#### 1996-97-98

#### THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

#### HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

### **VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 164

#### MONDAY, 1 JUNE 1998

1 The House met, at 12.30 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Right Honourable Ian Sinclair) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

## 2 TREATIES—JOINT STANDING COMMITTEE—REPORT—STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER

Mr Taylor (Chair) presented the following papers:

Treaties—Joint Standing Committee—14th report—Multilateral Agreement on Investment—

Interim report, May 1998.

Evidence received by the committee.

Minutes of proceedings.

Ordered—That the report be printed.

Mr Taylor, Mr McClelland and Mr Hardgrave made statements in connection with the report.

The time allotted for making statements on the report having expired—

Mr Taylor moved—That the House take note of the report.

Mr Taylor was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed.

In accordance with standing order 102B, the debate was adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

#### 3 LEGAL AND CONSTITUTIONAL AFFAIRS—STANDING COMMITTEE— REPORT—STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER

Mr K. J. Andrews (Chair) presented the following papers:

Legal and Constitutional Affairs—Standing Committee—Don't stop the music!—Inquiry into copyright, music and small business—

Report, May 1998.

Evidence received by the committee.

Minutes of proceedings.

Ordered—That the report be printed.

Mr K. J. Andrews, Mr McClelland, Mrs E. J. Grace, Mr Mutch and Mr A. C. Smith made statements in connection with the report.

The time allotted for making statements on the report having expired—

Mr K. J. Andrews moved—That the House take note of the report.

Mr K. J. Andrews was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed.

In accordance with standing order 102B, the debate was adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

## 4 PROCEDURE—STANDING COMMITTEE—REPORT—STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS—MOTION TO TAKE NOTE OF PAPER

Mr Nugent (Chair) presented the following papers:

Procedure—Standing Committee—Ten years on—A review of the House of Representatives committee system—

Report, incorporating a dissenting report, May 1998.

Evidence received by the committee.

Minutes of proceedings.

Ordered—That the report be printed.

Mr Nugent and Mr Mossfield made statements in connection with the report.

The time for consideration of committee and delegation reports having expired—

Mr Nugent moved—That the House take note of the report.

Mr Nugent was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed.

In accordance with standing order 102B, the debate was adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

#### **5 EMPLOYMENT SECURITY BILL 1998**

Mr McMullan, pursuant to notice, presented a Bill for an Act to amend the *Workplace Relations Act 1996* and the *Corporations Law*, in order to help protect the entitlements of employees.

Mr McMullan made a statement in relation to the Bill.

Paper

Mr McMullan, by leave, presented an explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Bill read a first time.

Ordered—That the second reading be made an order of the day for the next sitting, in accordance with standing order 104A.

#### 6 CHILD CARE SYSTEM

Miss J. M. Kelly, pursuant to notice, moved—That this House:

- (1) recognises that the former Labor Government created a child care system which was based on inequitable funding practices such as operational subsidies;
- (2) agrees that the Government's reform of the child care system provides for an equitable distribution of money between low and middle income families and the creation of an extra 83 000 places over the next four years;
- (3) notes and supports the Government's allocation of \$4.9 billion to the child care system over the next four years;
- (4) calls on the Opposition to stop its campaign of misinformation to parents which threatens to do long-term damage to the child care sector as a whole;
- (5) notes that due to this Government's reforms low and middle income families are now better off than under the previous Government; and
- (6) condemns the former Labor Government for its management of the child care sector, creating a massive oversupply of centres in some areas and undersupply in others.

Debate ensued.

At 1.45 p.m., the time allotted for the debate having expired, the debate was interrupted in accordance with standing order 106A, Dr Southcott was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed, and the resumption of the debate was made an order of the day for the next sitting.

#### 7 MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

Members' statements were made.

#### 8 QUESTIONS

Questions without notice being asked—

Paper

Dr Wooldridge (Minister for Health and Family Services) presented the following paper:

Prescription drug utilization following patient co-payment changes in Australia—Copy of article published in *Pharmacoepidemiology and Drug Safety*, Volume 5, 385-392 (1996).

