

Subject: Supplementary Submission to the Economics Committee tin relation to saving for under 40 s

## Good afternoon

Please find attached our supplementary submission to the Economics Committee in relation to the inquiry into saving for under 40s.

At the public hearing on the 18 th of October in Sydney, TOWER was asked to provide:

- additional information in relation to Reasonable Benefit Limits; and
- modelling that compares negative gearing and superannuation.

Should the Committee need to talk about this in more length, either Grahame Evans or myself would be happy to provide more information.

Regards

## Carly O'Keefe

Manager, Sales Marketing - Superannuation
Distribution and Sales Marketing
TOWER Australia Limited
80 Alfred Street Milsons Point NSW 2061 Australia
Phone: $\quad+61294489181$
Fax: $\quad+61294489399$
Email: Carly.Okeefe@au.towerlimited.com
Website:

## Submission to the Standing Committee on Economics, Finance and Public Administration

Inquiry into improving the superannuation savings of people under 40

## TOWER Supplementary Material

## Reasonable Benefit Limit Statistics

TOWER was asked to provide more detail on the amount of people that exceed their Reasonable Benefit Limit (RBL).

The ATO in their Annual Report 2004 - 2005 provided the following commentary in relation to RBLs:
"We currently hold details of approximately 11.7 million reportable reasonable benefit limit benefits, related to around 4.8 million individuals. Data holdings are increasing at the rate of around $8 \%$ a year. Last year we processed over 1 million benefit reports received from funds and employers. Since 1991, approximately $117,000^{1}$ individuals have received excessive determination notices, representing $2.4 \%$ of individuals who have a recorded benefit."
"The expected growth of Australia's aged population, the dynamic and innovative nature of the superannuation industry and the increased emphasis on financial planning for retirement will give rise to continuing challenges in administering the reasonable benefit limit law."

1. A further 23,000 individuals received interim excessive determinations' under which the whole benefit was deemed 'excessive' because we were unable to match a tax file number. Many of these interim determinations will not resuit in an additional income tax liability.

We believe this reinforces our position that the number of people that exceed their RBL is very small. It seems counterproductive to have such a significant amount of administration required when it does not generate much revenue and serves to make superannuation much more complex.

## Superannuation/Negatively Geared Investment Comparison.

## Commentary On The Methodology Used

The attached calculations compare the investor's situation over a twenty six year period under two investment choices:

## Choice1

The investor sacrifices a portion of pre tax salary into superannuation.
The calculation recognises that each amount of salary sacrifice received as a contribution will be taxed at the rate of fifteen percent.

The calculation assumes a percentage of income being derived by the superannuation fund in the form of franked dividends. The portion of the income distributed attributable to franked dividends is grossed up by the underlying franking credits, and taxed at the superannuation fund level. This liability is reduced by the franking credits. The excess of franking credits over this tax liability is used to reduce the superannuation fund's tax liability in respect of other income.

The income and capital gains derived by the superannuation fund will be taxed in the fund. The calculation assumes that the trustee will retain a portion of the distribution to pay tax, and reinvest the balance.

The income calculation provides for one third of concessionally taxed capital gains to be exempt from tax in the superannuation fund. The Model assumes that a portion of the superannuation fund's investment income will be taxed on this concessional basis. For comparison purposes, it is assumed that the managed investment under Option 2 will derive the same percentage of concessionally taxed gains.

It is assumed that the investment will be preserved until retirement. For the purposes of this comparison, it is assumed that retirement will occur after twenty six years at age 55.

The Model assumes that at age 55 , the following will occur:

- A portion of the payment will be tax free. The tax free portion will be the exempt portion in 2006 indexed over the twenty six year period.
- The portion falling between the tax free amount and the Lump Sum RBL will be taxed at the rate of 16.5 percent (including Medicare).
- A portion in excess of the Lump Sum RBL will be taxed at the investor's marginal rate. The Lump Sum RBL is the 2006 amount indexed over the twenty six year period.


## Choice 2

The investor takes the equivalent of the salary sacrifice in cash, and borrows a capital sum where the annual interest payment is equal to the amount sacrificed under the first choice. The loan proceeds are then used to purchase units in a managed investment.

The cash taken by the investor under the second choice is taxable, but there is an equal offset created by the benefit of an interest deduction.

The calculation assumes a percentage of income in the form of franked dividends. The portion of the income distributed attributable to franked dividends is grossed up by the underlying franking credits and taxed at the investor's marginal rate. This liability is reduced by the franking credit.

The income and capital gains derived by the managed fund will flow through to the investor, and be taxed in his/her hands. The calculation assumes that the investor will retain a portion of the distribution to pay tax and reinvest the balance.

The income calculation provides for fifty percent of concessionally taxed realised capital gains to be exempt from tax in the investor's hands. The Model assumes that a portion of the managed fund's realised investment income will be taxed on this concessional basis. For comparison purposes, it is assumed that the superannuation fund under Option 1 will derive the same percentage of concessionally taxed gains.

