

1996

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

**VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 13

TUESDAY, 28 MAY 1996

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. The Speaker (the Honourable Bob Halverson) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

**2 QUESTIONS**

Questions without notice were asked.

**3 PAPER**

Mr Latham, by leave, after putting a question to the Speaker, presented the following paper:

Plagiarism allegations—Letter from the Speaker to Mr Latham, 27 May 1996.

**4 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED**

Mr Latham moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Member for Werriwa moving forthwith—That this House:

- (1) rejects the Member for Cowan's assertion that all Members of the House of Representatives are guilty of plagiarism;
- (2) expresses its concern at the plagiarism of published material by the Member for Cowan on 23 May and calls on him to apologise to the House;
- (3) notes that this practice is not consistent with the Prime Minister's call, supported by the Speaker, for a higher standard of parliamentary debate; and
- (4) calls on the Procedure Committee, once appointed, to report on an appropriate standing order to deal with the plagiarism of published material by Members.

*Closure of Member moved:* Mr Charles moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put and negatived.

Debate continued.

The time allowed by standing order 91 for debate on the motion having expired—

Question—put.

The House divided (the Second Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

AYES, 46

Mr Adams	Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Evans	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price
Mr Andren	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr McClelland	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Ms Macklin	Mr Sercombe
Mr Bevis	Mr E. L. Grace*	Mr McLeay	Mr Tanner
Mr Breton	Mr Griffin	Mr McMullan	Dr Theophanous
Mr Brown	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mr Campbell	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr Willis
Mr Crean	Mr Jones	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Wilton
Mrs Crosio	Mr Kerr	Mr P. F. Morris	
Ms Ellis	Mr Langmore	Mr Mossfield	

NOES, 92

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lieberman	Mr Ruddock
Mr Anderson	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr Lindsay	Mr Scott
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sharp
Mr Anthony	Mr Filing	Mr McArthur*	Mr Sinclair
Mrs Bailey	Mr Fischer	Mr McDougall	Mr Slipper
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest	Mr McGauran	Mr A. C. Smith
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr McLachlan	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mr Marek	Mr Somlyay
Mrs Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr Miles	Dr Southcott
Mr Bradford	Mr Georgiou	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Broadbent	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Brough	Ms Hanson	Mr Mutch	Mr Taylor
Mr Cadman	Mr Hardgrave	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr E. H. Cameron	Mr Hawker	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr R. A. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Causley	Mr Hockey	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Charles	Ms Jeanes	Mr Prosser	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr Cobb	Mrs Johnston	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Costello	Mr Jull	Mr Randall	Mrs West
Mr Dondas	Mr Katter	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Downer	Mrs D. M. Kelly	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mrs Draper	Miss J. M. Kelly	Mr Rocher	Ms Worth
Mrs Elson	Dr Kemp	Mr Ronaldson	Mr Zammit

\* Tellers

And so it was negatived.

## 5 PAPERS

The following papers were presented:

Employment, Education and Training Act—National Board of Employment, Education and Training—Higher Education Council—10th report, including the

Board's comments, on the operation of section 14 of the *Higher Education Funding Act 1988* and the Higher Education Contribution Scheme.

Petition not in accord with standing and sessional orders of the House—Gun control (Mr E. H. Cameron, 40 petitioners).

#### 6 AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL—35TH ANNIVERSARY—MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

Mr Ruddock (Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs), by leave, made a ministerial statement concerning the celebration today of the 35th anniversary of Amnesty International.

Mr Brereton, by leave, also made a statement in connection with the matter.

#### 7 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE— EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITY FOR YOUNG AUSTRALIANS

The House was informed that Mr P. J. Baldwin had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, "The impact of the Government's policies on educational opportunity for young Australians, particularly in regional Australia".

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Mr P. J. Baldwin rising to address the House—

Mr Ruddock (Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Second Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

AYES, 86

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sinclair
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McDougall	Mr A. C. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Fahey	Mr McGauran	Mr W. L. Smith
Mrs Bailey	Mr Fischer	Mr Marek	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest	Mr Miles	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mrs Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr Mutch	Mr Taylor
Mr Bradford	Mr Georgiou	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Broadbent	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr E. H. Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Prosser	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr R. A. Cameron	Ms Jeanes	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Mrs Johnston	Mr Randall	Mrs West
Mr Charles	Mr Jull	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Katter	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Costello	Miss J. M. Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Dondas	Dr Kemp	Mr Ruddock	Mr Zammit
Mr Downer	Mr Lieberman	Mr Scott	
Mrs Draper	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sharp	

## NOES, 47

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Beddall	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Rocher
Mr Bevis	Mr E. L. Grace*	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Breton	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brown	Ms Hanson	Mr McMullan	Mr Tanner
Mr Campbell	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mrs Crosio	Mr Jones	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Wilton
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Langmore	Mr Mossfield	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

## 8 SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED

Mr Crean moved—That so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Member for Sydney from debating the Government's policies on educational opportunity for young Australians, particularly in regional Australia.

