

1998-99

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 56

THURSDAY, 12 AUGUST 1999



1 The House met, at 9.30 a.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Neil Andrew) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—GEELONG ROAD**

Message No. 171, 11 August 1999, from the Senate was reported acquainting the House that the Senate had agreed to a resolution concerning the Geelong Road linking Melbourne and Geelong.

Mr McGauran (Minister for the Arts and the Centenary of Federation) moved—
That the message be considered at the next sitting.

Question—put.

The House proceeding to a division and the division not further proceeded with—

Question—passed.

3 **ABORIGINAL LAND RIGHTS (NORTHERN TERRITORY) AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 2) 1999**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mrs Crosio, in the Chair)—

AYES, 76

| | | | |
|------------------|-----------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Mr Abbott | Mrs Elson | Mr Lawler | Mr St Clair |
| Mr Anderson | Mr Entsch | Mr Lieberman | Mr Schultz |
| Mr K. J. Andrews | Mr Fahey | Mr Lloyd | Mr Scott |
| Mr Anthony | Mr Fischer | Mr McArthur* | Mr Secker |
| Fran Bailey | Mr Forrest* | Mr I. E. Macfarlane | Mr Slipper |
| Mr Baird | Mrs Gallus | Mr McGauran | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Barresi | Ms Gambaro | Mrs May | Dr Southcott |
| Mr Bartlett | Mrs Gash | Mr Moore | Dr Stone |
| Mr Billson | Mr Georgiou | Mrs Moylan | Mr C. P. Thompson |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Haase | Mr Nairn | Mr A. P. Thomson |
| Ms J. I. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave | Mr Nehl | Mr Truss |
| Mr Brough | Mr Hawker | Dr Nelson | Mr Tuckey |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Hockey | Mr Neville | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Cameron | Mrs Hull | Mr Nugent | Mrs D. S. Vale |
| Mr Causley | Mr Jull | Mr Prosser | Mr Wakelin |
| Mr Charles | Mr Katter | Mr Pyne | Dr Washer |
| Mr Costello | Mrs D. M. Kelly | Mr Reith | Mr Williams |
| Mr Downer | Jackie Kelly | Mr Ronaldson | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mrs Draper | Dr Kemp | Mr Ruddock | Ms Worth |

NOES, 65

| | | | |
|----------------------|---------------|--------------------|------------------|
| Mr Adams | Ms Gerick | Ms J. S. McFarlane | Mr Rudd |
| Mr Albanese | Mr Gibbons | Ms Macklin | Mr Sawford* |
| Mr Andren | Ms Gillard | Mr McLeay | Mr Sciacca |
| Mr Bevis | Mr Griffin | Mr McMullan | Mr Sercombe* |
| Mr Breerton | Ms Hall | Mr Martin | Mr Sidebottom |
| Ms Burke | Mr Hatton | Mr Melham | Mr Smith |
| Mr Cox | Ms Hoare | Mr Morris | Mr Snowdon |
| Mr Crean | Mr Hollis | Mr Mossfield | Mr Swan |
| Mr Danby | Mr Horne | Mr Murphy | Mr Tanner |
| Mr Edwards | Mrs Irwin | Ms O'Byrne | Dr Theophanous |
| Ms Ellis | Mr Jenkins | Mr O'Connor | Mr K. J. Thomson |
| Dr Emerson | Ms Kernot | Mr O'Keefe | Mr Wilkie |
| Mr G. J. Evans | Mr Kerr | Ms Plibersek | Mr Wilton |
| Mr M. J. Evans | Mr Latham | Mr Price | Mr Zahra |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Dr Lawrence | Mr Quick | |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson | Ms Livermore | Mr Ripoll | |
| Mr Fitzgibbon | Mr McClelland | Ms Roxon | |

* Tellers

Pairs

| | |
|------------|------------|
| Mr Howard | Mr Beazley |
| Mr Lindsay | Mr Lee |

And so it was resolved in the affirmative—Bill read a second time.

Message from the Governor-General

Message No. 101, 31 March 1999, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the Bill.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Ruddock (Minister representing the Minister for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Affairs), the Bill was read a third time.

4 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED

Mr O'Connor moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Member for Corio moving forthwith—That Senate message No. 171 be brought on for debate forthwith in order that the House:

- (1) endorse the inclusion of the Geelong Road as part of the national highway system and that the Commonwealth Government matches the Labor Party's commitment to fund half of the costs of the necessary upgrade to bring the road up to national highway system standards;
- (2) note that the Geelong Road is Victoria's most deadly highway with 87 fatalities since 1990 and that in that same period there have been 6000 car accidents resulting in 1000 injuries;
- (3) recognise that the Geelong Road carries over 100,000 vehicles a day and is a vital economic link servicing the ports of Melbourne and Geelong which carry 40 per cent of Australia's exports; and
- (4) concur with Senate message No. 171.