On termination of the investment, the units are redeemed and any excess of the sales proceeds over the cost of the investment including amounts reinvested will be subject to capital gains tax. Fifty percent of any taxable gain will be exempt from tax where the units are held for more than twelve months.

On termination of the investment, the capital sum borrowed is repaid and the proceeds on redemption reduced accordingly.

These investment choices are shown in two situations. The first situation is comparing the superannuation investment with a negatively geared managed investment. The second situation compares superannuation with a negatively geared property investment.

## Conclusions Reached

The negatively geared investment is generally more advantageous in the initial period. In the example using the maximum marginal rate, this period is thirteen years. This is due to:

- The higher investment levels offered by the borrowings being invested.
- The erosion of the investment balance in the superannuation option caused by the contributions tax.
- $50 \%$ CGT concession available to individuals as opposed to the one third concession available to superannuation funds.

In the latter period of the investment, the superannuation option sometimes becomes more attractive. The full effect of the following is then felt:

- The concessional tax rate of fifteen percent.
- The use of excess franking credits to shelter tax on other income.

Any tax payable on withdrawal from the superannuation fund may in certain circumstances be reduced by taking advantage of the higher pension RBL, and rolling the investment balance into a complying pension product.

However, the advantage of superannuation only emerges over the long term, and the investment is only accessible in exceptional circumstances. The negatively geared investment can be converted to cash at any time.

## Other Relevant Issues

Superannuation also offers flexibility to reduce investment commitments if the member's circumstances change eg. The member ceases employment for a period to care for children. In this circumstance, the investment continues to yield income. The interest commitment in the negatively geared investment continues regardless. The investor has to either continue funding the interest or redeem the investment.

G:Tax\ProductsiCommentary On The Methodology Used.doc
Negative gearing has a higher risk profile for the investor. The investor retains the obligation to repay the capital sum borrowed irrespective of the performance of the underlying investments.

## The Role Of Contributions Tax

The attached spreadsheets indicate the disincentive created by contributions tax. The capital sum in the superannuation investment is eroded by this impost immediately and this is reflected in investment performance over the life of the investment. The superannuation investment return increases by approximately eighteen percent if we assume zero contributions tax and a return of $8 \%$ per annum.

## David Glen <br> 3 February 2006

SSUMPTIONS:
hitial Investment/Salary Sacrifice
necmevield
ercentage Franked Dividende
Percentage Oin Realised Gains in Unit Trust Distrib
interest rate p.a
Amount Borrowed
Superannuation Tax Rate
Co Tax Rata for investment
Individual Margginal Rato
inual Fes
Taxable Portion of Concession
Concessional Gain Percentage
faxable Portion of Concessional Gain (Individual)
Retirement At Age 5
ETP Over 55 Rate
TP Tax FreeThreshold Current
Assumed AWOTE Index For Inv Span
Age of investor in Years
ump Sum RBL Current
tnestment Span Years
10.000.00 (pre tax)
$5 \%$
$100 \%$
$8 \%$
$70 \%$
$70 \%$
$7 \%$
142,857 Capital sum to yield interest equal to the salary sactifice $15 \%$
$30 \%$ $30 \%$
$66.67 \%$ Based on Opening Balance
$80 \% \%$ of investment income quallying for concessional treament
$50 \%$ Assume preservation requitements no longer apply at this point
$16.50 \%$
129,751
129,751
1.05 per annum
30
648,946

## alaty sacritice into superannuation

## Opening Balance Contributions

Contributions
Tax On Contribution
Tax On Contibutions
Balance (invested)

Tax On frcome
Tax On Investment Gain
Annual Fee (ffter tax)
Closing Balance
withat
Pojected RBL A Withrdrawal
ETP Analysis
Projected Tax Free Portion
Taxable Portion
Excessive Componen
Total Payment
ETP Tax
tax OnETP
ax On Excessive componen
Total Tax

| - | 9,476.77 | 20,042.55 | 31,822.49 | 44,956.11 | 59,598.97 | 75.924.50 | $94,126.06$ | 114.499.23 | 137,044.37 | 162,269.44 | 190,393.23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10.000 .00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000,00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 |
| (1,50000) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (11.500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) |
| 8.500 .00 | 17,976.77 | 28.542 .55 | 40322.49 | 53,456.11 | 68.998 .97 | 84,424.50 | 102.62t.06 | 122.919 .23 | 145,544.37 | 170,769.44 | 198.883 .23 |
| 425.00 | 898.84 | 1,427,13 | 2.016 .12 | 2,672.81 | 3.404 .95 | 4.221.23 | 5,131.30 | $6,145.96$ | 7,277.22 | $8,538.47$ | 9,944.66 |
| 680.00 | 1.438 .14 | 2.283.40 | 3,225.80 | 4,276.49 | 5,447.92 | 6,753.96 | 8,240.09 | 9,833.54 | 11.643 .55 | 13,661.56 | 15,911.46 |
| 91.07 | 192.61 | 305.81 | 432.03 | 572.75 | 729.63 | 904.55 | 1,099,56 | 1,316.99 | 1,559.40 | 1,829.67 | 2,131.00 |
| (74.80) | (158.20) | (251.18) | (354.85) | (470.43) | (599.29) | (742.96) | (903.14) | (1,081.73) | (1,280,84) | (1,502.83) | (1,750.32) |
| (1444.50) | (305.61) | (485.22) | (685.48) | (998.75) | (1,157.68) | (1,435.22) | (1,744,64) | (2.08962) | (2.474.26) | (2, 903.08) | (3,381.18) |
| 9,476.77 | 20.042 .55 | 31,822.49 | 44,956.11 | 59.598 .97 | ${ }^{75,924.50}$ | 94,126.06 | 111,419.23 | 137,044.37 | 162,26944 | 1900393.23 | 221,748.85 |