Questions without notice continued.

#### 9 PRIME MINISTER—MOTION OF CENSURE

Mr Beazley (Leader of the Opposition), by leave, moved—That this House censures the Prime Minister for having misled it when he denied the Government Members Task Force had been instructed to bring forth no recommendations.

Debate ensued.

Member ordered to withdraw

At 4.01 p.m. the Member for Hotham (Mr Crean) was ordered, under standing order 304A, to withdraw from the House for one hour for continuing to interject after a warning had been given from the Chair, and he accordingly withdrew from the Chamber.

Debate continued.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Speaker, Mr Sinclair, in the Chair)—

#### AYES, 44

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Connor
Mr Albanese	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Beazley	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Quick
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Brown	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Mr Holding	Mr Melham	Dr Theophanous
Mr Dargavel	Mr Hollis	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Jenkins	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr Mossfield	Mr Wilton

#### **NOES**, 87

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ronaldson
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Ruddock
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr McArthur*	Mr Sharp
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McDougall	Mr Slipper*
Mrs Bailey	Mr Forrest	Mr McGauran	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Ms Gambaro	Mr McLachlan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mr Marek	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mr Miles	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mrs Bishop	Mr Halverson	Mr Mutch	Mr Taylor
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Brough	Mr Hicks*	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr E. H. Cameron	Mr Howard	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Causley	Ms Jeanes	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Charles	Mrs Johnston	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mrs West
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Mr Williams
Mr Dondas	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reid	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Miss J. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Rocher	

<sup>\*</sup> Tellers

And so it was negatived.

#### 10 PETITIONS

The Clerk announced that the following Members had each lodged petitions for presentation, viz.:

Mr Brown and Mr McClelland, from 46 and 75 petitioners, and Mr Jenkins, from 15 residents of Victoria, respectively, praying that legislation that would impact upon existing quality, affordable childcare not be passed.

Mr Andren, from 11 residents of New South Wales, praying that the privatisation of the New South Wales Adult Migrant English Service be reviewed.

Mr Bevis, from 627 residents of Queensland, praying that the House ensure that the Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme does not discriminate against those with the greatest incapacity to pay for prescription medicines.

Mr Bevis, from 436 residents of Queensland, praying that the proposal to introduce nursing home entry fees be abandoned and full funding for capital assistance to nursing homes be restored.

Mr McClelland, from 69 residents of Sydney, in similar terms.

Mr Bevis, from 128 residents of Queensland, praying that changes to the Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme be reversed.

Mr Bevis, from 109 residents of Queensland, praying that certain legislative action be taken to protect the rights of Australian workers to secure employment.

Mr Bevis, from 108 residents of Queensland, praying that Medicare/Medibank offices be re-opened.

Mr Bevis, from 74 residents of Queensland, praying that nursing home care be equally available to all Australians on the basis of medical need alone.

Mr Bevis, from 60 petitioners, praying that certain action be taken regarding care for frail aged people.

Mr Bevis, from 26 residents of Queensland, praying that the extra tertiary places and facilities previously announced for Queensland universities be delivered.

Mr Bevis, from 2 petitioners, praying that nursing home care be available to all and that the family home be exempted from assets tests relating to payment for such care.

Mr Brown, from 27 petitioners, praying that the proposed Sexuality Discrimination Bill be rejected.

Mr R. A. Cameron, from 133 petitioners, praying that attempts to achieve the status of a republic in Australia be opposed.

Mr Halverson, from 34 petitioners, praying that action be taken to remove the exclusion of members of the Royal Australian Navy, who served in the Malaya campaign, from repatriation benefits under the Veterans' Entitlements Act.

Mr Jenkins, from 23 residents of Victoria, praying that the decision to allow mining at Jabiluka be reversed.

Mr Latham, from 21 petitioners, praying that post-secondary education be returned to a system which is fair and accessible for all Australians.

