Home Ownership Inquiry – 2nd Supplementary Submission

Christopher Moore - Individual

16 August 2015

After the 7 August committee hearing in Sydney, I have gone through and considered how a Principal and Interest Loan for investors could help improve home ownership.

Principal and Interest Loan for Investors

- Principal and Interest loans would more likely impact positively geared investors than negatively geared investors because a larger loan portfolio can be taken out as the rent usually covers the interest. (Especially at low rates).
- The principal component adds the equivalent of about 2.4% to a 4% rate and 1.5% to a 7% rate. (Based on 25year loan). The principal increases as rates fall. See Table 1.
- Including the principal means the investor reaches their maximum serviceability limit earlier. (i.e. they have to reduce their loan size, or purchase less properties).
- When positively geared investors are assessed against APRA's 7%, including the principal makes the repayments the equivalent of 8.5% (25 year loan).
- For a loan value of \$30M at 5%, P&I repayments would increase to the equivalent of 7%, or an additional \$600,000 per year. This extra portion would not be deductible.
- With falling interest rates, the principal component increases and thus inherently leans on both positively and negatively geared investors.

Table 1 - Principal and Interest breakdown for 25 year loans

25 Year I	_oan									
Principal a	nd Interest	Componen	ts for \$100,	000		Loan size with a Servicing Capacity of \$5000 per year				
First Year Payments			First Year	ear Loan Size						
				Principal %	Increase in			Loan Size		
Interest				added to Interest	Repayments			Reduction from		
Rate	Interest	Principal	Total	Rate	(I/O to P&I)	Interest Only	P&I	(I/O to P&I)		
1%	\$984	\$3,539	\$4,523	3.5%	360%	\$500,000	\$110,546	78%		
2%	\$1,972	\$3,115	\$5,087	3.1%	158%	\$250,000	\$98,290	61%		
3%	\$2,963	\$2,728	\$5,691	2.7%	92%	\$166,667	\$87,858	47%		
4%	\$3,957	\$2,377	\$6,334	2.4%	60%	\$125,000	\$78,939	37%		
5%	\$4,953	\$2,062	\$7,015	2.1%	42%	\$100,000	\$71,276	29%		
6%	\$5,952	\$1,780	\$7,732	1.8%	30%	\$83,333	\$64,666	22%		
7%	\$6,952	\$1,530	\$8,482	1.5%	22%	\$71,429	\$58,948	17%		
8%	\$7,953	\$1,309	\$9,262	1.3%	16%	\$62,500	\$53,984	14%		
9%	\$8,955	\$1,116	\$10,071	1.1%	12%	\$55,556	\$49,648	11%		
10%	\$9,957	\$947	\$10,904	0.9%	10%	\$50,000	\$45,855	8%		

Home Ownership Submission 4 - Supplementary Submission 2

Table 2 shows that the principal and interest over a number of years.

It shows the principal component of the repayment increases, meaning deductions for investors will reduce over time.

Towards the end of the loan, e.g. the last 5 to 10 years, the majority of the repayment will be the principal. If interest rates were to rise, most of the repayment would be the principal and thus not be deductible.

Table 2 - Yearly breakdown of Principal and Interest

25 Year Pr	incipal and	Interest Loa				
\$100,000 L	oan @ 7%	Interest Ra				
	Repayments					
						Principal % of
	Principal			Total		Total
Year	(\$100,000)	Interest	Principal	Repayment		Repayment
1	\$98,471	\$6,952	\$1,529	\$8,481		18.0%
2	\$96,831	\$6,841	\$1,640	\$8,481		19.3%
3	\$95,072	\$6,722	\$1,759	\$8,481		20.7%
4	\$93,186	\$6,595	\$1,886	\$8,481		22.2%
5	\$91,164	\$6,459	\$2,022	\$8,481		23.8%
6	\$88,996	\$6,313	\$2,168	\$8,481		25.6%
7	\$86,671	\$6,156	\$2,325	\$8,481		27.4%
8	\$84,178	\$5,988	\$2,493	\$8,481		29.4%
9	\$81,505	\$5,808	\$2,673	\$8,481		31.5%
10	\$78,638	\$5,614	\$2,867	\$8,481		33.8%

Home Ownership Submission 4 - Supplementary Submission 2

Positive Gearing

An example taken from a property investment magazine recently of 10 properties positively geared is shown in Table 3.

