

Further written submission to the Human Rights Sub-Committee of the Joint Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Trade – inquiry into Australia’s advocacy for the abolition of the death penalty

Dr Amy Maguire, University of Newcastle Law School

8 March 2016

Introduction

I appeared before the Sub-Committee hearing on 27 November 2015. The Sub-Committee requested that I make a further written submission. I have had correspondence with Nathan Fewkes, research officer, to clarify how written submissions are dealt with. Along with a co-author, Shelby Houghton, I have recently had an article accepted for publication in the journal *Current Issues in Criminal Justice*. I hope to be able to put this article forward for consideration by the Sub-Committee, but am required to make some revisions and collaborate with the Editor to have the manuscript proof-read, edited and typeset. I anticipate that this process will be complete by the end of April or start of May, and have a plan in place with the Editor to ensure this timeframe. The Editor is happy for me to submit the article for the Sub-Committee’s consideration as soon as this process has been completed (which will be two-three months prior to the journal appearing in print).

In the meantime, Mr Fewkes advised that I could submit some previously published materials for the Sub-Committee’s consideration. Below I set out the reference list from our forthcoming article. I have highlighted those sources which I have provided in soft copy by email. In a separate document, I will include the short articles I have recently published online in relation to death penalty abolition.

References

ABC (2015) ‘Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran ‘relieved’ over transfer delay, says Julie Bishop’, *ABC News* (online), 19 February 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-02-18/bali-nine-abbott-asks-indonesia-remember-australias-past-help/6139032>>.

ABC (2015) ‘Indonesian ambassador Paul Grigson returns to Jakarta after recall in protest of Bali Nine executions’ *ABC News* (online), 10 June 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-06-10/indonesian-ambassador-returns-to-jakarta-following-withdrawal/6534176>>.

Abjorensen N (2015), 'Death penalty: are we really united in our opposition?', *The Drum* (online), 1 May 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-05-01/abjorensen-are-we-really-united-in-our-opposition/6436942>>.

AFP Governance 2010, *AFP National Guideline on international police-to-police assistance in death penalty situations*, viewed 27 June 2015 <<http://www.afp.gov.au/~media/afp/pdf/ips-foi-documents/ips/publication-list/afp%20national%20guideline%20on%20international%20police-to-police%20assistance%20in%20death%20penalty%20situations.pdf>>.

Amnesty International (2014a) *Death Penalty: Overview*, Amnesty International Australia <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/what-we-do/death-penalty/>>.

Amnesty International (2014b) '2014 World Day Against the Death Penalty: Protecting people with mental and intellectual disabilities from the use of the death penalty', 2014 <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/ACT51/005/2014/en/>>.

Amnesty International (2015) *Death Sentences and Executions 2014*, February 2015, 7, 11-13 <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/research/2015/02/death-sentences-and-executions-2014/>>.

Abbott T (Prime Minister) (2015), *Executions of Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran*, media release, 29 April 2015, Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet, Canberra, viewed July 29 2015 <<http://www.pm.gov.au/media/2015-04-29/executions-andrew-chan-and-myuran-sukumaran-0>>

Associated Press (2015) 'Indonesian Court rejects Serge Atlaoui's final appeal against execution', *The Guardian Australia* (online), 22 June 2015 <<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/jun/22/indonesian-court-rejects-serge-atlaouis-final-appeal-against-execution>>.

Australian Coalition Against Death Penalty (2004) *Interview with Dr Philip Opas QC*, 1 March 2004 <<http://www.acadp.com/>>.

Bae S (2007) *When the State No Longer Kills: International Human Rights Norms and Abolition of Capital Punishment*, State University of New York Press, 2.

Byrnes A (2007a) 'The Right to Life, the Death Penalty and Human Rights Law: An International and Australian Perspective' *University of New South Wales Faculty of Law Research Series* 35.

Byrnes A (2007b) 'Drug Offences, the Death Penalty and Indonesia's Human Rights Obligations in the Case of the Bali 9: Opinion Submitted to the Constitutional Court of the Republic of Indonesia 3(a)', *University of New South Wales Law Resolution Series, Paper No. 44*; cited in Lynch C (2009) 'Indonesia's Use of Capital Punishment for Drug Trafficking

Crimes: Legal Obligations, Extralegal Factors and the Bali Nine Case', *Columbia Human Rights Law Review* 40, 523, 535.