## alary sacrifice into superannuation

Pening Balan
ontributions
ax On Contributions
Salance (inyested)
Ividend Income (net)
Tax On Income
Tax On Investment Gain
Amnual Fse (atiter tax)
Closing Galance
Withdrawal
Prapeted REL At withdrawa
ETP Analysis
Proiected Tax Free Portion
TTaxbe Portion
Excessive Component

| 13 | 14. | 15 | 16 | 47 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 24 | 22 | 23 | 24 | 25 | 25* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 221,748.85 | 256,707.66 | 295,683.72 | 339,138.69 | 387,587.24 | 441,603.20 | 501,826.35 | 568,969.97 | 643,829.34 | 727,291.08 | 820,343.76 | 924,089.48 | 1,039,757.03 | 1,168,716.40 |
| 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10.000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10.000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | $10,000.00$ | 10,000.00 |
| (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | [1.500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,50000) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (17.500.00) |
| 230,248.35 | 265,207.68 | 304,183.72 | 347.638 .69 | 386.087 .24 | $450,103.20$ | 510,326.35 | 577.469.97 | 652,329,34 | 735,791.08 | 828,843.76 | 932,589.48 | 1,048.257.03 | 1,177.246.40 |
| 11.512 .44 | 13,260.38 | 15,209.19 | 17,381.93 | 19,804,36 | 22,505.46 | 25,516.32 | 28,873.50 | 32,616.47 | $35,789.55$ | 41,442.19 | $46,629.47$ | 52,41235 | 58.860 .32 |
| 18,419.91 | 21,219.61 | 24,334.70 | 27.811 .10 | 31,686.98 | 36,008.26 | 40,826.11 | 46,197,60 | 52,186,35 | 58,863.29 | $66,307.50$ | ${ }^{74,607.16}$ | $83,860.56$ | 94,777,31 |
| 2,466.95 | 2,841.51 | 3.259.11 | 3,724.70 | 4,243.79 | 4,822.53 | 5,467.78 | 6.187 .18 | 6,989.24 | 7,883.48 | 8.880 .47 | 9,992.03 | 11,231.3 | 12.613 .03 |
| (2,026.26) | (2,333.91) | (2.676.91) | (3050,33) | (3,485,59) | (3.961.05) | (4,401.04) | (5.081.92) | (5,740.71) | (6,475.20) | (7.294,09) | (8,207.09) | (9,225.00) | (10,359.88) |
| (3,914,23) | (4,500.53) | (5,171.12) | (59.909.85) | (6,733.48) | (7.651.75) | (8,675.55) | (0,816.99) | (11.089.60) | (12,508.45) | (14.090, 35) | (15,854.02) | (17.820 37) | (20.012.68) |
| 256,707.66 | 295.683 .72 | 3398138.69 | 387.58724 | 441,603.20 | 501,826.35 | 568.969 .97 | 643.829 .34 | 727.291 .08 | $820,343.76$ | 924,089.48 | 1.039,757.03 | 1.168716.40 | 1,312,49500 |
| N/ | NA | A | va | NA | NA | va | /A | NA |  | A | UA | NA |  |

Excossive Comp
N/A N/A N/A N/A
NA
N/A N/A

Total Paymen
TP Tax
Tax On ETP
Tax On Excessive component
tox on Ex
$\overline{1444.063 .49}$
interest Paied On Lioan
Itorest Paid On Loan
ax On Cash Recived
Dividend insome (net)
vestmont Cain Realised
ax on investment gain- individua
tax on Income (@ Marginal \%)
axnual Foen (After tax)
Ander
Annual Feo (After tas)
Untholding Sold
Market" Value
"Market" Valu
axatle Gain On Redemplio
Tax on investment gain - individual
Loan Repayment
Retum After Tax