At the current 4.4% interest the investor is making about \$36,000 positive cashflow per year. Assuming a tax rate of 37% leaves \$22,680 of after tax income. But assuming a 25 year P&I loan for the \$2.3M loan portfolio, the principal added is about \$51,000. This is an additional \$28,000 beyond the \$22,680 profit that the investor has to find to service the loan.

At 6% interest rate, the portfolio is about neutral. But after adding the principal component, the investor needs to find \$41,000.

Assessing this investor at APRA's 7% floor, losses applied to gross income are nearly \$25,000 per year. Assuming the investors tax rate is 37%, net loss is \$15,750. Adding the principal component of \$35,000 (\$2.3M @ 7%) is \$51,000 per year out of the investors after tax cash flow.

If the investor were treated as an owner occupier for loan assessment purposes (as I have recommended in supplementary submission No 1) they would need \$60,000 of cash flow.

If the investor had \$100,000 of gross income (I have assumed), which is \$75,053 of after tax income, 68% of after tax income would need to service the loan, (80% as an owner occupier). But only 21% with an interest only loan.

By including the principal component, the investors' cash flow exceeds 1/3 of the investors after tax income. Reducing the portfolio by half from \$2.3M to about \$1.1M (or \$860k as an owner occupier) would meet the 1/3 servicing criteria.

That's a reduction from 10 properties to about 4.8 properties, or 3.7 properties if treated as an owner occupier for the purpose of the loan application.

This example highlights how including the principal repayment and also assessing loan serviceability as an owner occupier, the positively geared investor is significantly slowed from purchasing properties.

The benefits of P&I are that positively geared investors accumulate less properties, thus improving opportunities for home ownership. It would also improve financial system stability.

Table 3 - Positive Gearing Example - (Cashflow at the current 4.4%, then 6%, then 7%).

