

THE PARLIAMENT OF THE COMMONWEALTH OF AUSTRALIA

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

No. 58

MONDAY, 15 APRIL 1991

1 The House met, at 2 p.m., pursuant to adjournment. Mr Speaker (the Honourable Leo McLeay) took the Chair, and read Prayers.

2 **QUESTIONS:** Questions without notice were asked.

3 **SUSPENSION OF STANDING AND SESSIONAL ORDERS MOVED:** Dr Hewson (Leader of the Opposition), by leave, moved—That, despite his selective answers in the House today, so much of the standing and sessional orders be suspended as would prevent the Prime Minister from giving forthwith to this House a full account of the processes involved in the Government's decision in the 1987 election campaign not to impose a gold tax during the term of the next government, including what undertakings were given by the Prime Minister to Mr Connell and others.

Debate ensued.

Ordered—That Mr Hawke (Prime Minister) be granted an extension of time.

Debate continued.

Closure: Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the question be now put.

Question—That the question be now put—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr R. F. Edwards, in the Chair)—

AYES, 70

| | | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----------------|----------------|
| Mr Baldwin | Mr Duncan | Mr Johns | Mr Punch |
| Mr Beazley | Mr Elliott | Mr Jones | Mr Sawford |
| Mr Beddall | Ms Fatin | Mr Keating | Mr Scholes |
| Mr Bevis | Mr Ferguson | Mrs Kelly | Mr Sciacca |
| Mr Bilney | Mr Fitzgibbon | Mr Kerin | Mr J. L. Scott |
| Dr Blewett | Mr Free | Mr Kerr | Mr L. J. Scott |
| Mr R. J. Brown | Mr Gear* | Mr Langmore | Mr Simmons |
| Mr Campbell | Mr Gibson | Mr Lavarch | Mr Snow |
| Dr Catley | Mr Grace* | Mr Lee | Mr Snowdon |
| Dr Charlesworth | Mr Griffiths | Mr Lindsay | Mr Staples |
| Mr Courtice | Mr Hand | Ms McHugh | Dr Theophanous |
| Ms Crawford | Mr Hawke | Mr Martin | Mr Tickner |
| Mr Crean | Mr Hollis | Mr Melham | Mr West |
| Mrs Crosio | Mr Howe | Mr P. F. Morris | Mr Willis |
| Mrs Darling | Mr Hulls | Mr Newell | Mr H. F. Woods |
| Mr Dawkins | Mr Humphreys | Mr O'Keefe | Mr Wright |
| Mr Dubois | Mrs Jakobsen | Mr O'Neil | |
| Mr Duffy | Mr Jenkins | Mr Price | |

NOES, 66

| | | | |
|----------------|------------------|--------------|----------------|
| Mr Anderson | Mr Cowan | Dr Kemp | Mr Ronaldson |
| Mr Andrew* | Mr Dobie | Mr Lloyd | Mr Ruddock |
| Mr Atkinson | Mr Downer | Mr McArthur | Mr B. C. Scott |
| Mrs Bailey | Mr Fife | Mr McGauran | Mr Shack |
| Mr Beale | Mr Filing | Mr Mack | Mr Sharp |
| Mr Bradford | Mr T. A. Fischer | Mr MacKellar | Mr Sinclair |
| Mr Braithwaite | Mr P. S. Fisher | Mr McLachlan | Mr Smith |
| Mr Broadbent | Mr Ford | Mr Miles | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Burr | Mrs Gallus | Mr Moore | Mr Taylor |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Goodluck | Mr Nehl | Mr Truss |
| Mr Cameron | Mr Hall | Mr Nugent | Mr Tuckey |
| Mr Carlton | Mr Halverson | Mr Peacock | Mr Webster |
| Mr Chaney | Mr Hawker | Mr Prosser | Mr Wilson |
| Mr Charles | Dr Hewson | Mr Reid | Dr R. L. Woods |
| Mr Cobb | Mr Hicks* | Mr Reith | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mr Connolly | Mr Howard | Mr Riggall | |
| Mr Costello | Mr Jull | Mr Rocher | |

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

And the question—That the motion for the suspension of standing and sessional orders be agreed to—being accordingly put—

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr R. F. Edwards, in the Chair)—

AYES, 65

| | | | |
|----------------|------------------|--------------|----------------|
| Mr Anderson | Mr Cowan | Dr Kemp | Mr Ruddock |
| Mr Andrew* | Mr Dobie | Mr Lloyd | Mr B. C. Scott |
| Mr Atkinson | Mr Downer | Mr McArthur | Mr Shack |
| Mrs Bailey | Mr Fife | Mr McGauran | Mr Sharp |
| Mr Beale | Mr Filing | Mr MacKellar | Mr Sinclair |
| Mr Bradford | Mr T. A. Fischer | Mr McLachlan | Mr Smith |
| Mr Braithwaite | Mr P. S. Fisher | Mr Miles | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Broadbent | Mr Ford | Mr Moore | Mr Taylor |
| Mr Burr | Mrs Gallus | Mr Nehl | Mr Truss |
| Mr Cadman | Mr Goodluck | Mr Nugent | Mr Tuckey |
| Mr Cameron | Mr Hall | Mr Peacock | Mr Webster |
| Mr Carlton | Mr Halverson | Mr Prosser | Mr Wilson |
| Mr Chaney | Mr Hawker | Mr Reid | Dr R. L. Woods |
| Mr Charles | Dr Hewson | Mr Reith | Dr Wooldridge |
| Mr Cobb | Mr Hicks* | Mr Riggall | |
| Mr Connolly | Mr Howard | Mr Rocher | |
| Mr Costello | Mr Jull | Mr Ronaldson | |