Closure of Member

Dr Wooldridge (Minister for Health and Aged Care) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mrs Crosio, in the Chair)—

AYES, 76

| | | | |
|------------------|-----------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Mr Abbott | Mrs Elson | Mr Lawler | Mr St Clair |
| Mr Anderson | Mr Entsch | Mr Lieberman | Mr Schultz |
| Mr K. J. Andrews | Mr Fahey | Mr Lloyd | Mr Scott |
| Mr Anthony | Mr Fischer | Mr McArthur* | Mr Secker |
| Fran Bailey | Mr Forrest* | Mr I. E. Macfarlane | Mr Slipper |
| Mr Baird | Mrs Gallus | Mr McGauran | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Barresi | Ms Gambaro | Mrs May | Dr Southcott |
| Mr Bartlett | Mrs Gash | Mr Moore | Dr Stone |
| Mr Billson | Mr Georgiou | Mrs Moylan | Mr C. P. Thompson |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Haase | Mr Nairn | Mr A. P. Thomson |
| Ms J. I. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave | Mr Nehl | Mr Truss |
| Mr Brough | Mr Hawker | Dr Nelson | Mr Tuckey |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Hockey | Mr Neville | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Cameron | Mrs Hull | Mr Nugent | Mrs D. S. Vale |
| Mr Causley | Mr Jull | Mr Prosser | Mr Wakelin |
| Mr Charles | Mr Katter | Mr Pyne | Dr Washer |
| Mr Costello | Mrs D. M. Kelly | Mr Reith | Mr Williams |
| Mr Downer | Jackie Kelly | Mr Ronaldson | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mr Draper | Dr Kemp | Mr Ruddock | Ms Worth |

NOES, 64

| | | | |
|----------------------|--------------|--------------------|------------------|
| Mr Adams | Ms Gerick | Mr McClelland | Mr Ripoll |
| Mr Albanese | Mr Gibbons | Ms J. S. McFarlane | Ms Roxon |
| Mr Bevis | Ms Gillard | Ms Macklin | Mr Rudd |
| Mr Brereton | Mr Griffin | Mr McLeay | Mr Sawford* |
| Ms Burke | Ms Hall | Mr McMullan | Mr Sciacca |
| Mr Cox | Mr Hatton | Mr Martin | Mr Sercombe* |
| Mr Crean | Ms Hoare | Mr Melham | Mr Sidebottom |
| Mr Danby | Mr Hollis | Mr Morris | Mr Smith |
| Mr Edwards | Mr Horne | Mr Mossfield | Mr Snowdon |
| Ms Ellis | Mrs Irwin | Mr Murphy | Mr Swan |
| Dr Emerson | Mr Jenkins | Ms O'Byrne | Mr Tanner |
| Mr G. J. Evans | Ms Kernot | Mr O'Connor | Dr Theophanous |
| Mr M. J. Evans | Mr Kerr | Mr O'Keefe | Mr K. J. Thomson |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Latham | Ms Plibersek | Mr Wilkie |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson | Dr Lawrence | Mr Price | Mr Wilton |
| Mr Fitzgibbon | Ms Livermore | Mr Quick | Mr Zahra |

* Tellers

Pairs

| | |
|------------|------------|
| Mr Howard | Mr Beazley |
| Mr Lindsay | Mr Lee |

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Ms Gillard (seconder) addressing the House—

Closure of Member

Dr Wooldridge moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mrs Crosio, in the Chair)—

AYES, 76

| | | | |
|------------------|-----------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Mr Abbott | Mrs Elson | Mr Lawler | Mr St Clair |
| Mr Anderson | Mr Entsch | Mr Lieberman | Mr Schultz |
| Mr K. J. Andrews | Mr Fahey | Mr Lloyd | Mr Scott |
| Mr Anthony | Mr Fischer | Mr McArthur* | Mr Secker |
| Fran Bailey | Mr Forrest* | Mr I. E. Macfarlane | Mr Slipper |
| Mr Baird | Mrs Gallus | Mr McGauran | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Barresi | Ms Gambaro | Mrs May | Dr Southcott |
| Mr Bartlett | Mrs Gash | Mr Moore | Dr Stone |
| Mr Billson | Mr Georgiou | Mrs Moylan | Mr C. P. Thompson |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Haase | Mr Nairn | Mr A. P. Thomson |
| Ms J. I. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave | Mr Nehl | Mr Truss |
| Mr Brough | Mr Hawker | Dr Nelson | Mr Tuckey |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Hockey | Mr Neville | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Cameron | Mrs Hull | Mr Nugent | Mrs D. S. Vale |
| Mr Causley | Mr Jull | Mr Prosser | Mr Wakelin |
| Mr Charles | Mr Katter | Mr Pyne | Dr Washer |
| Mr Costello | Mrs D. M. Kelly | Mr Reith | Mr Williams |
| Mr Downer | Jackie Kelly | Mr Ronaldson | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mr Draper | Dr Kemp | Mr Ruddock | Ms Worth |