Dr Lawrence, from 44 petitioners, praying that certain actions be taken to protect all native old growth, wilderness and other high conservation value forests in Australia.

Mr McClelland, from 909 electors of the Division of Barton, praying that a commission of inquiry or judicial inquiry be established to investigate all aspects of the long term operating plan for Sydney (Kingsford-Smith) Airport including the part played by senior members of the Government.

Mr McClelland, from 60 electors of the Division of Barton, praying that the Rockdale, NSW, Medicare office remain open.

Mr Quick, from 631 petitioners, praying that Australia's recognition of Indonesian sovereignty over East Timor be rescinded.

Mr Tanner, from 65 petitioners, praying that no further reduction be made to university funding, the imposition of undergraduate tuition fees be prevented and university staff be adequately remunerated.

Petitions received.

#### 11 CLOSED CAPTIONING

Mr McLeay, pursuant to notice, moved—That this House calls on the Government to make closed captioning compulsory on all programs.

Debate ensued.

The time allotted for the debate having expired, the debate was interrupted, the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting, and Mr Hardgrave was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed.

#### 12 PRIVATE HEALTH INSURANCE

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the motion of Mr E. H. Cameron—That this House:

- (1) acknowledges that Australia's health system is reliant on a successful private health insurance industry complementing the public health system;
- (2) notes with concern the neglect of the former Labor Government to stem the exodus from private health insurance between 1984 and 1996;
- (3) calls on the Australian Labor Party to agree to supporting incentives for private health insurance as part of its policy platform at its annual conference in 1998;
- (4) expresses its support for the incentives provided by the Federal Government for people to maintain private health insurance and for those who do not have it, to take it out;
- (5) calls on private health insurers to minimise any premium increases which may force more Australians to reconsider their membership;

- (6) welcomes any further policies which encourage people who can afford to take out private health insurance, to do so; and
- (7) calls on the Government to refer the issue of private health insurance and the Australian health system to the Standing Committee on Family and Community Affairs for further solutions to alleviate the decline in private health insurance caused by the policies of the former Labor Government—

#### Debate resumed.

The time allotted for private Members' business having expired, the debate was interrupted, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

#### 13 POSTPONEMENT OF ORDER OF THE DAY

Mr Truss (Minister for Customs and Consumer Affairs) moved—That order of the day No. 1, government business (Grievance debate), be postponed until a later hour this day.

Mr Bevis addressing the House—

Closure of Member

Mr Truss moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Hollis, in the Chair)—

#### AYES, 84

Mr Abbott Mr Anderson Mr J. N. Andrew Mr K. J. Andrews Mr Anthony Mrs Bailey Mr R. C. Baldwin Mr Barresi Mr Bartlett Mr Billson Mrs Bishop Mr Broadbent Mr Brough Mr Cadman Mr E. H. Cameron Mr Causley Mr Charles	Mrs Draper Mrs Elson Mr Entsch Mr R. D. C. Evans Mr Fahey Mr Fischer Mr Forrest Ms Gambaro Mrs Gash Mr Georgiou Mrs E. J. Grace Mr Halverson Mr Hardgrave Mr Hicks* Mr Hockey Ms Jeanes Mrs Johnston	Mr Lieberman Mr Lindsay Mr Lloyd Mr McArthur* Mr McDougall Mr McGauran Mr McLachlan Mr Marek Mr Miles Mrs Moylan Mr Mutch Mr Nairn Mr Nehl Dr Nelson Mr Neville Mr Nugent Mr Prosser	Mr Ronaldson Mr Ruddock Mr Scott Mr Sharp Mr Slipper* Mr W. L. Smith Mr Somlyay Dr Southcott Mrs Stone Mrs Sullivan Mr Taylor Mr A. P. Thomson Mr Truss Mr Tuckey Mr M. A. J. Vaile Mrs D. S. Vale Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Ms Jeanes	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Cobb Mr Costello Mr Dondas Mr Downer	Mr Jull Mr Katter Mrs D. M. Kelly Dr Kemp	Mr Pyne Mr Randall Mr Reid Mr Reith	Mrs West Mr Williams Dr Wooldridge Ms Worth