NOES, 71

| | | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----------------|----------------|
| Mr Baldwin | Mr Duncan | Mr Johns | Mr Price |
| Mr Beazley | Mr Elliott | Mr Jones | Mr Punch |
| Mr Beddall | Ms Fatin | Mr Keating | Mr Sawford |
| Mr Bevis | Mr Ferguson | Mrs Kelly | Mr Scholes |
| Mr Bilney | Mr Fitzgibbon | Mr Kerin | Mr Sciacca |
| Dr Blewett | Mr Free | Mr Kerr | Mr J. L. Scott |
| Mr R. J. Brown | Mr Gear* | Mr Langmore | Mr L. J. Scott |
| Mr Campbell | Mr Gibson | Mr Lavarch | Mr Simmons |
| Dr Catley | Mr Grace* | Mr Lee | Mr Snow |
| Dr Charlesworth | Mr Griffiths | Mr Lindsay | Mr Snowdon |
| Mr Courtice | Mr Hand | Ms McHugh | Mr Staples |
| Ms Crawford | Mr Hawke | Mr Mack | Dr Theophanous |
| Mr Crean | Mr Hollis | Mr Martin | Mr Tickner |
| Mrs Crosio | Mr Howe | Mr Melham | Mr West |
| Mrs Darling | Mr Hulls | Mr P. F. Morris | Mr Willis |
| Mr Dawkins | Mr Humphreys | Mr Newell | Mr H. F. Woods |
| Mr Dubois | Mrs Jakobsen | Mr O'Keefe | Mr Wright |
| Mr Duffy | Mr Jenkins | Mr O'Neil | |

* Tellers

And so it was negated.

4 AUDITOR-GENERAL'S REPORT—PUBLICATION OF PAPER: The Deputy Speaker, for Mr Speaker, presented the following paper:

Audit Act—Auditor-General—Audit report No. 23 of 1990-91—
Implementation of program evaluation: Stage 1.

Mr Beazley (Leader of the House), by leave, moved—That:

(1) this House, in accordance with the provisions of the *Parliamentary Papers Act 1908*, authorises the publication of the Auditor-General's audit report No. 23 of 1990-91; and

(2) the report be printed.

Question—put and passed.

5 PAPER: The following paper was presented:

Employment, Education and Training Act—National Board of Employment, Education and Training—Report—Response to the Review of the Institute of Advanced Studies, dated April 1991.

6 PROPOSED DISCUSSION OF MATTER OF PUBLIC IMPORTANCE—MINISTER FOR EMPLOYMENT, EDUCATION AND TRAINING: The House was informed that Dr Kemp had proposed that a definite matter of public importance be submitted to the House for discussion, namely, “The damage resulting from the prolonged mismanagement of the export of education, and of the education portfolio, by the Minister for Employment, Education and Training”.

The proposed discussion having received the necessary support—

Dr Kemp rising to address the House—

Mr Beazley (Leader of the House) moved—That the business of the day be called on.

Question—put.

The House divided (the Deputy Speaker, Mr R. F. Edwards, in the Chair)—

AYES, 70

| | | | |
|-----------------|---------------|-----------------|----------------|
| Mr Baldwin | Mr Duncan | Mr Jones | Mr Punch |
| Mr Beazley | Mr Elliott | Mr Keating | Mr Sawford |
| Mr Beddall | Ms Fatin | Mrs Kelly | Mr Scholes |
| Mr Bevis | Mr Ferguson | Mr Kerin | Mr Sciacca |
| Mr Bilney | Mr Fitzgibbon | Mr Kerr | Mr J. L. Scott |
| Dr Blewett | Mr Free | Mr Langmore | Mr L. J. Scott |
| Mr R. J. Brown | Mr Gear* | Mr Lavarch | Mr Simmons |
| Mr Campbell | Mr Gibson | Mr Lee | Mr Snow |
| Dr Catley | Mr Grace* | Mr Lindsay | Mr Snowdon |
| Dr Charlesworth | Mr Griffiths | Ms McHugh | Mr Staples |
| Mr Courtice | Mr Hand | Mr Mack | Dr Theophanous |
| Ms Crawford | Mr Hollis | Mr Martin | Mr Tickner |
| Mr Crean | Mr Howe | Mr Melham | Mr West |
| Mrs Crosio | Mr Hulls | Mr P. F. Morris | Mr Willis |
| Mrs Darling | Mr Humphreys | Mr Newell | Mr H. F. Woods |
| Mr Dawkins | Mrs Jakobsen | Mr O'Keefe | Mr Wright |
| Mr Dubois | Mr Jenkins | Mr O'Neil | |
| Mr Duffy | Mr Johns | Mr Price | |