NOES, 64

| | | | |
|----------------------|--------------|--------------------|------------------|
| Mr Adams | Ms Gerick | Mr McClelland | Mr Ripoll |
| Mr Albanese | Mr Gibbons | Ms J. S. McFarlane | Ms Roxon |
| Mr Bevis | Ms Gillard | Ms Macklin | Mr Rudd |
| Mr Breton | Mr Griffin | Mr McLeay | Mr Sawford* |
| Ms Burke | Ms Hall | Mr McMullan | Mr Sciacca |
| Mr Cox | Mr Hatton | Mr Martin | Mr Sercombe* |
| Mr Crean | Ms Hoare | Mr Melham | Mr Sidebottom |
| Mr Danby | Mr Hollis | Mr Morris | Mr Smith |
| Mr Edwards | Mr Horne | Mr Mossfield | Mr Snowdon |
| Ms Ellis | Mrs Irwin | Mr Murphy | Mr Swan |
| Dr Emerson | Mr Jenkins | Ms O'Byrne | Mr Tanner |
| Mr G. J. Evans | Ms Kernot | Mr O'Connor | Dr Theophanous |
| Mr M. J. Evans | Mr Kerr | Mr O'Keefe | Mr K. J. Thomson |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Latham | Ms Plibersek | Mr Wilkie |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson | Dr Lawrence | Mr Price | Mr Wilton |
| Mr Fitzgibbon | Ms Livermore | Mr Quick | Mr Zahra |

* Tellers

Pairs

Mr Howard Mr Beazley
 Mr Lindsay Mr Lee

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mrs Crosio, in the Chair)—

AYES, 64

| | | | |
|----------------------|--------------|--------------------|------------------|
| Mr Adams | Ms Gerick | Mr McClelland | Mr Ripoll |
| Mr Albanese | Mr Gibbons | Ms J. S. McFarlane | Ms Roxon |
| Mr Bevis | Ms Gillard | Ms Macklin | Mr Rudd |
| Mr Brereton | Mr Griffin | Mr McLeay | Mr Sawford* |
| Ms Burke | Ms Hall | Mr McMullan | Mr Sciacca |
| Mr Cox | Mr Hatton | Mr Martin | Mr Sercombe* |
| Mr Crean | Ms Hoare | Mr Melham | Mr Sidebottom |
| Mr Danby | Mr Hollis | Mr Morris | Mr Smith |
| Mr Edwards | Mr Horne | Mr Mossfield | Mr Snowdon |
| Ms Ellis | Mrs Irwin | Mr Murphy | Mr Swan |
| Dr Emerson | Mr Jenkins | Ms O'Byrne | Mr Tanner |
| Mr G. J. Evans | Ms Kernot | Mr O'Connor | Dr Theophanous |
| Mr M. J. Evans | Mr Kerr | Mr O'Keefe | Mr K. J. Thomson |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Latham | Ms Plibersek | Mr Wilkie |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson | Dr Lawrence | Mr Price | Mr Wilton |
| Mr Fitzgibbon | Ms Livermore | Mr Quick | Mr Zahra |

NOES, 76

| | | | |
|------------------|-----------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Mr Abbott | Mrs Elson | Mr Lawler | Mr St Clair |
| Mr Anderson | Mr Entsch | Mr Lieberman | Mr Schultz |
| Mr K. J. Andrews | Mr Fahey | Mr Lloyd | Mr Scott |
| Mr Anthony | Mr Fischer | Mr McArthur* | Mr Secker |
| Fran Bailey | Mr Forrest* | Mr I. E. Macfarlane | Mr Slipper |
| Mr Baird | Mrs Gallus | Mr McGauran | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Barresi | Ms Gambaro | Mrs May | Dr Southcott |
| Mr Bartlett | Mrs Gash | Mr Moore | Dr Stone |
| Mr Billson | Mr Georgiou | Mrs Moylan | Mr C. P. Thompson |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Haase | Mr Nairn | Mr A. P. Thomson |
| Ms J. I. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave | Mr Nehl | Mr Truss |
| Mr Brough | Mr Hawker | Dr Nelson | Mr Tuckey |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Hockey | Mr Neville | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Cameron | Mrs Hull | Mr Nugent | Mrs D. S. Vale |
| Mr Causley | Mr Jull | Mr Prosser | Mr Wakelin |
| Mr Charles | Mr Katter | Mr Pyne | Dr Washer |
| Mr Costello | Mrs D. M. Kelly | Mr Reith | Mr Williams |
| Mr Downer | Jackie Kelly | Mr Ronaldson | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mr Draper | Dr Kemp | Mr Ruddock | Ms Worth |

* Tellers

Pairs

Mr Howard Mr Beazley

Mr Lindsay Mr Lee

And so it was negatived.

5 SUPERANNUATION CONTRIBUTIONS AND TERMINATION PAYMENTS TAXES LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1999

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr K. J. Thomson who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House condemns the Government for:

- (1) introducing the superannuation surcharge tax which is the world’s worst practice tax legislation and administration; and
- (2) wasting the time of the House by requiring Members to debate fundamental surcharge tax amending legislation, some 3 years after the flawed policy was announced”.

Debate continued.

Ordered—That Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration) be granted an extension of time.

Debate continued.

Mr McClelland, by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration being granted a further extension of time.