|  | 155.744.39 | 169,787.66 | 185,100.76 | 201,794,95 | 219,994.78 | 239,836.05 | 261,466.79 | 285,048.40 | 310,756.83 | 338,783.90 | 369338.73 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\frac{142,357.14}{142,87.14}$ | 15574139 | 169,787.66 | 185,10076 | 201.794 .95 | $219,994.78$ | 2398336.05 | 261.46679 | $285,048.40$ | 310756.83 | 338,783.90 | 369.338 .73 |
| 10,000,00 | 10.00000 | 10,000.00 | 10,000,00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000,00 | 10,000.00 | 10,00000 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 |
| (0,000.00) | (10.000.00) | (10,000.00) | (0,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (00,000.00) | (0,000,00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) |
| (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4.850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) |
| 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4850.00 | $4,850.00$ | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4.850 .00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 |
| 7,142.86 | 7.787 .07 | 8,48938 | 9,255.04 | $10,089.75$ | 10.999.74 | 11.991 .80 | 13.073 .34 | 14.252 .42 | 15,537.84 | 18,939.20 | 18.466 .94 |
| 8.000 .00 | 8.721 .52 | 9.508 .11 | 10,365. | 11,300.52 | 12.3497 | 13.430. | 14,642, | 15,962.7 | 17,402 | 18,971.9 | 20,682.97 |
| 3,428.57 | 737 | 074. | 42 | 843 | 5.279. | 5,756.06 | 6,275.2 | 841 | 7,458.17 | $8,130.8$ | 8.864,13 |
| (2.328.00) | (2.537.96) | (2,766.86) | (3,016.40) | (3,288.45) | (3,585.03) | (3,908.37) | (4,260.86) | (4,645.15) | (5.064.09) | (5.520.82) | (6,018.74) |
| (1,887.76) | (2.058.04) | (2,243.62) | (2,445.97) | (2,606, 58) | (2907.07) | (3.169.26) | (3,455.10) | (3766.71) | (4,106.43) | (4,476.79) | (4,880.55) |
| (1,471.43) | (11.604.14) | (1,748.81) | (1,906.54) | (2,078.49) | (2,265.95) | (2,47031) | (2.693.11) | (2,936.00) | (3,200.80) | (3.489.48) | (3,904,99) |
| $155,741.39$ | 169787.66 | 185,10076 | 201794.95 | 219,99478 | 2398360.05 | 261.466 .79 | 285.048 .40 | 310,756.83 | 338,783,90 | $369,338.73$ | 402,64929 |
| 155.741 .39 | 169,787.66 | 185,100.76 | 201,794.95 | 19.994.78 | 239.836.05 | 261,466.79 | 285,048.40 | 310.756.83 | 338,783.90 | 369.338.73 | 402,649.29 |
| 152,312.81 | 166,049.87 | 181,025.85 | 197,352.53 | 215,151,70 | 234,556.18 | 255,710.72 | 278,773.20 | 303,915.67 | 331,325.74 | 61,207,91 | 93,785.16 |
| 3.428 .57 | 3,737.79 | 4,074.90 | 4.442.42 | 4,843:08 | 5,279.87 | 5756.06 | 6,275.20 | 6.847.16 | 7,458.16 | 8,130.81 | 8,864.13 |
| (831.43) | (900.41) | (988.16) | (1,077.29) | (11744.45) | (1,280.37) | (1,395.85) | (1,521.74) | (1,65898) | (1,808.61) | (1,971.72) | (2, 149.55) |
| (142,857.14) | (142, 857.14) | (142, 857.14) | (142,857.14) | (142,857 14) | (142,857.4) | (142,857.14) | (142,857.14) | (142,857.44) | (142,857.14) | (142,857.14) | (142,857 14 |
| 12.052.81 | 26.024.11 | 41,255.45 | 57.860 .51 | 75.963 .19 | 95,698.54 | 117.213.80 | 140,669.52 | 166.24071 | 194,118.15 | 224.509.86 | 257.642 .60 |

Interest Paid On Loan
Tax On Cash Recegive
Tax On Cash Received
Benefit From interest Deduction
Dividend Inconne (net)
hvestment Gain Realised
ax on investment gain x individual
tax on income (@) Marginal \%)
Amual Fee (Atter tax)
Unitholding Sold
Unitholding Sold
Cost Base
axable Gain On Redemption

Tax on investment gain - indiviculal


## NALYSIS OF DIFFERENCE

Opening Balance Difference
Prior Year Tax On Redemption of Units
Sipeetantuation Contributions
ontributions Tax
ETP Tax
Difference in Eamings
Differshce in Feess
Tax On fncome
Unrealised Gain
Trean On Investment Gain
Tax On Redemption Of Units
Advantage (Disadvantage) of Sal Sac Super
Difference Per Caculation
Proof