NOES, 64

| | | | |
|----------------|------------------|--------------|----------------|
| Mr Anderson | Mr Costello | Mr Jull | Mr Rocher |
| Mr Andrew* | Mr Cowan | Dr Kemp | Mr Ronaldson |
| Mr Atkinson | Mr Dobie | Mr Lloyd | Mr Ruddock |
| Mrs Bailey | Mr Downer | Mr McArthur | Mr B. C. Scott |
| Mr Beale | Mr Fife | Mr McGauran | Mr Shack |
| Mr Bradford | Mr Filing | Mr MacKellar | Mr Sharp |
| Mr Braithwaite | Mr T. A. Fischer | Mr McLachlan | Mr Sinclair |
| Mr Broadbent | Mr P. S. Fisher | Mr Miles | Mr Smith |
| Mr Burr | Mr Ford | Mr Moore | Mr Somlyay |
| Mr Cadman | Mrs Gallus | Mr Nehl | Mr Taylor |
| Mr Cameron | Mr Goodluck | Mr Nugent | Mr Truss |
| Mr Carlton | Mr Hall | Mr Peacock | Mr Tuckey |
| Mr Chaney | Mr Halverson | Mr Prosser | Mr Webster |
| Mr Charles | Mr Hawker | Mr Reid | Mr Wilson |
| Mr Cobb | Mr Hicks* | Mr Reith | Dr R. L. Woods |
| Mr Connolly | Mr Howard | Mr Riggall | Dr Wooldridge |

* Tellers

And so it was resolved in the affirmative.

- 7 **MILITARY SUPERANNUATION AND BENEFITS BILL 1991:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Message from the Governor-General: Message No. 118, dated 20 March 1991, from His Excellency the Governor-General was announced recommending an appropriation of revenue for the purposes of the Bill.

The House resolved itself into a committee of the whole.

In the committee

Bill, by leave, taken as a whole.

On the motion of Mr Bilney (Minister for Defence Science and Personnel), the following amendment was made, after debate: Clause 30, page 11, lines 36-38, omit “if the member has become subject to a return of service obligation after the commencement of the first-mentioned period”, substitute “if, at the time when, or at any time after, the benefit becomes or became payable, the member is, or was, subject to a return of service obligation”.

Bill, as amended, agreed to.

Bill to be reported with an amendment.

The House resumed; Mr MacKellar reported accordingly.

On the motion of Mr Bilney, by leave, the House adopted the report, and, by leave, the Bill was read a third time.

- 8 **DEFENCE FORCE SUPERANNUATION LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1991:**

The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Question—put and passed—Bill read a second time.

Leave granted for third reading to be moved forthwith.

On the motion of Mr Bilney (Minister for Defence Science and Personnel), the Bill was read a third time.

- 9 **MESSAGES FROM THE SENATE:** Messages from the Senate were reported returning the following Bills without amendment:

15 April 1991—Message—

No. 196—Sales Tax Laws Amendment (No. 1) 1991.

No. 197—Sales Tax Laws Amendment (No. 2) 1991.

No. 198—Higher Education Funding Amendment 1991.

No. 199—States Grants (TAFE Assistance) Amendment 1991.

- 10 **BOUNTY LEGISLATION AMENDMENT BILL 1991:** The order of the day having been read for the resumption of the debate on the question—That the Bill be now read a second time—

Debate resumed.

-
- 11 **ADJOURNMENT:** It being approximately 10.30 p.m.—The question was proposed—That the House do now adjourn.

Debate ensued.

The House continuing to sit until 11 p.m.—Mr Speaker adjourned the House until tomorrow at 2 p.m.

PAPERS: The following papers were deemed to have been presented on 15 April 1991:

Civil Aviation Act—Civil Aviation Regulations—Civil Aviation Orders—

Part 20—Amendment, dated 5 April 1991.

Part 40—Amendment, dated 11 April 1991.

Part 48—Amendment, dated 9 April 1991.

Part 103—Amendment, dated 5 April 1991.

Export Control Act—Export Control (Orders) Regulations—Orders—1991—
No. 1—Export Control (Fresh Fruits and Vegetables) as amended
(Amendment).

Health Insurance Act—Determination pursuant to subsection 23DU (1),
dated 14 March 1991.

Public Service Act—Determinations—1991—Nos. 26, 37, 39, 41, 43, 44.

ATTENDANCE: All Members attended (at some time during the sitting) except Mr Aldred, Dr H. R. Edwards, Mr Gorman, Mrs Sullivan and Mr Walker.

L. M. BARLIN
Clerk of the House of Representatives