*Closure of Member:* Mr Reith (Leader of the House) moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Second Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 86

Mr Abbott	Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sinclair
Mr Anderson	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Slipper
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McArthur*	Mr A. C. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Fahey	Mr McDougall	Mr W. L. Smith
Mrs Bailey	Mr Fischer	Mr Marek	Mr Somlyay
Mr Barresi	Mr Forrest	Mr Miles	Dr Southcott
Mr Bartlett	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Billson	Ms Gambaro	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mrs Bishop	Mrs Gash	Mr Mutch	Mr Taylor
Mr Bradford	Mr Georgiou	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Broadbent	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr E. H. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Prosser	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr R. A. Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Ms Jeanes	Mr Randall	Mrs West
Mr Charles	Mrs Johnston	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Dondas	Miss J. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock	Mr Zammit
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott	
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr Sharp	

## NOES, 47

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Albanese	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price
Mr Andren	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Rocher
Mr Beddall	Mr E. L. Grace*	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brown	Ms Hanson	Mr McMullan	Mr Tanner
Mr Campbell	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mrs Crosio	Mr Jones	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Wilton
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Langmore	Mr Mossfield	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Mr P. J. Baldwin (seconder) addressing the House—

*Closure of Member:* Mr Reith moved—That the Member be not further heard.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Second Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 85

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lloyd	Mr Slipper
Mr Anderson	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr McArthur*	Mr A. C. Smith
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr McDougall	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr Marek	Mr Somlyay
Mrs Bailey	Mr Forrest	Mr Miles	Dr Southcott
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gallus	Mr Moore	Mrs Stone
Mr Bartlett	Ms Gambaro	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mr Mutch	Mr Taylor
Mrs Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mr Nairn	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Bradford	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Nehl	Mr Truss
Mr Broadbent	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Tuckey
Mr Brough	Mr Hawker	Mr Nugent	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Cadman	Mr Hicks*	Mr Prosser	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr E. H. Cameron	Mr Hockey	Mr Pyne	Mr Wakelin
Mr Causley	Ms Jeanes	Mr Randall	Mrs West
Mr Charles	Mrs Johnston	Mr Reid	Mr Williams
Mr Cobb	Mr Jull	Mr Reith	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Costello	Mr Katter	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mr Dondas	Miss J. M. Kelly	Mr Ruddock	Mr Zammit
Mr Downer	Dr Kemp	Mr Scott	
Mrs Draper	Mr Lieberman	Mr Sharp	
Mrs Elson	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sinclair	

## NOES, 46

Mr Adams	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr Price
Mr Albanese	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Quick
Mr Andren	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Rocher
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr E. L. Grace*	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Beddall	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Bevis	Ms Hanson	Mr McMullan	Mr Tanner
Mr Brown	Mr Holding	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Melham	Mr K. J. Thomson
Mrs Crosio	Mr Jones	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Wilton
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Langmore	Mr Mossfield	
Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr O'Keefe	

\* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

Question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—put.

The House divided (the Second Deputy Speaker, Mr Jenkins, in the Chair)—

## AYES, 44

Mr Adams	Mr M. J. Evans	Mr Latham	Mr Mossfield
Mr Albanese	Mr L. D. T. Ferguson	Dr Lawrence	Mr O'Keefe
Mr Andren	Mr M. J. Ferguson	Mr Lee	Mr Price
Mr P. J. Baldwin	Mr Fitzgibbon	Mr McClelland	Mr Quick
Mr Beddall	Mr E. L. Grace*	Ms Macklin	Mr Sawford*
Mr Bevis	Mr Griffin	Mr McLeay	Mr Sercombe
Mr Brown	Mr Holding	Mr McMullan	Mr Tanner
Mr Crean	Mr Hollis	Mr Martin	Dr Theophanous
Mrs Crosio	Mr Jones	Mr Melham	Mr K. J. Thomson
Ms Ellis	Mr Kerr	Mr A. A. Morris	Mr Willis
Mr G. J. Evans	Mr Langmore	Mr P. F. Morris	Mr Wilton