| 0 | (2,576.04) | (5,981.55) | (9,432.97) | (12.504.41) | (16,364.27) | (19,774.04) | (23,087.73) | (26.250.28) | (29,196.34) | (31,848.71) | (34,116.63) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | (831.43) | (906.47) | (988.15) | (1,077.29) | (1,174.45) | (1,280.37) | (1,395.85) | (1,521.74) | (1,658.98) | (1,808.61) | (1,971,72) |
| 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,00000 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,00000 | 10.000 .00 | 10.00000 | 10.000 .00 | 10,00000 |
| (1,500.00) | (1.500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| (14,037.86) | (48,171.60) | (14,286.96) | (14.378.76) | (14.440.97) | (44,466.58) | (44.447.43) | (14.374.09) | (14.235.63) | (14.019.46) | (13.711.07) | (13,293.79) |
| 1,326.93 | 1.298.53 | 1,263.59 | 1,221.00 | 1.169.74 | 1,108.27 | 1,035.09 | 948.47 | 846.38 | 726.54 | 586.39 | 423.01 |
| 1.978 .83 | 2,250.62 | 2.549 .43 | 2.878 .00 | 3.239 .33 | 3,636.70 | 4,073.81 | 4.554.66 | 5,083.70 | 5,665.83 | 6.306.46 | $7,01.55$ |
| (3,428.57) | (3.737.79) | (4.074.90) | (4,442.42) | (4,843.08) | (5,279.87) | (5,756.06) | (6,275.20) | (6,844,46) | (7,458.17) | (8,130.81) | (8,864.13) |
| 2.253 .20 | 2,37976 | 2.545 .68 | 2,661.55 | 2,818.02 | 2.985 .74 | 3,165.41 | 3,357.72 | 3,563.42 | 3,783.25 | 4,017.99 | 4,268.42 |
| 331.43 | 906.41 | 988.16 | $1,077.2$ | 1,174.45 | $1.280,37$ | 1,39585 | 1,521,74 | 1,658.98 | 18808.61 | 1,971.72 | 2.448 .55 |
| (2,576.04) | (5,981.55) | (9,432.97) | (12,904.41) | (16,364,21) | (19,774.04) | (23,087.73) | (26,250.28) | (29,196,34) | ( 31.848 .71 ) | (34,116.63) | (35.893.75) |
| (2,576.04) | (5.981.55) | (9,432.97) | (12,904.41) | (16,364.21) | (19,774.04) | (23,067.73) | (26,250.28) | (28, 196, 34) | (31,848.71) | (34,116.63) | (35,893,75) |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 000 |

Tax On Inoome
Tax On Investment Gain
Tax On Redemption Of Units
Advantage (Disadvantege) of Sal Sac Supe
Difference Per Calcuatation
Proof

| (35,89375) | (37.055.89) | (37.458.53) | (36,933.80) | (35,287.37) | (32.294.59) | (27,696.39) | (21,194.52) | (12,446.16) | (1,057.96) | 13,420. | . 506 | 787.70 | 938.53 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| (2,149.55) | (2,343,42) | (2,554.77) | (2,785.19) | (3.036.38) | (3,310.23) | (3,608.78) | (3934.25) | (4,289.08) | (4,675.91) | (5,097.63) | (5,557.39) | (6,058.61) | (6,605.03) |
| 10,000.00 | 10,00000 | 10,000,00 | 10,000.00 | 10000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10000.00 | 10,00000 | 10.000.00 | 0,000.00 |
| (1,500.00) | (1.500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500,00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1.500.00) | [1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | (144,063.49) |
| (12.748.47) | (12.053.21) | (11,182.85) | (10,108.74) | (8,798.09) | (7.213.49) | (5,312.36) | (3.046.22) | (359.89) | 2,809.33 | 6.532.66 | $10,890.87$ | 15,975.59 | 27,890.69 |
| 233.06 | 12.80 | (242.01) | (036.19) | (875.17) | (1,255.08) | (1,712.87) | (2,226.34) | (2,814.36) | (3.486.86) | (4,255.11) | (5.131.74) | (6,131.05) | (7,269.11) |
| 7,787.67 | 642.11 | 9,582.86 | 10.618.79 | 1,759.66 | 13.016 .25 | 14,400.49 | 15,925.52 | 17,605.89 | 19,457.64 | 21,498.50 | 23,748.07 | 26,228.02 | 28,962.27 |
| (9,663.58) | (10.535.44) | (11,485.39) | (12,521.16) | (13,650.44) | (14,881.56) | (16,223.73) | (17,686.94) | (19,282.12) | (21.021.17) | (22,917.06) | (24,983,95) | (27,237.24) | (29.693.76) |
| 4.535 .31 | 4.899 .45 | 5,121.61 | 5.442 .54 | 5,782.96 | $6,443.53$ | 6.524 .87 | 6,927.51 | 7,351.85 | 7,798. 18 | 8,260.60 | 8757.01 | 92.269 .09 | 9,802, 18 |
| 23443.42 | 2.554 .77 | 2.785.19 | 3.03636 | 3,310.23 | 3,608.78 | 3.934.25 | 4.289.08 | 4.675.91 | 5.99763 | 5,557.39 | 6,058.64 | 6,605.03 | 7.200 .74 |
| (37,055.89) | [37,458,53] | (36,933.80) | (35,287.37) | (32,294.59) | (27,696.39) | (21,194.52) | (12,446.16) | (1,057.96) | +3.420.87 | 31,506.22 | 53,787.70 | 80,938.53 | (30,336,98) |
| (37,056.89) | (37,458.53) | (36.933.80) | (35.287.37) | (32,294.59) | (27,696.39) | (21,194.52) | (12,446.16) | (1,05796) | 13.420 .87 | 31,506.22 | 53787.70 | 80,938.53 | (30,336.98) |
|  | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 000 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |  |