Question—put and passed.

Debate continued.

Amendment negatived.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Slipper, the Bill was read a third time.

6 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—CONSTITUTION ALTERATION (ESTABLISHMENT OF REPUBLIC) BILL 1999

A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill with amendments and a resolution concerning a proposed Constitutional Convention:

12 August 1999—Message No. 172—Constitution Alteration (Establishment of Republic) Bill 1999.

Ordered—That the amendments be considered forthwith.

Mr Williams (Attorney-General) moved—That amendments (1) and (3) be disagreed to.

Debate adjourned (Ms Worth—Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education, Training and Youth Affairs), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for a later hour this day.

7 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—POSTPONEMENT OF QUESTION TIME

Ms Worth (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education, Training and Youth Affairs), by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent question time today commencing immediately after the House completes its consideration of Senate message No. 172 concerning Senate amendments to the Constitution Alteration (Establishment of Republic) Bill 1999.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

8 CONSTITUTION ALTERATION (ESTABLISHMENT OF REPUBLIC) BILL 1999—SENATE AMENDMENTS

The order of the day having been read for the further consideration of the amendments made by the Senate—

Debate resumed on the Senate amendments (*see entry No. 6*) and on the motion moved by Mr Williams (Attorney-General), viz.—That amendments (1) and (3) be disagreed to.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 78

| | | | |
|------------------|--------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Mr Abbott | Mrs Elson | Mr Lawler | Mr Schultz |
| Mr Anderson | Mr Entsch | Mr Lieberman | Mr Scott |
| Mr Andren | Mr Fahey | Mr Lloyd | Mr Secker |
| Mr K. J. Andrews | Mr Fischer | Mr McArthur* | Mr Slipper |
| Mr Anthony | Mr Forrest* | Mr I. E. Macfarlane | Mr Somlyay |
| Fran Bailey | Mrs Gallus | Mr McGauran | Dr Southcott |
| Mr Baird | Ms Gambaro | Mrs May | Dr Stone |
| Mr Barresi | Mrs Gash | Mr Moore | Mr C. P. Thompson |
| Mr Bartlett | Mr Georgiou | Mrs Moylan | Mr A. P. Thomson |
| Mr Billson | Mr Haase | Mr Nairn | Mr Truss |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave | Mr Nehl | Mr Tuckey |
| Ms J. I. Bishop | Mr Hawker | Dr Nelson | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough | Mr Hockey | Mr Neville | Mrs D. S. Vale |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Howard | Mr Nugent | Mr Wakelin |
| Mr Cameron | Mrs Hull | Mr Prosser | Dr Washer |
| Mr Causley | Mr Jull | Mr Pyne | Mr Williams |
| Mr Charles | Mr Katter | Mr Reith | Dr Wooldridge |

| | | | |
|-------------|-----------------|--------------|----------|
| Mr Costello | Mrs D. M. Kelly | Mr Ronaldson | Ms Worth |
| Mr Downer | Jackie Kelly | Mr Ruddock | |
| Mrs Draper | Dr Kemp | Mr St Clair | |

NOES, 66

| | | | |
|----------------------|---------------|--------------------|------------------|
| Mr Adams | Mr Fitzgibbon | Ms Livermore | Mr Ripoll |
| Mr Albanese | Ms Gerick | Mr McClelland | Ms Roxon |
| Mr Beazley | Mr Gibbons | Ms J. S. McFarlane | Mr Rudd |
| Mr Bevis | Ms Gillard | Ms Macklin | Mr Sawford* |
| Mr Brereton | Mr Griffin | Mr McLeay | Mr Sciacca |
| Ms Burke | Ms Hall | Mr McMullan | Mr Sercombe* |
| Mr Cox | Mr Hatton | Mr Martin | Mr Sidebottom |
| Mr Crean | Ms Hoare | Mr Melham | Mr Smith |
| Mrs Crosio | Mr Hollis | Mr Morris | Mr Snowden |
| Mr Danby | Mr Horne | Mr Mossfield | Mr Swan |
| Mr Edwards | Mrs Irwin | Mr Murphy | Mr Tanner |
| Ms Ellis | Mr Jenkins | Ms O'Byrne | Dr Theophanous |
| Dr Emerson | Ms Kernot | Mr O'Connor | Mr K. J. Thomson |
| Mr G. J. Evans | Mr Kerr | Mr O'Keefe | Mr Wilkie |
| Mr M. J. Evans | Mr Latham | Ms Plibersek | Mr Zahra |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Dr Lawrence | Mr Price | |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson | Mr Lee | Mr Quick | |

* Tellers

Pairs

Mr Lindsay Mr Wilton

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Williams presented reasons, which were circulated, and are as follows:

*Reasons of the House of Representatives for disagreeing to amendments (1) and (3) of the Senate***Senate Amendment (3)**

Amendment (3) would limit the extension of an incumbent President's term under proposed section 60 of the Constitution to 30 days.