Rent after Maintenance (Investment Properties Rent S/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only) wear) Property No.1 S. 38.0 S. 304.0 S. 305.000 4.40% S. 1.118 S. Property No.2 S. 400 S. 320.0 S. 354,000 4.40% S. 1.218 S. Property No.3 S. 240 S. 192.0 S. 154,000 4.40% S. 564 S. Property No.5 S. 290 S. 232.0 S. 255.00 4.40% S. 788 S. Property No.5 S. 290 S. 232.0 S. 255.00 4.40% S. 788 S. Property No.5 S. 290 S. 232.0 S. 255.00 4.40% S. 788 S. Property No.6 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 200,000 4.40% S. 733 S. Property No.7 S. 320 S. 255.0 S. 199,000 4.40% S. 733 S. Property No.8 S. 295 S. 236.0 S. 170,000 4.40% S. 723 S. Property No.8 S. 295 S. 236.0 S. 170,000 4.40% S. 723 S. Property No.8 S. 295 S. 236.0 S. 170,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 260,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 260,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 260,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 260,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 260,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 260,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 260,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 260,000 4.40% S. 755 S. Property No.10 S. 325 S. 260.0 S. 360,000 S	ipal and	Mont								
Rent after Maintenance (Investment Investment Investment Rent S/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only) Very early	yment cipal and est, 25									
Net Cashflow Net	2ipal and 2st, 25 1,678	Renav	ılv Loan	Month			Rent after		Investment	
Investment	1,678		· .							
Property No 1 S 380 S 304.0 S 305.000 4.40% S 1,118 S	1,678	l'								
Property No 1			-31	•		Loan Amount	'	Pant S/waak		
Property No 2			1 110	- "			` ,			
Property No 3	1,947	_		-		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
Property No 4	0.47	_					•		· ·	
Property No 5	847	_		_						
Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 4.40% \$ 733 \$	1,870	_		•		· · · ·				
Property No 7	1,183			_					' '	
Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 \$ 4.40% \$ 623 \$ 5	1,100	_		•					· ' '	
Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 \$ 4.40% \$ 755 \$ 5	1,095					, ,,,,,,			· · ·	
Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 4.40% \$ 755 \$ \$	935	_							· <i>'</i>	
S	1,133	_								
Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 1,987 \$	1,133	\$	755	\$	4.40%	,	\$ 260.0	\$ 325	Property No 10	
Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 1,987 \$						\$ 2,349,000				
Net Cashflow Per Week \$ 697 - \$	12,920									
Net Cashflow Per Year \$ 36,260 \$	2,981	\$	1,987	\$	Per Week		\$ 2,684	\$ 3,355	Per Week	
Net Cashflow Per Year \$ 36,260 \$										
Rent after Monthly Loan Repayment (Interest Interest I	297	-\$	697	\$	Per Week	Net Cashflow				
Rent after Maintenance (0.8 x Rent) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only (Principal Interest Not 1) S 380 S 304.0 \$ 305,000 6.00% \$ 1,770	15,466	-\$	36,260	\$	Per Year	Net Cashflow				
Rent after Maintenance (0.8 x Rent) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only Properties Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only Property No 1 \$ 380 \$ 304.0 \$ 305,000 6.00% \$ 1,770 \$ \$ Property No 2 \$ 400 \$ 320.0 \$ 354,000 6.00% \$ 1,770 \$ \$ Property No 3 \$ 240 \$ 192.0 \$ 154,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ \$ Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ \$ Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$										
Rent after Maintenance (0.8 x Rent) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only Properties Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only Property No 1 \$ 380 \$ 304.0 \$ 305,000 6.00% \$ 1,770 \$ \$ Property No 2 \$ 400 \$ 320.0 \$ 354,000 6.00% \$ 1,770 \$ \$ Property No 3 \$ 240 \$ 192.0 \$ 154,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ \$ Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ \$ Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$ \$										
Maintenance	•									
Investment			·							
Properties Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only) year) Property No 1 \$ 380 \$ 304.0 \$ 305,000 6.00% \$ 1,525 \$ Property No 2 \$ 400 \$ 320.0 \$ 354,000 6.00% \$ 1,770 \$ Property No 3 \$ 240 \$ 192.0 \$ 154,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,075 \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 <td>cipal and</td> <td>(Princ</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>Maintenance</td> <td></td> <td></td>	cipal and	(Princ					Maintenance			
Property No 1 \$ 380 \$ 304.0 \$ 305,000 6.00% \$ 1,525 \$ Property No 2 \$ 400 \$ 320.0 \$ 354,000 6.00% \$ 1,770 \$ Property No 3 \$ 240 \$ 192.0 \$ 154,000 6.00% \$ 770 \$ Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,075 \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 995 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$	est, 25	Intere	est	(Intere			(0.8 x Rent)		Investment	
Property No 2 \$ 400 \$ 320.0 \$ 354,000 6.00% \$ 1,770 \$ Property No 3 \$ 240 \$ 192.0 \$ 154,000 6.00% \$ 770 \$ Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,075 \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 995 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ Net Cashflow Per Week -\$ 2,5 -\$ -\$		year)		Only)	Interest Rate	Loan Amount	(Assumed)	Rent \$/week	Properties	
Property No 3 \$ 240 \$ 192.0 \$ 154,000 6.00% \$ 770 \$ Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,075 \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 995 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week -\$ 26 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year <td>1,965</td> <td>\$</td> <td>1,525</td> <td>\$</td> <td>6.00%</td> <td>\$ 305,000</td> <td>\$ 304.0</td> <td>\$ 380</td> <td>Property No 1</td>	1,965	\$	1,525	\$	6.00%	\$ 305,000	\$ 304.0	\$ 380	Property No 1	
Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,075 \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 995 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Investment Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount	2,280	\$	1,770	\$	6.00%	\$ 354,000	\$ 320.0	\$ 400	Property No 2	
Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 6.00% \$ 1,700 \$ Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,075 \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 995 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week -\$ 26 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Week -\$ 26 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Investment Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount <td< td=""><td>992</td><td>\$</td><td>770</td><td>\$</td><td>6.00%</td><td>\$ 154,000</td><td>\$ 192.0</td><td>\$ 240</td><td>Property No 3</td></td<>	992	\$	770	\$	6.00%	\$ 154,000	\$ 192.0	\$ 240	Property No 3	
Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 6.00% \$ 1,075 \$ Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 995 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week -\$ 26 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Investment Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only)	2,190	_		•		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 6.00% \$ 1,000 \$ Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 995 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week -\$ 26 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Rent after Maintenance (0.8 x Rent) Monthly Loan Repayment (Interest Conly) (Princigate Conly) Net Cashflow (Princigate Conly) </td <td>1,385</td> <td>_</td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>•</td> <td></td> <td><u> </u></td>	1,385	_		•			•		<u> </u>	
Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 6.00% \$ 995 \$ Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Monthly Loan Repayment (Interest Interest Investment Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only) year) Property No 1 \$ 380 \$ 304.0 \$ 305,000 7.00% \$ 1,779 \$	1,288	_		_						
Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 6.00% \$ 850 \$ Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 26 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ Rent after Maintenance Monthly Loan Repayment (Interest Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Interest Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Inte	1,282	_		_						
Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$ Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ \$ -\$	1,095			_						
Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 6.00% \$ 1,030 \$ Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$ Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ \$ -\$	1,327	_				,				
S 2,349,000 Per Month \$ 11,745 \$	1,327	_				, ,,,,,,,			<u> </u>	
Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$	1,327	7	1,030	۲	0.00%		\$ 200.0	ý 323	rioperty No 10	
Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 2,710 \$ Net Cashflow Per Week -\$ 26 -\$ -\$ 1,372 -\$ Net Cashflow Per Year -\$ 1,372 -\$ -\$ Monthly Loan Repayment (Principal Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Repayment (Interest Interest Rate Only) -\$ <	15.131	ċ	11 745	ċ	Dor Month	\$ 2,349,000				
Net Cashflow	-, -	-	, -				¢ 2.694	¢ 2.2FF	Dor Wook	
Net Cashflow	3,492	Ş	2,710	>	Per week		\$ 2,084	\$ 3,355	Per week	
Net Cashflow										
Rent after Maintenance (Investment Properties Rent \$\\$/week (Assumed) Rent \$\\$ 380 \$ \$ 304.0 \$ \$ 305,000 \$ 7.00% \$ 1,779 \$	808	-								
Rent after Monthly Loan Repayr	42,010	-\$	1,372	-\$	Per Year	Net Cashflow				
Rent after Monthly Loan Repayr										
Rent after Monthly Loan Repayr	hly Loan	Mont								
Maintenance (Principle Investment Properties Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only) year) Property No 1 \$ 380 \$ 304.0 \$ 305,000 7.00% \$ 1,779 \$	Repayment		Monthly Loan				Rent after			
Investment	ipal and									
Properties Rent \$/week (Assumed) Loan Amount Interest Rate Only) year) Property No 1 \$ 380 \$ 304.0 \$ 305,000 7.00% \$ 1,779 \$	Interest, 25		1 ' '						Investment	
Property No 1 \$ 380 \$ 304.0 \$ 305,000 7.00% \$ 1,779 \$	230, 23			•		Loan Amount		Rent \$/week		
	2,155		1 770						<u> </u>	
	2,502	\$	2,065	-			\$ 320.0	\$ 400	Property No 2	
Property No 3 \$ 240 \$ 192.0 \$ 154,000 7.00% \$ 898 \$	1,088					· · · ·		•	<u> </u>	
Property No 4 \$ 480 \$ 384.0 \$ 340,000 7.00% \$ 1,983 \$	2,403			_					<u> </u>	
Property No 5 \$ 290 \$ 232.0 \$ 215,000 7.00% \$ 1,254 \$	1,519			_						
Property No 6 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 200,000 7.00% \$ 1,167 \$	1,413	_		_					· ,	
Property No 7 \$ 320 \$ 256.0 \$ 199,000 7.00% \$ 1,161 \$	1,406	_		•						
Property No 8 \$ 295 \$ 236.0 \$ 170,000 7.00% \$ 992 \$	1,201	\$	992	\$	7.00%	\$ 170,000	\$ 236.0		Property No 8	
Property No 9 \$ 300 \$ 240.0 \$ 206,000 7.00% \$ 1,202 \$	1,456	\$	1,202	\$	7.00%	\$ 206,000	\$ 240.0		Property No 9	
Property No 10 \$ 325 \$ 260.0 \$ 206,000 7.00% \$ 1,202 \$	1,456	\$	1,202	\$	7.00%	\$ 206,000	\$ 260.0	\$ 325	Property No 10	
\$ 2,349,000						\$ 2,349,000				
Per Month \$ 13,703 \$	16,600	\$	13,703	\$	Per Month					
Per Week \$ 3,355 \$ 2,684 Per Week \$ 3,162 \$			3,162		Per Week		\$ 2,684	\$ 3,355	Per Week	
	3,831							, -		
	3,831									
Net Cashflow Per Week -\$ 478 -\$	3,831 1,147	-\$	478	-\$	Per Week	Net Cashflow				