## Attachment B

Comparison of Salary Sacrifice - Super vs Negative Geared Property Investment Comparison of Salary Sacrifice - Super V8 Negative Ge
gitax/product advicesfall

ASSUMPTIONS:
Antial Investment
incomeYield
are

Percentage of Realised Gains in Unit Trust Distrib
Interest rate p .a
Amount Borrowed
Superannuation Tax Rate
Co Tax Rate for investment
Co Tax Rate for investment
Annual Fes
Taxable Portion of Concessional Gain (Superfund)
Concessional Gain Percestage
Taxable Portion of Concesssional Gain
Retirement At Age 55
ETP Tax FreeThreshold Curren
Assumed AWOTE Index For thy Span
Age of Investof in Years
Lump Sum rai Current
ump Sum rbi Currem
inestment Span Years
$10,000.00$ (pre tax)
4\%
$0 \%$
$0 \%$
$0 \%$
$4 \%$
$4 \%$
$100 \%$
$7 \%$
42,857 Capital sum to yield interest equal to the salary sacricice
$150 \%$
$30 \%$
$30 \%$
$48.5 \%$
$2 \%$
$66.67 \%$
$100 \% \%$ of investment income quatifying for concessienal treatment
Assurne preservation fequirements no longer apply at this point.
129,757
1.05 per annum

30
648,946



## negative geared property

Opening Baiance
Baiance
Cash Receved in Lieu of Salary Saerifice
interest Paid On Loan
ax On Cash Reseived
Senefif from Interess: Deduction
Rental income
mvestment Gain Unrealised
fax on invesment gain - individual
Tax on inconse (@ Marginal \%)
Annual Expenses (After tax)

## Unitholding Sold

"Marker" Vaiue
Cost Bas
Taxabie Gain On Redemption
Tax on investment gain - individual
Loan Repayment
Return After Tax

| 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| - | 148,657.15 | 154,692.63 | 160,973.16 | 467,508.67 | 174.309.54 | 181,386.51 | 188,750.80 | 190,414.08 | 204,388.49 | $212,686.66$ | 221,321.75 |
| 142, 857. 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 142,857.14 | 148,657.15 | 154,692.63 | 160,973.16 | 167.508 .67 | 174,309.54 | 181.386 .51 | 188,750.80 | 196,444.08 | 204,388.49 | 212,686.66 | 221,321.75 |
| 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10.000.00 | 40,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10.000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 |
| (10,000.00) | (10.000.00) | (10.000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | ( 10.000000 ) | (10,000.00) | (10.000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | ( $10,000.00$ ) | ( $10,000.00$ ) |
| (4,850.00) | (4.850.00) | (4.850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,85000) | (4.850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) |
| 4,850.00 | 4.850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4.850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4.850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4.850.00 | 4.850.00 |
| 5.744 .29 | 5.946 .29 | 6,187.77 | 6.438 .93 | 6,700.35 | 6,972.38 | 7,255.46 | 7,550.03 | 7,856.56 | 8,175.54 | 8.507 .47 | 8.852 .87 |
| 5.714 .29 | 5.946 .29 | 6,187.71 | 6,439.93 | 6,70035 | 6,972.38 | $7,255.46$ | 7,550.03 | 7,856.56 | 8,175.54 | 8,507.47 | 8,852.87 |
| - |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | - |
| (1,385.72) | (1,441.98) | (1,500.52) | (1,561.44) | (1,624.83) | (1,690.80) | (1,759,45) | (1, 130888$)$ | (1,905.22) | (1,982.57) | (2,063.06) | \{2,446.82) |
| (2,77143) | (2,883.95) | (3,001.04) | (3,122.88) | (3,249.67) | (3,381.60) | (3,518.90) | (3,661.76) | (3,810,43) | (3,965.14) | (4, 126.12) | (4,293,64) |
| [1,471.43) | [1,531.77) | (1.593.33) | (1,658.02) | (1,725.34) | (1,795.39) | (1,868.28) | (1,944.14) | (2,023.06) | (2, 105,20) | (2,190.67) | (2279.61) |
| 148,657.15 | 154,692.63 | 160.973.16 | 167,508.67 | 174.309.54 | 181,386.51 | 188.750 .80 | 196.414.08 | 204,388.49 | 212.886 .66 | 221.321 .75 | $\underline{230,307.41}$ |
| 148,657.15 | 154,692.63 | 160,973.16 | 167,508.67 | 174,309.54 | 181,386.51 | 188,750.80 | 196,414.08 | 204,388.49 | 212,686.66 | 221,321.75 | 230,307.41 |
| 148,657.15 | 154,692.63 | 160,973.16 | 167,508.67 | 174,309.54 | 181.386 .51 | 188,750.80 | 196,414.08 | 204.388 .49 | 212,686.66 | 221,321.75 | 230.307 .41 |
|  |  | - | - | - | - |  | - | - |  |  |  |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| (142.857.14) | (142,857.44) | (142.857.14) | (142.857.14) | (142,257.14) | (142,857.14) | (142,857.14) | (142,857.44) | (142, 857.14) | (142,857.14) | (142,857.44) | (142,857.14) |
| 5.800.00 | 11,835.49 | 18,116.07 | 24.651.53 | 31452.39 | 38,529.37 | 45,893.65 | 53,556.94 | 61,531.35 | 69,829.51 | 78.464.60 | 87,450.27 |