#### NOES, 43

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Lee	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Price
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Quick
Mr Bevis	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Brown	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Holding	Mr Melham	Dr Theophanous
Mrs Crosio	Mr Jenkins	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Dargavel	Mr Jones	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Willis
Ms Ellis	Mr Latham	Mr Mossfield	Mr Wilton
Mr G. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr O'Connor	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr Crean rising to address the House—

Closure

Mr Truss moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Hollis, in the Chair)—

#### AYES, 84

3.5. 411	1.C. D.	3.6. 7.1.1	3.6 D 11
Mr Abbott	Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ronaldson
Mr Anderson	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Ruddock
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McArthur*	Mr Sharp
Mr Anthony	Mr Fahey	Mr McDougall	Mr Slipper*
Mrs Bailey	Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Mr Forrest	Mr McLachlan	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mr Marek	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Miles	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mrs Bishop	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Mutch	Mr Taylor
Mr Broadbent	Mr Halverson	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr E. H. Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Causley	Ms Jeanes	Mr Nugent	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Charles	Mrs Johnston	Mr Prosser	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mrs West
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Mr Williams
Mr Dondas	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reid	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith	Ms Worth

#### NOES, 44

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Lee	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Price
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Quick
Mr Bevis	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Brown	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Holding	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Mr Jenkins	Mr A. A. Morris	Dr Theophanous
Mr Dargavel	Mr Jones	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Latham	Mr Mossfield	Mr Willis
Mr G. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilton

<sup>\*</sup> Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That order of the day No. 1, government business, be postponed until a later hour this day—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr Hollis, in the Chair)—

#### **AYES**, 85

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sharp
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper*
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr McDougall	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mrs Bailey	Mr Forrest	Mr McLachlan	Dr Southcott
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Ms Gambaro	Mr Marek	Mrs Stone
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gash	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bartlett	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Taylor
Mr Billson	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Mutch	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mrs Bishop	Mr Halverson	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hicks*	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr E. H. Cameron	Ms Jeanes	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs Johnston	Mr Prosser	Mrs West
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Costello	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reid	Ms Worth
Mr Dondas	Miss J. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ruddock	

#### NOES, 44

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Lee	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Price
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Quick
Mr Bevis	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McLeay	Mr Sawford*
Mr Brereton	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Mr Sercombe*
Mr Brown	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Crean	Mr Holding	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Mr Jenkins	Mr A. A. Morris	Dr Theophanous
Mr Dargavel	Mr Jones	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Latham	Mr Mossfield	Mr Willis
Mr G. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr O'Connor	Mr Wilton

<sup>\*</sup> Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

#### 14 MAIN COMMITTEE—DAY OF NEXT MEETING

The Deputy Speaker reported that Monday, 1 June 1998, at 8 p.m., had been fixed for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

#### 15 MESSAGES FROM THE SENATE

Messages from the Senate, 28 May 1998, were reported:

(a) returning the following Bills without amendment:

No. 489—Interstate Road Transport Amendment 1998;

No. 490—Interstate Road Transport Charge Amendment 1998;

No. 491—Australian Science, Technology and Engineering Council Repeal 1998;

No. 492—Tax Law Improvement (No. 1) 1998;

No. 493—Taxation Laws (Technical Amendments) 1997; and

(b) acquainting the House that the Senate had agreed to the amendments made by the House to the Ballast Water Research and Development Funding Levy Collection Bill 1997—No. 495.

# 16 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—SOCIAL SECURITY LEGISLATION AMENDMENT (YOUTH ALLOWANCE CONSEQUENTIAL AND RELATED MEASURES) BILL 1998

A message from the Senate was reported returning the following Bill with amendments:

29 May 1998—Message No. 496—Social Security Legislation Amendment (Youth Allowance Consequential and Related Measures) 1998.