Section 60 was intended to cover the possibility that a new appointment would not be finalised before the end of the incumbent's term. This reflects the reality of the appointment process—it is not a process which can necessarily be regulated by means of strict schedules and deadlines. Section 60 should allow for the continuation of the incumbent President, who would previously have been appointed with the support of both the Prime Minister and the Leader of the Opposition, beyond 30 days. This is a better option than the more cumbersome acting arrangements contemplated by recommendation 3.

The arrangements contemplated in amendment (3) would be unnecessarily cumbersome in the case of a short extension. Further, it would be inappropriate to rely on a State Governor to act in the event that circumstances should force a

longer extension - for example if it proved impossible to find a mutually agreed nominee.

For these reasons, the House of Representatives opposes recommendation (3).

Senate Amendment (1)

Amendment (1) relates to the long title of the Bill, which will of course form the basis of the question.

That title as passed by the House of Representatives indicates both the nature of the change to a republic—to replace the Queen and Governor-General with a President—and the proposed method of appointment. It distinguishes the proposed model from other proposed models.

The wording suggested in the amendment gives no indication of the particular republic model or the nature of change. It does nothing to help voters to identify clearly what they are voting on. Research clearly shows there is a need to provide that help and to dispel misconceptions.

For these reasons, the House of Representatives opposes amendment (1).

On the motion of Mr Williams, the reasons were adopted.

Mr Williams moved—That Senate amendments (2) and (4) to (8) be agreed to.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 137

| | | | |
|----------------------|-----------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Mr Adams | Mr Fischer | Mr Lloyd | Mr Ruddock |
| Mr Albanese | Mr Fitzgibbon | Mr McArthur* | Mr St Clair |
| Mr Anderson | Mr Forrest* | Mr McClelland | Mr Sawford* |
| Mr Anthony | Mrs Gallus | Mr I. E. Macfarlane | Mr Sciacca |
| Fran Bailey | Ms Gambaro | Ms J. S. McFarlane | Mr Scott |
| Mr Baird | Mrs Gash | Mr McGauran | Mr Secker |
| Mr Barresi | Mr Georgiou | Ms Macklin | Mr Sercombe* |
| Mr Bartlett | Ms Gerick | Mr McLeay | Mr Sidebottom |
| Mr Beazley | Mr Gibbons | Mr McMullan | Mr Slipper |
| Mr Bevis | Ms Gillard | Mr Martin | Mr Smith |
| Mr Billson | Mr Griffin | Mrs May | Mr Snowdon |
| Ms J. I. Bishop | Mr Haase | Mr Melham | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Brereton | Ms Hall | Mr Moore | Dr Southcott |
| Mr Brough | Mr Hardgrave | Mr Morris | Dr Stone |
| Ms Burke | Mr Hatton | Mr Mossfield | Mrs Sullivan |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Hawker | Mrs Moylan | Mr Swan |
| Mr Cameron | Ms Hoare | Mr Murphy | Mr Tanner |
| Mr Charles | Mr Hockey | Mr Nairn | Dr Theophanous |
| Mr Costello | Mr Hollis | Mr Nehl | Mr C. P. Thompson |
| Mr Cox | Mr Horne | Dr Nelson | Mr A. P. Thomson |
| Mr Crean | Mr Howard | Mr Neville | Mr K. J. Thomson |
| Mrs Crosio | Mrs Irwin | Mr Nugent | Mr Truss |
| Mr Danby | Mr Jenkins | Ms O'Byrne | Mr Tuckey |
| Mr Downer | Mr Katter | Mr O'Connor | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mrs Draper | Mrs D. M. Kelly | Mr O'Keefe | Mrs D. S. Vale |
| Mr Edwards | Jackie Kelly | Ms Plibersek | Mr Wakelin |
| Ms Ellis | Dr Kemp | Mr Price | Dr Washer |
| Mrs Elson | Ms Kernot | Mr Prosser | Mr Wilkie |
| Dr Emerson | Mr Kerr | Mr Pyne | Mr Williams |
| Mr Entsch | Mr Latham | Mr Quick | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mr G. J. Evans | Mr Lawler | Mr Reith | Ms Worth |
| Mr M. J. Evans | Dr Lawrence | Mr Ripoll | Mr Zahra |
| Mr Fahey | Mr Lee | Mr Ronaldson | |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Lieberman | Ms Roxon | |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson | Ms Livermore | Mr Rudd | |

NOES, 8

| | | | |
|-----------|-------------------|------------|------------|
| Mr Abbott | Mr K. J. Andrews* | Mr Causley | Mr Jull |
| Mr Andren | Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mrs Hull* | Mr Schultz |

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

The Speaker declared that the question—That Senate amendments (2) and (4) to (8) be agreed to—had been resolved in the affirmative by an absolute majority.

9 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice being asked—

Paper

Mr Williams (Attorney-General) presented the following paper:

Keating, Hon. P. J.—*60 Minutes* programmes of 21 March 1999 and 28 March 1999—Statement by Mr Williams.

