1999.

#### **10 POSTPONEMENT OF ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Ordered—That orders of the day Nos 1 to 3, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

#### **11 MIGRATION LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 2000**

Mr Ruddock (Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs), pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend the law relating to migration, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Mr Ruddock moved—That the Bill be now read a second time.

*Paper*

Mr Ruddock presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Debate adjourned (Mr M. J. Ferguson), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**12 TAXATION LAWS AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 5) 2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr K. J. Thomson, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words:

“whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House:

- (1) expresses its concern with the fundamental unfairness of the Government’s approach to taxation generally and the fundamental unfairness of a goods and services tax, including the heavy compliance burden on small business, and in particular the Government’s decision to tax health items including, for the first time in fifty years, taxing tampons and sanitary pads; and
- (2) calls on the Treasurer to amend the GST legislation or the Minister for Health to honour the Government’s pre-election promise that health products would be GST-free by including tampons and sanitary pads in the Minister’s determination”—

Debate continued.

Ms Gillard was granted leave to continue her speech when the debate is resumed.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

**13 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 1999-2000—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE**

The Deputy Speaker reported that the Main Committee had returned the Bill for further consideration (*see item No. 2, Minutes of Proceedings of the Main Committee*), and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Debate resumed on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Tanner (see item No. 2, Minutes of Proceedings of the Main Committee)*—

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Adams, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 76

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr St Clair
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Schultz
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McArthur*	Mr Secker
Fran Bailey	Mr Forrest*	Mr I. E. Macfarlane	Mr Slipper
Mr Baird	Mrs Gallus	Mr McGauran	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mrs May	Dr Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Moore	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr C. P. Thompson
Mrs B. K. Bishop	Mr Haase	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Ms J. I. Bishop	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cameron	Mrs Hull	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Mr Jull	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mr Katter	Mr Pyne	Dr Washer
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Draper	Mr Lawler	Mr Ruddock	Ms Worth

## NOES, 62

Mr Albanese	Mr Gibbons	Ms J. S. McFarlane	Ms Roxon
Mr Bevis	Ms Gillard	Ms Macklin	Mr Rudd
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Ms Burke	Ms Hall	Mr McMullan	Mr Sciacca
Mr Byrne	Ms Hoare	Mr Martin	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Cox	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr Sidebottom
Mrs Crosio	Mr Horne	Mr Morris	Mr Smith
Mr Danby	Mrs Irwin	Mr Mossfield	Mr Snowdon
Mr Edwards	Mr Jenkins	Mr Murphy	Mr Swan
Ms Ellis	Ms Kernot	Ms O'Byrne	Mr Tanner
Dr Emerson	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	Dr Theophanous
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe	Mr Wilkie
Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Ms Plibersek	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Price	Mr Zahra
Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Livermore	Mr Quick	
Ms Gerick	Mr McClelland	Mr Ripoll	

\* Tellers

*Pairs*

Mr Howard	Mr Beazley
Jackie Kelly	Mr Hatton

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), the Bill was read a third time.

#### 14 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 4) 1999-2000—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Deputy Speaker reported that the Main Committee had returned the Bill for further consideration (*see item No. 3, Minutes of Proceedings of the Main Committee*), and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), the Bill was read a third time.

#### 15 CORPORATIONS LAW AMENDMENT (EMPLOYEE ENTITLEMENTS) BILL 2000

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr K. J. Thomson, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words:

“the House is of the opinion that the Bill is a most inadequate measure and condemns the Government for its failure to introduce measures to adequately protect employee entitlements”—

Debate resumed.

Ms Roxon addressing the House—

---

#### 16 ADJOURNMENT

It being 10.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

The House continuing to sit until 11 p.m.—The Deputy Speaker adjourned the House until tomorrow at 9.30 a.m.

---

#### PAPERS

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 14 March 2000:

Civil Aviation Act—Civil Aviation Regulations—Civil Aviation Orders—Amendments—2000—

Part 39-105—17 February, 2(3), 6(2), 9(3) March.

Part 40—10 March.

Instruments—2000—No. CASA 81.

---

---

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Hatton, Jackie Kelly\* and Mr Somlyay.

\* On leave

---

---

**I. C. HARRIS**  
Clerk of the House of Representatives

1998-1999-2000

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 97

**MAIN COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

**TUESDAY, 14 MARCH 2000**

---

1 The Main Committee met at 4 p.m.

**2 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 3) 1999-2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr Tanner, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not denying the Bill a second reading, the House condemns:

- (1) the Government for its abdication of Commonwealth responsibility for appropriate national funding of health, education and other essential community services;
- (2) the recent statements by the Prime Minister indicating that Specific Purpose Payments to the States will be reduced as part of the introduction of the new tax system, breaking both his promise to the Australian people and to State and Territory leaders; and
- (3) the Government’s failure to abide by the independent arbitration process regarding the indexation of the Australian Health Care Agreement’s payments to the States for public hospitals”—

Debate resumed.

Mrs Elson moved—That further proceedings on the Bill be conducted in the House.

Question—put and passed.

**3 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 4) 1999-2000**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Mrs Elson moved—That further proceedings on the Bill be conducted in the House.

Question—put and passed.



**4 ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Mrs Elson, the Main Committee adjourned at 5.27 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 9.40 a.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.



**B. C. WRIGHT**

Clerk of the Main Committee