Home Ownership Submission 4 - Supplementary Submission 2

Negative gearing

As discussed at the 7 August committee hearing with Mr Alexander, the use of deductions for home owners would be difficult to implement with changing interest rates.

The closest thing is the use of the principal component in a principal and interest loan for investors.

As interest rates fall, the principal component increases thus consuming the investors after tax income. This would not induce investors to sell, but would reduce the investors lending capacity if they wished to use their equity to purchase another property.

For existing home owners who borrow to buy another property, they will need to service the principal on both properties.

Table 4 looks at an investor who has a \$1M loan to buy an investment property.

At 7%, the interest only after tax income is a loss of \$21,748. With a P&I loan, the principal is \$15,300, thus increasing total repayments to \$37,000.

If say, the investor had a limit of \$21,748, to ensure enough cashflow for day to day living, the loan size would be reduced from \$1,000,000 to \$741,113 (because of the \$15,300 principal).

If the investor was treated as an owner occupier for the purpose of loan assessment, the loan size would be further reduced from \$741,113 to 669,040 (because the tax refund is ignored).

This highlights the significant difference made by including the principal in sizing the loan, and treating investors as owner occupiers for the purpose of the loan assessment.

This approach aligns investors with owner occupiers, and thus increases the chance of improving home ownership, especially for first home buyers.

Table 4 – Comparison of Interest Only and P&I (25 Years) for an Investment Property Loan

					Tax Rate		First Year	
		First Year	Rental		37%	After Tax	Principal	After Tax
Interest		Interest	Income		(Refund /	Cashflow	Repayment	Cashflow
Rate	Loan Value	Repayment	(3.5% Yield)	Gain/Loss	Payment)	(Interest Only)	(25 Years)	(P&I)
1%	\$1,000,000	-\$9,840	\$35,000	\$25,160	-\$9,309	\$15,851	-\$35,390	-\$19,539
2%	\$1,000,000	-\$19,720	\$35,000	\$15,280	-\$5,654	\$9,626	-\$31,150	-\$21,524
3%	\$1,000,000	-\$29,630	\$35,000	\$5,370	-\$1,987	\$3,383	-\$27,280	-\$23,897
4%	\$1,000,000	-\$39,570	\$35,000	-\$4,570	\$1,691	-\$2,879	-\$23,770	-\$26,649
5%	\$1,000,000	-\$49,530	\$35,000	-\$14,530	\$5,376	-\$9,154	-\$20,620	-\$29,774
6%	\$1,000,000	-\$59,520	\$35,000	-\$24,520	\$9,072	-\$15,448	-\$17,800	-\$33,248
7%	\$1,000,000	-\$69,520	\$35,000	-\$34,520	\$12,772	-\$21,748	-\$15,300	-\$37,048
8%	\$1,000,000	-\$79,530	\$35,000	-\$44,530	\$16,476	-\$28,054	-\$13,090	-\$41,144
9%	\$1,000,000	-\$89,550	\$35,000	-\$54,550	\$20,184	-\$34,367	-\$11,160	-\$45,527
10%	\$1,000,000	-\$99,570	\$35,000	-\$64,570	\$23,891	-\$40,679	-\$9,470	-\$50,149

Home Ownership Submission 4 - Supplementary Submission 2

Australian Financial Review – 10 August 2015

Westpac CEO, Mr Hartzer noted that in Britain, where he had worked previously, interestonly loans could be offered now only as a fully advised financial product.