Byron M (2000) 'Why My Opinion Shouldn't Count: Revenge, Retribution, and the Death Penalty Debate' *Journal of Social Philosophy* 31, 307.

Carne G (2011), 'Abolitionist or Relativist? Australia's legislative and international responses to its international human rights death penalty abolition obligations' *University of Western Sydney Law Review* 3, 40, 47-9.

Commonwealth of Australia (2015) *Parliamentary Debates: House of Representatives: official Hansard*, 12 February 2015, 656 (Julie Bishop, Foreign Minister).

Commonwealth of Australia (2009) *Parliamentary Debates: House of Representatives: official Hansard*, 19 November 2009, 12197 (Robert McClelland, Attorney-General).

Connelly A (2015) 'Sovereignty and the Sea: President Joko Widodo's Foreign Policy Challenges' *Contemporary Southeast Asia: A Journal of International and Strategic Affairs* (37) 6, 17.

Cohen-Cole E, Derlauf S, Fagan J and Nagin D (2009) 'Modern Uncertainty and the Deterrent Effect of Capital Punishment' *American Law and Economics Review* 11, 335, 364.

Cornell University Law School, *Death Penalty Worldwide*, viewed 26 April 2015 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/search.cfm>>.

Cornell University Law School (2011) *Death Penalty Database: Saudi Arabia*, 4 April 2011 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=Saudi+Arabia#f72-3>>.

Cornell University Law School (2012) *Death Penalty Database: Afghanistan*, 11 December 2012 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=Afghanistan>>.

Cornell University Law School (2014a) *Death Penalty Database: Iran*, 7 April 2014 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=Iran>>.

Cornell University Law School (2014b) *Death Penalty Database: China*, 10 April 2014 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=China#f97-3>>.

Cornell University Law School (2014c) *Death Penalty Database: United States of America*, 10 March 2014 <<http://www.deathpenaltyworldwide.org/country-search-post.cfm?country=United+States+of+America>>.

de Wet E (2004) 'The Prohibition of Torture as an International Norm of *jus cogens* and Its Implications for National and Customary Law', *European Journal of International Law*, 15, 97.

Doherty B (2015) 'Death penalty shunned in Pacific, but Asia re-adopts executions – report', *The Guardian* (online), 1 April 2015
<<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/apr/01/indonesias-renewed-use-of-death-penalty-is-part-of-wider-trend-report>>.

Drilling A (2013-2014) 'Capital Punishment: The Global Trend toward Abolition and Its Implications for the United States' *Ohio Northern University Law Review* 40, 847, 850-859.

Duff X (2014) *Noose*, Five Mile Press.

Finlay L (2011) 'Exporting the Death Penalty? Reconciling International Police Cooperation and the Abolition of the Death Penalty in Australia' *Sydney Law Review* 33, 95-98.

France Diplomatie (2015) *Fiji – Permanent abolition of the death penalty*, Press Release, 13 February 2015 < <http://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/country-files/fiji-islands/france-and-fiji-islands/political-relations-6849/article/fiji-permanent-abolition-of-the>>.

Fullilove M (2006) *Capital Punishment and Australian Foreign Policy* (Lowy Institute, 2006) 7.

Garkawe S (2013) 'The Role of Abolitionist Nations in Stopping the Use of the Death Penalty in Asia: The Case of Australia' in Hood R and Deva S (eds) *Confronting Capital Punishment in Asia: Human Rights, Politics and Public Opinion*, Oxford University Press, 101-102.

Gaughran A (2015) 'One hundred death penalty free countries within reach after Fiji becomes number 99', *Amnesty International* (online), 13 March 2015 < <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/campaigns/2015/03/one-hundred-death-penalty-free-countries-within-reach-after-fiji-becomes-number-99-1/>>.
General Affairs Council of the European Union (2008) *EU Guidelines on the Death Penalty*.

Grattan M (2015) 'Australia withdraws its Indonesian ambassador in execution response', *The Conversation*, 29 April 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/australia-withdraws-its-indonesian-ambassador-in-execution-response-4095>>.

Harrison N (2006) 'Extradition of the "Bali Nine": Can and should the risk of capital punishment facing Australians be relevant to extradition decisions?' *International Journal of Punishment and Sentencing* 1(4), 221.

