

---

The Parliament of the Commonwealth of Australia

# **Remediation of Defence Land at Neutral Bay, Sydney, NSW**

Parliamentary Standing Committee on Public Works

8 February 2001  
Canberra

---

© Commonwealth of Australia 2001

ISBN [Click **here** and type ISBN Number]



# Contents

Membership of the Committee.....	vii
Extract from the Votes and Proceedings of the House of Representatives .....	ix
List of abbreviations.....	xi
List of recommendations.....	xiii

## REPORT

<b>1 Introduction.....</b>	<b>1</b>
Inquiry process.....	1
Scope of the proposal.....	2
Site location and description .....	2
The cost.....	3
History of site.....	4
<b>2 Decision of the Land and Environment Court of New South Wales .....</b>	<b>7</b>
Summary .....	7
Relevant legislation.....	7
Background.....	8
The major issues in the Judgment .....	10
Open space .....	10
The design of the development and its visual impact .....	12
Contaminated lands .....	12
Issues arising from the judgement.....	13

---

<b>3</b>	<b>The need for the work .....</b>	<b>15</b>
	Introduction.....	15
	Contamination of site.....	15
	Commonwealth liability .....	17
	Liability for contamination from the lora site .....	20
	Conclusions .....	21
<b>4</b>	<b>Environmental remediation .....</b>	<b>23</b>
	Introduction.....	23
	Remediation options .....	23
	Outline of proposed remediation.....	24
	Environmental benefits and impacts.....	25
	Conclusion .....	28
<b>5</b>	<b>Cost.....</b>	<b>29</b>
	Independent audit.....	30
	GST .....	32
	Haulage of waste materials .....	32
	Low density option.....	33
<b>6</b>	<b>Heritage issues .....</b>	<b>37</b>
	Introduction.....	37
	The Retort House.....	38
	The cliff line.....	40
<b>7</b>	<b>Community consultation process.....</b>	<b>43</b>
	Introduction.....	43
	Adequacy of consultation process.....	44
<b>8</b>	<b>The wharf.....</b>	<b>47</b>
	Introduction.....	47
	Condition of the wharf .....	47
	Future of the wharf .....	48
<b>9</b>	<b>Conclusions and recommendation.....</b>	<b>51</b>

---

**APPENDICES**

<b>Appendix A—Witnesses.....</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>Appendix B—List of Submissions .....</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>Appendix C—Plan of Site and Location of Naval Structures .....</b>	<b>57</b>





## **Membership of the Committee**

**Chair**            Hon Judi Moylan MP

**Deputy Chair**   Hon Janice Crosio MBE, MP

**Members**        **House of Representatives**

Mr John Forrest MP

Mr Colin Hollis MP

Mr Peter Lindsay MP

Mr Bernie Ripoll MP

**Senate**

Senator Paul Calvert

Senator Alan Ferguson

Senator Shayne Murphy

## **Sectional Committee**

**Chair**            Hon Judi Moylan MP

**Members**        **House of Representatives**

Mr Peter Lindsay MP

**Senate**

Senator Shayne Murphy

## **Committee Secretariat**

Secretary                      Mr Trevor Rowe

Inquiry Secretary              Mr Ian Ireland

Administrative Officer        Ms Maria Pappas





# **Extract from the Votes and Proceedings of the House of Representatives**

**No. 130 dated Thursday, 17 August 2000**

23 PUBLIC WORKS-PARLIAMENTARY STANDING COMMITTEE-REFERENCE  
OF WORK-REMEDICATION OF DEFENCE LAND AT NEUTRAL BAY, SYDNEY

Mr Slipper (Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Finance and Administration), pursuant to notice, moved-That, in accordance with the provisions of the *Public Works Committee Act 1969*, the following proposed work be referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Public Works for consideration and report: Remediation of Defence land at Neutral Bay, Sydney.

Question-put and passed.





## List of abbreviations

BTEX	Benzene, Toluene, Ethylene and Xylene
CLMA	<i>Contaminated Lands Management Act 1997 (NSW)</i>
CRG	Community Reference Group
DCP	Development Control Plan
DoD	Department of Defence
EPA	New South Wales Environmental Protection Authority
EPAA	<i>Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 (NSW)</i>
LEC	Land and Environment Court of New South Wales
NSLEP	North Sydney Local Environment Plan
PAH	Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons
RAN	Royal Australian Navy
RANTME	Royal Australian Navy Torpedo Maintenance Engineering
TPH	Total petroleum hydrocarbons
TRG	Technical Reference Group





## List of recommendations

### Recommendation 1

The Committee recommends that the Minister for Defence write to the New South Wales Environment Protection Authority requesting that the Authority consider issuing an investigation order under Part 3 of the *Contaminated Land Management Act 1997* (NSW) in respect of the Iora residential site, after the former *HMAS Platypus* site is remediated. (Paragraph 3.25)

### Recommendation 2

The Committee recommends that the Department of Defence investigate the possibility of being compensated for any damage caused by the migration onto the former *HMAS Platypus* site of off-site contaminants, and costs associated with remediation and installation of a management system for such contaminants. (Paragraph 3.26)

### Recommendation 3

The Committee recommends in respect of future submissions relating to land remediation, that the Department of Defence and other agencies provide the Committee, in the interest of public accountability and transparency, with an independent audit of the project's budget. (Paragraph 5.10)

### Recommendation 4

The Committee recommends that the excavation of the cliff line at the former *HMAS Platypus* site proposed by Department of Defence proceed after features of heritage value, identified by Australian Heritage Commission have been photographed and appropriately documented. This should be done in consultation with the Australian Heritage Commission and the Australian National Archives. (Paragraph 6.22)

**Recommendation 5**

The Committee recommends the excavation of the cliff line at the former *HMAS Platypus* site proposed by the Department of Defence proceed, to the extent that the cliff's profile reproduces the basic vertical character of the current cliff line. (Paragraph 6.23)

**Recommendation 6**

The Committee recommends that the Department of Defence consider establishing a web site for the purposes of keeping the community informed of the project's status, promoting the benefits of the project and facilitating the project's implementation. (Paragraph 7.10)

**Recommendation 7**

The Committee recommends that the Department of Defence establish a complaint-response mechanism in order that complaints concerning the proposed works can be effectively and efficiently addressed. (Paragraph 7.11)

**Recommendation 8**

The Committee recommends that the Department of Defence:

- continue discussions with the New South Wales Waterways Authority as to the future of the wharf at former *HMAS Platypus* with a view to resolving the issue as quickly as possible; and
- provide the Committee, within 12 months, with a report detailing Department of Defence plans with respect to the future of the wharf at former *HMAS Platypus*. (Paragraph 8.9)

**Recommendation 9**

The Committee recommends that the proposed remediation of Defence land at Neutral Bay, Sydney, New South Wales proceed at a cost of \$16.5 million. (Paragraph 9.7)