| Year | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | ${ }^{18}$ | 19 | ${ }^{20}$ | 21 | 22 | 23 | 24 | 25 | 25+ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Opering Balance | 230,307.41 | 239,657.90 | 249,388.07 | 259,513.16 | 270.049 .40 | 281,01341 | 292,422.56 | 304,294.91 | 346,649.29 | 329.505 .24 | 342,883,16 | 356,804.21 | 371,290.47 | 386,364.86 |
| Loan Drawdown |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Balance | 230,307.41 | 239,657.90 | 249,38801 | $259,513.16$ | 270,049,40 | 281,013.41 | 292,422.56 | 304,294.91 | 316.649.29 | 329,505.24 | 342,883.16 | 356.804 .21 | 371,290.47 | 366,364.86 |
| Cash Received in Leen Of Salary Sacrifice | 10,000.00 | 10.000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000,00 | 10,000.00 |
| interest Padid On Loan | (10,000.00) | (10.000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10.000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) | (10,000.00) |
| Tax On Cash Received | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4.850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4,850.00) | (4, 450.00$)$ |
| Beneft From interest Deduction | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4.850 .00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 | 4,850.00 |
| Rental income | 9,242.30 | 0,586.32 | 9.975 .52 | 10,380.53 | 10,801.98 | 11.240 .54 | 11,696.90 | 12,774.80 | 12.665 .97 | 13,180.21 | 13,715.33 | 14.272.17 | ${ }_{14.851 .62}$ | 15,454.59 |
| Investment Gain Realised | 0.212 .30 | 9,586.32 | 9.975 .52 | 10,380.53 | 10.801 .98 | 11,240.54 | 11,696.90 | 12,171.80 | 12,665.97 | 13,480.21 | 13,715.33 | 14.272 .17 | 14.851.62 | 15,454.59 |
| Investment Gain Unrealised | - | - |  |  | - | - | - | - | - |  | - |  |  | . |
| Tax on investrient gain - individual | (2,233.98) | (2,324.68) | (2,419.05) | (2,547.28) | (2,619.48) | (2,725.83) | (2,836.50) | (2,951.66) | (3,071.50) | (3,196.20) | (3,325.97) | (3,461.00) | (3,601.52) | (3,747.74) |
| Tax on Income (@ Marginal \%) | (4,467.97) | (4,649.37) | (4,833.13) | (5,034.56) | (5,238.96) | (5,451.66) | (5,673.00) | (5,903.32) | (6,143.00) | (6,392. 40) | (6,651.94) | (6,922.00) | (7,203.04) | (7,495.48) |
| Annual Expenses (After tax) | (2,372.77) | (2,468.48) | (2,568.70) | (2.672.98) | (2.781.51) | (2,894.44) | (3,011.95) | (3,134.24) | (3.261.49) | (3,393.90) | (3.531.69) | (3.675.08) | (3,824.29) | (3,979.56) |
| Closing Balante | 239,657.90 | $249,388.01$ | 259,513.16 | 270.049 .40 | 281:013,41 | 292,422.56 | 304,294,91 | 316,649.29 | 329.505 .24 | 342.883 .16 | 356,804,21 | 371,290.47 | 386,364.86 | 402.051 .26 |
| Unitholding Sold |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| "Market Value | 239,657.90 | 249,388.01 | 259,51316 | 270,049.40 | 281,013.41 | 292,422.56 | 304,294.91 | 316,649,29 | 329,505.24 | 342,883.16 | 356,304.21 | 371,290.47 | 366,364,86 | 402,051.26 |
| Cost Base | 239,657.90 | 249,388.01 | 259,513.16 | 270,049.40 | 281,013.41 | 292,422.56 | 304,294.91 | 316,649.29 | 329,505.24 | 342,883.16 | 356.804.21 | 371,290.47 | 366,364.86 | 402.051:26 |
| Taxable Gain On Redemption | $\underline{-}$ | - | $\cdots$ | $\square$ | - | - - | - | - | - | . | - | - | - |  |
| Tax on investment gain - indvidual | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Loan Repayment | (142.857.14) | (142,857.14) | (142,857.14) | (142,857,14) | (142.857.14) | (142.857.14) | (142.857.14) | (142, 857.14) | (142,857.44) | (142.857.14) | (142,857.14) | (142.857.14) | (142.857.44) | (142,857.14) |
| Return After Tax | 96,800.75 | 106,530.87 | 116,656.02 | 127,192.26 | 138,456.27 | 149,565.42 | 161,437.77 | 173,792.15 | 186,648.10 | 200,026.02 | 213,947.07 | 228,433.33 | 243,507.72 | 259,194,12 |