Hood R (2002) *The Death Penalty: A Worldwide Perspective* (3rd Ed, Oxford University Press), 7.

Hood R and Hoyle C (2009) 'Abolishing the Death Penalty Worldwide: The Impact of a 'New Dynamic'' *Crime and Justice* 38, 1, 22.

Hood R and Hoyle C (2015) 'There is no evidence that the death penalty acts as a deterrent', *The Conversation*, 25 April 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/there-is-no-evidence-that-the-death-penalty-acts-as-a-deterrent-37886>>

Human Rights and Democracy Department (2011) *HMG Strategy for Abolition of the Death Penalty 2010-2015*, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, 3.

Klein N and Knapman L (2011) 'Australians Sentenced To Death Overseas: Promoting Bilateral Dialogues To Avoid International Law Disputes' *Monash University Law Review* 37(2), 89, 106.

Lamb K (2015) 'Bali Nine: Indonesia has death penalty double standard, says brother of spared maid' *The Guardian* (online), 16 February <<http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/feb/16/bali-nine-indonesia-has-death-penalty-double-standard-says-brother-of-spared-maid>>.

Letter from Law Council of Australia to Federal Attorney-General and Minister for Home Affairs, 'AFP Practical Guide on International Police to Police Assistance in Potential Death Penalty Situations, 29 January 2010, 2 <<http://www.lawcouncil.asn.au/lawcouncil/images/LCA-PDF/docs-dated/20100129-MinisterforHomeAffairsrenewAFPGuide.pdf>>.

Lehrfreund S (2013) 'The Impact and Importance of International Human Rights Standards: Asia in World Perspective' in Hood R and Deva S (eds) *Confronting Capital Punishment in Asia: Human Rights, Politics and Public Opinion*, Oxford University Press, 25.

Lennan J and Williams G (2012) 'The Death Penalty in Australian Law' *Sydney Law Review* 34, 659, 663.

Lindsey T (2015) 'Indonesia's stance on the death penalty has become incoherent', *The Conversation*, 16 February 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/indonesias-stance-on-the-death-penalty-has-become-incoherent-37619>>.

Lowy Institute (2015) *New Lowy Institute Poll finds that 62% of Australians Oppose the Execution of Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran*, Media Release, 16 February 2015 <<http://www.lowyinstitute.org/news-and-media/press-releases/new-lowy-institute-poll-finds-62-australians-oppose-execution-andrew-chan-and-myuran-sukumaran>>.

Lynch C (2008-2009) 'Indonesia's Use of Capital Punishment for Drug-Trafficking Crimes: Legal Obligations, Extralegal Factors, and the Bali Nine Case' *Columbia Human Rights Law Review* 523, 558.

Maguire A (2015) 'Hardline on refugees undermines principled opposition to execution', *The Conversation*, 30 April 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/hard-line-on-refugees-undermines-principled-opposition-to-execution-40953>>.

Malkani B (2013) 'The Obligation to Refrain from Assisting the Use of the Death Penalty' *International and Comparative Law Quarterly* 62, 523, 549.

Marcus C (2015) 'The Bali Nine ringleaders traded in death by smuggling heroin and now must face the consequences', *The Sunday Mail (QLD)* (online), 18 January 2015 <<http://www.couriermail.com.au/news/opinion/opinion-the-bali-nine-ringleaders-traded-in-death-by-smuggling-heroin-and-now-must-face-the-consequences/story-fnihsr9v-1227188153470>>.

Margarey K and Jordan R (2010) 'Parliament and the Protection of Human Rights', *Parliamentary Library Briefing Book*, 12 October 2010 <http://www.aph.gov.au/About_Parliament/Parliamentary_Departments/Parliamentary_Library/pubs/BriefingBook43p/humanrightsprotection>.

Marr D (2010) 'Death and the State' *The Sydney Morning Herald* (online), 23 October 2010 <<http://www.smh.com.au/national/death-and-the-state-20101022-16xw5.html>>.

McInerney M (2015) 'Australian campaign to abolish the death penalty', *BBC News* (online), 4 May 2015 <<http://www.bbc.com/news/world-australia-32579232>>.

Méndez J.E (2013) *Report of the Special Rapporteur on torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment*, UN Doc A/HRC/25/60/Add.2 (11 March 2013), para 56.