Ordered—That the amendments be considered forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Ruddock (Minister representing the Minister for Social Security), the amendments were agreed to.

## 17 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—FISHERIES LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL (NO. 1) 1998

Message No. 494, 28 May 1998, from the Senate was reported transmitting for the concurrence of the House a Bill for an Act to amend and repeal legislation relating to fisheries, and for related purposes.

Bill read a first time.

Ordered—That the second reading be made an order of the day for the next sitting.

## 18 NATIVE TITLE AND THE ABORIGINAL AND TORRES STRAIT ISLANDER LAND FUND—PARLIAMENTARY JOINT COMMITTEE—ADVISORY REPORT—STATEMENTS BY MEMBERS

Mr Entsch (Chair) presented the following papers:

Native Title and the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Land Fund—Parliamentary Joint Committee—12th report—Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Heritage Protection Bill 1998—

Advisory report, incorporating a dissenting report, May 1998.

Evidence received by the committee.

Ordered—That the report be printed.

Mr Entsch and Mr Melham, by leave, made statements in connection with the report.

#### 19 WHEAT MARKETING LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1998

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr O'Keefe who moved, as an amendment—That all words after "That" be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: "the House calls for the enactment of the proposals to be deferred for one year and the existing arrangements extended for this period so that further consideration can be given by industry representatives to the best arrangements for the industry and so that all parties can be fully satisfied about those arrangements before they are finally enacted".

Debate continued.

Question—That the words proposed to be omitted stand part of the question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mrs D. M. Kelly, in the Chair)—

#### AYES, 84

Mr Abbott	Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Reith
Mr Anderson	Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ronaldson
Mr Andren	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Ruddock
Mr J. N. Andrew	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr McArthur*	Mr Sharp
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McDougall	Mr Slipper*
Mrs Bailey	Mr Forrest	Mr McGauran	Mr Somlyay
Mr R. C. Baldwin	Mrs Gallus	Mr McLachlan	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Ms Gambaro	Mr Marek	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gash	Mr Miles	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mr Georgiou	Mrs Moylan	Mr Taylor
Mrs Bishop	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Mutch	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Broadbent	Mr Halverson	Mr Nairn	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nehl	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Dr Nelson	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr E. H. Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Neville	Mrs D. S. Vale
Mr Causley	Ms Jeanes	Mr Nugent	Mr Wakelin
Mr Charles	Mrs Johnston	Mr Prosser	Mrs West
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Pyne	Mr Williams
Mr Dondas	Mr Katter	Mr Randall	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Miss J. M. Kelly	Mr Reid	Ms Worth

#### NOES, 43

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe
MI Adams	wii wi. J. Feiguson	MII Laulalli	WII O Keele
Mr Albanese	Mr Filing	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Quick
Mr Beddall	Mr E. L. Grace*	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin*	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brereton	Mr Hatton	Mr Martin	Mr S. F. Smith
Mr Brown	Mr Holding	Mr Melham	Mr Tanner
Mrs Crosio	Mr Hollis	Mr A. A. Morris	Dr Theophanous
Mr Dargavel	Mr Jenkins	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Jones	Mr Mossfield	Mr Wilton
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Kerr	Mr O'Connor	

<sup>\*</sup> Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the Bill be now read a second time—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Message from the Governor-General

Message No. 277, 13 May 1998, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation for the purposes of the Bill.

Consideration in detail

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

Mr Anderson (Minister for Primary Industries and Energy), by leave, moved revised Government amendments (1) to (7) as circulated, together.

Paper

Mr Anderson presented a revised supplementary explanatory memorandum to the Bill.

Amendments agreed to.

Bill, as amended, agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Mr Anderson, by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

#### 20 COMPREHENSIVE NUCLEAR TEST-BAN TREATY BILL 1998

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Mr Anthony addressing the House—

It being 10.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

21 ADJOURNMENT

The House continuing to sit until 11 p.m.—The Speaker adjourned the House until tomorrow at 2 p.m.