ANALYSIS OF DIFFERENCE
Opening Batance Difference
Prior Year Tax On Fedemotion of Units
frify Year Tax On Redemption of
Superamnuation Co
Contributions Tax
ETP Tax
Difference in Earnings
Oifference in Fees
Tax On thcome
Unrealsed Gain
Tax On Investment Gain
Tax On Redemption Of Units
Advantage (Disadvantage) of Sai Sac Super
Difference Per Calculation

| 0 | 3,150.50 | 6,539.89 | 10.183 .73 | 14,098.60 | 18,301.99 | 22.812 .4 | 27,649.80 | 32,834.81 | 38,389.6 | 44,337.76 | 50,704.01 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10.000.00 | 0,000.00 | 0,000.00 |
| (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | ( 1.500 .00 ) | (1.500.00) | (1.500.00) | (1,500.00) | (11.500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| (10.748.58) | (10,496.54) | (00.225.40) | (9,933.88) | (9,620.68) | (9.284.40) | (8,923.58) | (8.536.58) | (8,121.78) | (7,677.40) | (7,201.56) | (8,692.26) |
| 1,326.93 | 1,234.51 | 1,136.45 | 1,032.43 | 922.09 | 805.06 | 680.97 | 549.40 | 409.91 | 262.04 | 105.32 | (60.75) |
| 2,720.43 | 2.779 .25 | 2.839.79 | 2,902.06 | 2,966.17 | 3,032.07 | 3,099.85 | 3,169.50 | 3.241 .08 | 3,314.61 | 3,390.12 | 3,467.63 |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 1,351.72 | 1,372.17 | 1,393.01 | 1,414.23 | 1,435.82 | 1,457.77 | 1,480.07 | 1.502.69 | 1,525.63 | 1,548.86 | 1.572.37 | 96.12 |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.90 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 3,150.50 | 6,53989 | 10,183.73 | 14,098.60 | 18.301 .99 | 22,812.49 | 27.649 .80 | 32,834.81 | 36,389.65 | 44,337.76 | 50,704.01 | 57,514.75 |
| 3.150 .50 | 6.53989 | 10,183.73 | 14.098 .60 | 16,301.99 | 22.812 .49 | 27.649 .80 | 32,834.81 | 38.389 .65 | 44,337.76 | 50,704.01 | 57,514.75 |
| 0.00 | 0.00 |  | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.0 |


ANALYSIS OF DIFFERENCE
Opening Batance Difference
Opening Balance Difference
Prior Year Tax On Redemplion of Units
Superannuation Contributions
Contributions Tax
ETP Tax
Difference in Earnings
Difference in Fees
Tax On income
Unreatised Gain
Tax On investment Gain
Tax On Redemption of Units
Advantage (Disadvantage) of Sal Sac Super
Difference Per Calculation

| 57.514.75 | 64,797.88 | 72,582.98 | 80,901.31 | 89,786.07 | 99,272.36 | 109,397.37 | 120,200.49 | 131,723.38 | 144,010.19 | 157,107.59 | 171,065.03 | 185,934.83 | 201,772.38 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.0 | 0.00 | 0.0 | 0.00 |
| 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10.000 .00 | 10,000.00 | 10.000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 | 10,000.00 |
| (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (9,500.00) | (1,500.00) | [1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) | (1,500.00) |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | (6,343.82) |
| (6,147.40) | (5,564.74) | (4,941.94) | (4,276.48) | (3,565.70) | (2,806.80) | (1,996.78) | (1,132.54) | (210.70) | 772.24 | 1,820.02 | 2,936.62 | 4.126.2 | 5,393.22 |
| (236,74) | (423.20) | (620.74) | (829999) | (1,051.62) | (1,286.35) | (1.534.92) | (1,798. 12) | (2,076.77) | (2,371.79) | (2,684.07) | (3,014.62) | (3,364.46) | (3,734.70) |
| 3,547.18 | 3,628.78 | 3,772.45 | 3,798.22 | 3.886.09 | 3,976.09 | 4.068.22 | 4.162.49 | 4,258.91 | 4,357.45 | 4.458.14 | 4,560.93 | 4.665.83 | 4,772.80 |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 1.620 .09 | 1,644.25 | 1.668.57 | 1,693.01 | 1,717.52 | 1,742.07 | 1,766.60 | 1,791.05 | 1.815 .38 | 1.839 .50 | 1,863.36 | 1.886.87 | 09.96 | 32.53 |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 64,797.88 | 72,582.98 | $80,901.31$ | 89,786.07 | 99,272.36 | 109,397.37 | 120.200 .49 | 131,723.38 | 144,010.19 | 157,107.59 | 171,0055,03 | 185,934.83 | 201,772.38 | 212,292.41 |
| 64,797.88 | 72.582 .98 | $80,901.31$ | 89.786 .07 | 99.272.36 | 109.397 .37 | 120,200.49 | 131,723.38 | 144,010.19 | 157,107.59 | 171.065.03 | 185,934.83 | 201.772.38 | 212.292.41 |
| 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.0 |