Mitchell N (2003) Radio 3AW, *Interview with Prime Minister John Howard*, radio program, 8 August 2003.

O'Malley N (2015) 'Julie Bishop: Ending death penalty worldwide on Australia's UN agenda', *Sydney Morning Herald* (online), 30 September 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/world/julie-bishop-ending-death-penalty-worldwide-on-australias-un-agenda-20150930-gjxxxg.html>>.

Parliament of Australia (2015) *Inquiry: Australia's Advocacy for the Abolition of the Death Penalty* <<http://www.aph.gov.au/deathpenalty>>.

Plibersek T and Shorten B (2015) 'The Execution of Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran', Media Release, 29 April 2015, <<http://tanyaplibersek.com/2015/04/statement-the-execution-of-andrew-chan-and-myuran-sukumaran/>>.

Refugee Council of Australia (2015) *2015-16 Federal Budget in Brief*, 3, viewed 28 July 2015 <<http://www.refugeecouncil.org.au/wp-content/uploads/2014/08/2015-16-Budget.pdf>>.

Reith P (2015) 'Why no outcry over death penalty in the US?', *Sydney Morning Herald* (online), 18 May 2015 < <http://www.smh.com.au/comment/why-no-outcry-over-death-penalty-in-the-us-20150518-gh40v2.html>>.

Roberts G, Jennett G and staff (2015) 'Bali Nine pair Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran 'dignified' ahead of executions', *ABC News* (Online), 29 April 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-04-28/bali-nine-andrew-chan-myuran-sukumaran-dignified-executions/6428222>>.

Rothwell D, Kaye S, Akhtarkhavari A and Davis R (2014), *International Law: Cases and Materials with Australian Perspectives* (2nd Ed, Cambridge University Press) 206.

Roy Morgan Research (2009), *Australians say penalty for murder should be Imprisonment (64%) rather than the Death Penalty (23%)*, (Finding No 4411) <<http://www.roymorgan.com/findings/finding-4411-201302260051>>.

Roy Morgan Research (2015), *Australians think Andrew Chan and Myuran Sukumaran should be executed*, (Finding No 6044) <<http://www.roymorgan.com/findings/6044-executions-andrew-chan-myuran-sukumaran-january-2015-201501270609>>.

Saul H (2015) 'Bali Nine: Schizophrenic man Rodrigo Gularte did not understand he was going to be executed until final moments before his death', *The Independent* (online), 30 April 2015 <<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/bali-nine-schizophrenic-man-rodrigo-gularte-did-not-understand-he-was-going-to-be-executed-until-final-moments-before-his-death-10214446.html>>.

Sayed-Khaiyum A (2015) Republic of Fiji, *Parliamentary Debates*, Parliament of Fiji, 9 February 2015, 680.

SBS (2015) 'Bali Nine bribe probe takes evidence', *SBS* (online), 11 May 2015 < <http://www.sbs.com.au/news/article/2015/05/11/bali-nine-bribe-probe-takes-evidence>>.

S (2014) 'The Value of International Standards in the Campaign for the Abolition of the Death Penalty' *The Brown Journal of World Affairs*, XXI (1) 41, 44-45.

Shetty

Sifris R (2007) 'Balancing Abolitionism and Cooperation on the World's Scale: The Case of the Bali Nine', *Federal Law Review* 35, 81

Sky News (2015) 'Hundreds Gather for Bali Nine Vigil', *Sky News* (online), April 28, 2015 < <http://www.skynews.com.au/news/top-stories/2015/04/28/hundreds-gather-for-bali-nine-vigil.html>>.

Stoicescu C (2015) 'Indonesia uses faulty stats on 'drug crisis' to justify death penalty', *The Conversation* (online), 5 February 2015 <<https://theconversation.com/indonesia-uses-faulty-stats-on-drug-crisis-to-justify-death-penalty-36512>>.

Sydney Morning Herald (2015) 'Opposition to the death penalty is a moral absolute', *SMH* (online), 6 March 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/comment/smh-editorial/opposition-to-the-death-penalty-is-a-moral-absolute-20150305-13vmjf.html>>.

Tapsell R (2015) 'Of course I'm going to try to save my citizens from execution', *Inside Story*, 31 March 2015 <<http://insidestory.org.au/of-course-im-going-to-try-to-save-my-citizens-from-execution>>.