Questions without notice continuing—

Member ordered to withdraw

At 3.17 p.m. the Member for Jagajaga (Ms Macklin) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a general warning had been given by the Chair, and she accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Questions without notice continuing—

Member ordered to withdraw

At 3.27 p.m. the Member for Melbourne Ports (Mr Danby) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a general warning had been given by the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Suspension of standing and sessional orders moved

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition) moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Leader of the Opposition moving forthwith—That this House censures the Prime Minister for his failure to uphold the requirements of the Auditor-General's 'Administration of grants better practice guidelines' and his blatant use of Telstra funds to provide a war chest for coalition candidates.

Debate ensued.

The time allowed by standing order 91 for debate on the motion having expired—

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Nehl, in the Chair)—

AYES, 65

| | | | |
|----------------------|--------------|--------------------|------------------|
| Mr Adams | Ms Gerick | Mr McClelland | Mr Rudd |
| Mr Albanese | Mr Gibbons | Ms J. S. McFarlane | Mr Sawford* |
| Mr Beazley | Ms Gillard | Mr McLeay | Mr Sciacca |
| Mr Bevis | Mr Griffin | Mr McMullan | Mr Sercombe* |
| Mr Breton | Ms Hall | Mr Martin | Mr Sidebottom |
| Ms Burke | Mr Hatton | Mr Melham | Mr Smith |
| Mr Cox | Ms Hoare | Mr Morris | Mr Snowdon |
| Mr Crean | Mr Hollis | Mr Mossfield | Mr Swan |
| Mrs Crosio | Mr Horne | Mr Murphy | Mr Tanner |
| Mr Edwards | Mrs Irwin | Ms O'Byrne | Dr Theophanous |
| Ms Ellis | Mr Jenkins | Mr O'Connor | Mr K. J. Thomson |
| Dr Emerson | Ms Kernot | Mr O'Keefe | Mr Wilkie |
| Mr G. J. Evans | Mr Kerr | Ms Plibersek | Mr Wilton |
| Mr M. J. Evans | Mr Latham | Mr Price | Mr Zahra |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Dr Lawrence | Mr Quick | |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson | Mr Lee | Mr Ripoll | |
| Mr Fitzgibbon | Ms Livermore | Ms Roxon | |

NOES, 77

| | | | |
|------------------|-----------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Mr Abbott | Mr Entsch | Mr Lieberman | Mr Secker |
| Mr Anderson | Mr Fahey | Mr Lloyd | Mr Slipper |
| Mr K. J. Andrews | Mr Fischer | Mr McArthur* | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Anthony | Mr Forrest* | Mr I. E. Macfarlane | Dr Southcott |
| Fran Bailey | Mrs Gallus | Mr McGauran | Dr Stone |
| Mr Baird | Ms Gambaro | Mrs May | Mrs Sullivan |
| Mr Barresi | Mrs Gash | Mr Moore | Mr C. P. Thompson |
| Mr Bartlett | Mr Georgiou | Mrs Moylan | Mr A. P. Thomson |
| Mr Billson | Mr Haase | Mr Nairn | Mr Truss |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave | Dr Nelson | Mr Tuckey |
| Ms J. I. Bishop | Mr Hawker | Mr Neville | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough | Mr Hockey | Mr Nugent | Mrs D. S. Vale |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Howard | Mr Prosser | Mr Wakelin |
| Mr Cameron | Mrs Hull | Mr Pyne | Dr Washer |
| Mr Causley | Mr Jull | Mr Reith | Mr Williams |
| Mr Charles | Mr Katter | Mr Ronaldson | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mr Costello | Mrs D. M. Kelly | Mr Ruddock | Ms Worth |
| Mr Downer | Jackie Kelly | Mr St Clair | |
| Mrs Draper | Dr Kemp | Mr Schultz | |
| Mrs Elson | Mr Lawler | Mr Scott | |

* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

 Questions without notice concluded.

10 PAPER

The following paper was presented:

Australian Communications Authority—Report—Telecommunications Interception Review—Review of the longer term cost-effectiveness of telecommunications interception arrangements under section 332R of the *Telecommunications Act 1997*, June 1999.

11 SPECIAL ADJOURNMENT

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the House, at its rising, adjourn until Monday, 23 August 1999, at 12.30 p.m., unless the Speaker or, in the event of the Speaker being unavailable, the Deputy Speaker, fixes an alternative day or hour of meeting.

Question—put and passed.

12 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—MEDICARE

The House was informed that Ms Macklin had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The Government’s attack on Medicare demonstrated by its undermining of bulk billing and its failure to support a public inquiry into the future funding needs of public hospitals”.