## NOES, 87

Mr Abbott	Mr Entsch	Mr Lindsay	Mr Sharp
Mr Anderson	Mr R. D. C. Evans	Mr Lloyd	Mr Sinclair
Mr K. J. Andrews	Mr Fahey	Mr McArthur*	Mr Slipper
Mr Anthony	Mr Fischer	Mr McDougall	Mr A. C. Smith
Mrs Bailey	Mr Forrest	Mr Marek	Mr W. L. Smith
Mr Barresi	Mrs Gallus	Mr Miles	Mr Somlyay
Mr Bartlett	Ms Gambaro	Mr Moore	Dr Southcott
Mr Billson	Mrs Gash	Mrs Moylan	Mrs Stone
Mrs Bishop	Mr Georgiou	Mr Mutch	Mrs Sullivan
Mr Bradford	Mrs E. J. Grace	Mr Nairn	Mr Taylor
Mr Broadbent	Ms Hanson	Mr Nehl	Mr A. P. Thomson
Mr Brough	Mr Hardgrave	Dr Nelson	Mr Truss
Mr Cadman	Mr Hawker	Mr Nugent	Mr Tuckey
Mr E. H. Cameron	Mr Hicks*	Mr Prosser	Mr M. A. J. Vaile
Mr Causley	Mr Hockey	Mr Pyne	Ms D. S. Vale
Mr Charles	Ms Jeanes	Mr Randall	Mr Wakelin
Mr Cobb	Mrs Johnston	Mr Reid	Mrs West
Mr Costello	Mr Jull	Mr Reith	Mr Williams
Mr Dondas	Mr Katter	Mr Rocher	Dr Wooldridge
Mr Downer	Miss J. M. Kelly	Mr Ronaldson	Ms Worth
Mrs Draper	Dr Kemp	Mr Ruddock	Mr Zammit
Mrs Elson	Mr Lieberman	Mr Scott	

\* Tellers

And so it was negated.

#### 9 MESSAGE FROM THE SENATE—HEALTH LEGISLATION (POWERS OF INVESTIGATION) AMENDMENT BILL 1996

Message No. 7, dated 27 May 1996, from the Senate was reported transmitting for the concurrence of the House a Bill for an Act to amend the *Health Legislation (Powers of Investigation) Amendment Act 1994* and the *Human Services and Health Legislation Amendment Act (No. 3) 1995*.

Bill read a first time.

Ordered—That the second reading be made an order of the day for the next sitting.

#### 10 HOUSING ASSISTANCE BILL 1996

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—*And on the amendment moved thereto by Ms Macklin, viz.*—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House is of the opinion that agreements entered into under the proposed Act should—

- (1) operate for up to 3 years from 1 July 1996;
- (2) involve Commonwealth funding of \$1 067 863 000 in each of those three years, to be distributed on the same (approximately per capita) basis as existing Commonwealth State Housing Agreement (CSHA) funds; and

Preamble agreed to.

Title agreed to.

Bill agreed to.

Consideration in detail concluded.

On the motion of Mr Ruddock (Minister representing the Minister for Social Security), by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

#### 11 SELECTION COMMITTEE—REPORT

Mr Nehl (Chair) presented the following paper:

Selection Committee—Report relating to the consideration of committee and delegation reports and private Members' business on Monday, 17 June 1996.

#### 12 AIRPORTS BILL 1996

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed by Mr Tanner who moved, as an amendment—That all words after “That” be omitted with a view to substituting the following words: “whilst not declining to give the Bill a second reading, the House is of the opinion that:

- (1) no sales should occur until all Environmental Impact Statement processes are completed and the future of Sydney West Airport is resolved;
- (2) in order to ensure that the Commonwealth achieves the maximum lease payments possible as a result of the processes set out in the Airports Bill and the Airports (Transitional) Bill, Sydney (Kingsford-Smith) Airport should be included in the first tranche of airports outlined in the Minister for Finance's second reading speech for the Airports (Transitional) Bill, rather than be offered for leasehold sale at some later time; and
- (3) the road and other infrastructure developments associated with the Badgerys Creek proposal should proceed where appropriate, regardless of whether Sydney West Airport is built at Badgerys Creek”.

Debate continued.

Ordered—That Miss J. M. Kelly be granted an extension of time.

Debate continued.

Mr Price addressing the House—

---

#### 13 ADJOURNMENT

It being 10.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

Question—put and passed.

And then the House, at 11 p.m., adjourned until tomorrow at 9.30 a.m.

---



**ATTENDANCE**

All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr J. N. Andrew, Mr Neville, Mr O'Connor and Mr S. F. Smith.

---

---

**L. M. BARLIN**

Clerk of the House of Representatives

1996

**HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES**  
**SUPPLEMENT TO VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS**

No. 13

**MAIN COMMITTEE****MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**

TUESDAY, 28 MAY 1996

---

1 Due to divisions having been called in the House, the Main Committee met at 5.12 p.m.

**2 SUPPLY BILL (NO. 1) 1996-97**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Mr Jones having been called upon to speak—

Mr Rocher moved—That the Member for Moore be now heard.

Question—put and passed.

Debate continued.

---

*Suspension of sitting:* At 8.52 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of sitting:* At 9.10 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---

Debate continued.

---

*Suspension of sitting:* At 9.11 p.m., a division having been called in the House, the proceedings were suspended.

*Resumption of sitting:* At 9.26 p.m., the proceedings were resumed.

---

Debate continued.

Debate adjourned (Mr M. A. J. Vaile), and the resumption of the debate made an order of the day for the next sitting.

**3 ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion of Mr M. A. J. Vaile, the Main Committee adjourned at 10.50 p.m.

The Deputy Speaker fixed tomorrow at 10 a.m. for the next meeting of the Main Committee.

---

**I. C. HARRIS**  
Clerk of the Main Committee