Tufft B (2015) 'Indonesia hits back at Tony Abbott claims that tsunami aid money should be used as a bargaining chip for convicted drug smugglers', *The Independent* (online), 22 February 2015 <<http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/australasia/indonesia-hits-back-at-tony-abbott-claims-that-tsunami-aid-money-should-be-used-a-bargaining-chip-for-convicted-drug-smugglers-10062397.html>>.

Tahls K (2015) 'Pressure on: Indonesia may pause all killings', *The New Daily* (online), 5 March 2015 <<http://thenewdaily.com.au/news/2015/03/05/indonesia-suggests-moratorium-death-penalty/>>.

The Australian (2015) 'Bali 9 due: Myuran Sukumaran and Andrew Chan 'keeping hope alive'', *The Australian* (online), 27 April 2015 <<http://www.theaustralian.com.au/national-affairs/bali-9-duo-myuran-sukumaran-and-andrew-chan-keeping-hope-alive/story-fn59niix-1227323659045>>.

The Drum (2015) 'How do you feel about the Bali Nine executions?' *ABC* (online), 29 April 2015 <<http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-04-29/drum-australia-reacts-to-bali-nine-executions/6429380>>.

Toohey P (2010), 'Tony Abbott says death penalty fitting for mass killers' *Herald Sun* (online), 20 February 2010 <<http://www.heraldsun.com.au/news/tony-abbott-says-death-penalty-fitting-for-mass-killers/story-e6frf7jo-1225832368108>>.

Topsfield J (2015) 'Bali nine executions: Indonesia responds to Australia withdrawing ambassador', *The Age* (Melbourne), 29 April 2015 <<http://www.theage.com.au/world/bali-nine-executions-indonesia-responds-to-australia-withdrawing-ambassador-20150429-1mvzlp.html>>.

UN Human Rights Council (2015) 'Human Rights Council holds High-Level Panel on the death penalty', Media Release, 4 March 2015, HRC15/015E <<http://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=15640&LangID=E>>.

Walia S (2015) 'India is slowing killing its death row prisoners without actually hanging them', *Quartz India* (online), 2 April 2015 <<http://qz.com/374310/india-is-slowly-killing-its-death-row-prisoners-without-actually-hanging-them/>>

Whyte S (2015) 'Federal budget 2015: Foreign aid to Indonesia to be slashed' *Sydney Morning Herald* (online), 6 May 2015 <<http://www.smh.com.au/federal-politics/political-news/federal-budget-2015-foreign-aid-to-indonesia-to-be-slashed-20150506-ggujmd.html>>.

Legislation

Crimes Legislation Amendment (Torture Prohibition and Death Penalty Abolition) Act 2010 (Cwlth).

Death Penalty Abolition Act 1973 (Cwlth).

Extradition Act 1988 (Cwlth).

Cases:

Atkins v Virginia, 536 US 304, 316-317 (US, 2002))

International legal materials:

Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment 1985, 1465 UNTS 85, opened for signature 4 February 1985, entered into force 26 June 1987.

General Assembly resolution 67/97, *The rule of law at the national and international levels*, A/RES/67/97 (14 December 2012), available from undocs.org/A/RES/67/97.

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966, 999 UNTS 171, opened for signature 16 December 1966, entered into force 23 March 1976.

Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Aiming at the Abolition of the Death Penalty 1989, A/RES/44/128, 15 December 1989, entered into force 11 July 1991.

Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court 1998, 2187 UNTS 90, opened for signature 17 July 1998, entered into force 1 July 2002, Article 31.1(a).

Universal Declaration of Human Rights 1948, GA Resolution 217, A (III).

United Nations Committee Against Torture (2014) 'Concluding observations on the combined third to fifth periodic reports of the United States of America', UN Doc CAT/C/USA/CO/3-5, 19 December 2014, para 25.

United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples 2007, GA Res 61/295, UN GAOR, 61st sess, 107th plen mtg, Supp no 49, UN Doc A/RES/61/295, 13 September 2007.

United Nations Economic and Social Council resolution 1984/50, *Safeguards guaranteeing the rights of those facing the death penalty*, adopted on 25 May 1984, endorsed by the UN General Assembly in resolution 39/118, adopted without a vote on 14 December 1984, paragraph 3.