Members rising to support the proposed discussion—

Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr J. N. Andrew, in the Chair)—

AYES, 77

| | | | |
|------------------|-----------------|---------------------|-------------------|
| Mr Abbott | Mr Entsch | Mr Lloyd | Mr Secker |
| Mr Anderson | Mr Fahey | Mr McArthur* | Mr Slipper |
| Mr K. J. Andrews | Mr Fischer | Mr I. E. Macfarlane | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Anthony | Mr Forrest* | Mr McGauran | Dr Southcott |
| Fran Bailey | Mrs Gallus | Mrs May | Dr Stone |
| Mr Baird | Ms Gambaro | Mr Moore | Mrs Sullivan |
| Mr Barresi | Mrs Gash | Mrs Moylan | Mr C. P. Thompson |
| Mr Bartlett | Mr Georgiou | Mr Nairn | Mr A. P. Thomson |
| Mr Billson | Mr Haase | Mr Nehl | Mr Truss |
| Mrs B. K. Bishop | Mr Hardgrave | Dr Nelson | Mr Tuckey |
| Ms J. I. Bishop | Mr Hawker | Mr Neville | Mr M. A. J. Vaile |
| Mr Brough | Mr Hockey | Mr Nugent | Mrs D. S. Vale |
| Mr Cadman | Mrs Hull | Mr Prosser | Mr Wakelin |
| Mr Cameron | Mr Jull | Mr Pyne | Dr Washer |
| Mr Causley | Mr Katter | Mr Reith | Mr Williams |
| Mr Charles | Mrs D. M. Kelly | Mr Ronaldson | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mr Costello | Jackie Kelly | Mr Ruddock | Ms Worth |
| Mr Downer | Dr Kemp | Mr St Clair | |
| Mrs Draper | Mr Lawler | Mr Schultz | |
| Mrs Elson | Mr Lieberman | Mr Scott | |

NOES, 64

| | | | |
|----------------------|-------------|--------------------|------------------|
| Mr Adams | Ms Gerick | Ms Livermore | Mr Ripoll |
| Mr Albanese | Mr Gibbons | Mr McClelland | Ms Roxon |
| Mr Bevis | Ms Gillard | Ms J. S. McFarlane | Mr Rudd |
| Mr Brereton | Mr Griffin | Mr McLeay | Mr Sawford* |
| Ms Burke | Ms Hall | Mr McMullan | Mr Sciacca |
| Mr Cox | Mr Hatton | Mr Martin | Mr Sercombe* |
| Mr Crean | Ms Hoare | Mr Melham | Mr Sidebottom |
| Mrs Crosio | Mr Hollis | Mr Morris | Mr Smith |
| Mr Edwards | Mr Horne | Mr Mossfield | Mr Snowdon |
| Ms Ellis | Mrs Irwin | Mr Murphy | Mr Swan |
| Dr Emerson | Mr Jenkins | Ms O'Byrne | Mr Tanner |
| Mr G. J. Evans | Ms Kernot | Mr O'Connor | Dr Theophanous |
| Mr M. J. Evans | Mr Kerr | Mr O'Keefe | Mr K. J. Thomson |
| Mr L. D. T. Ferguson | Mr Latham | Ms Plibersek | Mr Wilkie |
| Mr M. J. Ferguson | Dr Lawrence | Mr Price | Mr Wilton |
| Mr Fitzgibbon | Mr Lee | Mr Quick | Mr Zahra |

* Tellers

Pairs

Mr Howard Mr Beazley

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

13 JOINT STANDING COMMITTEES—MEMBERSHIP

Dr Stone (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for the Environment and Heritage), by leave, moved—That:

- (1) Mr L. D. T. Ferguson be appointed a member of the Joint Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade;
- (2) Mr L. D. T. Ferguson be discharged from the Joint Standing Committee on Treaties and that, in his place, Mr Wilkie be appointed a member of the committee; and
- (3) Mr Adams be appointed a member of the Joint Standing Committee on Migration.

Question—put and passed.

14 NATIONAL LIBRARY OF AUSTRALIA COUNCIL

Dr Stone (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for the Environment and Heritage), by leave, moved—That, in accordance with the provisions of the *National Library Act 1960*, this House elects Mr M. J. Ferguson to be a member of the Council of the National Library of Australia and to continue as a member for a period of 3 years from and including this day.

Question—put and passed.

15 COPYRIGHT AMENDMENT (COMPUTER PROGRAMS) BILL 1999—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Dr Stone (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for the Environment and Heritage), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

16 CRIMINAL CODE AMENDMENT (SLAVERY AND SEXUAL SERVITUDE) BILL 1999—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Dr Stone (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for the Environment and Heritage), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

17 SUPERANNUATION (UNCLAIMED MONEY AND LOST MEMBERS) BILL 1999—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee, a Governor-General's message recommending an appropriation had been reported, and the Bill had been agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Dr Stone (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for the Environment and Heritage), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

18 SUPERANNUATION (UNCLAIMED MONEY AND LOST MEMBERS) CONSEQUENTIAL AND TRANSITIONAL BILL 1999—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Dr Stone (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for the Environment and Heritage), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

19 MINISTERS OF STATE AMENDMENT BILL 1999—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee, a Governor-General's message recommending an appropriation had been reported, and the Bill had been agreed to without amendment, and presented a certified copy of the Bill.

Bill agreed to.

On the motion of Dr Stone (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for the Environment and Heritage), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

20 AUSTRALIAN TOURIST COMMISSION AMENDMENT BILL 1999—REPORT FROM MAIN COMMITTEE

The Speaker reported that the Bill had been fully considered by the Main Committee and agreed to with an amendment and presented a certified copy of the Bill together with a schedule of the amendment.