#### **PAPERS**

The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 1 June 1998:

Australian Meat and Live-stock Industry Act and Australian Meat and Live-stock Industry (Repeals and Consequential Provisions) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 107.

Australian Postal Corporation Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 99.

Beef Production Levy Act, Cattle (Exporters) Export Charge Act, Cattle Transactions Levy Act, Live-stock (Exporters) Export Charge Act, Live-stock (Producers) Export Charges Act, Live-stock Slaughter (Processors) Levy Act, Live-stock Transactions Levy Act and Primary Industries Levies and Charges Collection Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 106.

Charter of the United Nations Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 102.

Commerce (Trade Descriptions) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 100.

Corporations Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 109.

Customs Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 101.

Family Law Act—Rules of Court—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 117.

Financial Management and Accountability Act and Productivity Commission (Repeals, Transitional and Consequential Amendments) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 112.

Freedom of Information Act and Productivity Commission (Repeals, Transitional and Consequential Amendments) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 111.

Health Insurance Commission Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 103

Higher Education Funding Act—Determination 1998 No. T11.

Maternity Leave (Commonwealth Employees) Act and Productivity Commission (Repeals, Transitional and Consequential Amendments) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 113.

Migration Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 104.

Occupational Health and Safety (Commonwealth Employment) Act and Productivity Commission (Repeals, Transitional and Consequential Amendments) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 115.

Primary Industries and Energy Research and Development Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 105.

Productivity Commission (Repeals, Transitional and Consequential Amendments) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 110.

Public Service Act—Determinations 1998 Nos. 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, LES 19, LES 20, LES 21, LES 22.

Student and Youth Assistance Act—Determination 1998 No. 1.

Superannuation Industry (Supervision) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 108.

Superannuation (Productivity Benefit) Act and Productivity Commission (Repeals, Transitional and Consequential Amendments) Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 114.

Sydney Airport Demand Management Act—Determination 1998 Sydney Airport Compliance Scheme.

Tradesmen's Rights Regulation Act—Regulations—Statutory Rules 1998 No. 116.

#### ATTENDANCE

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr R. A. Cameron, Mr Campbell and Mr Hawker.

I. C. HARRIS

Clerk of the House of Representatives

1996-97-98

## HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 164

#### MAIN COMMITTEE

#### MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

MONDAY, 1 JUNE 1998

1 The Main Committee met at 8 p.m.

#### 2 APPROPRIATION BILL (NO. 1) 1998-99—BUDGET DEBATE

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—And on the amendment moved thereto by Mr G. J. Evans (Deputy Leader of the Opposition), viz.—That all words after "That" be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: "whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House notes that the Budget:

- (1) does nothing to redress the pain caused to ordinary Australian families, and those doing it hardest in our community, by the impact of successive Budget cuts on health, education, job programs, aged care, child care and many other government programs and services;
- (2) by seeking to achieve surplus on the basis of savage Budget cuts, rather than on growth and job creation, does nothing to give hope to the unemployed and underemployed;
- (3) confirms that the Opposition's alternative Budget strategy, as originally announced in 1996, would have returned the Budget to surplus in 1998-99—on the basis of putting growth and jobs first, with much more moderate outlays reductions;
- (4) lacks credibility in its growth, employment and current account deficit forecasts;
- (5) confirms that Australia has a private rather than public saving problem—and the stupidity of the Coalition's promise-breaking decision in 1997 to abandon Labor's superannuation co-contribution; and
- (6) is incomplete and misleading in its projections of future revenue and outlays, in that it makes no provision for election-driven new expenditures and the Government's GST and other tax proposals"—

Debate resumed.

Suspension of sitting

At 8.50 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

Resumption of sitting

At 9.03 p.m. the proceedings were resumed.

Debate continued.

Mr Reid was granted leave to continue his speech when the debate is resumed.

Debate adjourned, and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

#### **3 ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Mr Anthony, the Main Committee adjourned at 10.16 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 4.30 p.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

**B. C. WRIGHT** Clerk of the Main Committee

Printed by Authority by the Commonwealth Government Printer