Amendment made by the Main Committee agreed to.

Bill, as amended, agreed to.

On the motion of Dr Stone (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for the Environment and Heritage), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

21 POSTPONEMENT OF ORDER OF THE DAY

Ordered—That order of the day No. 3, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day.

22 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—A NEW TAX SYSTEM (COMMONWEALTH-STATE FINANCIAL ARRANGEMENTS) BILL 1999

Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration moving amendments to the A New Tax System (Commonwealth-State Financial Arrangements) Bill 1999 during the consideration of the Senate's requests for amendments to the Bill.

Question—put and passed.

23 A NEW TAX SYSTEM (COMMONWEALTH-STATE FINANCIAL ARRANGEMENTS) BILL 1999—SENATE'S REQUESTS

The order of the day having been read for the consideration of the amendments requested by the Senate—

On the motion of Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), the requested amendments were made, after debate.

On the motion of Mr Slipper, Government amendments (1) to (11) were made, together.

Mr Slipper moved—That in the message returning the Bill to the Senate, the Senate be requested to reconsider the Bill in respect of the amendments made by the House of Representatives.

Question—put and passed.

24 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS—A NEW TAX SYSTEM (COMMONWEALTH-STATE FINANCIAL ARRANGEMENTS—CONSEQUENTIAL PROVISIONS) BILL 1999

Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), by leave, moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration moving amendments to the A New Tax System (Commonwealth-State Financial Arrangements—Consequential Provisions) Bill 1999 during the consideration of the amendment made by the Senate to the Bill.

Question—put and passed.

25 A NEW TAX SYSTEM (COMMONWEALTH-STATE FINANCIAL ARRANGEMENTS—CONSEQUENTIAL PROVISIONS) BILL 1999—SENATE'S AMENDMENT

The order of the day having been read for the consideration of the amendment made by the Senate—

On the motion of Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), the amendment was disagreed to, after debate.

On the motion of Mr Slipper, Government amendments (1) to (5) were made, together.

Mr Slipper moved—That in the message returning the Bill to the Senate, the Senate be requested to reconsider the Bill in respect of the amendments made by the House of Representatives.

Question—put and passed.

26 SOCIAL SECURITY AMENDMENT (DISPOSAL OF ASSETS) BILL 1999

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Adjournment negatived

It being 5.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration) requiring the question to be put forthwith without debate—

Question—put and negatived.

Debate continued.

Paper

Mr Latham, by leave, presented the following paper:

Getting Even—Women MPs on Life, Power and Politics by Anne Henderson—
Copy of review by Mr Latham.

Debate continued.

Ms Hall was granted leave to continue her speech when the debate is resumed.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

27 ADJOURNMENT

Mr M. A. J. Vaile (Minister for Trade) moved—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Messages from the Senate

Messages from the Senate, 12 August 1999, were reported:

- (a) returning the Constitution Alteration (Establishment of Republic) Bill 1999 and acquainting the House that the Senate does not insist upon its amendments Nos. 1 and 3 disagreed to by the House—Message No. 175; and
 - (b) returning the Constitution Alteration (Preamble) Bill 1999 without amendment—Message No. 176.
-

Question—That the House do now adjourn—put and passed.

And then the House, at 6.54 p.m., adjourned until Monday, 23 August 1999, at 12.30 p.m., in accordance with the resolution agreed to this sitting.

PAPER

The following paper was deemed to have been presented on 12 August 1999:
Public Service Act—Determination—Department of the Environment and
Heritage 1999 No. 1.

**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Lindsay.

**I. C. HARRIS**

Clerk of the House of Representatives

1998-99

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES
SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 56

MAIN COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

THURSDAY, 12 AUGUST 1999

1 The Main Committee met at 9.40 a.m.

2 MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

Members' statements were made.

3 SUPERANNUATION (UNCLAIMED MONEY AND LOST MEMBERS) BILL 1999

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Message from the Governor-General

Message No. 103, 31 July 1999, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the Bill.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

4 SUPERANNUATION (UNCLAIMED MONEY AND LOST MEMBERS) CONSEQUENTIAL AND TRANSITIONAL BILL 1999

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

5 MINISTERS OF STATE AMENDMENT BILL 1999

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Message from the Governor-General

Message No. 102, 22 June 1999, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the Bill.

Leave granted for the question on the report to be put forthwith.

Question—That the Bill be reported to the House without amendment—put and passed.

6 AUSTRALIAN TOURIST COMMISSION AMENDMENT BILL 1999

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Suspension of sitting

At 11.34 a.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

Resumption of sitting

At 12.08 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

Debate continued.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Consideration in detail

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

On the motion of Mr Fitzgibbon, an Opposition amendment was agreed to.

Bill, as amended, agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

Ordered—That the Bill be reported to the House with an amendment.

7 ADJOURNMENT

It being 12.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the Main Committee do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

At 1 p.m. the Deputy Speaker adjourned the Main Committee.

B. C. WRIGHT
Clerk of the Main Committee